

Network Working Group
Internet-Draft

S. Bradner
Harvard University
Jorge Contreras
WilmerHale
Editors
26 June 2007

Rights Contributors provide to the IETF Trust

[<draft-ietf-ipr-3978-incoming-01.txt>](#)

Status of this Memo

By submitting this Internet-Draft, each author represents that any applicable patent or other IPR claims of which he or she is aware have been or will be disclosed, and any of which he or she becomes aware will be disclosed, in accordance with [Section 6 of BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/ietf/lid-abstracts.txt>.

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html>.

This Internet-Draft will expire on December 26, 2007.

Copyright (C) IETF Trust (2007).

Abstract

The IETF policies about rights in Contributions to the IETF are designed to ensure that such Contributions can be made available to the IETF and Internet communities while permitting the authors to retain as many rights as possible. This memo details the IETF policies on rights in Contributions to the IETF. It also describes the objectives that the policies are designed to meet. This memo obsoletes [RFC 3978](#) and 4748 and, with [RFC 3979](#) and RFC xxx (-outgoing), replaces [Section 10 of RFC 2026](#).

Internet-Draft

[RFC 3978](#)-incoming

26 June 2007

Table of Contents

1. Definitions
 2. Introduction
 - 2.1 No Retroactive Effect
 3. Exposition of why these procedures are the way they are
 - 3.1. Rights Granted in Contributions
 - 3.2. Rights to use Contributions
 - 3.3. Right to Produce Derivative Works
 - 3.4. Rights to use Trademarks
 - 3.5. Contributions Not Subject to Copyright
 - 3.6. Copyright in RFCs
 4. RFC Editor Documents
 5. Rights in Contributions
 - 5.1. General Policy
 - 5.2. Confidentiality Obligations
 - 5.3. Rights Granted by Contributors to the IETF Trust
 - 5.4. Sublicenses by IETF Trust
 - 5.5. No Patent License
 - 5.6. Representations and Warranties
 - 5.7. No Duty to Publish
 - 5.8. Trademarks
 - 5.9. Copyright in RFCs
 6. Legends, Notices and Other Standardized Text in IETF Documents
 7. Security Considerations
 8. References
 - 8.1. Normative References
 - 8.2. Informative References
 9. Acknowledgements
 10. Editors' Addresses
- Full Copyright Statement

1. Definitions

The following definitions are for terms used in the context of this document. Other terms, including "IESG," "ISOC," "IAB," and "RFC Editor," are defined in [\[RFC2028\]](#).

- a. "Contribution": any submission to the IETF intended by the Contributor for publication as all or part of an Internet-Draft or RFC (except for RFC Editor Contributions described in [Section 4](#) below) and any statement made within the context of an IETF activity. Such statements include oral statements in IETF sessions, as well as written and electronic communications made at any time or place, which are addressed to:

- o the IETF plenary session,
- o any IETF working group or portion thereof,
- o the IESG, or any member thereof on behalf of the IESG,
- o the IAB or any member thereof on behalf of the IAB,
- o any IETF mailing list, including the IETF list itself, any

- working group or design team list, or any other list functioning under IETF auspices,
- o the RFC Editor or the Internet-Drafts function (except for RFC Editor Contributions described in [Section 4](#) below).

Statements made outside of an IETF session, mailing list or other function, that are clearly not intended to be input to an IETF activity, group or function, are not IETF Contributions in the context of this document.

- b. "Contributor": an individual submitting a Contribution.
- c. "Copyright" means the legal right granted to an author in a document or other work of authorship under applicable law. A "copyright" is not equivalent to a "right to copy". Rather a copyright encompasses all of the exclusive rights that an author has in a work, such as the rights to copy, publish, distribute and create derivative works of the work. An author often cedes these rights to his or her employer or other parties as a condition of employment or compensation.
- d. "IETF": In the context of this document, the IETF includes all individuals who participate in meetings, working groups, mailing lists, functions and other activities which are organized or initiated by ISOC, the IESG or the IAB under the general designation of the Internet Engineering Task Force or IETF, but solely to the extent of such participation.
- e. "IETF Documents": RFCs and Internet-Drafts.
- f. "IETF Standards Process": the activities undertaken by the IETF in any of the settings described in 1(c) below.
- g. "IETF Trust": A trust established under the laws of the Commonwealth of Virginia, USA, in order to hold and administer intellectual property rights for the benefit of the IETF.
- h. "Internet-Draft": temporary documents used in the IETF Standards Process. Internet-Drafts are posted on the IETF web site by the IETF Secretariat. As noted in [Section 2.2 of RFC 2026](#), Internet-Drafts have a nominal maximum lifetime of six months in the IETF Secretariat's public directory.
- i. "Legend Instructions" means the standardized text that is

included in IETF Documents and the instructions and requirements for including that standardized text in IETF Documents, each as posted from time to time at www.ietf.org/legends.

