

Network Working Group
Internet-Draft
Intended status: Standards Track
Expires: September 10, 2017

A. Morton
AT&T Labs
M. Bagnulo
UC3M
P. Eardley
BT
K. D'Souza
AT&T Labs
March 9, 2017

Initial Performance Metric Registry Entries draft-ietf-ippm-initial-registry-03

Abstract

This memo defines the Initial Entries for the Performance Metrics Registry. This version includes:

- * All [section 4](#), 5, 6, 7, and 8 parameters reference YANG types for alternate data formats.
- * implementation of standard naming format for parameters.
- * implementation of many IANA early-review comments.

Still need: Add MBM metric entry.

Requirements Language

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [RFC 2119](#) [[RFC2119](#)].

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <http://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

This Internet-Draft will expire on September 10, 2017.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2017 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	6
2.	Scope	7
3.	Registry Categories and Columns	7
4.	UDP Round-trip Latency Registry Entry	8
4.1.	Summary	8
4.1.1.	ID (Identifier)	9
4.1.2.	Name	9
4.1.3.	URIs	9
4.1.4.	Description	9
4.1.5.	Change Controller	9
4.1.6.	Version (of Registry Format)	9
4.2.	Metric Definition	9
4.2.1.	Reference Definition	9
4.2.2.	Fixed Parameters	10
4.3.	Method of Measurement	11
4.3.1.	Reference Method	11
4.3.2.	Packet Stream Generation	12
4.3.3.	Traffic Filtering (observation) Details	13
4.3.4.	Sampling Distribution	13
4.3.5.	Run-time Parameters and Data Format	13
4.3.6.	Roles	14
4.4.	Output	14
4.4.1.	Type	14
4.4.2.	Reference Definition	15

4.4.3.	Metric Units	15
4.4.4.	Calibration	15
4.5.	Administrative items	16
4.5.1.	Status	16
4.5.2.	Requestor (keep?)	16

4.5.3.	Revision	16
4.5.4.	Revision Date	16
4.6.	Comments and Remarks	16
5.	Packet Delay Variation Registry Entry	16
5.1.	Summary	16
5.1.1.	ID (Identifier)	17
5.1.2.	Name	17
5.1.3.	URIs	17
5.1.4.	Description	17
5.1.5.	Change Controller	17
5.1.6.	Version (of Registry Format)	17
5.2.	Metric Definition	17
5.2.1.	Reference Definition	17
5.2.2.	Fixed Parameters	18
5.3.	Method of Measurement	19
5.3.1.	Reference Method	19
5.3.2.	Packet Stream Generation	20
5.3.3.	Traffic Filtering (observation) Details	21
5.3.4.	Sampling Distribution	21
5.3.5.	Run-time Parameters and Data Format	21
5.3.6.	Roles	21
5.4.	Output	22
5.4.1.	Type	22
5.4.2.	Reference Definition	22
5.4.3.	Metric Units	23
5.4.4.	Calibration	23
5.5.	Administrative items	24
5.5.1.	Status	24
5.5.2.	Requestor (keep?)	24
5.5.3.	Revision	24
5.5.4.	Revision Date	24
5.6.	Comments and Remarks	24
6.	DNS Response Latency Registry Entry	24
6.1.	Summary	24
6.1.1.	ID (Identifier)	24
6.1.2.	Name	25

6.1.3.	URI	25
6.1.4.	Description	25
6.1.5.	Change Controller	25
6.1.6.	Version (of Registry Format)	25
6.2.	Metric Definition	25
6.2.1.	Reference Definition	25
6.2.2.	Fixed Parameters	26
6.3.	Method of Measurement	28
6.3.1.	Reference Method	28
6.3.2.	Packet Stream Generation	29
6.3.3.	Traffic Filtering (observation) Details	30
6.3.4.	Sampling Distribution	30

6.3.5.	Run-time Parameters and Data Format	30
6.3.6.	Roles	31
6.4.	Output	31
6.4.1.	Type	31
6.4.2.	Reference Definition	32
6.4.3.	Metric Units	32
6.4.4.	Calibration	32
6.5.	Administrative items	33
6.5.1.	Status	33
6.5.2.	Requestor	33
6.5.3.	Revision	33
6.5.4.	Revision Date	33
6.6.	Comments and Remarks	33
7.	UDP Poisson One-way Delay Registry Entries	33
7.1.	Summary	34
7.1.1.	ID (Identifier)	34
7.1.2.	Name	34
7.1.3.	URI and URL	34
7.1.4.	Description	34
7.2.	Metric Definition	35
7.2.1.	Reference Definition	35
7.2.2.	Fixed Parameters	35
7.3.	Method of Measurement	36
7.3.1.	Reference Method	36
7.3.2.	Packet Stream Generation	37
7.3.3.	Traffic Filtering (observation) Details	38
7.3.4.	Sampling Distribution	38
7.3.5.	Run-time Parameters and Data Format	38
7.3.6.	Roles	39

7.4.	Output	39
7.4.1.	Type	39
7.4.2.	Reference Definition	39
7.4.3.	Metric Units	42
7.4.4.	Calibration	42
7.5.	Administrative items	43
7.5.1.	Status	43
7.5.2.	Requestor (keep?)	43
7.5.3.	Revision	43
7.5.4.	Revision Date	43
7.6.	Comments and Remarks	43
8.	UDP Periodic One-way Delay Registry Entries	43
8.1.	Summary	44
8.1.1.	ID (Identifier)	44
8.1.2.	Name	44
8.1.3.	URIs	44
8.1.4.	Description	45
8.2.	Metric Definition	45
8.2.1.	Reference Definition	45

8.2.2.	Fixed Parameters	46
8.3.	Method of Measurement	47
8.3.1.	Reference Method	47
8.3.2.	Packet Stream Generation	48
8.3.3.	Traffic Filtering (observation) Details	48
8.3.4.	Sampling Distribution	48
8.3.5.	Run-time Parameters and Data Format	48
8.3.6.	Roles	49
8.4.	Output	49
8.4.1.	Type	49
8.4.2.	Reference Definition	49
8.4.3.	Metric Units	52
8.4.4.	Calibration	52
8.5.	Administrative items	53
8.5.1.	Status	53
8.5.2.	Requestor (keep?)	53
8.5.3.	Revision	53
8.5.4.	Revision Date	53
8.6.	Comments and Remarks	53
9.	ver08 BLANK Registry Entry	54
9.1.	Summary	54
9.1.1.	ID (Identifier)	54

9.1.2.	Name	54
9.1.3.	URIs	54
9.1.4.	Description	54
9.1.5.	Reference	54
9.1.6.	Change Controller	54
9.1.7.	Version (of Registry Format)	54
9.2.	Metric Definition	54
9.2.1.	Reference Definition	55
9.2.2.	Fixed Parameters	55
9.3.	Method of Measurement	55
9.3.1.	Reference Method	55
9.3.2.	Packet Stream Generation	55
9.3.3.	Traffic Filtering (observation) Details	55
9.3.4.	Sampling Distribution	55
9.3.5.	Run-time Parameters and Data Format	55
9.3.6.	Roles	55
9.4.	Output	56
9.4.1.	Type	56
9.4.2.	Reference Definition	56
9.4.3.	Metric Units	56
9.4.4.	Calibration	56
9.5.	Administrative items	56
9.5.1.	Status	56
9.5.2.	Requestor	56
9.5.3.	Revision	56
9.5.4.	Revision Date	56

9.6.	Comments and Remarks	56
10.	Example RTCP-XR Registry Entry	57
10.1.	Registry Indexes	57
10.1.1.	Identifier	57
10.1.2.	Name	57
10.1.3.	URI	57
10.1.4.	Status	57
10.1.5.	Requestor	57
10.1.6.	Revision	57
10.1.7.	Revision Date	57
10.1.8.	Description	57
10.1.9.	Reference Specification(s)	58
10.2.	Metric Definition	58
10.2.1.	Reference Definition	58
10.2.2.	Fixed Parameters	58

10.3.	Method of Measurement	59
10.3.1.	Reference Method	59
10.3.2.	Stream Type and Stream Parameters	59
10.3.3.	Output Type and Data Format	59
10.3.4.	Metric Units	59
10.3.5.	Run-time Parameters and Data Format	60
10.4.	Comments and Remarks	61
11.	Revision History	61
12.	Security Considerations	62
13.	IANA Considerations	62
14.	Acknowledgements	62
15.	References	62
15.1.	Normative References	63
15.2.	Informative References	64
	Authors' Addresses	66

[1.](#) Introduction

Note: Efforts to synchronize structure and terminology with [\[I-D.ietf-ippm-metric-registry\]](#) will likely be incomplete until both drafts are stable.

This memo proposes an initial set of entries for the Performance Metric Registry. It uses terms and definitions from the IPPM literature, primarily [\[RFC2330\]](#). Proponents of Passive Performance Metrics are encouraged to develop a similar document.

Although there are several standard templates for organizing specifications of performance metrics (see [\[RFC2679\]](#) for an example of the traditional IPPM template, based to large extent on the Benchmarking Methodology Working Group's traditional template in [\[RFC1242\]](#), and see [\[RFC6390\]](#) for a similar template), none of these templates were intended to become the basis for the columns of an

IETF-wide registry of metrics. While examining aspects of metric specifications which need to be registered, it became clear that none of the existing metric templates fully satisfies the particular needs of a registry.

Therefore, [\[I-D.ietf-ippm-metric-registry\]](#) defines the overall format for a Performance Metric Registry. Section 5 of [\[I-D.ietf-ippm-metric-registry\]](#) also gives guidelines for those

requesting registration of a Metric, that is the creation of entry(s) in the Performance Metric Registry: "In essence, there needs to be evidence that a candidate Registered Performance Metric has significant industry interest, or has seen deployment, and there is agreement that the candidate Registered Performance Metric serves its intended purpose." The process in [[I-D.ietf-ippm-metric-registry](#)] also requires that new entries are administered by IANA through Expert Review, which will ensure that the metrics are tightly defined.

