

Forwarding and Control Element	R. Haas	
Separation (forces)	IBM	
Internet-Draft	September 10, 2008	
Intended status: Standards Track		
Expires: March 14, 2009		

[TOC](#)

## ForCES MIB

### draft-ietf-forces-mib-10

#### Status of this Memo

By submitting this Internet-Draft, each author represents that any applicable patent or other IPR claims of which he or she is aware have been or will be disclosed, and any of which he or she becomes aware will be disclosed, in accordance with Section 6 of BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/ietf/1id-abstracts.txt>.

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html>.

This Internet-Draft will expire on March 14, 2009.

#### Abstract

This memo defines a Management Information Base (MIB) module for use with network management protocols in the Internet community. In particular, it defines managed objects for the Forwarding and Control Element Separation (ForCES) Network Element (NE).

---

#### Table of Contents

- [1.](#) Requirements notation
- [2.](#) The Internet-Standard Management Framework
- [3.](#) Introduction

- [4. ForCES MIB Overview](#)
  - [5. ForCES MIB Definition](#)
  - [6. Associations kept in the MIB](#)
  - [7. Support for multiple CEs and FEs](#)
  - [8. Security Considerations](#)
  - [9. IANA Considerations](#)
  - [10. Changes from Previous Draft Revisions](#)
  - [11. References](#)
    - [11.1. Normative References](#)
    - [11.2. Informative References](#)
  - [Appendix A. Acknowledgments](#)
  - [§ Author's Address](#)
  - [§ Intellectual Property and Copyright Statements](#)
- 

## 1. Requirements notation

[TOC](#)

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [\[RFC2119\] \(Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels," March 1997.\)](#).

---

## 2. The Internet-Standard Management Framework

[TOC](#)

For a detailed overview of the documents that describe the current Internet-Standard Management Framework, please refer to section 7 of [\[RFC3410\] \(Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D., and B. Stewart, "Introduction and Applicability Statements for Internet-Standard Management Framework," December 2002.\)](#).

Managed objects are accessed via a virtual information store, termed the Management Information Base or MIB. MIB objects are generally accessed through the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP). Objects in the MIB are defined using the mechanisms defined in the Structure of Management Information (SMI). This memo specifies a MIB module that is compliant to the SMIV2, which is described in STD 58, [\[RFC2578\] \(McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Structure of Management Information Version 2 \(SMIV2\)," April 1999.\)](#), STD 58, [\[RFC2579\] \(McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Textual Conventions for SMIV2," April 1999.\)](#) and STD 58, [\[RFC2580\] \(McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D., and J. Schoenwaelder, "Conformance Statements for SMIV2," April 1999.\)](#).

---

### 3. Introduction

[TOC](#)

The ForCES MIB module is a read-only MIB module that captures information related to the ForCES protocol ([\[RFC3654\] \(Khosravi, H. and T. Anderson, "Requirements for Separation of IP Control and Forwarding," November 2003.\)](#), [\[RFC3746\] \(Yang, L., Dantu, R., Anderson, T., and R. Gopal, "Forwarding and Control Element Separation \(ForCES\) Framework," April 2004.\)](#), [\[forces-applicability-draft\] \(Crouch, A., Khosravi, H., Handley, M., and A. Doria, "ForCES Applicability Statement," July 2006.\)](#) and [\[forces-protocol-draft\] \(Doria, A., Haas, R., Hadi Salim, J., Khosravi, H., and W. Wang, "ForCES Protocol Specification," August 2008.\)](#)).

The ForCES MIB module does not include information that is specified in other MIB modules, such as packet counters for interfaces, etc. More specifically, the information in the ForCES MIB module relative to associations (between Control Elements and Forwarding Elements) that are in the UP state includes:

- \*identifiers of the elements in the association,
- \*configuration parameters of the association, and
- \*statistics of the association.

---

### 4. ForCES MIB Overview

[TOC](#)

The MIB module contains the latest ForCES protocol version supported by the Control Element (CE) (`forcesLatestProtocolVersionSupported`). Note that the CE must also allow interaction with Forwarding Elements (FEs) supporting earlier versions.