- j. "RFC": the basic publication series for the IETF. RFCs are published by the RFC Editor. Although RFCs may be superseded in whole or in part by subsequent RFCs, the text of an RFC is not altered once published in RFC form. (See [\[RFC2026\] Section 2.1](#))
- k. "Reasonably and personally known": means something an individual knows personally or, because of the job the individual holds, would reasonably be expected to know. This wording is used to indicate that an organization cannot purposely keep an individual in the dark about patents or patent applications just to avoid the

disclosure requirement. But this requirement should not be interpreted as requiring the IETF Contributor or participant (or his or her represented organization, if any) to perform a patent search in an attempt to find applicable IPR.

[2](#). Introduction

In all matters of copyright and document procedures, the intent is to benefit the Internet community and the public at large, while respecting the legitimate rights of others.

Under the laws of most countries and current international treaties (for example the "Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Work" [Berne Convention]), authors obtain numerous rights in the works they produce automatically upon producing them. These rights include copyrights, moral rights and other rights. In many cases, if the author produces a work within the scope of his or her employment, most of those rights are usually assigned to the employer, either by operation of law or, in many cases, under contract. (The Berne Convention names some rights as "inalienable", which means that the author retains them in all cases.)

In order for Contributions to be used within the IETF Standards Process, including when they are published as Internet-Drafts or RFCs, certain limited rights must be granted to the IETF Trust, which then grants the necessary rights to the IETF. In addition, Contributors must make representations to IETF Trust and the IETF regarding their ability to grant these rights.

[Section 1](#) provides definitions used in these policies. Sections [3](#)

and 4 of this document explain the rationale for these provisions. Only sections [5](#) and [6](#) of this document are normative, the other sections are informative. A companion document [RFC 3979](#) [[RFC3979](#)] deals with rights, including possible patent rights, in technologies developed or specified as part of the IETF Standards Process. This document is not intended to address those issues. This memo obsoletes [RFC 3978](#) and 4748 and, with [RFC 3979](#) and RFC xxx(-outgoing), replaces [Section 10 of RFC 2026](#).

This document is not intended as legal advice. Readers are advised to consult their own legal advisors if they would like a legal interpretation of their rights or the rights of the IETF Trust in any Contributions they make.

[2.1](#) No Retroactive Effect

This memo does not retroactively obtain additional rights from Contributions that predate the date that the IETF Trust announces the adoption of these procedures.

[3](#). Exposition of Why These Procedures Are the Way They Are

[3.1](#). Rights Granted in Contributions

The IETF Trust and IETF must obtain the right to publish an IETF Contribution as an RFC or an Internet-Draft from the Contributors.

A primary objective of this policy is to obtain from the document authors only the non-exclusive rights that are needed to develop and publish IETF Documents and to use IETF Contributions in the IETF Standards Process and potentially elsewhere.

The authors retain all other rights, but cannot withdraw the above rights from the IETF Trust and IETF.

It is important to note that under this document Contributors are required to grant certain rights to the IETF Trust, which holds all IETF-related intellectual property on behalf of the IETF community. The IETF Trust will, in turn, grant a sublicense of these rights to all IETF participants for use in the IETF Standards Process. This sublicense is necessary for the standards development work of the IETF to continue. In addition, the IETF Trust may grant certain other sublicenses of the rights that it is granted under this

document. In granting such other sublicenses, the IETF Trust will be guided [and bound] by documents such as [-outbound].

3.2. Rights to use Contributions

Because, under the laws of most countries and applicable international treaties, copyright rights come into existence when a work of authorship is created (but see [Section 3.5](#) below regarding public domain documents), and IETF cannot make use of IETF Contributions if it does not have sufficient rights with respect to these copyright rights, it is important that the IETF receive assurances from all Contributors that they have the authority to grant the IETF the rights that they claim to grant. Without this assurance, IETF and its participants would run a greater risk of liability to the owners of these rights. To this end, IETF asks Contributors to give the assurances in [Section 5.6](#) below. These assurances are requested, however, only to the extent of the Contributor's reasonable and personal knowledge. (See [Section 1\(l\)](#))

3.3. Right to Produce Derivative Works

The IETF needs to be able to evolve IETF Documents in response to experience gained in the deployment of the technologies described in such IETF Documents, to incorporate developments in research and to react to changing conditions on the Internet and other IP networks. The IETF may also decide to permit others to develop derivative works based on Contributions. In order to do this, the IETF must be able to produce derivatives of its documents; thus the IETF must obtain

the right from Contributors to produce derivative works. The right to produce derivative works is required for all IETF standards track documents and for most IETF non-standards track documents. There are two exceptions to this requirement: documents describing proprietary technologies and documents that are republications of the work of other standards organizations.