[2.](#) Scope

This document defines the initial set of Performance Metrics Registry entries, for which IETF approval (following development in the IP Performance Metrics (IPPM) Working Group) will satisfy the requirement for Expert Review. Note that all are Active Performance Metrics, which are based on RFCs prepared in the IPPM working group of the IETF, according to their framework [[RFC2330](#)] and its updates.

[3.](#) Registry Categories and Columns

This section provides the categories and columns of the registry, for easy reference. An entry (row) therefore gives a complete description of a Registered Metric.

Category

Column | Column |

Summary

Identifier | Name | URIs | Desc. | Reference | Change Controller | Ver |

Metric Definition

Reference Definition | Fixed Parameters |

Method of Measurement

Reference | Packet | Traffic | Sampling | Run-time | Role |
Method | Stream | Filter | Distribution | Parameters | |
| Generation |

Output

Type | Reference | Units | Calibration |
| Definition | | |

Administrative Information

Status | Request | Rev | Rev.Date |

Comments and Remarks

[4.](#) UDP Round-trip Latency Registry Entry

This section gives an initial registry entry for the UDP Round-trip Latency.

Note: Each Registry entry only produces a "raw" output or a statistical summary. To describe both "raw" and one or more statistics efficiently, the Identifier, Name, and Output Categories can be split and a single section can specify two or more closely-related metrics. See [Section 7](#) for an example specifying multiple Registry entries with many common columns.

[4.1.](#) Summary

This category includes multiple indexes to the registry entry: the element ID and metric name.

[4.1.1.](#) ID (Identifier)

<insert a numeric identifier, an integer, TBD>

[4.1.2.](#) Name

<insert name according to metric naming convention>

RTDelay_Active_IP-UDP-Poisson_RFCXXXXsecY_Seconds_95Percentile

[4.1.3.](#) URIs

URN: Prefix urn:ietf:metrics:perf:<name>

URL: http://<TBD by IANA>/<name>

[4.1.4.](#) Description

This metric assesses the delay of a stream of packets exchanged between two hosts (which are the two measurement points), and the Output is the Round-trip delay for all successfully exchanged packets expressed as the 95th percentile of their conditional delay distribution.

[4.1.5.](#) Change Controller

IETF

[4.1.6.](#) Version (of Registry Format)

1.0

[4.2.](#) Metric Definition

This category includes columns to prompt the entry of all necessary details related to the metric definition, including the RFC reference and values of input factors, called fixed parameters.

[4.2.1.](#) Reference Definition

<Full bibliographic reference to an immutable doc.>

Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., and M. Zekauskas, "A Round-trip Delay Metric for IPPM", [RFC 2681](#), September 1999.

[RFC2681]

<specific section reference and additional clarifications, if needed>

[Section 2.4 of \[RFC2681\]](#) provides the reference definition of the singleton (single value) Round-trip delay metric. [Section 3.4 of \[RFC2681\]](#) provides the reference definition expanded to cover a multi-singleton sample. Note that terms such as singleton and sample are defined in [Section 11 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Note that although the [\[RFC2681\]](#) definition of "Round-trip-Delay between Src and Dst" is directionally ambiguous in the text, this metric tightens the definition further to recognize that the host in the "Src" role will send the first packet to "Dst", and ultimately receive the corresponding return packet from "Dst" (when neither are lost).

Finally, note that the variable "dT" is used in [\[RFC2681\]](#) to refer to the value of Round-trip delay in metric definitions and methods. The variable "dT" has been re-used in other IPPM literature to refer to different quantities, and cannot be used as a global variable name.

[4.2.2.](#) Fixed Parameters

<list and specify Fixed Parameters, input factors that must be determined and embedded in the measurement system for use when needed>

Type-P as defined in [Section 13 of \[RFC2330\]](#):

- o IPv4 header values:
 - * DSCP: set to 0
 - * TTL: set to 255
 - * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o IPv6 header values:
 - * DSCP: set to 0
 - * Hop Count: set to 255

- * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o UDP header values:
 - * Checksum: the checksum MUST be calculated and included in the header
- o UDP Payload

- * total of 9 bytes

Other measurement parameters:

- o Tmax: a loss threshold waiting time
 - * 3.0, expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) and with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#).

[4.3.](#) Method of Measurement

This category includes columns for references to relevant sections of the RFC(s) and any supplemental information needed to ensure an unambiguous methods for implementations.

[4.3.1.](#) Reference Method

<for metric, insert relevant section references and supplemental info>

The methodology for this metric is defined as Type-P-Round-trip-Delay-Poisson-Stream in [section 2.6 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2681\]](#) and [section 3.6 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2681\]](#) using the Type-P and Tmax defined under Fixed Parameters.

The reference method distinguishes between long-delayed packets and lost packets by implementing a maximum waiting time for packet arrival. Tmax is the waiting time used as the threshold to declare a packet lost. Lost packets SHALL be designated as having undefined

delay.

The calculations on the delay (RTT) SHALL be performed on the conditional distribution, conditioned on successful packet arrival within T_{max}. Also, when all packet delays are stored, the process which calculates the RTT value MAY enforce the T_{max} threshold on stored values before calculations. See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

The reference method requires some way to distinguish between different packets in a stream to establish correspondence between sending times and receiving times for each successfully-arriving packet. Sequence numbers or other send-order identification MUST be

retained at the Src or included with each packet to dis-ambiguate packet reordering if it occurs.

If a standard measurement protocol is employed, then the measurement process will determine the sequence numbers or timestamps applied to test packets after the Fixed and Runtime parameters are passed to that process. The chosen measurement protocol will dictate the format of sequence numbers and time-stamps, if they are conveyed in the packet payload.

Refer to [Section 4.4 of \[RFC6673\]](#) for expanded discussion of the instruction to "send a Type-P packet back to the Src as quickly as possible" in [Section 2.6 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2681\]](#). [Section 8 of \[RFC6673\]](#) presents additional requirements which MUST be included in the method of measurement for this metric.

4.3.2. Packet Stream Generation

This section gives the details of the packet traffic which is the basis for measurement. In IPPM metrics, this is called the Stream, and can easily be described by providing the list of stream parameters.

<section/specification references, and description of any new generation parameters, if needed>

[Section 11.1.3 of \[RFC2330\]](#) provides three methods to generate Poisson sampling intervals. the reciprocal of lambda is the average packet spacing, thus the Run-time Parameter is $\text{Reciprocal_lambda} = 1/\text{lambda}$, in seconds.

>>> Check with Sam, most likely it is this...

Method 3 SHALL be used, where given a start time (Run-time Parameter), the subsequent send times are all computed prior to measurement by computing the pseudo-random distribution of inter-packet send times, (truncating the distribution as specified in the Run-time Parameter, Trunc), and the Src sends each packet at the computed times.

Note that Trunc is the upper limit on inter-packet times in the Poisson distribution. A random value greater than Trunc is set equal to Trunc instead.

[4.3.3.](#) Traffic Filtering (observation) Details

The measured results based on a filtered version of the packets observed, and this section provides the filter details (when present).

<section reference>.

NA

[4.3.4.](#) Sampling Distribution

<insert time distribution details, or how this is diff from the filter>

NA

[4.3.5.](#) Run-time Parameters and Data Format

Run-time Parameters are input factors that must be determined, configured into the measurement system, and reported with the results for the context to be complete.

<list of run-time parameters, and their data formats>

Src the IP address of the host in the Src Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [Section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

Dst the IP address of the host in the Dst Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

T0 a time, the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a start time is unspecified and Tf is to be interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval. The start time is controlled through other means.

Tf a time, the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a end time date is ignored and Tf is interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval.

Reciprocal_lambda average packet interval for Poisson Streams expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type

decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#).

Trunc Upper limit on Poisson distribution expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#) (values above this limit will be clipped and set to the limit value). (if fixed,

Trunc = 30.0000 seconds.)

>>> should Poisson run-time params be fixed instead? probably yes if modeling a specific version of MBA tests.

[4.3.6.](#) Roles

<lists the names of the different roles from the measurement method>

Src launches each packet and waits for return transmissions from Dst.

Dst waits for each packet from Src and sends a return packet to Src.

[4.4.](#) Output

This category specifies all details of the Output of measurements using the metric.

[4.4.1.](#) Type

<insert name of the output type, raw or a selected summary statistic>

Percentile -- for the conditional distribution of all packets with a valid value of Round-trip delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value corresponding to the 95th percentile, as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

The percentile = 95, meaning that the reported delay, "95Percentile", is the smallest value of Round-trip delay for which the Empirical Distribution Function (EDF), $F(95\text{Percentile}) \geq 95\%$ of the singleton Round-trip delay values in the conditional distribution. See [section 11.3 of \[RFC2330\]](#) for the definition of the percentile statistic using the EDF.

[4.4.2.](#) Reference Definition

<describe the reference data format for each type of result>

For all outputs ---

T0 the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Tf the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Raw -- REMOVED IN VERSION 01

For Act_IP_UDP_Round-trip_Delay_Poisson_95th-percentile:

95Percentile The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of RFC \[RFC5905\]](#)

[4.4.3. Metric Units](#)

<insert units for the measured results, and the reference specification>.

The 95th Percentile of Round-trip Delay is expressed in seconds.

[4.4.4. Calibration](#)

[Section 3.7.3 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides a means to quantify the systematic and random errors of a time measurement. In-situ calibration could be enabled with an internal loopback at the Source host that includes as much of the measurement system as possible, performs address manipulation as needed, and provides some form of isolation (e.g., deterministic delay) to avoid send-receive interface contention. Some portion of the random and systematic error can be characterized this way.

When a measurement controller requests a calibration measurement, the loopback is applied and the result is output in the same format as a normal measurement with additional indication that it is a calibration result.

Both internal loopback calibration and clock synchronization can be used to estimate the *available accuracy* of the Output Metric Units. For example, repeated loopback delay measurements will reveal the portion of the Output result resolution which is the result of system noise, and thus inaccurate.

