Network Working Group Internet-Draft S. Bradner
Harvard University
Jorge Contreras
WilmerHale
Editors
February 2007

## Rights Contributions provide to the IETF Trust

<<u>draft-ietf-ipr-3978-incoming-00.txt</u>>

#### Status of this Memo

By submitting this Internet-Draft, each author represents that any applicable patent or other IPR claims of which he or she is aware have been or will be disclosed, and any of which he or she becomes aware will be disclosed, in accordance with <u>Section 6 of BCP 79</u>.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at <a href="http://www.ietf.org/ietf/lid-abstracts.txt">http://www.ietf.org/ietf/lid-abstracts.txt</a>.

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at <a href="http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html">http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html</a>.

This Internet-Draft will expire on August 26, 2007.

#### Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) The IETF Trust (2007).

## Abstract

The IETF policies about rights in Contributions to the IETF are designed to ensure that such Contributions can be made available to the IETF and Internet communities while permitting the authors to retain as many rights as possible. This memo details the IETF policies on rights in Contributions to the IETF. It also describes the objectives that the policies are designed to meet. This memo obsoletes  $\frac{RFC}{3978}$  and, with  $\frac{RFC}{3979}$  and  $\frac{RFC}{3979}$  and  $\frac{RFC}{3979}$  and  $\frac{RFC}{3979}$ 

replaces <u>Section 10 of RFC 2026</u>.

#### Table of Contents

- 1. Definitions
- 2. Introduction
- 3. Rights in IETF Contributions
- 3.1. General Policy
- 3.2. Confidentiality Obligations
- 3.3. Granting of Rights and Permissions
- 3.4. Representations and Warranties
- 3.5. No Duty to Publish
- 3.6. Trademarks
- 4. Rights in RFC Editor Contributions
- 4.1. Requirements from Section 3
- 4.2. Granting of Rights and Permissions
- 5. Notices Required in IETF Documents
- 5.1. IPR Disclosure Acknowledgement
- 5.2. Derivative Works Limitation
- 5.3. Publication Limitation
- 5.4. Copyright Notice
- 5.5. Disclaimer
- 5.6. Exceptions
- 6. Notices and Rights Required in RFC Editor Contributions
- 7. Exposition of why these procedures are the way they are
- 7.1. Rights Granted in IETF Contributions
- 7.2. Rights to use Contributed Material
- 7.3. Right to Produce Derivative Works
- 7.4. Rights to use Trademarks
- 7.5. Who Does This Apply To?
- 8. Contributions Not Subject to Copyright
- 9. Security Considerations
- 10. References
- 10.1. Normative References
- 10.2. Informative References
- 11. Acknowledgements

Editor's Address

Full Copyright Statement

## 1. Definitions

The following definitions are for terms used in the context of this document. Other terms, including "IESG," "ISOC," "IAB," and "RFC Editor," are defined in [RFC2028].

a. "IETF": In the context of this document, the IETF includes all individuals who participate in meetings, working groups, mailing lists, functions and other activities which are organized or

Bradner & Contreras [Page 2]

initiated by ISOC, the IESG or the IAB under the general designation of the Internet Engineering Task Force or IETF, but solely to the extent of such participation.

- b. "IETF Standards Process": the activities undertaken by the IETF in any of the settings described in 1(c) below.
- c. "IETF Contribution": any submission to the IETF intended by the Contributor for publication as all or part of an Internet-Draft or RFC (except for RFC Editor Contributions described below) and any statement made within the context of an IETF activity. Such statements include oral statements in IETF sessions, as well as written and electronic communications made at any time or place, which are addressed to:
  - o the IETF plenary session,
  - o any IETF working group or portion thereof,
  - o the IESG, or any member thereof on behalf of the IESG,
  - o the IAB or any member thereof on behalf of the IAB,
  - o any IETF mailing list, including the IETF list itself, any working group or design team list, or any other list functioning under IETF auspices,
  - o the RFC Editor or the Internet-Drafts function (except for RFC Editor Contributions described below).

Statements made outside of an IETF session, mailing list or other function, that are clearly not intended to be input to an IETF activity, group or function, are not IETF Contributions in the context of this document.