The right to produce derivative works must be granted in order for an IETF working group to accept a Contribution as a working group document or otherwise work on it. For non-working group Contributions where the Contributor requests publication as a standards track RFC, the right to produce derivative works must be granted before the IESG will issue an IETF Last-Call and, for most non-standards track non-working group Contributions, before the IESG will consider the Internet-Draft for publication. Occasionally a Contributor may not

want to grant publication rights or the right to produce derivative works before finding out if a Contribution has been accepted for development in the IETF Standards Process. In these cases the Contributor may include a limitation on the right to make derivative works in the form specified in the Legend Instructions. A working group can discuss the Contribution with the aim to decide if it should become a working group document, even though the right to produce derivative works or to publish the Contribution as an RFC has not yet been granted. However, if the Contribution is accepted for development, the Contributor must resubmit the Contribution without the limitation notices before a working group can formally adopt the Contribution as a working group document. The IETF Trust may establish different policies for granting sublicenses with respect to different types of Contributions and content within Contributions (such as executable code versus descriptive text or references to third party materials). The IETF Trust's policies concerning the granting of sublicenses to make derivative works will be guided by RFC [-outbound.

The IETF has historically encouraged organizations to publish details of their technologies, even when the technologies are proprietary, because understanding how existing technology is being used helps when developing new technology. But organizations that publish information about proprietary technologies are frequently not willing to have the IETF produce revisions of the technologies and then possibly claim that the IETF version is the "new version" of the organization's technology. Organizations that feel this way can specify that a Contribution be published with the other rights granted under this document but may withhold the right to produce derivative works other than translations. The right to produce translations is required before any Contribution can be published as an RFC to ensure the widest possible distribution of the material in RFCs.

In addition, IETF Documents frequently make normative references to standards or recommendations developed by other standards organizations. Since the publications of some standards organizations are not public documents, it can be quite helpful to the IETF to republish, with the permission of the other standards organization, some of these documents as RFCs so that the IETF community can have open access to them to better understand what they are referring to. In these cases the RFCs can be published without the right for the

IETF to produce derivative works. In both of the above cases in which the production of derivative works is excluded, the Contributor must include a special legend in the Contribution, as specified in the Legend Instructions, in order to notify IETF participants about this restriction.

[3.4. Rights to Use Trademarks](#)

Contributors may wish to seek trademark or service mark protection on any terms that are coined or used in their Contributions. IETF makes no judgment about the validity of any such trademark rights. However, the IETF requires each Contributor, under the licenses described in [Section 5.3](#) below, to grant IETF Trust a perpetual license to use any such trademarks or service marks solely in exercising rights to reproduce, publish, discuss and modify the IETF Contribution. This license does not authorize IETF or others to use any trademark or service mark in connection with any product or service offering.

[3.5. Contributions Not Subject to Copyright](#)

Certain documents, including those produced by the U.S. government and those which are in the public domain, may not be protected by the same copyright and other legal rights as other documents. Nevertheless, we ask each Contributor to grant to the IETF the same rights as he or she would grant, and to make the same representations, as though the IETF Contribution were protected by the same legal rights as other documents, and as though the Contributor could be able to grant these rights. We ask for these grants and representations only to the extent that the Contribution may be protected. We believe they are necessary to protect the ISOC, the IETF Trust, the IETF, the IETF Standards Process and all IETF participants, and also because the IETF does not have the resources or wherewithal to make any independent investigation as to the actual proprietary status of any document submitted to it.

[3.6 Copyright in RFCs.](#)

As noted above, Contributors to the IETF (or their employers) retain ownership of the copyright in their Contributions. This includes Internet-Drafts and all other Contributions made within the IETF Standards Process (e.g., via e-mail, oral comment and otherwise). However, it is important that the IETF (through the IETF Trust) own

Informational RFCs and RFCs that are submitted as RFC Editor Contributions). Ownership of the copyright in an RFC does not diminish the Contributors' rights in their underlying contributions, but it does prevent anyone other than the IETF Trust (and its licensees) from republishing or modifying an RFC in RFC format. In this respect, Contributors are treated the same as anybody else: though they may extract and republish their own Contributions without limitation, they may not do so in the IETF's RFC format. And while this principle (which is included in [Section 5.9](#) below) may appear to be new to IETF, it actually reflects historical practice and has been observed for many years through the inclusion of an ISOC or IETF Trust copyright notice on all RFC documents since the publication of [RFC 2026](#).

