

Network Working Group
Internet-Draft
Obsoletes: [3005](#) (if approved)
Updates: [3683](#) (if approved)
Intended status: Best Current Practice
Expires: 28 August 2022

L. Eggert
NetApp
24 February 2022

IETF Discussion List Charter
draft-eggert-bcp45bis-08

Abstract

The Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF) discussion mailing list furthers the development and specification of Internet technology through the general discussion of technical, procedural, operational and other topics for which no dedicated mailing lists exists. As this is the most general IETF mailing list, considerable latitude in terms of topics is allowed, but there are posts and topics that are unsuitable for this mailing list. This document defines the charter for the IETF discussion list and explains its scope.

This document obsoletes [RFC3005](#) and updates [RFC3683](#).

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on 28 August 2022.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2022 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

Internet-Draft

IETF Discussion List Charter

February 2022

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Revised BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the [Trust Legal Provisions](#) and are provided without warranty as described in the Revised BSD License.

This document may contain material from IETF Documents or IETF Contributions published or made publicly available before November 10, 2008. The person(s) controlling the copyright in some of this material may not have granted the IETF Trust the right to allow modifications of such material outside the IETF Standards Process. Without obtaining an adequate license from the person(s) controlling the copyright in such materials, this document may not be modified outside the IETF Standards Process, and derivative works of it may not be created outside the IETF Standards Process, except to format it for publication as an RFC or to translate it into languages other than English.

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	3
2.	Charter for the IETF Discussion List	3
3.	Moderation	5
4.	Security Considerations	5
5.	IANA Considerations	5
6.	References	5
6.1.	Normative References	6
6.2.	Informative References	6
Appendix A.	Changes	7
A.1.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-08	7
A.2.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-07	8
A.3.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-06	8
A.4.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-05	8
A.5.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-04	8
A.6.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-03	9
A.7.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-02	9
A.8.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-01	9
A.9.	Since draft-eggert-bcp45bis-00	9
A.10.	Since RFC3005	9
	Acknowledgements	10

[1.](#) Introduction

The IETF discussion list [[IETF-DISCUSS](#)] furthers the development and specification of Internet technology through the general discussion of technical, procedural, operational and other topics for which no dedicated mailing lists exists. As this is the most general IETF mailing list, considerable latitude in terms of topics is allowed. However, there are posts and topics that are unsuitable for this mailing list. This document defines the charter for the IETF discussion list and explains its scope.

The IETF Note Well [[NOTE-WELL](#)] applies to discussions on the IETF discussion list and all other IETF mailing lists, and requires conformance with the IETF Guidelines for Conduct [[RFC7154](#)] and the Anti-Harassment Policy [[RFC7776](#)], among others.

This document obsoletes [[RFC3005](#)], documenting the use of other mailing lists for discussions that used to be in scope for the IETF discussion list, referring to applicable policies such as the Guidelines for Conduct [[RFC7154](#)] and the Anti-Harassment Policy [[RFC7776](#)], and clarifying moderation procedures. It also updates part of [Section 1 of \[RFC3683\]](#), which copies the list of "inappropriate postings" from [[RFC3005](#)]. This list in [[RFC3683](#)] is hence updated by the new list in [Section 2](#) below.

[2.](#) Charter for the IETF Discussion List

The IETF discussion list is meant for discussions for which a more appropriate list does not exist, such as discussions that do not fall within the scope of any working group, area, or other established list. When discussions are started on the IETF discussion list for which such a venue does exist, they should be continued at that other venue as soon as this is pointed out.

When no dedicated mailing list exists for a topic, it may be preferable to request the creation of one [[NON-WG-LISTS](#)] and announce

the availability of the new list on the IETF discussion list and on other related lists, such as area lists, rather than discussing that topic on the IETF discussion list.

Appropriate postings to the IETF discussion list include:

- * Initial discussion of technical issues that are candidates for IETF work, but have not yet identified appropriate mailing lists.

Eggert

Expires 28 August 2022

[Page 3]

Internet-Draft

IETF Discussion List Charter

February 2022

- * Questions and clarifications concerning practical aspects of IETF meetings, although most of these topics are better brought up on the discussion list for IETF LLC administrative issues [[ADMIN-DISCUSS](#)] or the attendee discussion list for a given IETF meeting.
- * Announcements of conferences, events, or activities that are sponsored or endorsed by the IETF, IRTF, IAB or the Internet Society, although the IETF announcement list [[IETF-ANNOUNCE](#)] is the preferred list for these.
- * Discussions of IETF direction, policy, and the standards process in general, when a more suitable list (such as the discussion list for IETF LLC administrative issues [[ADMIN-DISCUSS](#)], the IAB discussion list for architectural issues [[ARCH-DISCUSS](#)], a meeting attendees list, a process-oriented WG list, etc.) cannot be identified.

