        Deprecation of BGP Path Attribute values 30, 31, 129, 241, 242, and 234
                     draft-ietf-idr-deprecate-30-31-129-01

Abstract

   This document requests IANA to mark BGP path attribute values 30, 31,
   129, 241, 242, and 243 as "deprecated".

Status of This Memo

   This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the
   provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

   Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering
   Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute
   working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-
   Drafts is at http://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/.

   Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months
   and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any
   time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference
   material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

   This Internet-Draft will expire on June 20, 2017.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

It has been discovered that certain BGP Path Attribute values have
been used in BGP implementations which have been deployed in the wild
while not being assigned by the IANA for such usage. Unregistered
usage of BGP Path Attribute values can lead to deployment problems
for new technologies.

The use of these unregistered values was noticed when BGP Large
Communities attribute [I-D.ietf-idr-large-community] was initially
assigned value 30 by IANA. It was subsequently discovered that a
widely-deployed BGP-4 [RFC4271] implementation had released code
which used path attribute 30 and which applied a "Treat-as-withdraw"
[RFC7606] strategy to routes containing a valid Large Community
attribute, since it was expecting a different data structure.
Because these routes were dropped, early adopters of Large
Communities were unreachable from parts of the Internet. As a
workaround, a new Early IANA Allocation was requested.

The squatting of values 30, 31, 129, 241, 242 and 243 has been
confirmed by the involved vendors or through source code review.

2. IANA Considerations

Per this document, IANA is requested to mark values 30, 31, 129, 241,
242, and 243 as "deprecated" in the "BGP Path Attributes" registry
under the "Border Gateway Protocol (BGP) Parameters" group. The
marking "deprecated" meaning "use is not recommended"
([I-D.leiba-cotton-iana-5226bis]).

3. Security Considerations

There are no meaningful security consequences arising from this
registry update.

4. Informative References

   [I-D.ietf-idr-large-community]
            Heitz, J., Snijders, J., Patel, K., Bagdonas, I., and N.
            Hilliard, "BGP Large Communities", draft-ietf-idr-large-
            community-08 (work in progress), November 2016.

   [I-D.leiba-cotton-iana-5226bis]
            Cotton, M., Leiba, B., and T. Narten, "Guidelines for
            Writing an IANA Considerations Section in RFCs", draft-
            leiba-cotton-iana-5226bis-18 (work in progress), September
            2016.

   [RFC4271] Rekhter, Y., Ed., Li, T., Ed., and S. Hares, Ed., "A
            Border Gateway Protocol 4 (BGP-4)", RFC 4271,
            DOI 10.17487/RFC4271, January 2006,
            <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4271>.

   [RFC7606] Chen, E., Ed., Scudder, J., Ed., Mohapatra, P., and K.
            Patel, "Revised Error Handling for BGP UPDATE Messages",
            RFC 7606, DOI 10.17487/RFC7606, August 2015,
            <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7606>.

Appendix A. Acknowledgements

   The author would like to gratefully acknowledge Marlien Vijfhuizen
   who helped discover the squatting of value 30, and Nick Hilliard for
   editorial feedback.

Author's Address

   Job Snijders
   NTT Communications
   Theodorus Majofskistraat 100
   Amsterdam 1065 SZ
   NL

   Email: job@ntt.net