

None
Internet-Draft
Expires: July 30, 2010

A. Barth
U.C. Berkeley
I. Hickson
Google, Inc.
January 26, 2010

Media Type Sniffing
draft-abarth-mime-sniff-04

Abstract

Many web servers supply incorrect Content-Type header fields with their HTTP responses. In order to be compatible with these servers, user agents consider the content of HTTP responses as well as the Content-Type header fields when determining the effective media type of the response. This document describes an algorithm for determining the effective media type of HTTP responses that balances security and compatibility considerations.

Please send feedback on this draft to apps-discuss@ietf.org.

Status of this Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted to IETF in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/ietf/lid-abstracts.txt>.

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html>.

This Internet-Draft will expire on July 30, 2010.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2010 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the

Internet-Draft

Media Type Sniffing

January 2010

document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the BSD License.

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	3
2.	Metadata	5
3.	Web Pages	6
4.	Text or Binary	8
5.	Unknown Type	10
6.	Image	15
7.	Feed or HTML	16
8.	References	19
	Authors' Addresses	20

1. Introduction

The HTTP Content-Type header field indicates the media type of an HTTP response. However, many HTTP servers supply a Content-Type that does not match the actual contents of the response. Historically, web browsers have tolerated these servers by examining the content of HTTP responses in addition to the Content-Type header field to determine the effective media type of the response.

Without a clear specification of how to "sniff" the media type, each user agent implementor was forced to reverse engineer the behavior of the other user agents and to develop their own algorithm. These divergent algorithms have led to a lack of interoperability between user agents and to security issues when the server intends an HTTP response to be interpreted as one media type but some user agents interpret the responses as another media type.

These security issues are most severe when an "honest" server lets potentially malicious users upload files and then serves the contents of those files with a low-privilege media type (such as text/plain or image/jpeg). (Malicious servers, of course, can specify an arbitrary media type in the Content-Type header field.) In the absence of media type sniffing, this user-generated content would not be interpreted as a high-privilege media type, such as text/html. However, if a user agent does interpret a low-privilege media type, such as image/gif, as a high-privilege media type, such as text/html, the user agent has created a privilege escalation vulnerability in the server. For example, a malicious user might be able to leverage content sniffing to mount a cross-site script attack by including JavaScript code in the uploaded file that a user agent treats as text/html.

This document describes a content sniffing algorithm that carefully balances the compatibility needs of user agent implementors with the security constraints. The algorithm has been constructed with reference to content sniffing algorithms present in popular user

agents, an extensive database of existing web content, and metrics collected from implementations deployed to a sizable number of users [[BarthCaballeroSong2009](#)].

WARNING! Whenever possible, user agents SHOULD NOT employ a content sniffing algorithm. However, if a user agent does employ a content sniffing algorithm, the user agent SHOULD use the algorithm in this document because using a different content sniffing algorithm than servers expect causes security problems. For example, if a server believes that the client will treat a contributed file as an image (and thus treat it as benign), but a user agent believes the content to be HTML (and thus privileged to execute any scripts contained

therein), an attacker might be able to steal the user's authentication credentials and mount other cross-site scripting attacks.

Conformance requirements phrased as algorithms or specific steps MAY be implemented in any manner, so long as the end result is equivalent. (In particular, the algorithms defined in this specification are intended to be easy to follow, and not intended to be performant.)

[2.](#) Metadata

The explicit media type metadata information associated with sequence of octets depends on the protocol that was used to fetch the octets.

For octets received via HTTP, the Content-Type HTTP header field, if present, indicates the media type. Let the official-type be the media type indicated by the HTTP Content-Type header field, if present. If the Content-Type header field is absent or if its value cannot be interpreted as a media type (e.g. because its value doesn't contain a U+002F SOLIDUS ('/') character), then there is no official-type.

Note: If an HTTP response contains multiple Content-Type header fields, the user agent MUST use the textually last Content-Type header field to the official-type. For example, if the last Content-Type header field contains the value "foo", then there is no official media type because "foo" cannot be interpreted as a media type (even if the HTTP response contains another Content-Type header field that could be interpreted as a media type).

For octets fetched from the file system, user agents should use

platform-specific conventions (e.g., operating system file extension/type mappings) to determine the official-type.