These topics used to be in scope for the IETF discussion list, but have since moved to dedicated lists:

- * Last Call discussions of documents now take place on the IETF Last Calls mailing list [[LAST-CALLS](#)].
- * Discussion of IETF administrative policies now takes place on the discussion list for IETF LLC administrative issues [[ADMIN-DISCUSS](#)].

Inappropriate postings include:

- * Advertising and other unsolicited bulk e-mail
- * Discussion of subjects unrelated to IETF policy, meetings, activities, or technical topics
- * Uncivil commentary, regardless of the general subject, per the IETF Note Well [[NOTE-WELL](#)]
- * Announcements of conferences, events, or activities that are not sponsored or endorsed by the Internet Society or the IETF.

[3.](#) Moderation

The IETF Chair appoints Moderators (previously known as the "sergeant-at-arms") for the IETF discussion list that are empowered to restrict posting by a person, or to an email thread, when the content is inappropriate and represents a pattern of abuse. They are encouraged to take into account the overall nature of the postings by an individual and whether particular postings are an aberration or typical.

Moderation of the IETF discussion list, including the handling of any appeals, is to be guided by the IETF discussion list charter specified in [Section 2](#), and the related guidance from [Section 1](#) that applies to all mailing lists. The moderators are intended to establish a self-moderation function on the community, by the community. Because the IESG and IAB are in the appeals chain for moderator decisions (see below), the IETF Chair therefore should not appoint a moderator who is serving in such a role. If a moderator is selected for the IESG or IAB, they will step down from the moderator team.

Apart from appointing moderators, the IETF Chair should refrain from

the day-to-day operation and management of the moderator team. The moderator team will independently define, publish, and execute their role; see the current set of operating procedures [[MOD-SOP](#)] and abuse patterns [[MOD-UPC](#)]. The moderator team should reach out to the IETF Chair for any conflict resolution in a timely manner.

Because a moderator serves at the discretion of the IETF Chair – even if the IETF Chair is not otherwise involved in the operation of the moderator team – any moderator decision can be appealed to the IETF Chair, per [[RFC2026](#)]. Decisions by the IETF Chair can be appealed to the IESG as whole, again per [[RFC2026](#)].

[4.](#) Security Considerations

The usual security considerations [[RFC3552](#)] do not apply to this document.

Potential abuse of the moderation process for the suppression of undesired opinions is counteracted by the availability of an appeals process, per [Section 3](#).

[5.](#) IANA Considerations

This document does not request any IANA actions.

[6.](#) References

Eggert

Expires 28 August 2022

[Page 5]

Internet-Draft

IETF Discussion List Charter

February 2022

[6.1.](#) Normative References

[RFC2026] Bradner, S., "The Internet Standards Process -- Revision 3", [BCP 9](#), [RFC 2026](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC2026, October 1996, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc2026>>.

[6.2.](#) Informative References

[ADMIN-DISCUSS]

IETF, "Discussion List for IETF LLC Administrative Issues", 20 October 2021, <<https://ietf.org/mailman/listinfo/admin-discuss>>.

[ARCH-DISCUSS]

IAB, "Open Discussion Forum For Long/Wide-Range

Architectural Issues", 20 October 2021,
<<https://ietf.org/mailman/listinfo/architecture-discuss>>.

[IETF-ANNOUNCE]

IETF, "IETF Announcement List", 20 October 2021,
<<https://ietf.org/mailman/listinfo/ietf-announce>>.

[IETF-DISCUSS]

IETF, "IETF Discussion List", 20 October 2021,
<<https://ietf.org/mailman/listinfo/ietf>>.

[LAST-CALLS]

IETF, "IETF Last Calls", 20 October 2021,
<<https://ietf.org/mailman/listinfo/last-call>>.

[MOD-SOP] IETF Discussion List Moderator Team, "IETF Discussion List Moderator Team Standard Operating Procedures", 20 October 2021, <<https://github.com/ietf/saa/blob/main/sop.md>>.

[MOD-UPC] IETF Discussion List Moderator Team, "Unprofessional Commentary", 20 October 2021,
<<https://github.com/ietf/saa/blob/main/unprofessional-commentary.md>>.

[NON-WG-LISTS]

IETF, "Non-Working Group Email List Guidelines", 20 October 2021,
<<https://ietf.org/how/lists/nonwglis-guidelines/>>.

[NOTE-WELL]

IETF, "Note Well", 20 October 2021,
<<https://ietf.org/about/note-well/>>.

[RFC3005] Harris, S., "IETF Discussion List Charter", [BCP 45](#), [RFC 3005](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3005, November 2000,
<<https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc3005>>.

[RFC3552] Rescorla, E. and B. Korver, "Guidelines for Writing RFC Text on Security Considerations", [BCP 72](#), [RFC 3552](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3552, July 2003,
<<https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc3552>>.

- [RFC3683] Rose, M., "A Practice for Revoking Posting Rights to IETF Mailing Lists", [BCP 83](#), [RFC 3683](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3683, March 2004, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc3683>>.
- [RFC7154] Moonesamy, S., Ed., "IETF Guidelines for Conduct", [BCP 54](#), [RFC 7154](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7154, March 2014, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc7154>>.
- [RFC7776] Resnick, P. and A. Farrel, "IETF Anti-Harassment Procedures", [BCP 25](#), [RFC 7776](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7776, March 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc7776>>.

