Workgroup:
Limited Additional Mechanisms for PKIX and
SMIME
Internet-Draft: draft-ietf-lamps-rfc5990bis-00
Obsoletes: 5990 (if approved)
Published: 19 April 2023
Intended Status: Standards Track
Expires: 21 October 2023
Authors: R. Housley S. Turner
Vigil Security sn3rd

Use of the RSA-KEM Algorithm in the Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS)

Abstract

The RSA Key Encapsulation Mechanism (RSA-KEM) Algorithm is a one-pass (store-and-forward) cryptographic mechanism for an originator to securely send keying material to a recipient using the recipient's RSA public key. The RSA-KEM Algorithm is specified in Clause 11.5 of ISO/IEC: 18033-2:2006. This document specifies the conventions for using the RSA-KEM Algorithm with the Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS) using KEMRecipientInfo as specified in draft-ietf-lamps-cms-kemri.

About This Document

This note is to be removed before publishing as an RFC.

Status information for this document may be found at https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-ietf-lamps-rfc5990bis/.

Discussion of this document takes place on the Limited Additional Mechanisms for PKIX and SMIME Working Group mailing list (mailto:spasm@ietf.org), which is archived at https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/browse/spasm/. Subscribe at https://www.ietf.org/mailman/listinfo/spasm/.

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents

at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on 21 October 2023.

Copyright Notice

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

The RSA Key Encapsulation Mechanism (RSA-KEM) Algorithm is a one-pass (store-and-forward) cryptographic mechanism for an originator to securely send keying material to a recipient using the recipient's RSA public key. The RSA-KEM Algorithm is specified in Clause 11.5 of [ISO18033-2].

The RSA-KEM Algorithm takes a different approach than other RSA key transport mechanisms [RFC8017], with the goal of providing higher security assurance. The RSA-KEM Algorithm encrypts a random integer with the recipient's RSA public key, derives a key-encryption key from the random integer, and wraps a symmetric content-encryption key with the key-encryption key. In this way, the originator and the recipient end up with the same content-encryption key. Given a content-encryption key CEK, RSA-KEM can be summarized as:

1. Generate a random integer z between 0 and n-1.

2. Encrypt the integer z with the recipient's RSA public key:

       c = z^e mod n

3. Derive a key-encryption key KEK from the integer z:

       KEK = KDF(z)

4. Wrap the CEK with the KEK to obtain wrapped keying material WK:

       WK = WRAP(KEK, CEK)

5. The originator sends c and WK to the recipient.

This different approach provides higher security assurance for two reasons. First, the input to the underlying RSA operation is effectively a random integer between 0 and n-1, where n is the RSA modulus, so it does not have any structure that could be exploited by an adversary. Second, the input is independent of the keying material so the result of the RSA decryption operation is not directly available to an adversary. As a result, the RSA-KEM Algorithm enjoys a "tight" security proof in the random oracle model. (In other padding schemes, such as PKCS #1 v1.5 [RFC8017], the input has structure and/or depends on the keying material, and the provable security assurances are not as strong.) The approach is also architecturally convenient because the public-key operations are separate from the symmetric operations on the keying material. Another benefit is that the length of the keying material is bounded only by the symmetric key-wrapping algorithm, not the size of the RSA modulus.

For completeness, a specification of the RSA-KEM Algorithm is given in Appendix A of this document; ASN.1 syntax is given in Appendix B.

1.1. Conventions and Definitions

The key words "**MUST**", "**MUST NOT**", "**REQUIRED**", "**SHALL**", "**SHALL NOT**", "**SHOULD**", "**SHOULD NOT**", "**RECOMMENDED**", "**NOT RECOMMENDED**", "**MAY**", and "**OPTIONAL**" in this document are to be interpreted as described in BCP 14 [RFC2119] [RFC8174] when, and only when, they appear in all capitals, as shown here.

1.2. ASN.1

CMS values are generated using ASN.1 [X.680], which uses the Basic Encoding Rules (BER) and the Distinguished Encoding Rules (DER) [X.690].