For each association identified by the pair CE ID and FE ID, the following associated information is provided by the MIB module as an entry (`forcesAssociationEntry`) in the association table (`forcesAssociationTable`):

- \*Version number of the ForCES protocol running in this association (`forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion`).
- \*Time when the association entered the UP state (`forcesAssociationTimeUp`).
- \*Time when the association left the UP state (`forcesAssociationTimeDown`). Note that this is only used for notification purposes as the association is removed from the MIB immediately after it leaves the UP state.

\*Number of ForCES Heartbeat messages sent from the CE (forcesAssociationHBMsgSent) and received by the CE (forcesAssociationHBMsgReceived) since the association entered the UP state.

\*Number of operational ForCES messages sent from the CE (forcesAssociationOperMsgSent) and received by the CE (forcesAssociationOperMsgReceived) since the association entered the UP state. Only messages other than Heartbeat, Association Setup, Association Setup Response, and Association Teardown are counted.

Finally, the MIB module defines the following notifications:

\*Whenever an association enters the UP state, a notification (forcesAssociationEntryUp) is issued containing the version of the ForCES protocol running. CE ID and FE ID are concatenated to form the table index, hence they appear in the OID of the ForCES-protocol running-version object. Optionally, a notification (forcesAssociationEntryUpStats) can instead be issued with all associated information for this association, except forcesAssociationTimeDown.

\*Whenever an association leaves the UP state, a notification (forcesAssociationEntryDown) is issued containing the version of the ForCES protocol running. Optionally, a notification (forcesAssociationEntryDownStats) can instead be issued with all associated information for this association. The reason is that the association and all its associated information will be removed from the MIB immediately after this notification has been issued.

```

FORCES-MIB DEFINITIONS ::= BEGIN

IMPORTS
    MODULE-IDENTITY, OBJECT-TYPE, NOTIFICATION-TYPE,
        mib-2, Integer32
    FROM SNMPv2-SMI

    TEXTUAL-CONVENTION, TimeStamp
    FROM SNMPv2-TC

    MODULE-COMPLIANCE, OBJECT-GROUP,
    NOTIFICATION-GROUP
    FROM SNMPv2-CONF

    ZeroBasedCounter32
    FROM RMON2-MIB;

forcesMib MODULE-IDENTITY
    LAST-UPDATED "200809101200Z" -- Sep 10, 2008
    ORGANIZATION "IETF Forwarding and Control Element
        Separation (ForCES) Working Group"
    CONTACT-INFO
        "WG Charter:
        http://www.ietf.org/html.charters/forces-charter.html

        Mailing lists:
        General Discussion: forces@peach.ease.lsoft.com
        To Subscribe: listserv@peach.ease.lsoft.com
        In Body: subscribe forces

        Chairs: Patrick Droz
        Email: dro@zurich.ibm.com
        Jamal Hadi Salim
        Email: hadi@znyx.com

        Editor: Robert Haas
        IBM
        Email: rha@zurich.ibm.com"

DESCRIPTION
    "This MIB module contains managed object definitions
    for the ForCES Protocol.
    Copyright (C) The Internet Trust (2008). This
    version of this MIB module is part of RFC yyyy; see
    the RFC itself for full legal notices."
-- RFC Ed.: replace yyyy with actual RFC number & remove this note
REVISION "200809101200Z" -- Sep 10, 2008
DESCRIPTION
    "Initial version, published as RFC yyyy."
-- RFC Ed.: replace yyyy with actual RFC number & remove this note

```

```

        ::= { mib-2 XXX }
-- RFC Ed.: replace XXX with IANA-assigned number & remove this note

_*****

forcesMibNotifications OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { forcesMib 0 }
forcesMibObjects        OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { forcesMib 1 }
forcesMibConformance   OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { forcesMib 2 }

ForcesID ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
    STATUS      current
    DESCRIPTION
        "The ForCES identifier is a four octet quantity."
    SYNTAX      OCTET STRING (SIZE (4))

ForcesProtocolVersion ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
    DISPLAY-HINT "d"
    STATUS      current
    DESCRIPTION
        "ForCES protocol version number.
        The version numbers used are defined in the
        specifications of the respective protocol:
        1 - ForCESv1 [RFCzzzz]."
```