[Appendix A](#). Changes

| RFC Editor: Please remove this appendix before publication.

[A.1](#). Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-08](#)

- * Update [[RFC3683](#)], because it copies text from [[RFC3005](#)] that this document updates. See this issue (<https://github.com/larseggert/bcp45bis/issues/11>).
- * addressed Eric Vyncke's IESG review (https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-eggert-bcp45bis/ballot/#draft-eggert-bcp45bis_eric-vyncke)
- * addressed Francesca Palombini's IESG review (https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-eggert-bcp45bis/ballot/#draft-eggert-bcp45bis_francesca-palombini) and Carsten Bormann's ART review (<https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/art/ZnkYEl-9mRWfKXtzHVUu7u92QB0/>)
- * addressed John Scudder's IESG review (https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-eggert-bcp45bis/ballot/#draft-eggert-bcp45bis_john-scudder)

- * addressed Roman Danyliw's IESG review

(https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-eggert-bcp45bis/ballot/#draft-eggert-bcp45bis_roman-danyliw)

- * addressed Ben Kaduk's IESG review
(https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-eggert-bcp45bis/ballot/#draft-eggert-bcp45bis_benjamin-kaduk)

A.2. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-07](#)

- * incorporated suggestions from Adrian Farrel
(https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/last-call/bt79VpEeM4iAiFVD5vtxHAa_kdc)
- * incorporated some suggestions from S Moonesamy
(<https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/last-call/xQoWLovElvnS80ZPgHquAwJs3Mw>)
- * applied suggestions from Robert Wilton
(<https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/last-call/qCC0p5Yow7A0QLo8T3862jPl4i0>)

A.3. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-06](#)

- * applied a suggestion from Lloyd Wood
(<https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/ietf/jVF496BFjekl9eVx1q9sqDIqOCs>) to add access dates to cited URLs
- * fixes to this change log
- * applied a suggestion from Brian Carpenter to change "unprofessional" to "uncivil"

A.4. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-05](#)

- * clarification of list scope as suggested by Brian Carpenter
(<https://github.com/larseggert/bcp45bis/pull/10>)

A.5. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-04](#)

- * use [RFC2026](#) appeals process
(<https://github.com/larseggert/bcp45bis/pull/7>)
- * addressed comments from Barry Leiba
(<https://github.com/larseggert/bcp45bis/pull/6>)
- * quote cited text from Wikipedia

A.6. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-03](#)

- * addressed Robert Wilton's AD review (<https://github.com/larseggert/bcp45bis/pull/5>)

A.7. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-02](#)

- * additional details about and guidelines for the SAA team, based on a suggestion from Dhruv Dhody (<https://github.com/larseggert/bcp45bis/pull/1>)
- * remove reference to the IETF 110 attendees list, since those lists are being removed by the secretariat shortly after each meeting

A.8. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-01](#)

- * applied a suggestion from Brian Carpenter (https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/gendispatch/-U2LWKf0VonKnQXs4jPEqIg_L_A)
- * rephrased beginning of [Section 2](#), as suggested by Stephen Farrell (<https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/gendispatch/p73lu-D-WvQrbKBZ80c2T7bbBlQ/>)
- * incorporated a suggestion from Christian Huitema (<https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/gendispatch/64LgqlIk0h62mAK09Muqn1ccqRE/>)

A.9. Since [draft-eggert-bcp45bis-00](#)

- * added introduction, security considerations and IANA considerations sections
- * added "note to readers" with pointers to the discussion list and the repo
- * added references to IETF Sergeants-at-Arms procedures
- * added references to various mailing lists for topics that used to be in scope for the IETF discussion list but no longer are
- * added references to the Note Well and relevant other policies that apply

A.10. Since [RFC3005](#)

- * converted to Markdown and xml2rfc v3

- * updated references (as part of the conversion)
- * updated author information
- * various formatting changes

Acknowledgements

The following people have made contributions to this document:

- * Adrian Farrel
- * Barry Leiba
- * Ben Kaduk
- * Brian Carpenter
- * Carsten Bormann
- * Christian Huitema
- * Dhruv Dhody
- * Eric Rescorla
- * Eric Vyncke
- * Francesca Palombini
- * John Scudder
- * Lloyd Wood
- * Martin Thomson
- * Robert Wilton
- * S Moonesamy

* Stephen Farrell

Susan R. Harris authored [[RFC3005](#)], which this document replaces.

Author's Address

Eggert

Expires 28 August 2022

[Page 10]

Internet-Draft

IETF Discussion List Charter

February 2022

Lars Eggert
NetApp
Stenbergintie 12 B
FI-02700 Kauniainen
Finland
Email: lars@eggert.org
URI: <https://eggert.org/>