[4.](#) RFC Editor Documents

This document only relates to Contributions made as part of the IETF Standards Process. Other documents that are referred to as Internet-Drafts and RFCs may be submitted to and published by the RFC Editor independently of the IETF Standards Process. Such "RFC Editor Documents" are not covered by this document. RFC Editor Contributions must be marked appropriately as described in the Legend Instructions. See the RFC Editor web page for information about the policies concerning rights in RFC Editor Documents.

[5.](#) Rights in Contributions

[5.1.](#) General Policy

By submission of a Contribution, each person actually submitting the Contribution, and each named co-Contributor, is deemed to have read and understood the rules and requirements set forth in this document. Each Contributor is deemed, by the act of submitting a Contribution, to enter into a legally-binding agreement to comply with the terms and conditions set forth in this document, on his or her own behalf and on behalf of the organization the Contributor represents or is sponsored by (if any), when submitting the Contribution. No further acknowledgement, signature or other action is required to bind a Contributor to these terms and conditions. The operation of the IETF and the work conducted by its many participants is dependent on such agreement by each Contributor, and each IETF participant expressly relies on the agreement of each Contributor to the terms and conditions set forth in this document.

[5.2.](#) Confidentiality Obligations

No information or document that is subject to any requirement of confidentiality or any restriction on its dissemination may be submitted as a Contribution or otherwise considered in any part of the IETF Standards Process, and there must be no assumption of any

confidentiality obligation with respect to any Contribution. Each Contributor agrees that any statement in a Contribution, whether generated automatically or otherwise, that states or implies that the Contribution is confidential or subject to any privilege, can be disregarded for all purposes, and will be of no force or effect.

[5.3](#). Rights Granted by Contributors to the IETF Trust

To the extent that a Contribution or any portion thereof is protected by copyright or other rights of authorship, the Contributor, and each named co-Contributor, and the organization he or she represents or is sponsored by (if any) grant a perpetual, irrevocable, non-exclusive, royalty-free, world-wide right and license to the IETF Trust under all such copyrights and other rights in the Contribution.

- (A) to copy, publish, display, and distribute the Contribution, in whole or in part,
- (B) to prepare translations of the Contribution into languages other than English, in whole or in part, and to copy, publish, display, and distribute such translations or portions thereof,
- (C) unless explicitly disallowed in the notices contained in a Contribution [in the form specified by the Legend Instructions], to modify or prepare derivative works (in addition to translations) that are based on or incorporate all or part of the Contribution, and to copy, publish, display, and distribute such derivative works, or portions thereof, and
- (D) to reproduce any trademarks, service marks or trade names which are included in the Contribution solely in connection with the reproduction, distribution or publication of the Contribution and derivative works thereof as permitted by this [Section 5.3](#), provided that when reproducing Contributions, trademark and service mark identifiers used in the Contribution, including TM and (R) will be preserved.

[5.4](#) Sublicenses by IETF Trust

The IETF Trust will sublicense the rights granted to it under Section 5.3 to all IETF participants for use within the IETF Standards Process. This license is expressly granted under [TRUST LICENSE DOCUMENT].

In addition, the IETF Trust may grant additional sublicenses of the licenses granted to it hereunder. In doing so, the IETF Trust will comply with the guidance provided under RFC xxx [-outbound].

[5.5](#) No Patent License

The licenses granted in [Section 5.3](#) shall not be deemed to grant any right under any patent, patent application or other similar

intellectual property right disclosed by the Contributor under [BCP 79](#) or otherwise.

[5.6.](#) Representations and Warranties

With respect to each Contribution, each Contributor represents that to the best of his or her knowledge and ability:

- a. The Contribution properly acknowledges all major Contributors. A major Contributor is any person who has materially or substantially contributed to the Contribution.
- b. No information in the Contribution is confidential and the IETF, IETF Trust, ISOC, and its affiliated organizations may freely disclose any information in the Contribution.
- c. There are no limits to the Contributor's ability to make the grants, acknowledgments and agreements herein that are reasonably and personally known to the Contributor.
- d. The Contributor has not intentionally included in the Contribution any material which is defamatory or untrue or which is illegal under the laws of the jurisdiction in which the Contributor has his or her principal place of business or residence.
- e. All trademarks, trade names, service marks and other proprietary names used in the Contribution that are reasonably and personally known to the Contributor are clearly designated as such where reasonable.