-- RFC Ed.: replace zzzz with actual RFC number of ForCES protocol  
-- & remove this note

```

    SYNTAX      Integer32 (1..255)

-- Notifications

forcesAssociationEntryUp NOTIFICATION-TYPE
    OBJECTS      {
        forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion
    }
    STATUS      current
    DESCRIPTION
        "This notification is generated as soon
        as an association enters the UP state.
        Note that these notifications are not
        throttled as the CE itself should
        throttle the setup of associations."
    ::= { forcesMibNotifications 1 }

forcesAssociationEntryDown NOTIFICATION-TYPE
    OBJECTS      {
        forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion
    }
    STATUS      current
    DESCRIPTION
```

```
        "This notification is generated as soon
        as an association leaves the UP state.
        Note that these notifications are not
        throttled as the CE itself should
        throttle the setup of associations."
 ::= { forcesMibNotifications 2 }
```

```
forcesAssociationEntryUpStats NOTIFICATION-TYPE
OBJECTS      {
    forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion,
    forcesAssociationTimeUp
}
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
    "This notification is generated as soon
    as an association enters the UP state.
    Note that these notifications are not
    throttled as the CE itself should
    throttle the setup of associations."
 ::= { forcesMibNotifications 3 }
```

```
forcesAssociationEntryDownStats NOTIFICATION-TYPE
OBJECTS      {
    forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion,
    forcesAssociationTimeUp,
    forcesAssociationTimeDown,
    forcesAssociationHBMsgSent,
    forcesAssociationHBMsgReceived,
    forcesAssociationOperMsgSent,
    forcesAssociationOperMsgReceived,
    forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime
}
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
    "This notification is generated as soon
    as an association leaves the UP state.
    Note that these notifications are not
    throttled as the CE itself should
    throttle the setup of associations."
 ::= { forcesMibNotifications 4 }
```

```
-- Objects
```

```
forcesLatestProtocolVersionSupported OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX      ForcesProtocolVersion
MAX-ACCESS  read-only
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
    "The ForCES protocol version supported by the CE.
```

The current protocol version is 1.  
Note that the CE must also allow interaction  
with FEs supporting earlier versions."  
 ::= { forcesMibObjects 1 }

forcesAssociations OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { forcesMibObjects 2 }

forcesAssociationTable OBJECT-TYPE  
SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF ForcesAssociationEntry  
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
"The (conceptual) table of associations."  
 ::= { forcesAssociations 1 }

forcesAssociationEntry OBJECT-TYPE  
SYNTAX ForcesAssociationEntry  
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
"A (conceptual) entry for one association."  
INDEX { forcesAssociationCEID, forcesAssociationFEID }  
 ::= { forcesAssociationTable 1 }

ForcesAssociationEntry ::= SEQUENCE {  
    forcesAssociationCEID                ForcesID,  
    forcesAssociationFEID                ForcesID,  
  
    forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion  
  ForcesProtocolVersion,  
  
    forcesAssociationTimeUp              TimeStamp,  
    forcesAssociationTimeDown            TimeStamp,  
  
    forcesAssociationHBMsgSent           ZeroBasedCounter32,  
    forcesAssociationHBMsgReceived       ZeroBasedCounter32,  
    forcesAssociationOperMsgSent         ZeroBasedCounter32,  
    forcesAssociationOperMsgReceived     ZeroBasedCounter32,  
    forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime  TimeStamp  
}

forcesAssociationCEID OBJECT-TYPE  
SYNTAX ForcesID  
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
"The ForCES ID of the CE."  
 ::= { forcesAssociationEntry 1 }

forcesAssociationFEID OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX ForcesID  
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
    "The ForCES ID of the FE."  
 ::= { forcesAssociationEntry 2 }

forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion OBJECT-TYPE  
SYNTAX ForcesProtocolVersion  
MAX-ACCESS read-only  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
    "The current ForCES protocol version used in this  
    association.  
    The current protocol version is 1."  
 ::= { forcesAssociationEntry 3 }

