

Network Working Group  
Internet-Draft  
Updates: [8006](#), [8008](#), [9241](#) (if approved)  
Intended status: Standards Track  
Expires: 9 February 2023

N. Sopher  
Qwilt  
S. Mishra  
Verizon  
8 August 2022

Content Delivery Network Interconnection (CDNI) Footprint Types:  
Subdivision Code and Union  
draft-ietf-cdni-additional-footprint-types-02

## Abstract

Open Caching architecture is a use case of Content Delivery Networks Interconnection (CDNI) in which the commercial Content Delivery Network (CDN) is the upstream CDN (uCDN) and the ISP caching layer serves as the downstream CDN (dCDN). This document supplements the CDNI Metadata Footprint Types defined in [RFC 8006](#). The Footprint Types defined in this document can be used for Footprint objects as part of the Metadata interface (MI) defined in [RFC 8006](#) or the Footprint & Capabilities Advertisement interface (FCI) defined in [RFC 8008](#). The document also updates [RFC 9241](#) with relevant ALTO entity domain types. The defined Footprint Types are derived from requirements raised by Open Caching but are also applicable to CDNI use cases in general.

## Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on 9 February 2023.

## Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2022 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

---

Internet-Draft Content Delivery Network Interconnection August 2022

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Revised BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the [Trust Legal Provisions](#) and are provided without warranty as described in the Revised BSD License.

## Table of Contents

<a href="#">1.</a>	Introduction . . . . .	<a href="#">2</a>
<a href="#">1.1.</a>	Terminology . . . . .	<a href="#">3</a>
<a href="#">2.</a>	CDNI Metadata Additional Footprint Types . . . . .	<a href="#">3</a>
<a href="#">2.1.</a>	CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Footprint Type . . . . .	<a href="#">3</a>
<a href="#">2.1.1.</a>	CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Data Type . . . . .	<a href="#">4</a>
<a href="#">2.1.1.1.</a>	CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Data Type Description . . . . .	<a href="#">4</a>
<a href="#">2.1.2.</a>	CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Footprint Type Description . . . . .	<a href="#">4</a>
<a href="#">2.2.</a>	CDNI Metadata FootprintUnion Footprint Type . . . . .	<a href="#">5</a>
<a href="#">2.2.1.</a>	CDNI Metadata FootprintUnion Data Type . . . . .	<a href="#">6</a>
<a href="#">2.2.2.</a>	CDNI Metadata FootprintUnion Footprint Type Description . . . . .	<a href="#">6</a>
<a href="#">3.</a>	ALTO Property Map Service Entity . . . . .	<a href="#">8</a>
<a href="#">3.1.</a>	SUBDIVISIONCODE Domain . . . . .	<a href="#">8</a>
<a href="#">3.1.1.</a>	Entity Domain Type . . . . .	<a href="#">8</a>
<a href="#">3.1.1.1.</a>	Domain-Specific Entity Identifiers . . . . .	<a href="#">9</a>
<a href="#">4.</a>	IANA Considerations . . . . .	<a href="#">9</a>
<a href="#">4.1.</a>	CDNI Metadata Footprint Types . . . . .	<a href="#">9</a>
<a href="#">4.2.</a>	ALTO Entity Domain Types . . . . .	<a href="#">9</a>
<a href="#">5.</a>	Security Considerations . . . . .	<a href="#">10</a>
<a href="#">6.</a>	Acknowledgements . . . . .	<a href="#">10</a>
<a href="#">7.</a>	References . . . . .	<a href="#">10</a>
<a href="#">7.1.</a>	Normative References . . . . .	<a href="#">10</a>
<a href="#">7.2.</a>	Informative References . . . . .	<a href="#">11</a>
	Authors' Addresses . . . . .	<a href="#">12</a>

## [1.](#) Introduction

The Streaming Video Alliance [[SVA](#)] is a global association that works to solve streaming video challenges in an effort to improve end-user experience and adoption. The Open Caching Working Group [[OCWG](#)] of

the Streaming Video Alliance [[SVA](#)] is focused on the delegation of video delivery requests from commercial CDNs to a caching layer at the ISP's network. Open Caching architecture is a specific use case of CDNI where the commercial CDN is the upstream CDN (uCDN) and the ISP caching layer is the downstream CDN (dCDN). The Open Caching

Internet-Draft Content Delivery Network Interconnection August 2022

Request Routing Specification [[OC-RR](#)] defines the Request Routing process and the interfaces that are required for its provisioning. This document defines and registers CDNI Footprint and Capabilities objects [[RFC8008](#)] that are required for Open Caching Request Routing.