Note: It is essential that file extensions are not used for determining the media type for octets fetched over HTTP because, in some cases, file extensions can be supplied by malicious parties. For example, most PHP installations let the attacker append arbitrary path information to URLs (e.g., `http://example.com/foo.php/bar.html`) and thereby determine the file extension.

For octets fetched over some other protocols, e.g. FTP, there is no type information.

Note: Comparisons between media types, as defined by MIME specifications, are done in an ASCII case-insensitive manner. [[RFC2046](#)]

[3.](#) Web Pages

The user agent MUST use the following algorithm to determine the sniffed-type of a sequence of octets:

1. If the user agent is configured to strictly obey the official-type, then let the sniffed-type be the official-type and abort these steps.
2. If the octets were fetched via HTTP and there is an HTTP Content-Type header field and the value of the last such header field has octets that **exactly** match the octets contained in one of the following lines:

+-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+

Bytes in Hexadecimal	Textual Representation
74 65 78 74 2f 70 6c 61 69 6e	text/plain
74 65 78 74 2f 70 6c 61 69 6e 3b 20 63 68 61 72 73 65 74 3d 49 53 4f 2d 38 38 35 39 2d 31	text/plain; charset=ISO-8859-1
74 65 78 74 2f 70 6c 61 69 6e 3b 20 63 68 61 72 73 65 74 3d 69 73 6f 2d 38 38 35 39 2d 31	text/plain; charset=iso-8859-1
74 65 78 74 2f 70 6c 61 69 6e 3b 20 63 68 61 72 73 65 74 3d 55 54 46 2d 38	text/plain; charset=UTF-8

...then jump to the "text or binary" section below.

3. If there is no official-type, jump to the "unknown type" section below.
4. If the official-type is "unknown/unknown", "application/unknown", or "*/*", jump to the "unknown" type section below.
5. If the official-type ends in "+xml", or if it is either "text/xml" or "application/xml", then let the sniffed-type be the official-type and abort these steps.
6. If the official-type is an image type supported by the user agent (e.g., "image/png", "image/gif", "image/jpeg", etc), then jump to the "images" section below.

7. If the official-type is "text/html", then jump to the "feed or HTML" section below.
8. Let the sniffed-type be the official type.

1. The user agent MAY wait for 512 or more octets to arrive.

Note: Waiting for 512 octets to arrive causes the text-or-binary algorithm to be deterministic for a given sequence of octets. However, in some cases, the user agent might need to wait an arbitrary length of time for these octets to arrive. User agents SHOULD wait for 512 octets to arrive, when feasible.

2. Let n be the smaller of either 512 or the number of octets that have already arrived.
3. If n is greater than or equal to 3, and the first 2 or 3 octets match one of the following octet sequences:

Bytes in Hexadecimal	Description
FE FF	UTF-16BE BOM
FF FE	UTF-16LE BOM
EF BB BF	UTF-8 BOM

...then let the sniffed-type be "text/plain" and abort these steps.

4. If none of the first n octets are binary data octets then let the sniffed-type be "text/plain" and abort these steps.

Binary Data Byte Ranges
0x00 -- 0x08
0x0B
0x0E -- 0x1A
0x1C -- 0x1F

5. If the first octets match one of the octet sequences in the "pattern" column of the table in the "unknown type" section below, ignoring any rows whose cell in the "security" column says "scriptable" (or "n/a"), then let the sniffed-type be the type given in the corresponding cell in the "sniffed type" column on that row and abort these steps.

WARNING! It is critical that this step not ever return a scriptable type (e.g., text/html), because otherwise that would allow a privilege escalation attack.