forcesAssociationTimeUp OBJECT-TYPE  
SYNTAX TimeStamp  
MAX-ACCESS read-only  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
    "The value of sysUpTime at the time this  
    association entered the UP state.  
    If this association started prior to the last  
    initialization of the network subsystem, then  
    this object contains a zero value.  
    This object allows to uniquely identify  
    associations with the same CE and FE IDs."  
 ::= { forcesAssociationEntry 4 }

forcesAssociationTimeDown OBJECT-TYPE  
SYNTAX TimeStamp  
MAX-ACCESS accessible-for-notify  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
    "The value of sysUpTime at the time this  
    association left the UP state."  
 ::= { forcesAssociationEntry 5 }

forcesAssociationHBMsgSent OBJECT-TYPE  
SYNTAX ZeroBasedCounter32  
MAX-ACCESS read-only  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION  
    "A counter of how many heartbeat messages have  
    been sent by the CE on this association  
    since the association entered the UP state.  
    Discontinuities in the value of this counter

can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime."  
 ::= { forcesAssociationEntry 6 }

forcesAssociationHBMsgReceived OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX ZeroBasedCounter32

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"A counter of how many heartbeat messages have been received by the CE on this association since the association entered the UP state. Discontinuities in the value of this counter can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime."

::= { forcesAssociationEntry 7 }

forcesAssociationOperMsgSent OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX ZeroBasedCounter32

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"A counter of how many messages other than heartbeat (i.e., config and query) have been sent by the CE on this association since the association entered the UP state. Discontinuities in the value of this counter can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime."

::= { forcesAssociationEntry 8 }

forcesAssociationOperMsgReceived OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX ZeroBasedCounter32

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"A counter of how many messages other than heartbeat (i.e., config response, query response, event notification, and packet redirect) have been received by the CE on this association since the association entered the UP state. Discontinuities in the value of this counter can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime."

::= { forcesAssociationEntry 9 }

```

forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX TimeStamp
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
        "The value of sysUpTime on the most recent occasion
        at which any one or more of this association's
        counters suffered a discontinuity. The relevant
        counters are the specific instances associated with
        this association of any ZeroBasedCounter32 object
        contained in the forcesAssociationTable. If no
        such discontinuities have occurred since the last
        reinitialization of the local management subsystem,
        then this object contains a zero value."
    ::= { forcesAssociationEntry 10 }

-- Conformance

forcesMibCompliances OBJECT IDENTIFIER
    ::= { forcesMibConformance 1 }
forcesMibGroups OBJECT IDENTIFIER
    ::= { forcesMibConformance 2 }

-- Compliance statements

forcesMibCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
        "The compliance statement for routers running ForCES and
        implementing the ForCES MIB."
    MODULE -- this module
        MANDATORY-GROUPS { forcesMibGroup, forcesNotificationGroup }

        GROUP forcesNotificationStatsGroup
        DESCRIPTION
            "Implementation of this group is recommended."

        GROUP forcesStatsGroup
        DESCRIPTION
            "Implementation of this group is recommended."

    ::= { forcesMibCompliances 1 }

-- Units of conformance

forcesNotificationGroup NOTIFICATION-GROUP

```

```
NOTIFICATIONS { forcesAssociationEntryUp,
                forcesAssociationEntryDown
              }
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
```

```
"A collection of notifications for signaling important
ForCES events."
```

```
::= { forcesMibGroups 1 }
```

```
forcesMibGroup OBJECT-GROUP
```

```
OBJECTS { forcesLatestProtocolVersionSupported,
          forcesAssociationRunningProtocolVersion
        }
```

```
STATUS current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
```

```
"A collection of objects to support management of ForCES
routers."
```

```
::= { forcesMibGroups 2 }
```

```
forcesNotificationStatsGroup NOTIFICATION-GROUP
```

```
NOTIFICATIONS { forcesAssociationEntryUpStats,
                forcesAssociationEntryDownStats
              }
```

```
STATUS current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
```

```
"A collection of optional notifications for signaling
important ForCES events including statistics."
```

```
::= { forcesMibGroups 3 }
```

```
forcesStatsGroup OBJECT-GROUP
```

```
OBJECTS { forcesAssociationTimeUp,
          forcesAssociationTimeDown,
          forcesAssociationHBMsgSent,
          forcesAssociationHBMsgReceived,
          forcesAssociationOperMsgSent,
          forcesAssociationOperMsgReceived,
          forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime
        }
```

```
STATUS current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
```

```
"A collection of optional objects to provide extra
information about the associations. There is no protocol
reason to keep such information, but these objects can
be very useful in debugging connectivity problems."
```

```
::= { forcesMibGroups 4 }
```