[4.5.](#) Administrative items

[4.5.1.](#) Status

<current or deprecated>

[4.5.2.](#) Requestor (keep?)

name or RFC, etc.

[4.5.3.](#) Revision

1.0

[4.5.4.](#) Revision Date

YYYY-MM-DD

[4.6.](#) Comments and Remarks

Additional (Informational) details for this entry

[5.](#) Packet Delay Variation Registry Entry

This section gives an initial registry entry for a Packet Delay Variation metric.

Note: If each Registry entry should only produce a "raw" output or a statistical summary, then the "Output" Category can be split and this section can become two closely-related metrics.

[5.1.](#) Summary

This category includes multiple indexes to the registry entries, the element ID and metric name.

<skipping some Summary columns for now>

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[5.1.1.](#) ID (Identifier)

<insert numeric identifier, an integer>

[5.1.2.](#) Name

<insert name according to metric naming convention>

OWPDV_Active_IP-UDP-Poisson_RFCXXXXsecY_Seconds_95Percentile

[5.1.3.](#) URIs

URI: Prefix urn:ietf:metrics:perf:<name>

URL: http://<TBD by IANA>/<name>

[5.1.4.](#) Description

An assessment of packet delay variation with respect to the minimum delay observed on the stream, and the Output is expressed as the 95th percentile of the packet delay variation distribution.

[5.1.5.](#) Change Controller

<org or person >

IETF

[5.1.6.](#) Version (of Registry Format)

1.0

[5.2.](#) Metric Definition

This category includes columns to prompt the entry of all necessary details related to the metric definition, including the RFC reference and values of input factors, called fixed parameters.

[5.2.1.](#) Reference Definition

<Full bibliographic reference to an immutable doc.>

Paxson, V., Almes, G., Mahdavi, J., and M. Mathis, "Framework for IP Performance Metrics", [RFC 2330](#), May 1998. [[RFC2330](#)]

Demichelis, C. and P. Chimento, "IP Packet Delay Variation Metric for IP Performance Metrics (IPPM)", [RFC 3393](#), November 2002. [[RFC3393](#)]

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 17]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

Morton, A. and B. Claise, "Packet Delay Variation Applicability Statement", [RFC 5481](#), March 2009. [[RFC5481](#)]

Mills, D., Martin, J., Burbank, J., and W. Kasch, "Network Time Protocol Version 4: Protocol and Algorithms Specification", [RFC 5905](#), June 2010. [[RFC5905](#)]

<specific section reference and additional clarifications, if needed>

See sections [2.4](#) and [3.4](#) of [[RFC3393](#)]. Singleton delay differences measured are referred to by the variable name "ddT" (applicable to all forms of delay variation). However, this metric entry specifies the PDV form defined in [section 4.2 of \[\[RFC5481\]\(#\)\]](#), where the singleton PDV for packet *i* is referred to by the variable name "PDV(*i*)".

[5.2.2](#). Fixed Parameters

<list and specify Fixed Parameters, input factors that must be determined and embedded in the measurement system for use when needed>

- o IPv4 header values:
 - * DSCP: set to 0
 - * TTL: set to 255
 - * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o IPv6 header values:
 - * DSCP: set to 0

- * Hop Count: set to 255
- * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o UDP header values:
 - * Checksum: the checksum MUST be calculated and included in the header
- o UDP Payload
 - * total of 200 bytes

Other measurement parameters:

Tmax: a loss threshold waiting time with value 3.0, expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) and with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#).

F a selection function unambiguously defining the packets from the stream selected for the metric. See [section 4.2 of \[RFC5481\]](#) for the PDV form.

See the Packet Stream generation category for two additional Fixed Parameters.

[5.3.](#) Method of Measurement

This category includes columns for references to relevant sections of the RFC(s) and any supplemental information needed to ensure an unambiguous methods for implementations.

[5.3.1.](#) Reference Method

<for metric, insert relevant section references and supplemental info>

See [section 2.6](#) and 3.6 of [\[RFC3393\]](#) for general singleton element calculations. This metric entry requires implementation of the PDV

form defined in [section 4.2 of \[RFC5481\]](#). Also see measurement considerations in [section 8 of \[RFC5481\]](#).

The reference method distinguishes between long-delayed packets and lost packets by implementing a maximum waiting time for packet arrival. Tmax is the waiting time used as the threshold to declare a packet lost. Lost packets SHALL be designated as having undefined delay.

The calculations on the one-way delay SHALL be performed on the conditional distribution, conditioned on successful packet arrival within Tmax. Also, when all packet delays are stored, the process which calculates the one-way delay value MAY enforce the Tmax threshold on stored values before calculations. See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

The reference method requires some way to distinguish between different packets in a stream to establish correspondence between sending times and receiving times for each successfully-arriving packet. Sequence numbers or other send-order identification MUST be

retained at the Src or included with each packet to dis-ambiguate packet reordering if it occurs.

If a standard measurement protocol is employed, then the measurement process will determine the sequence numbers or timestamps applied to test packets after the Fixed and Runtime parameters are passed to that process. The chosen measurement protocol will dictate the format of sequence numbers and time-stamps, if they are conveyed in the packet payload.

[5.3.2.](#) Packet Stream Generation

<list of generation parameters and section/spec references if needed>

[Section 11.1.3 of \[RFC2330\]](#) provides three methods to generate Poisson sampling intervals. the reciprocal of lambda is the average packet spacing, thus the Run-time Parameter is Reciprocal_lambda = 1/lambda, in seconds.

>>> Check with Sam, most likely it is this...

Method 3 SHALL be used, where given a start time (Run-time Parameter), the subsequent send times are all computed prior to measurement by computing the pseudo-random distribution of inter-packet send times, (truncating the distribution as specified in the Parameter Trunc), and the Src sends each packet at the computed times.

Note that Trunc is the upper limit on inter-packet times in the Poisson distribution. A random value greater than Trunc is set equal to Trunc instead.

Reciprocal_lambda average packet interval for Poisson Streams expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#). Reciprocal_lambda = 1 packet per second.

Trunc Upper limit on Poisson distribution expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#) (values above this limit will be clipped and set to the limit value). Trunc = 30.0000 seconds.

[5.3.3.](#) Traffic Filtering (observation) Details

<insert the measured results based on a filtered version of the packets observed, and this section provides the filter details (when present), and section reference>.

NA

[5.3.4.](#) Sampling Distribution

<insert time distribution details, or how this is diff from the filter>

NA

[5.3.5.](#) Run-time Parameters and Data Format

<list of run-time parameters, and their data formats>

Src the IP address of the host in the Src Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [Section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

Dst the IP address of the host in the Dst Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

T0 a time, the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a start time is unspecified and Tf is to be interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval. The start time is controlled through other means.

Tf a time, the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a end time date is ignored and Tf is interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval.

[5.3.6.](#) Roles

<lists the names of the different roles from the measurement method>

Src launches each packet to Dst.

Dst waits for each packet from Src.

[5.4.](#) Output

This category specifies all details of the Output of measurements using the metric.

5.4.1. Type

<insert name of the output type, raw or a selected summary statistic>

Percentile -- for the conditional distribution of all packets with a valid value of one-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value corresponding to the 95th percentile, as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

The percentile = 95, meaning that the reported delay, "95Percentile", is the smallest value of one-way PDV for which the Empirical Distribution Function (EDF), $F(95\text{Percentile}) \geq 95\%$ of the singleton one-way PDV values in the conditional distribution. See [section 11.3 of \[RFC2330\]](#) for the definition of the percentile statistic using the EDF.

5.4.2. Reference Definition

<the output type and data format for each type of result>

T0 the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Tf the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

95Percentile The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of RFC \[RFC5905\]](#)

[5.4.3.](#) Metric Units

<insert units for the measured results, and the reference specification>.

The 95th Percentile of one-way PDV is expressed in seconds.

[5.4.4.](#) Calibration

[Section 3.7.3 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides a means to quantify the systematic and random errors of a time measurement. In-situ calibration could be enabled with an internal loopback that includes as much of the measurement system as possible, performs address manipulation as needed, and provides some form of isolation (e.g., deterministic delay) to avoid send-receive interface contention. Some portion of the random and systematic error can be characterized this way.

For one-way delay measurements, the error calibration must include an assessment of the internal clock synchronization with its external reference (this internal clock is supplying timestamps for measurement). In practice, the time offsets of clocks at both the source and destination are needed to estimate the systematic error due to imperfect clock synchronization (the time offsets are smoothed, thus the random variation is not usually represented in the results).

time_offset The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a signed value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

When a measurement controller requests a calibration measurement, the loopback is applied and the result is output in the same format as a normal measurement with additional indication that it is a calibration result. In any measurement, the measurement function SHOULD report its current estimate of time offset as an indicator of the degree of synchronization.

Both internal loopback calibration and clock synchronization can be used to estimate the *available accuracy* of the Output Metric Units. For example, repeated loopback delay measurements will reveal the portion of the Output result resolution which is the result of system noise, and thus inaccurate.

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[5.5.](#) Administrative items

[5.5.1.](#) Status

<current or deprecated>

[5.5.2.](#) Requestor (keep?)

<name of individual or RFC, etc.>

[5.5.3.](#) Revision

1.0

[5.5.4.](#) Revision Date

YYYY-MM-DD

[5.6.](#) Comments and Remarks

<Additional (Informational) details for this entry>

Lost packets represent a challenge for delay variation metrics. See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) and the delay variation applicability statement[RFC5481] for extensive analysis and comparison of PDV and an alternate metric, IPDV.

[6.](#) DNS Response Latency Registry Entry

This section gives an initial registry entry for DNS Response Latency. [RFC 2681](#) [RFC2681] defines a Round-trip delay metric. We build on that metric by specifying several of the input parameters to precisely define a metric for measuring DNS latency.

[6.1.](#) Summary

This category includes multiple indexes to the registry entries, the element ID and metric name.