6. Otherwise, let the sniffed-type be "application/octet-stream" and abort these steps.

5. Unknown Type

1. The user agent MAY wait for 512 or more octets to arrive for the same reason as in the "text or binary" section above.
2. Let *n* be the smaller of either 512 or the number of octets that have already arrived.
3. For each row in the table below:
 - * If the row has no "WS" octets:
 1. Let *pattern-length* be the length of the pattern.
 2. If *n* is smaller than *pattern-length* then skip this row.
 3. Apply the bit-wise "and" operator to the first *pattern-length* octets and the given mask, and let the result be the *masked-data*.
 4. If the octets of the *masked-data* matches the given pattern octets exactly, then let the *sniffed-type* be the type given in the cell of the third column in that row and abort these steps.
 - * If the row has a "WS" octet or a "_>" octet:
 1. Let *index-pattern* be an index into the mask and pattern octet strings of the row.
 2. Let *index-stream* be an index into the octet stream being examined.
 3. LOOP: If *index-stream* points beyond the end of the octet stream, then this row doesn't match and skip this row.
 4. Examine the *index-stream*-th octet of the octet stream as follows:

- If the index-pattern-th octet of the pattern is a normal hexadecimal octet and not a "WS" octet or a "SB" octet:

If the bit-wise "and" operator, applied to the index-stream-th octet of the stream and the index-pattern-th octet of the mask, yield a value different than the index-pattern-th octet of the pattern, then skip this row.

Otherwise, increment index-pattern to the next octet in the mask and pattern and index-stream to the next octet in the octet stream.

- Otherwise, if the index-pattern-th octet of the pattern is a "WS" octet:

"WS" means "whitespace", and allows insignificant whitespace to be skipped when sniffing for a type signature.

If the index-stream-th octet of the stream is one of 0x09 (ASCII TAB), 0x0A (ASCII LF), 0x0C (ASCII FF), 0x0D (ASCII CR), or 0x20 (ASCII space), then increment only the index-stream to the next octet in the octet stream.

Otherwise, increment only the index-pattern to the next octet in the mask and pattern.

- Otherwise, if the index-pattern-th octet of the pattern is a "_>" octet:

"_>" means "space-or-bracket", and allows HTML tag names to terminate with either a space or a greater than sign.

If index-stream-th octet of the stream different than 0x20 (ASCII space) or 0x3E (ASCII ">"), then skip this row.

Otherwise, increment index-pattern to the next octet

in the mask and pattern and index-stream to the next octet in the octet stream.

5. If index-pattern does not point beyond the end of the mask and pattern octet strings, then jump back to the LOOP step in this algorithm.
 6. Otherwise, let the sniffed-type be the type given in the cell of the third column in that row and abort these steps.
4. If none of the first n octets are binary data (as defined in the "text or binary" section), then let the sniffed-type be "text/plain" and abort these steps.

5. Otherwise, let the sniffed-type be "application/octet-stream" and abort these steps.

The table used by the above algorithm is:

Mask in Hex	Pattern in Hex	Sniffed Type	Security
FF FF FF DF DF DF DF DF DF DF FF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <!DOCTYPE HTML	WS 3C 21 44 4F 43 54 59 50 45 20 48 54 4D 4C _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <HTML	WS 3C 48 54 4D 4C _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <HEAD	WS 3C 48 45 41 44 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <SCRIPT	WS 3C 53 43 52 49 50 54 _>	text/html	Scriptable

FF FF DF DF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <IFRAME	WS 3C 49 46 52 41 4d 45 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF FF FF Comment: <H1	WS 3C 48 31 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF FF Comment: <DIV	WS 3C 44 49 56 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: 	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <TABLE	WS 3C 54 41 42 4c 45 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF FF Comment: <A	WS 3C 41 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF DF DF FF	WS 3C 53 54 59 4c 45 _>	text/html	Scriptable

Comment: <STYLE			
FF FF DF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <TITLE	WS 3C 54 49 54 4c 45 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF FF Comment: <B	WS 3C 42 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF DF DF FF Comment: <BODY	WS 3C 42 4f 44 59 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF DF FF Comment: <BR	WS 3C 42 52 _>	text/html	Scriptable
FF FF DF FF Comment: <P	WS 3C 50 _>	text/html	Scriptable