END

---

## 6. Associations kept in the MIB

[TOC](#)

Associations enter the UP state as soon as the CE has sent to the FE an Association Setup Response message containing a successful Association Setup Result. Only associations that are UP are reflected in this MIB module.

Associations are removed from the MIB module as soon as they leave the UP state, i.e., if the CE has not received any message (Heartbeat or other protocol message) from the FE within a given time period or if an Association Teardown message has been sent by the CE.

Statistics counters are initialized to zero when the association is created. If the same association goes down and comes back up, the counters will reset and the discontinuity can be discovered by checking the discontinuity timestamp. In addition, the time-up timestamp in the association allows to distinguish new associations from past ones with the same index. Note that the optional down notification contains the statistics with the final values of the statistics counters.

---

## 7. Support for multiple CEs and FEs

[TOC](#)

An NE consists of one or more FEs and one or more CEs. Where there is a single CE, that CE will have knowledge of all the associations in the NE and so can provide the information necessary to support the managed objects defined in this MIB module. Where there is more than one CE, information about the associations may be distributed among the CEs. Whether each CE implements the managed objects for the associations of which it is aware or whether the CEs cooperate to present the appearance of a single set of managed objects for all the associations in the NE is outside the scope of this document.

---

## 8. Security Considerations

[TOC](#)

There are no management objects defined in this MIB module that have a MAX-ACCESS clause of read-write and/or read-create. So, if this MIB module is implemented correctly, then there is no risk that an intruder can alter or create any management objects of this MIB module via direct SNMP SET operations.

Some of the readable objects in this MIB module (i.e., objects with a MAX-ACCESS other than not-accessible) may be considered sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments. It is thus important to control even GET and/or NOTIFY access to these objects and possibly to even encrypt the values of these objects when sending them over the network via SNMP. These are the tables and objects and their sensitivity/vulnerability:

\*Objects in the forcesMibGroup are protocol versions. They are neither sensitive nor vulnerable.

\*Objects in the forcesStatsGroup are statistics. They are neither sensitive nor vulnerable.

SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 did not include adequate security. Even if the network itself is secure (for example by using IPsec), even then, there is no control as to who on the secure network is allowed to access and GET/SET (read/change/create/delete) the objects in this MIB module.

It is RECOMMENDED that implementers consider the security features as provided by the SNMPv3 framework (see [\[RFC3410\] \(Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D., and B. Stewart, "Introduction and Applicability Statements for Internet-Standard Management Framework," December 2002.\)](#), section 8), including full support for the SNMPv3 cryptographic mechanisms (for authentication and privacy).

Further, deployment of SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 is NOT RECOMMENDED. Instead, it is RECOMMENDED to deploy SNMPv3 and to enable cryptographic security. It is then a customer/operator responsibility to ensure that the SNMP entity giving access to an instance of this MIB module is properly configured to give access to the objects only to those principals (users) that have legitimate rights to indeed GET or SET (change/create/delete) them.

---

## 9. IANA Considerations

[TOC](#)

The MIB module in this document uses the following IANA-assigned OBJECT IDENTIFIER values recorded in the SMI Numbers registry:

Descriptor	OBJECT IDENTIFIER value
-----	-----
forcesMIB	{ mib-2 XXX }

Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): the IANA is requested to assign a value for "XXX" under the 'mib-2' subtree and to record the assignment in the SMI Numbers registry. When the assignment

has been made, the RFC Editor is asked to replace "XXX" (here and in the MIB module) with the assigned value and to remove this note.