<skipping some admin columns for now>

[6.1.1.](#) ID (Identifier)

<insert numeric identifier, an integer>

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 24]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[6.1.2.](#) Name

<insert name according to metric naming convention>

RTDNS_Active_IP-UDP-Poisson_RFCXXXXsecY_Seconds_Raw

[6.1.3.](#) URI

URI: Prefix urn:ietf:metrics:perf:<name>

URL: http://<TBD by IANA>/<name>

[6.1.4.](#) Description

This metric assesses the response time, the interval from the query transmission to the response.

[6.1.5.](#) Change Controller

IETF

[6.1.6.](#) Version (of Registry Format)

1.0

[6.2.](#) Metric Definition

This category includes columns to prompt the entry of all necessary details related to the metric definition, including the RFC reference and values of input factors, called fixed parameters.

[6.2.1.](#) Reference Definition

<Full bibliographic reference to an immutable doc.>

Mockapetris, P., "Domain names - implementation and specification", STD 13, [RFC 1035](#), November 1987. (and updates)

[RFC1035]

Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., and M. Zekauskas, "A Round-trip Delay Metric for IPPM", [RFC 2681](#), September 1999.

[RFC2681]

<specific section reference and additional clarifications, if needed>

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 25]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[Section 2.4 of \[RFC2681\]](#) provides the reference definition of the singleton (single value) Round-trip delay metric. [Section 3.4 of \[RFC2681\]](#) provides the reference definition expanded to cover a multi-singleton sample. Note that terms such as singleton and sample are defined in [Section 11 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

For DNS Response Latency, the entities in [\[RFC1035\]](#) must be mapped to [\[RFC2681\]](#). The Local Host with its User Program and Resolver take the role of "Src", and the Foreign Name Server takes the role of "Dst".

Note that although the [\[RFC2681\]](#) definition of "Round-trip-Delay between Src and Dst at T" is directionally ambiguous in the text, this metric tightens the definition further to recognize that the host in the "Src" role will send the first packet to "Dst", and ultimately receive the corresponding return packet from "Dst" (when neither are lost).

[6.2.2](#). Fixed Parameters

<list and specify Fixed Parameters, input factors that must be determined and embedded in the measurement system for use when needed>

Type-P as defined in [Section 13 of \[RFC2330\]](#):

- o IPv4 header values:

- * DSCP: set to 0
- * TTL set to 255
- * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o IPv6 header values:
 - * DSCP: set to 0
 - * Hop Count: set to 255
 - * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o UDP header values:
 - * Source port: 53
 - * Destination port: 53

- * Checksum: the checksum must be calculated and included in the header
- o Payload: The payload contains a DNS message as defined in [RFC 1035](#) [[RFC1035](#)] with the following values:
 - * The DNS header section contains:
 - + Identification (see the Run-time column)
 - + QR: set to 0 (Query)
 - + OPCODE: set to 0 (standard query)
 - + AA: not set
 - + TC: not set
 - + RD: set to one (recursion desired)
 - + RA: not set

- + RCODE: not set
- + QDCOUNT: set to one (only one entry)
- + ANCOUNT: not set
- + NSCOUNT: not set
- + ARCOUNT: not set
- * The Question section contains:
 - + QNAME: the Fully Qualified Domain Name (FQDN) provided as input for the test, see the Run-time column
 - + QTYPE: the query type provided as input for the test, see the Run-time column
 - + QCLASS: set to 1 for IN
- * The other sections do not contain any Resource Records.

Other measurement parameters:

- o Tmax: a loss threshold waiting time (and to help disambiguate queries)

- * 5.0, expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) and with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#).

Observation: reply packets will contain a DNS response and may contain RRs.

[6.3.](#) Method of Measurement

This category includes columns for references to relevant sections of the RFC(s) and any supplemental information needed to ensure an unambiguous methods for implementations.

6.3.1. Reference Method

<for metric, insert relevant section references and supplemental info>

The methodology for this metric is defined as Type-P-Round-trip-Delay-Poisson-Stream in [section 2.6 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2681\]](#) and [section 3.6 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2681\]](#) using the Type-P and Timeout defined under Fixed Parameters.

The reference method distinguishes between long-delayed packets and lost packets by implementing a maximum waiting time for packet arrival. Tmax is the waiting time used as the threshold to declare a packet lost. Lost packets SHALL be designated as having undefined delay.

The calculations on the delay (RTT) SHALL be performed on the conditional distribution, conditioned on successful packet arrival within Tmax. Also, when all packet delays are stored, the process which calculates the RTT value MAY enforce the Tmax threshold on stored values before calculations. See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

The reference method requires some way to distinguish between different packets in a stream to establish correspondence between sending times and receiving times for each successfully-arriving reply. Therefore, sequence numbers or other send-order identification MUST be retained at the Src or included with each packet to dis-ambiguate packet reordering if it occurs. Sequence number is part of the payload described under Fixed Parameters.

DNS Messages bearing Queries provide for random ID Numbers in the Identification header field, so more than one query may be launched while a previous request is outstanding when the ID Number is used.

IF a DNS response does not arrive within Tmax, the result is undefined. The Message ID SHALL be used to disambiguate the successive queries.

>>> This would require support of ID generation and population in the Message. An alternative would be to use a random Source port on the Query Message, but we would choose ONE before proceeding.

Refer to [Section 4.4 of \[RFC6673\]](#) for expanded discussion of the instruction to "send a Type-P packet back to the Src as quickly as possible" in [Section 2.6 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2681\]](#). [Section 8 of \[RFC6673\]](#) presents additional requirements which shall be included in the method of measurement for this metric.

In addition to operations described in [\[RFC2681\]](#), the Src MUST parse the DNS headers of the reply and prepare the information for subsequent reporting as a measured result, along with the Round-Trip Delay.

[6.3.2.](#) Packet Stream Generation

This section gives the details of the packet traffic which is the basis for measurement. In IPPM metrics, this is called the Stream, and can easily be described by providing the list of stream parameters.

<list of generation parameters and section/spec references if needed>

[Section 11.1.3 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2330\]](#) provides three methods to generate Poisson sampling intervals. The reciprocal of lambda is the average packet rate, thus the Run-time Parameter is Reciprocal_lambda = 1/lambda, in seconds.

Method 3 is used, where given a start time (Run-time Parameter), the subsequent send times are all computed prior to measurement by computing the pseudo-random distribution of inter-packet send times, (truncating the distribution as specified in the Run-time Parameters), and the Src sends each packet at the computed times.

Note that Trunc is the upper limit on inter-packet times in the Poisson distribution. A random value greater than Trunc is set equal to Trunc instead.

[6.3.3. Traffic Filtering \(observation\) Details](#)

The measured results based on a filtered version of the packets observed, and this section provides the filter details (when present).

<section reference>.

NA

[6.3.4. Sampling Distribution](#)

<insert time distribution details, or how this is diff from the filter>

NA

[6.3.5. Run-time Parameters and Data Format](#)

Run-time Parameters are input factors that must be determined, configured into the measurement system, and reported with the results for the context to be complete.

<list of run-time parameters, and their data formats>

Src the IP address of the host in the Src Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [Section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

Dst the IP address of the host in the Dst Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

T0 a time, the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a start time is unspecified and Tf is to be interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval. The start time is controlled through other means.

Tf a time, the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a end time date is ignored and Tf is interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval.

Reciprocal_lambda average packet interval for Poisson Streams expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#).

Trunc Upper limit on Poisson distribution expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#) (values above this limit will be clipped and set to the limit value). (if fixed, Trunc = 30.0000 seconds.)

ID The 16-bit identifier assigned by the program that generates the query, and which must vary in successive queries, see [Section 4.1.1 of \[RFC1035\]](#). This identifier is copied into the corresponding reply and can be used by the requester (Src) to match-up replies to outstanding queries.

QNAME The domain name of the Query, formatted as specified in [section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#).

QTYPE The Query Type, which will correspond to the IP address family of the query (decimal 1 for IPv4 or 28 for IPv6, formatted as a uint16, as per [section 9.2 of \[RFC6020\]](#)).

[6.3.6.](#) Roles

<lists the names of the different roles from the measurement method>

Src launches each packet and waits for return transmissions from Dst.

Dst waits for each packet from Src and sends a return packet to Src.

[6.4.](#) Output

This category specifies all details of the Output of measurements using the metric.

[6.4.1.](#) Type

<insert name of the output type, raw or a selected summary statistic>

Raw -- for each DNS Query packet sent, sets of values as defined in the next column, including the status of the response, only assigning delay values to successful query-response pairs.

[6.4.2.](#) Reference Definition

<describe the data format for each type of result>

For all outputs:

T the time the DNS Query was sent during the measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

dT The time value of the round-trip delay to receive the DNS response, expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#). This value is undefined when the response packet is not received at Src within waiting time Tmxax seconds.

Rcode The value of the Rcode field in the DNS response header, expressed as a uint64 as specified in [section 9.2 of \[RFC6020\]](#). Non-zero values convey errors in the response, and such replies must be analyzed separately from successful requests.

[6.4.3.](#) Metric Units

<insert units for the measured results, and the reference specification>.

Round-trip Delay, dT, is expressed in seconds.

[6.4.4.](#) Calibration

[Section 3.7.3 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides a means to quantify the systematic and random errors of a time measurement. In-situ

calibration could be enabled with an internal loopback at the Source host that includes as much of the measurement system as possible, performs address and payload manipulation as needed, and provides some form of isolation (e.g., deterministic delay) to avoid send-receive interface contention. Some portion of the random and systematic error can be characterized this way.

When a measurement controller requests a calibration measurement, the loopback is applied and the result is output in the same format as a normal measurement with additional indication that it is a calibration result.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 32]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

Both internal loopback calibration and clock synchronization can be used to estimate the *available accuracy* of the Output Metric Units. For example, repeated loopback delay measurements will reveal the portion of the Output result resolution which is the result of system noise, and thus inaccurate.

[6.5.](#) Administrative items

[6.5.1.](#) Status

<current or deprecated>

[6.5.2.](#) Requestor

name or RFC, etc.