For consistency with other CDNI documents this document follows the CDNI convention of uCDN (upstream CDN) and dCDN (downstream CDN) to represent the commercial CDN and ISP caching layer respectively.

This document registers two CDNI Metadata Footprint Types ([section 7.2 of \[RFC8006\]](#)) for the defined objects:

- \* SubdivisionCode Footprint Type (e.g., for a dCDN advertising a footprint that is specific to a State in the USA)
- \* Collection Footprint Type (for a dCDN advertising a footprint that consists of a group built from multiple Footprints Types, e.g., both IPv4 and IPv6 client addresses)

## [1.1](#). Terminology

The following terms are used throughout this document:

- \* CDN - Content Delivery Network

Additionally, this document reuses the terminology defined in [[RFC6707](#)], [[RFC7336](#)], [[RFC8006](#)], and [[RFC8008](#)]. Specifically, we use the following CDNI acronyms:

- \* uCDN, dCDN - Upstream CDN and Downstream CDN respectively (see [[RFC7336](#)] )

## [2](#). CDNI Metadata Additional Footprint Types

[Section 5 of \[RFC8008\]](#) describes the FCI Capability Advertisement Object, which includes an array of CDNI Footprint Objects. Each such

object has a footprint-type and a footprint-value, as described in [section 4.2.2.2 of \[RFC8006\]](#). This document defines additional footprint types, beyond those mentioned in CDNI metadata [\[RFC8006\]](#).

## [2.1.](#) CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Footprint Type

[Section 4.3.8 of \[RFC8006\]](#) specifies the "Country Code" footprint type for listing [\[ISO3166-1\]](#) alpha-2 codes. Using Footprint Objects of this type, one can define an FCI Capability Advertisement Object footprint constraint that matches a specific country. Herein is define the subdivisioncode simple data type, as well as a footprint type allowing the dCDN to define constraints matching geographic

areas with better granularity, specifically using the [\[ISO3166-2\]](#) Country Subdivision codes.

### [2.1.1.](#) CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Data Type

The "SubdivisionCode" data type specified in [Section 2.1.1.1](#), describes a country specific subdivision using an [\[ISO3166-2\]](#) code. The data type is added to the list of data types described in [section 4.3 of \[RFC8006\]](#) that are used as properties of CDNI Metadata objects.

#### [2.1.1.1.](#) CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Data Type Description

An [\[ISO3166-2\]](#) code in lower case. Each code consists of two parts separated by a hyphen. The first part is the [\[ISO3166-1\]](#) code of the country. The second part is a string of up to three alphanumeric characters.

Type: String

Example SubdivisionCodes:

"ca-ns"

"us-ny"

#### [2.1.2.](#) CDNI Metadata SubdivisionCode Footprint Type Description

The "SubdivisionCode" simple data type specified in [Section 2.1.1](#), is

added to the data types listed as footprint types in [section 4.2.2.2 of \[RFC8006\]](#) .

Below is an example using a footprint object of type "SubdivisionCode". The Footprint Object in this example creates a constraint matching clients both in the Nova-Scotia province of Canada (ISO [\[ISO3166-2\]](#) code "CA-NS"), as well as in the state of New-York In the US (ISO [\[ISO3166-2\]](#) code "US-NY").

```
{
  "capabilities": [
    {
      "capability-type": <CDNI capability object type>,
      "capability-value": <CDNI capability object>,
      "footprints": [
        {
          "footprint-type": "subdivisioncode",
          "footprint-value": ["ca-ns", "us-ny"]
        }
      ]
    }
  ]
}
```

## [2.2.](#) CDNI Metadata FootprintUnion Footprint Type

As described in [section 5 of \[RFC8008\]](#), the FCI Capability Advertisement Object includes an array of CDNI Footprint Objects. [Appendix B of \[RFC8008\]](#) specifies the semantics of a Footprint Objects array as a multiple, additive, footprint constraints. This

implies that the advertisement of different footprint types narrows the dCDN's candidacy cumulatively.

Sections [4.3.5](#) and [4.3.6](#) of [\[RFC8006\]](#) specify the "IPv4CIDR" and "IPv6CIDR" footprint types, respectively, for listing IP address blocks. Using Footprint Objects of these types, one can define FCI Capability Advertisement Object footprint constraints that match IPv4 or IPv6 clients. However, the described "narrowing" semantic of the Footprint Objects array prevents the usage of these objects together to create a footprint constraint that matches IPv4 clients together with IPv6 clients.