- d. "Internet-Draft": temporary documents used in the IETF and RFC Editor processes. Internet-Drafts are posted on the IETF web site by the IETF Secretariat and have a nominal maximum lifetime in the Secretariat's public directory of 6 months, after which they are removed. Note that Internet-Drafts are archived many places on the Internet, and not all of these places remove expired Internet-Drafts. Internet-Drafts that are under active consideration by the IESG are not removed from the Secretariat's public directory until that consideration is complete. In addition, the author of an Internet-Draft can request that the lifetime in the Secretariat's public directory be extended before the expiration.
- e. "RFC": the basic publication series for the IETF. RFCs are published by the RFC Editor and once published are never modified. (See [RFC2026] Section 2.1)
- f. "RFC Editor Contribution": An Internet-Draft intended by the Contributor to be submitted to the RFC Editor for publication as

an Informational or Experimental RFC but not intended to be part of the IETF Standards Process.

- g. "IETF Internet-Drafts": Internet-Drafts other than RFC Editor Contributions. Note that under <u>Section 3.3</u> the grant of rights in regards to IETF Internet-Drafts as specified in this document is perpetual and irrevocable and thus survives the Secretariat's removal of an Internet-Draft from the public directory, except as limited by <u>Section 3.3</u> (C). (See [<u>RFC2026</u>] Sections <u>2.2</u> and <u>8</u>)
- h. "IETF Documents": RFCs and Internet-Drafts except for Internet-Drafts that are RFC Editor Contributions and the RFCs that are published from them.
- i. "RFC Editor Documents": RFCs and Internet-Drafts that are RFC Editor Contributions and the RFCs that may be published from them.
- j. "Contribution": IETF Contributions and RFC Editor Contributions.
- k. "Contributor": an individual submitting a Contribution.
- 1. "Reasonably and personally known": means something an individual knows personally or, because of the job the individual holds, would reasonably be expected to know. This wording is used to indicate that an organization cannot purposely keep an individual in the dark about patents or patent applications just to avoid the disclosure requirement. But this requirement should not be interpreted as requiring the IETF Contributor or participant (or his or her represented organization, if any) to perform a patent search to find applicable IPR.

#### 2. Introduction

Under the laws of most countries and current international treaties (for example the "Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Work" [Berne]), authors obtain numerous rights in the works they produce automatically upon producing them. These rights include copyrights, moral rights and other rights. In many cases, if the author produces a work within the scope of his or her employment, most of those rights are usually assigned to the employer, either by operation of law or, in many cases, under contract. (The Berne Convention names some rights as "inalienable", which means that the author retains them in all cases.)

This document details the rights that the IETF requires in IETF Contributions and rights the IETF, as publisher of Internet-Drafts, requires in all such Drafts including RFC Editor Contributions. The

RFC Editor may also define additional rights required for RFC Editor Contributions. This document obsoletes <a href="RFC 3978">RFC 3978</a> [RFC3978].

In order for works to be used within the IETF Standards Process or to be published as Internet-Drafts, certain limited rights in all Contributions must be granted to the IETF Trust and the IETF. In addition, Contributors must make representations to IETF Trust and the IETF regarding their ability to grant these rights. These necessary rights and representations have until now been laid out in Section 10 of [RFC2026]. In the years since [RFC2026] was published there have been a number of times when the exact intent of Section 10 has been the subject of vigorous debate within the IETF community. The aim of this document is to clarify various ambiguities in Section 10 of [RFC2026] that led to these debates and to amplify the policy in order to clarify what the IETF is currently doing.

Section 1 gives definitions used in describing these policies. Sections 3, 4, 5, and 6 of this document address the rights in Contributions previously covered by Section 10 of [RFC2026] and the "Note Well" explanatory text presented at many IETF activities. Sections 7 and 8 then explain the rationale for these provisions, including some of the clarifications that have become understood since the adoption of [RFC2026]. The rules and procedures set out in this document are not intended to substantially modify or alter the IETF's current policy toward Contributions.

A companion document [RFC3979] deals with rights in technologies developed or specified as part of the IETF Standards Process. This document is not intended to address those issues.

The rights addressed in this document fall into the following categories:

- o rights to make use of contributed material
- o copyrights in IETF documents
- o rights to produce derivative works
- o rights to use trademarks

This document is not intended as legal advice. Readers are advised to consult their own legal advisors if they would like a legal interpretation of their rights or the rights of the IETF in any Contributions they make.

# 2.1 No Retroactive Effect

This memo does not retroactively obtain additional rights from Contributions that predate the publication of this memo as a RFC.