[6.5.3.](#) Revision

1.0

[6.5.4.](#) Revision Date

YYYY-MM-DD

[6.6.](#) Comments and Remarks

Additional (Informational) details for this entry

[7.](#) UDP Poisson One-way Delay Registry Entries

This section specifies five initial registry entries for the UDP Poisson One-way Delay.

Note: Each Registry "Name" below specifies a single registry entry, whose output format varies according to the <statistic> element of the name that specifies one form of statistical summary.

IANA is asked to assign a different numeric identifiers to each of the five Metrics. All column entries beside the ID, Name, Description, and Output Reference Method categories are the same, thus this section proposes five closely-related registry entries. As a result, IANA is also asked to assign corresponding URNs and URLs to each Named Metric.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 33]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[7.1.](#) Summary

This category includes multiple indexes to the registry entries, the element ID and metric name.

[7.1.1.](#) ID (Identifier)

<insert numeric identifier, an integer, one corresponding to each name below>

[7.1.2.](#) Name

<insert name according to metric naming convention>

OWDelay_Active_IP-UDP-Poisson-
Payload250B_RFCXXXsecY_Seconds_<statistic>

where <statistic> is one of:

- o 95Percentile
- o Mean

- o Min
- o Max
- o StdDev

[7.1.3.](#) URI and URL

URI: Prefix urn:ietf:metrics:perf:<name>

URL: http:\\www.iana.org\ ... <name>

[7.1.4.](#) Description

This metric assesses the delay of a stream of packets exchanged between two hosts (or measurement points), and reports the <statistic> One-way delay for all successfully exchanged packets based on their conditional delay distribution.

where <statistic> is one of:

- o 95Percentile
- o Mean

- o Min
- o Max
- o StdDev

[7.2.](#) Metric Definition

This category includes columns to prompt the entry of all necessary details related to the metric definition, including the RFC reference and values of input factors, called fixed parameters.

[7.2.1.](#) Reference Definition

<Full bibliographic reference to an immutable doc.>

Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., Zekauskas, M., and A. Morton, Ed., "A One-Way Delay Metric for IP Performance Metrics (IPPM)", STD 81, [RFC 7679](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7679, January 2016, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7679>>.

[RFC7679]

Morton, A., and Stephan, E., "Spatial Composition of Metrics", [RFC 6049](#), January 2011.

[RFC6049]

<specific section reference and additional clarifications, if needed>

[Section 3.4 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides the reference definition of the singleton (single value) One-way delay metric. [Section 4.4 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides the reference definition expanded to cover a multi-value sample. Note that terms such as singleton and sample are defined in [Section 11 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Only successful packet transfers with finite delay are included in the sample, as prescribed in [section 4.1.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#).

[7.2.2.](#) Fixed Parameters

<list and specify Fixed Parameters, input factors that must be determined and embedded in the measurement system for use when needed>

Type-P:

- o IPv4 header values:

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 35]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

- * DSCP: set to 0
- * TTL: set to 255
- * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)

- o IPv6 header values:

- * DSCP: set to 0
- * Hop Count: set to 255
- * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o UDP header values:
 - * Checksum: the checksum MUST be calculated and included in the header
- o UDP Payload: TWAMP Test Packet Formats, [Section 4.1.2 of \[RFC5357\]](#)
 - * Security features in use influence the number of Padding octets.
 - * 250 octets total, including the TWAMP format

Other measurement parameters:

Tmax: a loss threshold waiting time with value 3.0, expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) and with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#).

See the Packet Stream generation category for two additional Fixed Parameters.

[7.3.](#) Method of Measurement

This category includes columns for references to relevant sections of the RFC(s) and any supplemental information needed to ensure an unambiguous methods for implementations.

[7.3.1.](#) Reference Method

<for metric, insert relevant section references and supplemental info>

Poisson-Stream in [section 3.6 of \[RFC7679\]](#) and [section 4.6 of \[RFC7679\]](#) using the Type-P and Tmax defined under Fixed Parameters.

The reference method distinguishes between long-delayed packets and lost packets by implementing a maximum waiting time for packet arrival. Tmax is the waiting time used as the threshold to declare a packet lost. Lost packets SHALL be designated as having undefined delay.

The calculations on the one-way delay SHALL be performed on the conditional distribution, conditioned on successful packet arrival within Tmax. Also, when all packet delays are stored, the process which calculates the one-way delay value MAY enforce the Tmax threshold on stored values before calculations. See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

The reference method requires some way to distinguish between different packets in a stream to establish correspondence between sending times and receiving times for each successfully-arriving packet. Sequence numbers or other send-order identification MUST be retained at the Src or included with each packet to dis-ambiguate packet reordering if it occurs.

Since a standard measurement protocol is employed [[RFC5357](#)], then the measurement process will determine the sequence numbers or timestamps applied to test packets after the Fixed and Runtime parameters are passed to that process. The measurement protocol dictates the format of sequence numbers and time-stamps conveyed in the TWAMP-Test packet payload.

[7.3.2.](#) Packet Stream Generation

This section gives the details of the packet traffic which is the basis for measurement. In IPPM metrics, this is called the Stream, and can easily be described by providing the list of stream parameters.

<list of generation parameters and section/spec references if needed>

[Section 11.1.3 of RFC 2681 \[RFC2330\]](#) provides three methods to generate Poisson sampling intervals. the reciprocal of lambda is the average packet spacing, thus the Run-time Parameter is `Reciprocal_lambda = 1/lambda`, in seconds.

Method 3 SHALL be used, where given a start time (Run-time Parameter), the subsequent send times are all computed prior to measurement by computing the pseudo-random distribution of inter-packet send times, (truncating the distribution as specified in the Parameter Trunc), and the Src sends each packet at the computed times.

Note that Trunc is the upper limit on inter-packet times in the Poisson distribution. A random value greater than Trunc is set equal to Trunc instead.

Reciprocal_lambda average packet interval for Poisson Streams expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#). Reciprocal_lambda = 1 packet per second.

Trunc Upper limit on Poisson distribution expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), and with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#) (values above this limit will be clipped and set to the limit value). Trunc = 30.0000 seconds.

[7.3.3.](#) Traffic Filtering (observation) Details

NA

[7.3.4.](#) Sampling Distribution

NA

[7.3.5.](#) Run-time Parameters and Data Format

Run-time Parameters are input factors that must be determined, configured into the measurement system, and reported with the results for the context to be complete.

<list of run-time parameters, and their data formats>

Src the IP address of the host in the Src Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [Section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

Dst the IP address of the host in the Dst Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

T0 a time, the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a start time is unspecified and Tf is to be interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval. The start time is controlled through other means.

Tf a time, the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a end time date is ignored and Tf is interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval.

[7.3.6.](#) Roles

<lists the names of the different roles from the measurement method>

Src launches each packet and waits for return transmissions from Dst. This is the TWAMP Session-Sender.

Dst waits for each packet from Src and sends a return packet to Src. This is the TWAMP Session-Reflector.

[7.4.](#) Output

This category specifies all details of the Output of measurements using the metric.

[7.4.1.](#) Type

<insert name of the output type, raw or a selected summary statistic>

See subsection titles below for Types.

[7.4.2.](#) Reference Definition

<describe the data format for each type of result>

For all output types ---

T0 the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 39]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

Tf the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

For each <statistic>, one of the following sub-sections apply:

[7.4.2.1](#). Percentile95

The 95th percentile SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the percentile statistic (where Round-trip delay should be substituted for "ipdv").

The percentile = 95, meaning that the reported delay, "95Percentile", is the smallest value of one-way delay for which the Empirical Distribution Function (EDF), $F(95\text{Percentile}) \geq 95\%$ of the singleton one-way delay values in the conditional distribution. See [section 11.3 of \[RFC2330\]](#) for the definition of the percentile statistic using the EDF.

95Percentile The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

7.4.2.2. Mean

The mean SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.2.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for details on calculating this statistic, and 4.2.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#).

Mean The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 40]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

(see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

7.4.2.3. Min

The minimum SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for details on calculating this statistic, and 4.3.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#).

Min The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

7.4.2.4. Max

The maximum SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for a closely related method for calculating this statistic, and 4.3.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#). The formula is as follows:

$$\text{Max} = (\text{FiniteDelay}[j])$$

such that for some index, j , where $1 \leq j \leq N$
 $\text{FiniteDelay}[j] \geq \text{FiniteDelay}[n]$ for all n

Max The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

[7.4.2.5](#). Std_Dev

The Std_Dev SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for a closely related method for calculating this statistic, and 4.3.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#). The formula is the classic calculation for standard deviation of a population.

Std_Dev The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from

the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [[RFC5905](#)]

[7.4.3.](#) Metric Units

<insert units for the measured results, and the reference specification>.

The <statistic> of One-way Delay is expressed in seconds.

[7.4.4.](#) Calibration

[Section 3.7.3 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides a means to quantify the systematic and random errors of a time measurement. In-situ calibration could be enabled with an internal loopback that includes as much of the measurement system as possible, performs address manipulation as needed, and provides some form of isolation (e.g., deterministic delay) to avoid send-receive interface contention. Some portion of the random and systematic error can be characterized this way.

For one-way delay measurements, the error calibration must include an assessment of the internal clock synchronization with its external reference (this internal clock is supplying timestamps for measurement). In practice, the time offsets of clocks at both the source and destination are needed to estimate the systematic error due to imperfect clock synchronization (the time offsets are smoothed, thus the random variation is not usually represented in the results).

`time_offset` The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a signed value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [[RFC5905](#)]

When a measurement controller requests a calibration measurement, the loopback is applied and the result is output in the same format as a normal measurement with additional indication that it is a calibration result. In any measurement, the measurement function SHOULD report its current estimate of time offset as an indicator of

the degree of synchronization.

Both internal loopback calibration and clock synchronization can be used to estimate the *available accuracy* of the Output Metric Units. For example, repeated loopback delay measurements will reveal the portion of the Output result resolution which is the result of system noise, and thus inaccurate.

[7.5.](#) Administrative items

[7.5.1.](#) Status

<current or deprecated>

[7.5.2.](#) Requestor (keep?)

name or RFC, etc.