Below is an example for an attempt at creating an object matching IPv4 clients of subnet "192.0.2.0/24", as well as IPv6 clients of subnet "2001:db8::/32". Such a definition results in an empty list of clients, as the constraints are additive and a client address cannot be both IPv4 and IPv6.

```
{
  "capabilities": [
    {
      "capability-type": <CDNI capability object type>,
      "capability-value": <CDNI capability object>,
      "footprints": [
        {
          "footprint-type": "ipv4cidr",
          "footprint-value": ["192.0.2.0/24"]
        },
        {
          "footprint-type": "ipv6cidr",
          "footprint-value": ["2001:db8::/32"]
        }
      ]
    }
  ]
}
```

```
}
]
}
```

To overcome the described limitation and allow a list of footprint constraints that match both IPv4 and IPv6 client addresses, below is introduced the "FootprintUnion" footprint type. This footprint type allows the collection of multiple footprint-objects into a unified object. It is useful for resolving the above limitation, as well as for unifying footprints of additional types such as countrycode and subdivisioncode.

### [2.2.1.](#) CDNI Metadata FootprintUnion Data Type

The "FootprintUnion" data type is based on the Footprint Object already defined in [section 4.2.2.2 of \[RFC8006\]](#). The footprint-value for a FootprintUnion object is an array of Footprint objects, where the Footprint objects may be of any Footprint Type other than FootprintUnion.

### [2.2.2.](#) CDNI Metadata FootprintUnion Footprint Type Description

The "footprintunion" data type specified in [Section 2.2.1](#), is added to the data types listed as footprint types in [section 4.2.2.2 of \[RFC8006\]](#).

Below is an example using a footprint object of type "footprintunion".

```
{
  "capabilities": [
    {
      "capability-type": <CDNI capability object type>,
      "capability-value": <CDNI capability object>,
      "footprints": [
        {
          "footprint-type": "footprintunion",
```

```
"footprint-value": [  
  {  
    "footprint-type": "ipv4cidr",  
    "footprint-value": ["192.0.2.0/24"]  
  },  
  {  
    "footprint-type": "ipv6cidr",  
    "footprint-value": ["2001:db8::/32"]  
  }  
]  
}  
]  
}
```

The footprint union also enables composing a countrycode and subdivisioncode based footprint objects. In the example below we create a constraint covering autonomous system 64496 within the US (ISO [[ISO3166-1](#)] alpha-2 code "US") and the Nova-Scotia province of Canada (ISO [[ISO3166-2](#)] code "CA-NS").



```

"capabilities": [
  {
    "capability-type": <CDNI capability object type>,
    "capability-value": <CDNI capability object>,
    "footprints": [
      {
        "footprint-type": "asn",
        "footprint-value": ["as64496"]
      },
      {
        "footprint-type": "footprintunion",
        "footprint-value": [
          {
            "footprint-type": "countrycode",
            "footprint-value": ["us"]
          },
          {
            "footprint-type": "subdivisioncode",
            "footprint-value": ["ca-ns"]
          }
        ]
      }
    ]
  }
]
}

```

### [3.](#) ALTO Property Map Service Entity

[Section 6 of \[RFC9241\]](#) describes how to represent footprint objects as entities in the ALTO property map. The approach is to represent the "footprint-type" as an entity domain type of the ALTO entity, and the footprint value as its domain-specific identifier. [\[RFC9241\]](#) further refers to the representation of footprint objects of types "asn" and "countrycode". Here we extend this definition to the "subdivisioncode" footprint-type.

#### [3.1.](#) SUBDIVISIONCODE Domain

The SUBDIVISIONCODE domain associates property values that defines codes for the names of the principal subdivisions.

##### [3.1.1.](#) Entity Domain Type

The entity domain type of the SUBDIVISIONCODE domain is "subdivisioncode" (in lowercase).

### [3.1.1.1](#). Domain-Specific Entity Identifiers

The entity identifier of an entity in a SUBDIVISIONCODE is encoded as an alpha-2 [\[ISO3166-1\]](#) Country Code, followed by a separator and up to three alphanumeric characters.

## 4. IANA Considerations

### [4.1](#). CDNI Metadata Footprint Types

[Section 7.2 of \[RFC8006\]](#) creates the "CDNI Metadata Footprint Types" subregistry within the "Content Delivery Network Interconnection (CDNI) Parameters" registry.

This document requests the registration of the two additional Footprint Types as defined in [Section 2.2](#) and [Section 2.1](#) :

Footprint Type	Description	Specification
FCI.subdivisioncode	<a href="#">[ISO3166-2]</a> Subdivision Code: An alpha-2 <a href="#">[ISO3166-1]</a> Country Code, followed by a separator and up to three alphanumeric characters.	RFCthis
FCI.footprintunion	A combination of other Footprint Objects	RFCthis

Table 1

[RFC Editor: Please replace RFCthis with the published RFC number for this document.]