---

## 10. Changes from Previous Draft Revisions

[TOC](#)

Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Prior to RFC publication of this document, the RFC Editor is asked to remove this entire section titled "Changes from Previous Draft Versions".  
Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-09: Moved the DISPLAY-HINT clause in the ForcesProtocolVersion MIB object before the STATUS clause to be conformant with RFC2579 (comment from Bert).  
Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-08:

- \*Changed the MIB objects forcesAssociationOtherMsgSent and forcesAssociationOtherMsgReceived to forcesAssociationOperMsgSent and forcesAssociationOperMsgReceived as they are not all other messages besides HB (comment from the General Area Review Team).

- \*Changed MIB counter objects forcesAssociationHBMsgSent, forcesAssociationHBMsgReceived, forcesAssociationOperMsgSent, and forcesAssociationOperMsgReceived from Counter32 to ZeroBasedCounter32 (comment from Bert Wijnen). Adapted the paragraph about statistics counters in section "Associations kept in the MIB"

- \*Introduced a MIB object forcesAssociationCounterDiscontinuityTime, and added it to the forcesAssociationEntry as well as to the forcesAssociationEntryDownStats notification and the forcesStatsGroup compliance group. Added text on discontinuity for all counter objects.

- \*Removed MIB counters from the forcesAssociationEntryUpStats notification, as passing now zero values is useless.

Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-07: They are editorial changes made as suggested by the General Area Review Team.

Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-06:

- \*Informational RFCs 3654 and 3746 moved to Informative References section.

- \*Updated chairs' names in the MIB description.

- \*Update references to protocol and applicability drafts.

\*Reversed the order of the two first sentences in section "Associations kept in the MIB"

Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-05: Copyright statement in the MIB description corrected to IETF Trust.

Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-04. They are changes suggested by the MIB doctor review, according to the MIB Review Checklist in Appendix A of RFC 4181:

\*Changed MIB descriptions with "since the association entered the UP state" instead of "since the association is up".

\*Updated the I-D boilerplate copyright statement.

\*Removed last sentence of abstract.

\*Moved the MIB boilerplate into a section of its own.

\*Moved the MIB definition into a section of its own.

\*Updated the Security Considerations section according to the boilerplate at <http://www.ops.ietf.org/mib-security.html>.

\*Updated the MIB description with the copyright statement.

\*Added DISPLAY-HINT to the ForCESProtocolVersion. Note that the smilint tool doesn't like it.

\*Added IETF to the MODULE-IDENTITY ORGANIZATION.

\*Updated CONTACT-INFO to indicate how to reach the group.

\*Changed forcesAssociationTimeDown MAX-ACCESS to accessible-for-notify.

\*Added text to DESCRIPTION of forcesAssociationTimeUp to indicate that it allows to uniquely identify associations with the same FE and CE IDs.

\*Added two optional notifications that carry stats and added corresponding text in the last paragraph of section titled "Associations kept in the MIB". The reason is that optional objects such as stats in a mandatory notification are not supported.

Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-03. They are small fixes to the text and the MIB module:

\*Added MIB boilerplate according to <http://www.ops.ietf.org/mib-boilerplate.html>

\*Clarified terminology with respect to MIB module and MIB managed objects.

\*Added RFC Editor note to indicate RFC number for version 1 of ForCES protocol under ForcesProtocolVersion.

\*Renumbered elements in forcesAssociationEntry starting with 1.

\*Changed ForcesProtocolVersion from INTEGER to Integer32.

\*Added forcesLatestProtocolVersionSupported into the mandatory forcesMibGroups conformance group.

\*Explicitely added the forcesStatsGroup to the forcesMibCompliance compliance statement as optional.

\*Moved the MIB Definition section to the front.

\*Rephrased IANA Considerations section according to RFC 4181 Section 3.5.2.

\*Added RFC Editor note to remove the "Changes from Previous Draft Revisions" section prior to publication.

Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-02. They are refinements of the MIB module:

\*Changed forcesAssociationCEID and forcesAssociationFEID from read-only to not-accessible to conform with Section 7.7 in [\[RFC2578\] \(McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Structure of Management Information Version 2 \(SMIV2\)," April 1999.\)](#).

\*Removed forcesAssociationCEID and forcesAssociationFEID from the notifications. This information is conveyed in the OID anyway.