[7.5.3.](#) Revision

1.0

[7.5.4.](#) Revision Date

YYYY-MM-DD

[7.6.](#) Comments and Remarks

Additional (Informational) details for this entry

[8.](#) UDP Periodic One-way Delay Registry Entries

This section specifies five initial registry entries for the UDP Periodic One-way Delay.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 43]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

Note: Each Registry "Name" below specifies a single registry entry, whose output format varies according to the <statistic> element of the name that specifies one form of statistical summary.

IANA is asked to assign a different numeric identifiers to each of the five Metrics. All column entries beside the ID, Name, Description, and Output Reference Method categories are the same, thus this section proposes five closely-related registry entries. As a result, IANA is also asked to assign corresponding URNs and URLs to each Named Metric.

[8.1.](#) Summary

This category includes multiple indexes to the registry entries, the element ID and metric name.

[8.1.1.](#) ID (Identifier)

<insert numeric identifier, an integer, one corresponding to each name below>

[8.1.2.](#) Name

<insert name according to metric naming convention>

OWDelay_Active_IP-UDP-Periodic-
Payload142B_RFCXXXXsecY_Seconds_<statistic>

where <statistic> is one of:

- o 95Percentile
- o Mean
- o Min
- o Max
- o StdDev

[8.1.3.](#) URIs

URI: Prefix urn:ietf:metrics:perf:<name>

URL: http:\\www.iana.org\ ... <name>

8.1.4. Description

This metric assesses the delay of a stream of packets exchanged between two hosts (or measurement points), and reports the <statistic> One-way delay for all successfully exchanged packets based on their conditional delay distribution.

where <statistic> is one of:

- o 95Percentile
- o Mean
- o Min
- o Max
- o StdDev

8.2. Metric Definition

This category includes columns to prompt the entry of all necessary details related to the metric definition, including the RFC reference and values of input factors, called fixed parameters.

8.2.1. Reference Definition

<Full bibliographic reference to an immutable doc.>

Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., Zekauskas, M., and A. Morton, Ed., "A One-Way Delay Metric for IP Performance Metrics (IPPM)", STD 81, [RFC 7679](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7679, January 2016, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7679>>.

[RFC7679]

Morton, A., and Stephan, E., "Spatial Composition of Metrics", [RFC 6049](#), January 2011.

[RFC6049]

<specific section reference and additional clarifications, if needed>

[Section 3.4 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides the reference definition of the singleton (single value) One-way delay metric. [Section 4.4 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides the reference definition expanded to cover a multi-value sample. Note that terms such as singleton and sample are

defined in [Section 11 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Only successful packet transfers with finite delay are included in the sample, as prescribed in [section 4.1.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#).

[8.2.2](#). Fixed Parameters

<list and specify Fixed Parameters, input factors that must be determined and embedded in the measurement system for use when needed>

Type-P:

- o IPv4 header values:
 - * DSCP: set to 0
 - * TTL: set to 255
 - * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o IPv6 header values:
 - * DSCP: set to 0
 - * Hop Count: set to 255
 - * Protocol: Set to 17 (UDP)
- o UDP header values:
 - * Checksum: the checksum MUST be calculated and included in the header
- o UDP Payload: TWAMP Test Packet Formats, [Section 4.1.2 of \[RFC5357\]](#)
 - * Security features in use influence the number of Padding octets.
 - * 142 octets total, including the TWAMP format

Other measurement parameters:

Tmax: a loss threshold waiting time with value 3.0, expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 5 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) and with resolution of 0.0001 seconds (0.1 ms), with lossless conversion to/from the 32-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6 of \[RFC5905\]](#).

See the Packet Stream generation category for two additional Fixed Parameters.

[8.3.](#) Method of Measurement

This category includes columns for references to relevant sections of the RFC(s) and any supplemental information needed to ensure an unambiguous methods for implementations.

[8.3.1.](#) Reference Method

<for metric, insert relevant section references and supplemental info>

The methodology for this metric is defined as Type-P-One-way-Delay-Poisson-Stream in [section 3.6 of \[RFC7679\]](#) and [section 4.6 of \[RFC7679\]](#) using the Type-P and Tmax defined under Fixed Parameters.

The reference method distinguishes between long-delayed packets and lost packets by implementing a maximum waiting time for packet arrival. Tmax is the waiting time used as the threshold to declare a packet lost. Lost packets SHALL be designated as having undefined delay.

The calculations on the one-way delay SHALL be performed on the conditional distribution, conditioned on successful packet arrival within Tmax. Also, when all packet delays are stored, the process which calculates the one-way delay value MAY enforce the Tmax threshold on stored values before calculations. See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

The reference method requires some way to distinguish between different packets in a stream to establish correspondence between sending times and receiving times for each successfully-arriving packet. Sequence numbers or other send-order identification MUST be retained at the Src or included with each packet to dis-ambiguate packet reordering if it occurs.

Since a standard measurement protocol is employed [[RFC5357](#)], then the measurement process will determine the sequence numbers or timestamps applied to test packets after the Fixed and Runtime parameters are passed to that process. The measurement protocol dictates the format of sequence numbers and time-stamps conveyed in the TWAMP-Test packet payload.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 47]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[8.3.2.](#) Packet Stream Generation

<list of generation parameters and section/spec references if needed>

This section gives the details of the packet traffic which is the basis for measurement. In IPPM metrics, this is called the Stream, and can easily be described by providing the list of stream parameters.

[Section 3 of \[RFC3432\]](#) prescribes the method for generating Periodic streams using associated parameters.

incT the nominal duration of inter-packet interval, first bit to first bit

dT the duration of the interval for allowed sample start times

T0 the actual start time of the periodic stream

NOTE: an initiation process with a number of control exchanges resulting in unpredictable start times (within a time interval) may be sufficient to avoid synchronization of periodic streams, and therefore a valid replacement for selecting a start time at random from a fixed interval.

These stream parameters will be specified as Run-time parameters.

[8.3.3.](#) Traffic Filtering (observation) Details

NA

[8.3.4.](#) Sampling Distribution

NA

[8.3.5.](#) Run-time Parameters and Data Format

Run-time Parameters are input factors that must be determined, configured into the measurement system, and reported with the results for the context to be complete.

<list of run-time parameters, and their data formats>

Src the IP address of the host in the Src Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [Section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

Dst the IP address of the host in the Dst Role (format ipv4-address-no-zone value for IPv4, or ipv6-address-no-zone value for IPv6, see [section 4 of \[RFC6991\]](#))

T0 a time, the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a start time is unspecified and Tf is to be interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval. The start time is controlled through other means.

Tf a time, the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#). When T0 is "all-zeros", a end time date is ignored and Tf is interpreted as the Duration of the measurement interval.

>>> should Periodic run-time params be fixed instead? probably yes if modeling a specific version of tests. Note in the NAME, i.e.

Poisson3.3

[8.3.6.](#) Roles

<lists the names of the different roles from the measurement method>

Src launches each packet and waits for return transmissions from Dst. This is the TWAMP Session-Sender.

Dst waits for each packet from Src and sends a return packet to Src. This is the TWAMP Session-Reflector.

[8.4.](#) Output

This category specifies all details of the Output of measurements using the metric.

[8.4.1.](#) Type

<insert name of the output type, raw or a selected summary statistic>

See subsection titles in Data Format for Types.

[8.4.2.](#) Reference Definition

<describe the data format for each type of result>

For all output types ---

T0 the start of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

Tf the end of a measurement interval, (format "date-and-time" as specified in [Section 5.6 of \[RFC3339\]](#), see also [Section 3 of \[RFC6991\]](#)). The UTC Time Zone is required by [Section 6.1 of \[RFC2330\]](#).

For each <statistic>, one of the following sub-sections apply:

[8.4.2.1](#). Percentile95

The 95th percentile SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the percentile statistic (where Round-trip delay should be substituted for "ipdv").

The percentile = 95, meaning that the reported delay, "95Percentile", is the smallest value of one-way delay for which the Empirical Distribution Function (EDF), $F(95\text{Percentile}) \geq 95\%$ of the singleton one-way delay values in the conditional distribution. See [section 11.3 of \[RFC2330\]](#) for the definition of the percentile statistic using the EDF.

95Percentile The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

[8.4.2.2](#). Mean

The mean SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.2.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for details on calculating this statistic, and 4.2.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#).

Mean The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9

(see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

[8.4.2.3](#). Min

The minimum SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for details on calculating this statistic, and 4.3.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#).

Min The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

[8.4.2.4](#). Max

The maximum SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for a closely related method for calculating this statistic, and 4.3.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#). The formula is as follows:

$$\text{Max} = (\text{FiniteDelay}[j])$$

such that for some index, j , where $1 \leq j \leq N$
 $\text{FiniteDelay}[j] \geq \text{FiniteDelay}[n]$ for all n

Max The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

[8.4.2.5](#). Std_Dev

The Std_Dev SHALL be calculated using the conditional distribution of all packets with a finite value of One-way delay (undefined delays are excluded), a single value as follows:

See [section 4.1 of \[RFC3393\]](#) for details on the conditional distribution to exclude undefined values of delay, and [Section 5 of \[RFC6703\]](#) for background on this analysis choice.

See [section 4.3.2 of \[RFC6049\]](#) for a closely related method for calculating this statistic, and 4.3.3 of [\[RFC6049\]](#). The formula is the classic calculation for standard deviation of a population.

Std_Dev The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a positive value of type decimal64 with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

[8.4.3](#). Metric Units

<insert units for the measured results, and the reference specification>.

The <statistic> of One-way Delay is expressed in seconds.

[8.4.4](#). Calibration

[Section 3.7.3 of \[RFC7679\]](#) provides a means to quantify the systematic and random errors of a time measurement. In-situ calibration could be enabled with an internal loopback that includes as much of the measurement system as possible, performs address manipulation as needed, and provides some form of isolation (e.g., deterministic delay) to avoid send-receive interface contention. Some portion of the random and systematic error can be characterized this way.