# 2.2 Boilerplate updates by the IETF Trust

In the past the IETF has had to publish new RFCs to make editorial or other minor updates to the boilerplate required on IETF Internet Drafts. This memo grants to the IETF Trust the explicit right to approve minor boilerplate changes as long as any such changes are consistent with philosophical goals of the current versions of the BCPs defining the IETF's philosophical goals for contributions. The IETF Trust is also authorized to handle special cases and fix minor errors.

## 3. Rights in IETF Contributions

The following are the rights the IETF requires in all IETF Contributions:

## **3.1**. General Policy

In all matters of copyright and document procedures, the intent is to benefit the Internet community and the public at large, while respecting the legitimate rights of others.

By submission of a Contribution, each person actually submitting the Contribution, and each named co-Contributor, is deemed to agree to the terms and conditions set forth in this document, on his or her own behalf and on behalf of the organization the Contributor represents or is sponsored by (if any), when submitting the Contribution.

## 3.2. Confidentiality Obligations

No information or document that is subject to any requirement of confidentiality or any restriction on its dissemination may be submitted as a Contribution or otherwise considered in any part of the IETF Standards Process, and there must be no assumption of any confidentiality obligation with respect to any Contribution. Each Contributor agrees that any statement in a Contribution, whether generated automatically or otherwise, that states or implies that the Contribution is confidential or subject to any privilege, can be disregarded for all purposes, and will be of no force or effect.

# 3.3. Rights Granted by Contributors to the IETF Trust

To the extent that a Contribution or any portion thereof is protected by copyright or other rights of authorship, the Contributor, and each named co-Contributor, and the organization he or she represents or is sponsored by (if any) grant a perpetual, irrevocable, non-exclusive, royalty-free, world-wide right and license to the IETF Trust under all such copyrights and other rights in the Contribution.

[editor question - since the IETF trust does not actually make modified versions etc - should this say "permit the copying, publication, ... of the Contribution ..."]

- (A) to copy, publish, display, and distribute the Contribution, in whole or in part,
- (B) to prepare translations of the Contribution into languages other than English, and to copy, publish, display, and distribute such translations or portions thereof,
- (C) unless explicitly disallowed in the notices contained in a Contribution [as per <u>Section 5.2</u> below], to modify or prepare derivative works (in addition to translations) that are based on or incorporate all or part of the Contribution, and to copy, publish, display, and distribute such derivative works, and
- (D) to reproduce any trademarks, service marks or trade names which are included in the Contribution solely in connection with the reproduction, distribution or publication of the Contribution and derivative works thereof as permitted by this <a href="Section 3.3">Section 3.3</a>, provided that when reproducing Contributions, trademark and service mark identifiers used in the Contribution, including TM and (r) will be preserved.

The licenses granted in this <u>Section 3.3</u> shall not be deemed to grant any right under any patent, patent application or other similar intellectual property right disclosed by the Contributor under <u>BCP 79</u> or otherwise.

## 3.4. Representations and Warranties

With respect to each Contribution, each Contributor represents that to the best of his or her knowledge and ability:

- a. The Contribution properly acknowledges all major Contributors. A major Contributor is any person who has materially or substantially contributed to the IETF Contribution.
- b. No information in the Contribution is confidential and the IETF, IETF Trust, ISOC, and its affiliated organizations may freely disclose any information in the Contribution.
- c. There are no limits to the Contributor's ability to make the grants, acknowledgments and agreements herein that are reasonably and personally known to the Contributor.

Bradner & Contreras

[Page 7]

- d. The Contributor has not intentionally included in the Contribution any material which is defamatory or untrue or which is illegal under the laws of the jurisdiction in which the Contributor has his or her principal place of business or residence.
- e. All trademarks, trade names, service marks and other proprietary names used in the Contribution that are reasonably and personally known to the Contributor are clearly designated as such where reasonable.

# 3.5. No Duty to Publish

The Contributor, and each named co-Contributor, acknowledges that the IETF has no duty to publish or otherwise use or disseminate any Contribution. The IETF reserves the right to withdraw or cease using any Contribution that does not comply with the requirements of Section 3.3 and Section 3.4 or 4.2.

#### 3.6. Trademarks

Contributors, and each named co-Contributor, who claim trademark rights in terms used in their IETF Contributions are requested to state specifically what conditions apply to implementers of the technology relative to the use of such trademarks. Such statements should be submitted in the same way as is done for other intellectual property claims. (See <a href="[RFC3979]">[RFC3979]</a> <a href="Section 6">Section 6</a>.)