FF FF FF FF FF FF WS 3C 21 2d 2d _> text/html Scriptable
Comment: <!--
FF FF FF FF FF FF WS 3C 3f 78 6d 6c text/xml Scriptable
Comment: <?xml (Note the case sensitivity and lack of trailing _>)
FF FF FF FF FF 25 50 44 46 2D application/pdf Scriptable
Comment: The string "%PDF-", the PDF signature.
FF FF FF FF FF FF 25 21 50 53 2D 41 application/ Safe
FF FF FF FF FF 64 6F 62 65 2D postscript
Comment: The string "%!PS-Adobe-", the PostScript signature.
FF FF 00 00 FE FF 00 00 text/plain n/a
Comment: UTF-16BE BOM
FF FF 00 00 FF FE 00 00 text/plain n/a
Comment: UTF-16LE BOM
FF FF FF 00 EF BB BF 00 text/plain n/a
Comment: UTF-8 BOM
FF FF FF FF FF FF 47 49 46 38 37 61 image/gif Safe
Comment: The string "GIF87a", a GIF signature.
FF FF FF FF FF FF 47 49 46 38 39 61 image/gif Safe
Comment: The string "GIF89a", a GIF signature.
FF FF FF FF FF FF 89 50 4E 47 0D 0A image/png Safe

FF FF 1A 0A
Comment: The PNG signature.
FF FF FF FF D8 FF image/jpeg Safe
Comment: A JPEG SOI marker followed by a octet of another marker.
FF FF 42 4D image/bmp Safe
Comment: The string "BM", a BMP signature.
FF FF FF FF 00 00 01 00 image/vnd. Safe
microsoft.icon

Comment: A Windows Icon signature.			
FF FF FF FF FF FF	52 61 72 20 1A 07	application/	Safe
FF	00	x-rar-compressed	
Comment: A RAR archive.			
FF FF FF FF	50 4B 03 04	application/zip	Safe
Comment: A ZIP archive.			
FF FF FF	1F 8B 08	application/	Safe
		x-gzip	
Comment: A GZIP archive.			

User agents MAY support additional types if necessary, by implicitly adding to the above table. However, user agents SHOULD NOT use any other patterns for types already mentioned in the table above because this could then be used for privilege escalation (where, e.g., a server uses the above table to determine that content is not HTML and thus safe from cross-site scripting attacks, but then a user agent detects it as HTML anyway and allows script to execute). In extending this table, user agents SHOULD NOT introduce any privilege escalation vulnerabilities.

Note: The column marked "security" is used by the algorithm in the "text or binary" section, to avoid sniffing text/plain content as a type that can be used for a privilege escalation attack.

6. Image

If the official-type is "image/svg+xml", then let the sniffed-type be the official-type (an XML type) and abort these steps.

If the first octets match one of the octet sequences in the first column of the following table, then let the sniffed-type be the type given in the corresponding cell in the second column on the same row and abort these steps:

Bytes in Hexadecimal	Sniffed Type	Comment
47 49 46 38 37 61	image/gif	"GIF87a"
47 49 46 38 39 61	image/gif	"GIF89a"
89 50 4E 47 0D 0A 1A 0A	image/png	
FF D8 FF	image/jpeg	
42 4D	image/bmp	"BM"
00 00 01 00	image/vnd.microsoft.icon	

Otherwise, let the sniffed-type be the official-type official-type and abort these steps.

7. Feed or HTML

1. The user agent MAY wait for 512 or more octets to arrive for the same reason as in the "text or binary" section above.
2. Let *s* be the stream of octets, and let *s*[*i*] represent the octet in *s* with position *i*, treating *s* as zero-indexed (so the first octet is at *i*=0).
3. If at any point this algorithm requires the user agent to determine the value of a octet in *s* which has not yet arrived, or which is past the first 512 octets, or which is beyond the end of the octet stream, the algorithm stops and the sniffed-type is "text/html".

Note: User agents are allowed, by the first step of this algorithm, to wait until the first 512 octets have arrived.

4. Initialize *pos* to 0.
5. If *s*[0] equals 0xEF, *s*[1] equals 0xBB, and *s*[2] equals 0xBF, then set *pos* to 3. (This skips over a leading UTF-8 BOM, if any.)
6. LOOP: Examine *s*[*pos*].
 - * If it equals 0x09 (ASCII tab), 0x20 (ASCII space), 0x0A (ASCII LF), or 0x0D (ASCII CR)

Increase *pos* by 1 and repeat this step.
 - * If it equals 0x3C (ASCII "<")

Increase *pos* by 1 and go to the next step.
 - * If it is anything else

Let the sniffed-type be "text/html" and abort these steps.
7. If the octets with positions *pos* to *pos*+2 in *s* are exactly equal to 0x21, 0x2D, 0x2D respectively (ASCII for "!--"), then:
 1. Increase *pos* by 3.
 2. If the octets with positions *pos* to *pos*+2 in *s* are exactly equal to 0x2D, 0x2D, 0x3E respectively (ASCII for "-->"), then increase *pos* by 3 and jump back to the previous step

(the step labeled loop start) in the overall algorithm in

this section.