For one-way delay measurements, the error calibration must include an assessment of the internal clock synchronization with its external reference (this internal clock is supplying timestamps for measurement). In practice, the time offsets of clocks at both the

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

source and destination are needed to estimate the systematic error due to imperfect clock synchronization (the time offsets are smoothed, thus the random variation is not usually represented in the results).

`time_offset` The time value of the result is expressed in units of seconds, as a signed value of type `decimal64` with fraction digits = 9 (see [section 9.3 of \[RFC6020\]](#)) with resolution of 0.000000001 seconds (1.0 ns), and with lossless conversion to/from the 64-bit NTP timestamp as per [section 6](#) of RFC [\[RFC5905\]](#)

When a measurement controller requests a calibration measurement, the loopback is applied and the result is output in the same format as a normal measurement with additional indication that it is a calibration result. In any measurement, the measurement function SHOULD report its current estimate of time offset as an indicator of the degree of synchronization.

Both internal loopback calibration and clock synchronization can be used to estimate the *available accuracy* of the Output Metric Units. For example, repeated loopback delay measurements will reveal the portion of the Output result resolution which is the result of system noise, and thus inaccurate.

[8.5.](#) Administrative items

[8.5.1.](#) Status

<current or deprecated>

[8.5.2.](#) Requestor (keep?)

name or RFC, etc.

[8.5.3.](#) Revision

1.0

[8.5.4.](#) Revision Date

YYYY-MM-DD

[8.6.](#) Comments and Remarks

Additional (Informational) details for this entry

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 53]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[9.](#) ver08 BLANK Registry Entry

This section gives an initial registry entry for

[9.1.](#) Summary

This category includes multiple indexes to the registry entries, the element ID and metric name.

[9.1.1.](#) ID (Identifier)

<insert numeric identifier, an integer>

[9.1.2.](#) Name

<insert name according to metric naming convention>

[9.1.3.](#) URIs

URI: Prefix urn:iETF:metrics:perf:<name>

URL:

[9.1.4.](#) Description

TBD.

[9.1.5.](#) Reference

<reference to the RFC of spec where the registry entry is defined>

[9.1.6.](#) Change Controller

<org or person >

[9.1.7.](#) Version (of Registry Format)

<currently 1.0>

[9.2.](#) Metric Definition

This category includes columns to prompt the entry of all necessary details related to the metric definition, including the RFC reference and values of input factors, called fixed parameters.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 54]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[9.2.1.](#) Reference Definition

<Full bibliographic reference to an immutable doc.>

<specific section reference and additional clarifications, if needed>

[9.2.2.](#) Fixed Parameters

<list and specify Fixed Parameters, input factors that must be determined and embedded in the measurement system for use when needed>

[9.3.](#) Method of Measurement

This category includes columns for references to relevant sections of the RFC(s) and any supplemental information needed to ensure an unambiguous methods for implementations.

[9.3.1.](#) Reference Method

<for metric, insert relevant section references and supplemental info>

[9.3.2.](#) Packet Stream Generation

<list of generation parameters and section/spec references if needed>

[9.3.3.](#) Traffic Filtering (observation) Details

<insert the measured results based on a filtered version of the packets observed, and this section provides the filter details (when present), and section reference>.

[9.3.4. Sampling Distribution](#)

<insert time distribution details, or how this is diff from the filter>

[9.3.5. Run-time Parameters and Data Format](#)

<list of run-time parameters, and any reference(s)>.

[9.3.6. Roles](#)

<lists the names of the different roles from the measurement method>

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 55]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[9.4. Output](#)

This category specifies all details of the Output of measurements using the metric.

[9.4.1. Type](#)

<insert name of the output type, raw or a selected summary statistic>

[9.4.2. Reference Definition](#)

<pointer to section/spec where output type/format is defined>

[9.4.3. Metric Units](#)

<insert units for the measured results, and the reference specification>.

[9.4.4. Calibration](#)

<describe the error calibration, a way to indicate that the results

were collected in a calibration mode of operation, and a way to report internal status metrics related to calibration, such as time offset>

[9.5.](#) Administrative items

[9.5.1.](#) Status

<current or deprecated>

[9.5.2.](#) Requestor

<name of individual or Internet Draft, etc.>

[9.5.3.](#) Revision

1.0

[9.5.4.](#) Revision Date

YYYY-MM-DD

[9.6.](#) Comments and Remarks

Additional (Informational) details for this entry

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 56]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[10.](#) Example RTCP-XR Registry Entry

This section is MAY BE DELETED or adapted before submission.

This section gives an example registry entry for the end-point metric described in [RFC 7003](#) [[RFC7003](#)], for RTCP-XR Burst/Gap Discard Metric reporting.

[10.1.](#) Registry Indexes

This category includes multiple indexes to the registry entries, the element ID and metric name.

[10.1.1.](#) Identifier

An integer having enough digits to uniquely identify each entry in the Registry.

[10.1.2.](#) Name

A metric naming convention is TBD.

[10.1.3.](#) URI

Prefix urn:ietf:metrics:param:<name>

[10.1.4.](#) Status

current

[10.1.5.](#) Requestor

Alcelip Mornuley

[10.1.6.](#) Revision

1.0

[10.1.7.](#) Revision Date

2014-07-04

[10.1.8.](#) Description

TBD.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 57]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

[10.1.9.](#) Reference Specification(s)

[[RFC3611](#)] [[RFC4566](#)] [[RFC6776](#)] [[RFC6792](#)] [[RFC7003](#)]

[10.2.](#) Metric Definition

This category includes columns to prompt the entry of all necessary

details related to the metric definition, including the RFC reference and values of input factors, called fixed parameters. [Section 3.2 of \[RFC7003\]](#) provides the reference information for this category.

[10.2.1.](#) Reference Definition

Packets Discarded in Bursts:

The total number of packets discarded during discard bursts. The measured value is unsigned value. If the measured value exceeds 0xFFFFFD, the value 0xFFFFFE MUST be reported to indicate an over-range measurement. If the measurement is unavailable, the value 0xFFFFFFFF MUST be reported.

[10.2.2.](#) Fixed Parameters

Fixed Parameters are input factors that must be determined and embedded in the measurement system for use when needed. The values of these parameters is specified in the Registry.

Threshold: 8 bits, set to value = 3 packets.

The Threshold is equivalent to Gmin in [\[RFC3611\]](#), i.e., the number of successive packets that must not be discarded prior to and following a discard packet in order for this discarded packet to be regarded as part of a gap. Note that the Threshold is set in accordance with the Gmin calculation defined in [Section 4.7.2 of \[RFC3611\]](#).

Interval Metric flag: 2 bits, set to value 11=Cumulative Duration

This field is used to indicate whether the burst/gap discard metrics are Sampled, Interval, or Cumulative metrics [\[RFC6792\]](#):

I=10: Interval Duration - the reported value applies to the most recent measurement interval duration between successive metrics reports.

I=11: Cumulative Duration - the reported value applies to the accumulation period characteristic of cumulative measurements.

Senders MUST NOT use the values I=00 or I=01.

10.3. Method of Measurement

This category includes columns for references to relevant sections of the RFC(s) and any supplemental information needed to ensure unambiguous methods for implementations. For the Burst/Gap Discard Metric, it appears that the only guidance on methods of measurement is in [Section 3.0 of \[RFC7003\]](#) and its supporting references. Relevant information is repeated below, although there appears to be no section titled "Method of Measurement" in [\[RFC7003\]](#).

10.3.1. Reference Method

Metrics in this block report on burst/gap discard in the stream arriving at the RTP system. Measurements of these metrics are made at the receiving end of the RTP stream. Instances of this metrics block use the synchronization source (SSRC) to refer to the separate auxiliary Measurement Information Block [\[RFC6776\]](#), which describes measurement periods in use (see [\[RFC6776\], Section 4.2](#)).

This metrics block relies on the measurement period in the Measurement Information Block indicating the span of the report. Senders MUST send this block in the same compound RTCP packet as the Measurement Information Block. Receivers MUST verify that the measurement period is received in the same compound RTCP packet as this metrics block. If not, this metrics block MUST be discarded.

10.3.2. Stream Type and Stream Parameters

Since RTCP-XR Measurements are conducted on live RTP traffic, the complete description of the stream is contained in SDP messages that proceed the establishment of a compatible stream between two or more communicating hosts. See Run-time Parameters, below.

10.3.3. Output Type and Data Format

The output type defines the type of result that the metric produces.

- o Value: Packets Discarded in Bursts
- o Data Format: 24 bits
- o Reference: [Section 3.2 of \[RFC7003\]](#)

10.3.4. Metric Units

The measured results are apparently expressed in packets, although there is no section of [\[RFC7003\]](#) titled "Metric Units".

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

10.3.5. Run-time Parameters and Data Format

Run-Time Parameters are input factors that must be determined, configured into the measurement system, and reported with the results for the context to be complete. However, the values of these parameters is not specified in the Registry, rather these parameters are listed as an aid to the measurement system implementor or user (they must be left as variables, and supplied on execution).

The Data Format of each Run-time Parameter SHALL be specified in this column, to simplify the control and implementation of measurement devices.

SSRC of Source: 32 bits As defined in [Section 4.1 of \[RFC3611\]](#).

SDP Parameters: As defined in [\[RFC4566\]](#)

Session description v= (protocol version number, currently only 0)

o= (originator and session identifier : username, id, version number, network address)

s= (session name : mandatory with at least one UTF-8-encoded character)

i=* (session title or short information) u=* (URI of description)

e=* (zero or more email address with optional name of contacts)

p=* (zero or more phone number with optional name of contacts)

c=* (connection information--not required if included in all media)

b=* (zero or more bandwidth information lines) One or more Time descriptions ("t=" and "r=" lines; see below)

z=* (time zone adjustments)

k=* (encryption key)

a=* (zero or more session attribute lines)

Zero or more Media descriptions (each one starting by an "m=" line;

see below)

m= (media name and transport address)

i=* (media title or information field)

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 60]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

c=* (connection information -- optional if included at session level)

b=* (zero or more bandwidth information lines)

k=* (encryption key)

a=* (zero or more media attribute lines -- overriding the Session attribute lines)

An example Run-time SDP description follows:

v=0

o=jdoe 2890844526 2890842807 IN IP4 192.0.2.5

s=SDP Seminar i=A Seminar on the session description protocol

u=http://www.example.com/seminars/sdp.pdf e=j.doe@example.com (Jane Doe)

c=IN IP4 233.252.0.12/127

t=2873397496 2873404696

a=recvonly

m=audio 49170 RTP/AVP 0

m=video 51372 RTP/AVP 99

a=rtpmap:99 h263-1998/90000

[10.4.](#) Comments and Remarks

TBD.