\*Added MIB conformance information.

Changes from draft-ietf-forces-mib-01. The changes are in response to the Working Group Last Call:

\*Addition of two traps/notifications to signal the associations that enter or leave the UP state.

\*Suppression of the DOWN and ESTABLISHING states. Only associations in the UP state are kept in the table.

\*Split of the Message counters into Heartbeat and other messages.

\*Addition of the current running version of ForCES protocol for each association in the UP state.

\*Addition of the latest version of the ForCES protocol supported by the CE.

---

## 11. References

[TOC](#)

---

### 11.1. Normative References

[TOC](#)

[RFC2119]	<a href="#">Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels,"</a> BCP 14, RFC 2119, March 1997 ( <a href="#">TXT</a> , <a href="#">HTML</a> , <a href="#">XML</a> ).
[RFC2578]	<a href="#">McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Structure of Management Information Version 2 (SMIV2),"</a> STD 58, RFC 2578, April 1999 ( <a href="#">TXT</a> ).
[RFC2579]	<a href="#">McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Textual Conventions for SMIV2,"</a> STD 58, RFC 2579, April 1999 ( <a href="#">TXT</a> ).
[RFC2580]	<a href="#">McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D., and J. Schoenwaelder,</a> "Conformance Statements for SMIV2," STD 58, RFC 2580, April 1999 ( <a href="#">TXT</a> ).
[forces-protocol-draft]	Doria, A., Haas, R., Hadi Salim, J., Khosravi, H., and W. Wang, "ForCES Protocol Specification," ID Document: draft-ietf-forces-protocol-15.txt, August 2008.

---

### 11.2. Informative References

[TOC](#)

[RFC3410]	Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D., and B. Stewart, "Introduction and Applicability Statements for Internet-Standard Management Framework," RFC 3410, December 2002 ( <a href="#">TXT</a> ).
[RFC3654]	Khosravi, H. and T. Anderson, "Requirements for Separation of IP Control and Forwarding," RFC 3654, November 2003 ( <a href="#">TXT</a> ).
[RFC3746]	Yang, L., Dantu, R., Anderson, T., and R. Gopal, "Forwarding and Control Element Separation (ForCES) Framework," RFC 3746, April 2004 ( <a href="#">TXT</a> ).
	Crouch, A., Khosravi, H., Handley, M., and A. Doria, "ForCES Applicability Statement,"

[forces-  
applicability-  
draft]

ID Document: draft-ietf-forces-  
applicability-05.txt, July 2006.

---

## Appendix A. Acknowledgments

[TOC](#)

The author gratefully acknowledges the contributions of: Jinrong Fenggen, John Flick, Xiaoyi Guo, Joel Halpern, Tom Petch, and Jamal Hadi Salim.

---

## Author's Address

[TOC](#)

	Robert Haas
	IBM
	Saeumerstrasse 4
	Rueschlikon 8803
	CH
Email:	<a href="mailto:rha@zurich.ibm.com">rha@zurich.ibm.com</a>
URI:	<a href="http://www.zurich.ibm.com/~rha">http://www.zurich.ibm.com/~rha</a>

---

## Full Copyright Statement

[TOC](#)

Copyright © The IETF Trust (2008).

This document is subject to the rights, licenses and restrictions contained in BCP 78, and except as set forth therein, the authors retain all their rights.

This document and the information contained herein are provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE CONTRIBUTOR, THE ORGANIZATION HE/SHE REPRESENTS OR IS SPONSORED BY (IF ANY), THE INTERNET SOCIETY, THE IETF TRUST AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIM ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

## Intellectual Property

The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any Intellectual Property Rights or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; nor does it represent that it has made any independent effort to identify any such rights. Information on the

procedures with respect to rights in RFC documents can be found in BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Copies of IPR disclosures made to the IETF Secretariat and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementers or users of this specification can be obtained from the IETF on-line IPR repository at <http://www.ietf.org/ipr>.

The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights that may cover technology that may be required to implement this standard. Please address the information to the IETF at [ietf-ipr@ietf.org](mailto:ietf-ipr@ietf.org).