**Nominating Committee Process: Earlier Announcement of Open Positions
and Solicitation of Volunteers**
draft-dawkins-nomcom-dont-wait-04

Status of this Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted to IETF in full conformance with the
provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.
Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task
Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups
may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.
Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months
and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any
time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material
or to cite them other than as "work in progress."
The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at http://
www.ietf.org/ietf/1id-abstracts.txt.
The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at
http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html.
This Internet-Draft will expire on January 7, 2010.

Copyright Notice

Abstract

This document updates RFC 3777, Section 4, Bullet 13 to allow
announcement of open positions and solicitation of volunteers to be
issued before a Nominating and Recall Committee Chair has been named by
the Internet Society President.

Table of Contents

---

1. Introduction   [TOC](#)

The Internet Engineering Steering Group (IESG), the Internet
Architecture Board (IAB), and at-large IETF representatives to the IETF
Administrative Oversight Committee (IAOC) are selected by a "Nominating
and Recall Committee" (universally abbreviated as "NomCom"). [RFC3777]
(Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process:
Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees," June 2004.) defines
how the NomCom is selected, and the processes it follows as it selects
candidates for these positions.
This document describes an issue with [RFC3777] (Galvin, J., "IAB and
IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Operation of the
Nominating and Recall Committees," June 2004.) that causes an avoidable
delay in the NomCom process, and specifies a normative update to
resolve the issue.

---

2. Background   [TOC](#)

[RFC3777] (Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and
Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees,"
June 2004.) is the latest in a series of revisions to the NomCom
process. [RFC3777] (Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation,
and Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees,"
June 2004.) has been updated once since 2004, but the update ([RFC5078]
(Dawkins, S., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall
Process: Revision of the Nominating and Recall Committees Timeline,"
October 2007.)) did not change normative text (it replaced a sample
timeline).

[RFC5078] (Dawkins, S., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Revision of the Nominating and Recall Committees Timeline," October 2007.) identified a serial delay in the process described in [RFC3777] (Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees," June 2004.), in section 4, "Nominating Committee Selection", bullet 13, which states:

> The Chair obtains the list of IESG and IAB positions to be reviewed and announces it along with a solicitation for names of volunteers from the IETF community willing to serve on the nominating committee.
>
> The solicitation must permit the community at least 30 days during which they may choose to volunteer to be selected for the nominating committee.
>
> The list of open positions is published with the solicitation to facilitate community members choosing between volunteering for an open position and volunteering for the nominating committee.

The result is that the Incoming NomCom Chair is the only person who can announce the list of open positions and solicitation for names of volunteers, a process that requires 30 days for public solicitation. Since this is the first step in organizing the NomCom committee, delays in selecting the Incoming NomCom Chair translate directly into delays in issuing the solicitation and organizing the NomCom.
This proved problematic in practice in 2008-2009, when Joel Halpern was named NomCom Chair less than 30 days prior to the Second IETF meeting. If the 30-day solicitation had already taken place, the Nomcom could have conducted face-to-face interviews at the Second IETF meeting, but since the required 30-day solicitation didn't start until Joel was named, Joel was unable to assemble his NomCom before the Second IETF meeting, and the NomCom had to carry out these interviews using e-mail and conference calls.
It is desirable to allow the solicitation and announcement to take place in a timely manner so that when an Incoming NomCom Chair is named, the NomCom Chair can immediately begin executing the NomCom process.

---

3. Discussion   TOC

This document proposes that four weeks after the First IETF meeting each year, the Internet Society President will either announce an Incoming NomCom Chair, or will direct the IETF Executive Director to issue the announcement of open positions and the solicitation for names of volunteers on behalf of the Incoming NomCom Chair. This allows the

search for the Incoming NomCom Chair and volunteers to proceed in parallel.
This process change covers only the announcement of open positions and solicitation for names of volunteers. This process change does not allow the NomCom process to move to completion without an Incoming NomCom Chair; it is only to ensure that the Incoming NomCom Chair can begin executing the NomCom process without an avoidable delay, and can use face-to-face time at the Second IETF meeting effectively for this purpose.
During discussions in the IETF 74 timeframe, it was suggested that we also allow the Secretariat to perform other clerical tasks that aren't called out specifically in the NomCom process, but which clearly do not require NomCom Chair judgment. This document does not provide guidance about specific clerical tasks that would be appropriate for the Secretariat to carry out. Instead, either the Incoming NomCom Chair (if one has been selected) or the Outgoing NomCom Chair (if the search for an Incoming NomCom Chair is still underway) may request the Secretariat to perform these tasks, with appropriate notification to the community.