## 4. Rights in RFC Editor Contributions

The following are the rights the IETF, as the publisher of Internet-Drafts, requires in all RFC Editor Contributions:

## 4.1. Requirements from <u>Section 3</u>

All RFC Editor Contributions must meet the requirements of Sections 3.1, 3.2, 3.4, 3.5 and 3.6.

# 4.2. Granting of Rights and Permissions

By submission of an RFC Editor Contribution, each person actually submitting the RFC Editor Contribution, and each named co-Contributor, is deemed to agree to the following terms and conditions, and to grant the following rights, on his or her own behalf and on behalf of the organization the Contributor represents or is sponsored by (if any) when submitting the RFC Editor Contribution.

To the extent that an RFC Editor Contribution or any portion thereof

is protected by copyright and other rights of authorship, the Contributor, and each named co-Contributor, and the organization he or she represents or is sponsored by (if any) grant a perpetual, irrevocable, non-exclusive, royalty-free, world-wide right and license to the IETF Trust and the IETF under all intellectual property rights in the RFC Editor Contribution for at least the life of the Internet-Draft:

- (A) to copy, publish, display, and distribute the RFC Editor Contribution as an Internet-Draft,
- (B) to prepare or allow the preparation of translations of the RFC into languages other than English.
- (C) unless explicitly disallowed in the notices contained in an RFC Editor Contribution (as per <u>Section 5.2</u> below), to prepare derivative works (other than translations) that are based on or incorporate all or part of the RFC Editor Contribution, or comment upon it. The license to such derivative works not granting the IETF Trust and the IETF any more rights than the license to the original RFC Editor Contribution, and
- (D) to reproduce any trademarks, service marks or trade names which are included in the RFC Editor Contribution solely in connection with the reproduction, distribution or publication of the RFC Editor Contribution and derivative works thereof as permitted by this paragraph. When reproducing RFC Editor Contributions, the IETF will preserve trademark and service mark identifiers used by the Contributor of the RFC Editor Contribution, including (TM) and (R) where appropriate.

#### Notices Required in IETF Documents

The IETF requires that certain notices and disclaimers described in this <u>Section 5</u> be reproduced verbatim in all IETF Documents (including copies, derivative works and translations of IETF Documents, but subject to the limited exceptions noted in <u>Section 5.2</u>). This requirement protects IETF and its participants from liabilities connected with these documents. The copyright notice also alerts readers that the document is an IETF Document, and that IETF Trust claims copyright rights to certain aspects of the document, such as its layout, the RFC numbering convention and the prefatory language of the document. This legend is not intended to imply that IETF Trust has obtained ownership of the IETF Contribution itself, which is retained by the author(s) or remains in the public domain, as applicable.

Each IETF Document must include the required notices described in this <u>Section 5</u>. The required notices are the following:

- a. The IPR Disclosure Acknowledgement described in <u>Section 5.1</u> (required in all Internet-Drafts).
- b. The Derivative Works Limitation described in <u>Section 5.2</u> (for specific IETF Documents only).
- c. The Publication Limitation described in <u>Section 5.3</u> (for specific types of Internet-Drafts only).
- d. The Copyright Notice described in <u>Section 5.4</u> (for all IETF Documents).
- e. The Disclaimer described in Section 5.5 (for all IETF Documents).

# 5.1. IPR Disclosure Acknowledgement (required in all Internet-Drafts)

"By submitting this Internet-Draft, each author represents that any applicable patent or other IPR claims of which he or she is aware have been or will be disclosed, and any of which he or she becomes aware will be disclosed, in accordance with <a href="Section 6 of BCP 79">Section 6 of BCP 79</a>."

## **5.2**. Derivative Works Limitation

If the Contributor desires to eliminate the IETF's right to make modifications and derivative works of an IETF Contribution (other than translations), one of the two of the following notices may be included in the Status of Memo section of an Internet-Draft and included in a published RFC:

- a. "This document may not be modified, and derivative works of it may not be created, except to publish it as an RFC and to translate it into languages other than English."
- b. "This document may not be modified, and derivative works of it may not be created."