[5.7.](#) No Duty to Publish

The Contributor, and each named co-Contributor, acknowledges that the IETF has no duty to publish or otherwise use or disseminate any Contribution. The IETF reserves the right to withdraw or cease using any Contribution that does not comply with the requirements of [Section 5.3](#) and [Section 5.4](#) or 5.6.

[5.8.](#) Trademarks

Contributors who claim trademark rights in terms used in their IETF Contributions are requested to state specifically what conditions apply to implementers of the technology relative to the use of such trademarks. Such statements should be submitted in the same way as is done for other intellectual property claims. (See [[RFC3979](#)] [Section 6.](#))

[5.9](#) Copyright in RFCs

Subject to each Contributor's (or its sponsor's) ownership of its

underlying Contributions (which ownership is qualified by the irrevocable licenses granted under [Section 5.3](#)), each Contributor hereby acknowledges that the copyright in any RFC in which such Contribution is included, other than an Informational RFC or an RFC that is an RFC Editor Contribution, shall be owned by the IETF Trust.

- [6.](#) Legends, Notices and Other Standardized Text in IETF Documents
The IETF requires that certain standardized text be reproduced verbatim in certain IETF Documents (including copies, derivative

works and translations of IETF Documents). Some of this standardized text may be mandatory (e.g., copyright notices and disclaimers that must be included in all RFCs) and some may be optional (e.g., limitations on the right to make derivative works). The text itself, as well as the rules that explain when and how it must be used, are contained in the Legend Instructions. The Legend Instructions may be updated from time to time, and the version of the standardized text that must be included in IETF Documents is that which was posted in the Legend Instructions on the date of publication.

The IETF reserves the right to refuse to publish Contributions that do not include the legends required by the Legend Instructions.

It is important to note that each Contributor grants the IETF Trust rights pursuant to this document and the policies described herein. The legends and notices included in certain written Contributions such as Internet-Drafts do not themselves convey any rights. They are simply included to inform the reader (whether or not part of the IETF) about certain legal rights and limitations associated with such documents.

- [7.](#) Security Considerations

This memo relates to IETF process, not any particular technology. There are security considerations when adopting any technology, but there are no known issues of security with IETF Contribution rights policies.

- [8.](#) References

- [8.1.](#) Normative References

[[RFC2026](#)] Bradner, S., "The Internet Standards Process -- Revision 3", [BCP 9](#), [RFC 2026](#), October 1996.

- [RFC2028] Hovey, R. and S. Bradner, "The Organizations Involved in the IETF Standards Process", [BCP 11](#), [RFC 2028](#), October 1996.
- [RFC3979] Bradner, S., Ed, "Intellectual Property Rights in IETF Technology", [BCP 79](#), [RFC 3979](#), March 2005.
- [Trust] IETF Trust Agreement - <http://iaoc.ietf.org/docs/IETF-Trust-Agreement-Executed-12-15-05.pdf>

8.2. Informative References

- [RFC3978] Bradner, S. Ed., "IETF Rights in Contributions", [RFC 3978](#), March 2005.
- [Berne] "Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Work", http://www.wipo.int/treaties/en/ip/berne/trtdocs_wo001.html

9. Acknowledgements

The editors would like to acknowledge the help of the IETF IPR Working Group provided during the development of the document.

Bradner & Contreras

[Page 11]

Internet-Draft

[RFC 3978](#)-incoming

26 June 2007

10. Editors' Addresses

Scott Bradner
Harvard University
29 Oxford St.
Cambridge MA, 02138 USA
Phone: +1 617 495 3864
EMail: sob@harvard.edu

Jorge L. Contreras
WilmerHale
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20006 USA
Phone: +1 202 663 6872
Email: jorge.contreras@wilmerhale.com

Full Copyright Statement

Copyright (C) The IETF Trust (2007). This document is subject to the rights, licenses and restrictions contained in [BCP 78](#), and except as set forth therein, the authors retain all their rights. This document and the information contained herein are provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE CONTRIBUTOR, THE ORGANIZATION HE/SHE REPRESENTS OR IS SPONSORED BY (IF ANY), THE INTERNET SOCIETY, THE IETF TRUST AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIM ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE

USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

Intellectual Property

The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any Intellectual Property Rights or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; nor does it represent that it has made any independent effort to identify any such rights. Information on the procedures with respect to rights in RFC documents can be found in [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#). Copies of IPR disclosures made to the IETF Secretariat and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementers or users of this specification can be obtained from the IETF on-line IPR repository at <http://www.ietf.org/ipr>. The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights that may cover technology that may be required to implement this standard. Please address the information to the IETF at ietf-ipr@ietf.org.

Acknowledgement

Funding for the RFC Editor function is currently provided by the Internet Society. ??

??

??

??