---

4. Updated text from RFC 3777

For [RFC3777] (Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees," June 2004.), in section 4, "Nominating Committee Selection", bullet 13, which states:

> The Chair obtains the list of IESG and IAB positions to be reviewed and announces it along with a solicitation for names of volunteers from the IETF community willing to serve on the nominating committee.

this text is replaced with the following text:

> The Chair (or the IETF Executive Director, if no Chair has been named four weeks after the First IETF meeting of the year) obtains the list of positions to be reviewed and announces it along with a solicitation for names of volunteers from the IETF community willing to serve on the nominating committee.
>
> If the IETF Executive Director issues the solicitation for volunteers, the IETF Executive Director must also collect responses to the solicitation and provide the names of volunteers to the Incoming NomCom Chair when the Incoming NomCom Chair is named.
>
> At the Chair's request, the IETF Secretariat may perform other clerical support tasks, as long as the task being performed does not require NomCom Chair judgment, in the NomCom Chair's opinion, and as

long as the community is appropriately notified that this request is being made. This request may come from the Incoming NomCom Chair (if one has been selected for this NomCom cycle) or the Outgoing NomCom Chair (if the search for an Incoming NomCom Chair is still underway).

Note: This text no longer specifies the list of bodies that NomCom reviews, rather than adding IAOC to the list of bodies in the text, so that this text need not change further when NomCom responsibilities change.

---

5. Possible Topics for Later Discussion

This section includes topics that came up during discussion of this document, which were not included in the normative changes contained in this document, because the goal for this document was incremental improvement, and these topics were more than incremental changes. They may be discussed further, or not, but we're less likely to forget them completely if we write them down.
[RFC3777] (Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees," June 2004.) tightly couples the announcement of open positions and call for volunteers, and this document didn't try to unravel these two separate actions. We had a request during discussion to separate them, so that a NomCom could consider the management structure of the IETF and the position descriptions that the leadership bodies provide, before announcing the positions being reviewed.

---

6. Security Considerations

This specification describes issues with the current IETF Nominating Committee process [RFC3777] (Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees," June 2004.) and proposes an update to avoid a serial delay. No security considerations apply.

---

7. IANA Considerations

{{{ RFC Editor: Please remove this section prior to publication. }}}
No IANA actions are requested in this specification.

---

8. Acknowledgements

[TOC]

The editor thanks the following folks who have provided useful observations and guidance on previous versions of this draft: Scott Bradner (who suggested that the IETF Secretariat have this responsibility), Brian Carpenter, Ralph Droms, Jim Galvin, Joel Halpern, Danny McPherson, and Pekka Savola.
The editor also thanks the Wednesday evening plenary session participants during IETF 74 who provided useful feedback on previous versions of this draft [w74plen] (, "IETF 74 Wednesday Evening Plenary Minutes," March 2009.).

9. References

[TOC]

9.1. Normative References

[TOC]

[RFC3777]	Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees," BCP 10, RFC 3777, June 2004 (TXT).

9.2. Informative References

[TOC]

[RFC5078]	Dawkins, S., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and Recall Process: Revision of the Nominating and Recall Committees Timeline," RFC 5078, October 2007 (TXT).
[w74plen]	"IETF 74 Wednesday Evening Plenary Minutes," March 2009.

Author's Address

[TOC]

	Spencer Dawkins (editor)
	Huawei Technologies (USA)
Phone:	+1 214 755 3870
Email:	spencer@wonderhamster.org