In the cases of MIB or PIB modules and in other cases where the Contribution includes material that is meant to be extracted in order to be used, the following should be appended to statement 5.2 (a) or 5.2 (b):

"other than to extract section XX as-is for separate use."

Notice 5.2(a) is used if the Contributor intends for the IETF Contribution to be published as an RFC. Notice 5.2(b) is used along with the Publication Limitation in <u>Section 5.3</u> when the Contributor does not intend for the IETF Contribution to be published as an RFC.

These notices may not be used with any standards-track document or with most working group documents, except as discussed in <u>Section 7.3</u> below, since the IETF must retain change control over its documents and the ability to augment, clarify and enhance the original IETF Contribution in accordance with the IETF Standards Process.

Notice 5.2(a) may be appropriate when republishing standards produced by other (non-IETF) standards organizations, industry consortia or companies. These are typically published as Informational RFCs, and do not require that change control be ceded to the IETF. Basically, documents of this type convey information for the Internet community.

A fuller discussion of the rationale behind these requirements is contained in <u>Section 7.3</u> below.

#### **5.3.** Publication Limitation

If the Contributor only wants the IETF Contribution to be made available in an Internet-Draft (i.e., does not want the IETF Contribution to be published as an RFC) then the Contributor may include the following notice in the Status of Memo section of the Internet-Draft.

"This document may only be posted in an Internet-Draft."

This notice can be used on IETF Contributions that are intended to provide background information to educate and to facilitate discussions within IETF working groups but are not intended to be published as RFCs.

## <u>5.4</u>. Copyright Notice (required for all IETF Documents)

(Normally placed at the end of the IETF Document.)

"Copyright (C) The IETF Trust (year).

This document is subject to the rights, licenses and restrictions contained in  $\underline{\text{BCP }78}$ , and except as set forth therein, the authors retain all their rights."

Copyright notices from other organizations or individuals are not permitted in IETF Documents except in the case where such document is the product of a joint development effort between the IETF and another standards development organization or the document is a republication of the work of another standards organization. Such exceptions must be approved on an individual basis by the IAB.

#### **5.5.** Disclaimer (required in all IETF Documents)

Bradner & Contreras

(Normally placed at the end of the IETF Document after the copyright notice.)

"This document and the information contained herein are provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE CONTRIBUTOR, THE ORGANIZATION HE/SHE REPRESENTS OR IS SPONSORED BY (IF ANY), THE INTERNET SOCIETY, THE IETF TRUST AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIM ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE."

# <u>5.6</u>. Exceptions

Notwithstanding the provisions of this <u>Section 5</u>, in certain limited cases an abbreviated notice may be placed on certain types of derivative works of IETF Documents in accordance with this <u>Section 5.6</u>.

a. in MIB modules, PIB modules and similar material commonly extracted from IETF Documents, except for material that is being placed under IANA maintenance, the following abbreviated notice shall be included in the body of the material that will be extracted in lieu of the notices otherwise required by <a href="Section 5">Section 5</a>:

"Copyright (C) The IETF Trust <year>. This version of this MIB module is part of RFC XXXX; see the RFC itself for full legal notices."

When the MIB or PIB module is the initial version of a module that is to be maintained by the IANA, the following abbreviated notice shall be included:

"Copyright (C) The IETF Trust <year>. The initial version of this MIB module was published in RFC XXXX; for full legal notices see the RFC itself. Supplementary information may be available at: <a href="http://www.ietf.org/copyrights/ianamib.html">http://www.ietf.org/copyrights/ianamib.html</a>."

For other types of components than "MIB", substitute "MIB module" with an appropriate identifier. In the case of MIB and PIB modules this statement should be placed in the DESCRIPTION clause of the MODULE-IDENTITY macro.

Variations of these abbreviated notices are not permitted except in cases where the material to be extracted is the product of a joint development effort between the IETF and another standards development organization or is a republication of the work of another standards organization. Such variations must be approved

on an individual basis by the IAB.

b. short excerpts of IETF Documents presented in electronic help systems, for example, the DESCRIPTION clauses for MIB variables, do not need to include a copyright notice.

## 6. Notices and Rights Required in RFC Editor Contributions

Since the IETF acts as publisher of Internet Drafts, even for Internet Drafts that are not intended to become part of the Standards Process, the following are required in all such drafts to protect the IETF and its processes. The RFC Editor may require additional notices.