3. Otherwise, increase pos by 1.
4. Return to step 2 in these substeps.
8. If s[pos] equals 0x21 (ASCII "!"):
 1. Increase pos by 1.
 2. If s[pos] equals 0x3E, then increase pos by 1 and jump back to the step labeled LOOP in the overall algorithm in this section.
 3. Otherwise, return to step 1 in these substeps.
9. If s[pos] equals 0x3F (ASCII "?"):
 1. Increase pos by 1.
 2. If s[pos] and s[pos+1] equal 0x3F and 0x3E respectively, then increase pos by 1 and jump back to the step labeled LOOP in the overall algorithm in this section.
 3. Otherwise, return to step 1 in these substeps.
10. Otherwise, if the octets in s starting at pos match any of the sequences of octets in the first column of the following table, then the user agent MUST follow the steps given in the corresponding cell in the second column of the same row.

Bytes in Hexadecimal	Requirement	Comment
72 73 73	Let the sniffed-type be "application/rss+xml" and abort these steps.	rss
66 65 65 64	Let the sniffed-type be "application/atom+xml" and abort	feed

	these steps.	
72 64 66 3A 52 44 46	Continue to the next step in this algorithm.	rdf:RDF

If none of the octet sequences above match the octets in *s* starting at *pos*, then let the sniffed-type be "text/html" and

abort these steps.

11. Initialize RDF-flag to 0.
12. Initialize RSS-flag to 0.
13. If the octets with positions *pos* to *pos*+23 in *s* are exactly equal to 0x68, 0x74, 0x74, 0x70, 0x3A, 0x2F, 0x2F, 0x70, 0x75, 0x72, 0x6C, 0x2E, 0x6F, 0x72, 0x67, 0x2F, 0x72, 0x73, 0x73, 0x2F, 0x31, 0x2E, 0x30, 0x2F respectively (ASCII for "http://purl.org/rss/1.0/"), then:
 1. Increase *pos* by 23.
 2. Set RSS-flag to 1.
14. If the octets with positions *pos* to *pos*+42 in *s* are exactly equal to 0x68, 0x74, 0x74, 0x70, 0x3A, 0x2F, 0x2F, 0x77, 0x77, 0x77, 0x2E, 0x77, 0x33, 0x2E, 0x6F, 0x72, 0x67, 0x2F, 0x31, 0x39, 0x39, 0x39, 0x2F, 0x30, 0x32, 0x2F, 0x32, 0x32, 0x2D, 0x72, 0x64, 0x66, 0x2D, 0x73, 0x79, 0x6E, 0x74, 0x61, 0x78, 0x2D, 0x6E, 0x73, 0x23 respectively (ASCII for "http://www.w3.org/1999/02/22-rdf-syntax-ns#"), then:
 1. Increase *pos* by 42.
 2. Set RDF-flag to 1.
15. Increase *pos* by 1.
16. If RDF-flag is 1 and RSS-flag is 1, then let the sniffed-type be "application/rss+xml" and abort these steps.

17. If pos points beyond the end of the octet stream s, then continue to step 19 of this algorithm.
18. Jump back to step 13 of this algorithm.
19. Let the sniffed-type be "text/html" and abort these steps.

For efficiency reasons, implementations might wish to implement this algorithm and the algorithm for detecting the character encoding of HTML documents in parallel.

8. References

[BarthCaballeroSong2009]

Barth, A., Caballero, J., and D. Song, "Secure Content Sniffing for Web Browsers, or How to Stop Papers from Reviewing Themselves", 2009, <<http://www.adambarth.com/papers/2009/barth-caballero-song.pdf>>.

Authors' Addresses

Adam Barth
University of California, Berkeley

Email: abarth@eecs.berkeley.edu
URI: <http://www.adambarth.com/>

Ian Hickson
Google, Inc.

Email: ian@hixie.ch
URI: <http://ln.hixie.ch/>