### [4.2](#). ALTO Entity Domain Types

[Section 12.3 of \[RFC9240\]](#) creates the "ALTO Entity Domain Types" registry.

This document requests the registration of an additional ALTO Entity Domain Types:

---

Internet-Draft Content Delivery Network Interconnection August 2022

Identifier	Entity Identifier Encoding	Hierarchy and Inheritance	Media Type of Defining Resource	Mapping to ALTO Address Type
subdivisioncode	See RFCthis, Section 3.1.1.1	None	None	false

Table 2

[RFC Editor: Please replace RFCthis with the published RFC number for this document.]

## 5. Security Considerations

This specification is in accordance with the CDNI Metadata and the CDNI Request Routing: Footprint and Capabilities Semantics. As such, it is subject to the security and privacy considerations as defined in [Section 8 of \[RFC8006\]](#) and in [Section 7 of \[RFC8008\]](#) respectively. More specifically, the use of "SubdivisionCode" footprint type, introduces a higher level of granularity into the published dCDN Footprint. Therefore, to meet confidentiality requirements, the use of transport-layer security mechanisms as specified in [Section 7 of \[RFC8008\]](#) is required.

## 6. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to express their gratitude to Ori Finkelman and Kevin J. Ma for their guidance and reviews throughout the development of this document.

## 7. References

### 7.1. Normative References

[IS03166-1]

ISO, "Codes for the representation of names of countries and their subdivisions -- Part 1: Country code", ISO 3166-1:2020, Edition 4, August 2020, <<https://www.iso.org/standard/72482.html>>.

[IS03166-2]

ISO, "Codes for the representation of names of countries and their subdivisions -- Part 2: Country subdivision code", ISO 3166-2:2020, Edition 4, August 2020, <<https://www.iso.org/standard/72483.html>>.

[RFC8006] Niven-Jenkins, B., Murray, R., Caulfield, M., and K. Ma, "Content Delivery Network Interconnection (CDNI) Metadata", [RFC 8006](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8006, December 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8006>>.

[RFC8008] Seedorf, J., Peterson, J., Previdi, S., van Brandenburg, R., and K. Ma, "Content Delivery Network Interconnection (CDNI) Request Routing: Footprint and Capabilities Semantics", [RFC 8008](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8008, December 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8008>>.

[RFC9240] Roome, W., Randriamasy, S., Yang, Y., Zhang, J., and K. Gao, "An Extension for Application-Layer Traffic Optimization (ALTO): Entity Property Maps", [RFC 9240](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC9240, July 2022, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc9240>>.

[RFC9241] Seedorf, J., Yang, Y., Ma, K., Peterson, J., and J. Zhang, "Content Delivery Network Interconnection (CDNI) Footprint and Capabilities Advertisement Using Application-Layer Traffic Optimization (ALTO)", [RFC 9241](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC9241, July 2022, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc9241>>.

## [7.2.](#) Informative References

- [OC-RR] Finkelman, O., Ed., Hofmann, J., Klein, E., Mishra, S., Ma, K., Sahar, D., and B. Zurat, "Open Caching - Request Routing Functional Specification", Version 1.1, 4 October 2019, <<https://www.streamingvideoalliance.org/books/open-cache-request-routing-functional-specification/>>.
- [OCWG] "Open Caching Home Page", <<https://www.streamingvideoalliance.org/technical-groups/open-caching/>>.
- [RFC6707] Niven-Jenkins, B., Le Faucheur, F., and N. Bitar, "Content Distribution Network Interconnection (CDNI) Problem Statement", [RFC 6707](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6707, September 2012, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6707>>.

Sopher & Mishra

Expires 9 February 2023

[Page 11]

---

Internet-Draft Content Delivery Network Interconnection August 2022

- [RFC7336] Peterson, L., Davie, B., and R. van Brandenburg, Ed., "Framework for Content Distribution Network Interconnection (CDNI)", [RFC 7336](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7336, August 2014, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7336>>.
- [SVA] "Streaming Video Alliance Home Page", <<https://www.streamingvideoalliance.org>>.

#### Authors' Addresses

Nir B. Sopher  
Qwilt  
6, Ha'harash  
Hod HaSharon  
4524079  
Israel  
Email: nir@apache.org

Sanjay Mishra  
Verizon  
13100 Columbia Pike  
Silver Spring, MD 20904  
United States of America  
Email: sanjay.mishra@verizon.com