- a. An IPR Disclosure Acknowledgement, identical to that specified in Section 5.1.
- b. One of the following three copyright release statements:
  - A. "By submitting this Internet-Draft, I accept the provisions of Section 3 of BCP 78."
  - B. "By submitting this Internet-Draft, I accept the provisions of Section 4 of BCP 78."
  - C. The Copyright Notice specified in <u>Section 5.4</u> and the disclaimer specified in <u>section 5.5</u>.

# 7. Exposition of Why These Procedures Are the Way They Are

# 7.1. Rights Granted in IETF Contributions

The IETF Trust and IETF must obtain the right to publish an IETF Contribution as an RFC or an Internet-Draft from the Contributors.

A primary objective of this policy is to obtain from the document authors only the non-exclusive rights that are needed to develop and publish IETF Documents and to use the IETF Contributions in the IETF Standards Process while leaving all other rights with the authors.

The non-exclusive rights that the IETF needs are:

- a. the right to publish the document
- b. the right to let the document be freely reproduced in the formats that the IETF publishes it in
- c. the right to let third parties translate it into languages other than English .ti -3 d. except where explicitly excluded (see Section 5.2), the right to make derivative works within the IETF

process.

e. the right to let third parties extract some logical parts, for example MIB modules

The authors retain all other rights, but cannot withdraw the above rights from the IETF Trust and IETF.

#### 7.2. Rights to use Contributed Material

Because, under the laws of most countries and applicable international treaties, copyright rights come into existence whenever a work of authorship is created (but see <a href="Section 8">Section 8</a> below regarding public domain documents), and IETF cannot make use of IETF Contributions if it does not have sufficient rights with respect to these copyright rights, it is important that the IETF receive assurances from all Contributors that they have the authority to grant the IETF the rights that they claim to grant. Without this assurance, IETF and its participants would run a greater risk of liability to the owners of these rights.

To this end, IETF asks Contributors to give the assurances in  $\frac{\text{Section}}{3.4}$  above. These assurances are requested, however, only to the extent of the Contributor's reasonable and personal knowledge. (See  $\frac{\text{Section 1}}{1}$ )

### 7.3. Right to Produce Derivative Works

The IETF needs to be able to evolve IETF Documents in response to experience gained in the deployment of the technologies described in such IETF Documents, to incorporate developments in research and to react to changing conditions on the Internet and other IP networks. In order to do this the IETF must be able to produce derivatives of its documents; thus the IETF must obtain the right from Contributors to produce derivative works.

The right to produce derivative works is required for all IETF standards track documents and for most IETF non-standards track documents. There are two exceptions to this requirement: documents describing proprietary technologies and documents that are republications of the work of other standards organizations.

The right to produce derivative works must be granted in order for an IETF working group to accept an IETF Contribution as a working group document or otherwise work on it. For non-working group IETF Contributions where the Contributor requests publication as a standards track RFC the right to produce derivative works must be granted before the IESG will issue an IETF Last-Call and, for most non-standards track non-working group IETF Contributions, before the

IESG will consider the Internet-Draft for publication. Occasionally a Contributor may not want to grant publication rights or the right to produce derivative works before finding out if an IETF Contribution has been accepted for development in the IETF Standards Process. In these cases the Contributor may include the Derivative Works Limitation described in Section 5.2 and the Publication Limitation described in Section 5.3 in their IETF Contribution. A working group can discuss the Internet-Draft with the aim to decide if it should become a working group document, even though the right to produce derivative works or to publish the IETF Contribution as an RFC has not yet been granted. If the IETF Contribution is accepted for development the Contributor must then resubmit the IETF Contribution without the limitation notices before a working group can formally adopt the IETF Contribution as a working group document.

The IETF has historically encouraged organizations to publish details of their technologies, even when the technologies are proprietary, because understanding how existing technology is being used helps when developing new technology. But organizations that publish information about proprietary technologies are frequently not willing to have the IETF produce revisions of the technologies and then claim that the IETF version is the "new version" of the organization's technology. Organizations that feel this way can specify that an IETF Contribution can be published with the other rights granted under this document but may withhold the right to produce derivative works other than translations. The right to produce translations is required before any IETF Contribution can be published as an RFC to ensure the widest possible distribution of the material in RFCs.

In addition, IETF Documents frequently make normative references to standards or recommendations developed by other standards organizations. Since the publications of some standards organizations are not public documents, it can be quite helpful to the IETF to republish, with the permission of the other standards organization, some of these documents as RFCs so that the IETF community can have open access to them to better understand what they are referring to. In these cases the RFCs can be published without the right for the IETF to produce derivative works.