11. Revision History

This section may be removed for publication. It contains partial information on updates.

This draft replaced [draft-mornuley-ippm-initial-registry](#).

In version 02, [Section 4](#) has been edited to reflect recent discussion on the ippm-list: * Removed the combination of "Raw" and left 95th percentile. * Hanging Indent on Run-time parameters (Fixed parameters use bullet lists and other indenting formats. * Payload format for

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 61]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

measurement has been removed. * Explanation of Conditional delay distribution.

Version 03 addressed Phil Eardley's comments and suggestions in sections [1-4](#). and resolved the definition of Percentiles.

Version 04 * All [section 4](#) parameters reference YANG types for alternate data formats. * Discussion has concluded that usecase(s) for machine parse-able registry columns are not needed.

12. Security Considerations

These registry entries represent no known security implications for Internet Security. Each referenced Metric contains a Security Considerations section.

13. IANA Considerations

IANA is requested to populate The Performance Metric Registry defined in [[I-D.ietf-ippm-metric-registry](#)] with the values defined above.

See the IANA Considerations section of [[I-D.ietf-ippm-metric-registry](#)] for additional requests and considerations.

14. Acknowledgements

The authors thank Brian Trammell for suggesting the term "Run-time Parameters", which led to the distinction between run-time and fixed

parameters implemented in this memo, for identifying the IPFIX metric with Flow Key as an example, and for many other productive suggestions. Thanks to Peter Koch, who provided several useful suggestions for disambiguating successive DNS Queries in the DNS Response time metric.

The authors also acknowledge the constructive reviews and helpful suggestions from Barbara Stark, Juergen Schoenwaelder, Tim Carey, and participants in the LMAP working group. Thanks to Michelle Cotton for her early IANA review, and to Amanda Barber for answering questions related to the presentation of the registry and accessibility of the complete template via URL.

15. References

Morton, et al. Expires September 10, 2017 [Page 62]

Internet-Draft Initial Registry March 2017

15.1. Normative References

- [I-D.ietf-ippm-metric-registry]
Bagnulo, M., Claise, B., Eardley, P., and A. Morton,
"Registry for Performance Metrics", Internet Draft (work
in progress) [draft-ietf-ippm-metric-registry](#), 2014.

- [RFC1035] Mockapetris, P., "Domain names - implementation and
specification", STD 13, [RFC 1035](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC1035,
November 1987, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc1035>>.

- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate
Requirement Levels", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 2119](#),
DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997,
<<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119>>.

- [RFC2330] Paxson, V., Almes, G., Mahdavi, J., and M. Mathis,
"Framework for IP Performance Metrics", [RFC 2330](#),
DOI 10.17487/RFC2330, May 1998,
<<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2330>>.

- [RFC2679] Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., and M. Zekauskas, "A One-way

Delay Metric for IPPM", [RFC 2679](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC2679, September 1999, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2679>>.

- [RFC2680] Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., and M. Zekauskas, "A One-way Packet Loss Metric for IPPM", [RFC 2680](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC2680, September 1999, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2680>>.
- [RFC2681] Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., and M. Zekauskas, "A Round-trip Delay Metric for IPPM", [RFC 2681](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC2681, September 1999, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2681>>.
- [RFC3339] Klyne, G. and C. Newman, "Date and Time on the Internet: Timestamps", [RFC 3339](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3339, July 2002, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3339>>.
- [RFC3393] Demichelis, C. and P. Chimento, "IP Packet Delay Variation Metric for IP Performance Metrics (IPPM)", [RFC 3393](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3393, November 2002, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3393>>.
- [RFC3432] Raisanen, V., Grotefeld, G., and A. Morton, "Network performance measurement with periodic streams", [RFC 3432](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3432, November 2002, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3432>>.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 63]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

- [RFC4737] Morton, A., Ciavattone, L., Ramachandran, G., Shalunov, S., and J. Perser, "Packet Reordering Metrics", [RFC 4737](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC4737, November 2006, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4737>>.
- [RFC5357] Hedayat, K., Krzanowski, R., Morton, A., Yum, K., and J. Babiarz, "A Two-Way Active Measurement Protocol (TWAMP)", [RFC 5357](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC5357, October 2008, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5357>>.
- [RFC5905] Mills, D., Martin, J., Ed., Burbank, J., and W. Kasch, "Network Time Protocol Version 4: Protocol and Algorithms Specification", [RFC 5905](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC5905, June 2010, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5905>>.

- [RFC6020] Bjorklund, M., Ed., "YANG - A Data Modeling Language for the Network Configuration Protocol (NETCONF)", [RFC 6020](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6020, October 2010, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6020>>.
- [RFC6049] Morton, A. and E. Stephan, "Spatial Composition of Metrics", [RFC 6049](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6049, January 2011, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6049>>.
- [RFC6673] Morton, A., "Round-Trip Packet Loss Metrics", [RFC 6673](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6673, August 2012, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6673>>.
- [RFC6991] Schoenwaelder, J., Ed., "Common YANG Data Types", [RFC 6991](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6991, July 2013, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6991>>.
- [RFC7679] Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., Zekauskas, M., and A. Morton, Ed., "A One-Way Delay Metric for IP Performance Metrics (IPPM)", STD 81, [RFC 7679](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7679, January 2016, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7679>>.
- [RFC7680] Almes, G., Kalidindi, S., Zekauskas, M., and A. Morton, Ed., "A One-Way Loss Metric for IP Performance Metrics (IPPM)", STD 82, [RFC 7680](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7680, January 2016, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7680>>.

15.2. Informative References

- [Brow00] Brownlee, N., "Packet Matching for NeTraMet Distributions", March 2000.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 64]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

- [RFC1242] Bradner, S., "Benchmarking Terminology for Network Interconnection Devices", [RFC 1242](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC1242, July 1991, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc1242>>.
- [RFC3611] Friedman, T., Ed., Caceres, R., Ed., and A. Clark, Ed., "RTP Control Protocol Extended Reports (RTCP XR)", [RFC 3611](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3611, November 2003, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3611>>.

- [RFC4148] Stephan, E., "IP Performance Metrics (IPPM) Metrics Registry", [BCP 108](#), [RFC 4148](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC4148, August 2005, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4148>>.
- [RFC4566] Handley, M., Jacobson, V., and C. Perkins, "SDP: Session Description Protocol", [RFC 4566](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC4566, July 2006, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4566>>.
- [RFC5472] Zseby, T., Boschi, E., Brownlee, N., and B. Claise, "IP Flow Information Export (IPFIX) Applicability", [RFC 5472](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC5472, March 2009, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5472>>.
- [RFC5477] Dietz, T., Claise, B., Aitken, P., Dressler, F., and G. Carle, "Information Model for Packet Sampling Exports", [RFC 5477](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC5477, March 2009, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5477>>.
- [RFC5481] Morton, A. and B. Claise, "Packet Delay Variation Applicability Statement", [RFC 5481](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC5481, March 2009, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5481>>.
- [RFC6248] Morton, A., "[RFC 4148](#) and the IP Performance Metrics (IPPM) Registry of Metrics Are Obsolete", [RFC 6248](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6248, April 2011, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6248>>.
- [RFC6390] Clark, A. and B. Claise, "Guidelines for Considering New Performance Metric Development", [BCP 170](#), [RFC 6390](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6390, October 2011, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6390>>.
- [RFC6703] Morton, A., Ramachandran, G., and G. Maguluri, "Reporting IP Network Performance Metrics: Different Points of View", [RFC 6703](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6703, August 2012, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6703>>.

Morton, et al.

Expires September 10, 2017

[Page 65]

Internet-Draft

Initial Registry

March 2017

- [RFC6776] Clark, A. and Q. Wu, "Measurement Identity and Information

Reporting Using a Source Description (SDS) Item and an RTCP Extended Report (XR) Block", [RFC 6776](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6776, October 2012, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6776>>.

[RFC6792] Wu, Q., Ed., Hunt, G., and P. Arden, "Guidelines for Use of the RTP Monitoring Framework", [RFC 6792](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6792, November 2012, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6792>>.

[RFC7003] Clark, A., Huang, R., and Q. Wu, Ed., "RTP Control Protocol (RTCP) Extended Report (XR) Block for Burst/Gap Discard Metric Reporting", [RFC 7003](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7003, September 2013, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7003>>.

[RFC7594] Eardley, P., Morton, A., Bagnulo, M., Burbridge, T., Aitken, P., and A. Akhter, "A Framework for Large-Scale Measurement of Broadband Performance (LMAP)", [RFC 7594](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7594, September 2015, <<http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7594>>.

Authors' Addresses

Al Morton
AT&T Labs
200 Laurel Avenue South
Middletown,, NJ 07748
USA

Phone: +1 732 420 1571
Fax: +1 732 368 1192
Email: acmorton@att.com
URI: <http://home.comcast.net/~acmacm/>

Marcelo Bagnulo
Universidad Carlos III de Madrid
Av. Universidad 30
Leganes, Madrid 28911
SPAIN

Phone: 34 91 6249500
Email: marcelo@it.uc3m.es
URI: <http://www.it.uc3m.es>

Philip Eardley
BT
Adastral Park, Martlesham Heath
Ipswich
ENGLAND

Email: philip.eardley@bt.com

Kevin D'Souza
AT&T Labs
200 Laurel Avenue South
Middletown,, NJ 07748
USA

Phone: +1 732 420 xxxx
Email: kld@att.com