In both of the above cases in which the production of derivative works is excluded, the Contributor must include a special legend in the IETF Contribution, as specified in <u>Section 5.2</u>, in order to notify IETF participants about this restriction.

# 7.4. Rights to Use Trademarks

Contributors may wish to seek trademark or service mark protection on any terms that are coined or used in their IETF Contributions. IETF Bradner & Contreras [Page 15]

makes no judgment about the validity of any such trademark rights. However, the IETF requires each Contributor, under the licenses described in <a href="Section 3.3">Section 3.3</a> above, to grant IETF a perpetual license to use any such trademarks or service marks solely in exercising its rights to reproduce, publish and modify the IETF Contribution. This license does not authorize any IETF participant to use any trademark or service mark in connection with any product or service offering, but only in the context of IETF Documents and discussions.

## 8. Contributions Not Subject to Copyright

Certain documents, including those produced by the U.S. government and those which are in the public domain, may not be protected by the same copyright and other legal rights as other documents.

Nevertheless, we ask each Contributor to grant to the IETF the same rights as he or she would grant, and to make the same representations, as though the IETF Contribution were protected by the same legal rights as other documents, and as though the Contributor could be able to grant these rights. We ask for these grants and representations only to the extent that the Contribution may be protected. We believe they are necessary to protect the ISOC, the IETF Trust, the IETF, the IETF Standards Process and all IETF participants, and also because the IETF does not have the resources or wherewithal to make any independent investigation as to the actual proprietary status of any document submitted to it.

# 9. Security Considerations

This memo relates to IETF process, not any particular technology. There are security considerations when adopting any technology, but there are no known issues of security with IETF Contribution rights policies.

#### 10. References

# 10.1. Normative References

[RFC2026] Bradner, S., "The Internet Standards Process -- Revision 3", <u>BCP 9</u>, <u>RFC 2026</u>, October 1996.

[RFC2028] Hovey, R. and S. Bradner, "The Organizations Involved in the IETF Standards Process", <u>BCP 11</u>, <u>RFC 2028</u>, October 1996.

[RFC3979] Bradner, S., Ed, "Intellectual Property Rights in IETF Technology", <u>BCP 79</u>, <u>RFC 3979</u>, March 2005.

#### 10.2. Informative References

[RFC3978] Bradner, S. Ed., "IETF Rights in Contributions", <u>RFC 3978</u>, March 2005.

[Berne] "Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Work", <a href="http://www.wipo.int/treaties/en/ip/berne/trtdocs\_wo001.html">http://www.wipo.int/treaties/en/ip/berne/trtdocs\_wo001.html</a>

## 11. Acknowledgements

The editors would like to acknowledge the help of the IETF IPR Working Group provided during the development of the document.

Editor's Address

Scott Bradner Harvard University 29 Oxford St. Cambridge MA, 02138

Phone: +1 617 495 3864 EMail: sob@harvard.edu

Jorge L. Contreras WilmerHale 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington, DC 20006 USA

Phone: +1 202 663 6872

Email: jorge.contreras@wilmerhale.com

Full Copyright Statement

Copyright (C) The IETF Trust (2007).

This document is subject to the rights, licenses and restrictions contained in  $\underline{\text{BCP }78}$ , and except as set forth therein, the authors retain all their rights.

This document and the information contained herein are provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE CONTRIBUTOR, THE ORGANIZATION HE/SHE REPRESENTS OR IS SPONSORED BY (IF ANY), THE INTERNET SOCIETY, THE IETF TRUST AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIM ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

Intellectual Property

[Page 17]

The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any Intellectual Property Rights or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; nor does it represent that it has made any independent effort to identify any such rights. Information on the procedures with respect to rights in RFC documents can be found in BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Copies of IPR disclosures made to the IETF Secretariat and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementers or users of this specification can be obtained from the IETF on-line IPR repository at <a href="http://www.ietf.org/ipr">http://www.ietf.org/ipr</a>.

The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights that may cover technology that may be required to implement this standard. Please address the information to the IETF at ietf-ipr@ietf.org.

## Acknowledgement

Funding for the RFC Editor function is currently provided by the Internet Society.

Bradner & Contreras [Page 18]