1.3. Changes Since RFC 5990

RFC 5990 [RFC5990] specified the conventions for using the RSA-KEM Algorithm in CMS as a key transport algorithm. That is, it used KeyTransRecipientInfo [RFC5652] for each recipient. This approach resulted in a very complex parameter definition with the id-rsa-kem algorithm identifier. Implementation experience with many different algorithms has shown that complex parameter structures cause interoperability issues. Since the publication of RFC 5990, a new KEMRecipientInfo structure [I-D.ietf-lamps-cms-kemri] has been defined to support KEM algorithms, and this new structure avoids the complex parameters structure that was used in RFC 5990. Likewise, when the id-rsa-kem algorithm identifier appears in the SubjectPublicKeyInfo field of a certificate, this document encourages the omission of any parameters.

RFC 5990 uses EK and the EncryptedKey, which the concatenation of C and WK (C || WK). The use of EK is necessary to align with the KeyTransRecipientInfo structure. In this document, C and WK are sent in separate fields of new KEMRecipientInfo structure. In particular, C is carried in the kemct field, and WK is carried in the encryptedKey field.

RFC 5990 supports the future definition of additional KEM algorithms that use RSA; this document supports only one, and it is identified by the id-kem-rsa object identifier.

RFC 5990 includes support for Camellia and Triple-DES block ciphers; discussion of these block ciphers is removed from this document, but the algorithm identifiers remain in the ASN.1 Module Appendix B.2.

RFC 5990 includes support for SHA-1 hash function; discussion of this hash function is removed from this document, but the algorithm identifier remains in the ASN.1 module Appendix B.2.

RFC 5990 required support for the KDF3 [ANS-X9.44] key-derivation function; this document continues to require support for the KDF3 key-derivation function, but it requires support for SHA-256 [SHS] as the hash function.

RFC 5990 recommends support for alternatives to KDF3 and AES-Wrap-128; this document simply states that other key-derivation functions and key-encryption algorithms **MAY** be supported.

RFC 5990 includes an ASN.1 module; this document provides an alternative ASN.1 module that follows the conventions established in [RFC5911], [RFC5912], and [RFC6268]. The new ASN.1 module Appendix B.2 produces the same bits-on-the-wire as the one in RFC 5990.

2. Use of the RSA-KEM Algorithm in CMS

The RSA-KEM Algorithm **MAY** be employed for one or more recipients in the CMS enveloped-data content type [RFC5652], the CMS authenticated-data content type [RFC5652], or the CMS authenticated-enveloped-data content type [RFC5083]. In each case, the KEMRecipientInfo [I-D.ietf-lamps-cms-kemri] is used with with the RSA-KEM Algorithm to securely transfer the content-encryption key from the originator to the recipient.

2.1. Underlying Components

A CMS implementation that supports the RSA-KEM Algorithm **MUST** support at least the following underlying components:

* For the key-derivation function, an implementation **MUST** support KDF3 [ANS-X9.44] with SHA-256 [SHS].

* For key-wrapping, an implementation **MUST** support the AES-Wrap-128 [RFC3394] key-encryption algorithm.

An implementation **MAY** also support other key-derivation functions and key-encryption algorithms as well.

2.2. RecipientInfo Conventions

When the RSA-KEM Algorithm is employed for a recipient, the RecipientInfo alternative for that recipient **MUST** be OtherRecipientInfo using the KEMRecipientInfo structure

[I-D.ietf-lamps-cms-kemri]. The fields of the KEMRecipientInfo **MUST** have the following values:

version is the syntax version number; it **MUST** be 0.

rid identifies the recipient's certificate or public key.

kem identifies the KEM algorithm; it **MUST** contain id-kem-rsa.

kemct is the ciphertext produced for this recipient; it contains C from steps 1 and 2 of Originator's Operations in Appendix A.

kdf identifies the key-derivation algorithm.

kekLength is the size of the key-encryption key in octets.

ukm is an optional random input to the key-derivation function.

wrap identifies a key-encryption algorithm used to encrypt the content-encryption key.

encryptedKey is the result of encrypting the keying material with the key-encryption key. When used with the CMS enveloped-data content type [RFC5652], the keying material is a content-encryption key. When used with the CMS authenticated-data content type [RFC5652], the keying material is a message-authentication key. When used with the CMS authenticated-enveloped-data content type [RFC5083], the keying material is a content-authenticated-encryption key.

NOTE: For backward compatibility, implementations **MAY** also support RSA-KEM Key Transport Algorithm, which uses KeyTransRecipientInfo as specified in [RFC5990].

2.3. Certificate Conventions

The conventions specified in this section augment RFC 5280 [RFC5280].

A recipient who employs the RSA-KEM Algorithm **MAY** identify the public key in a certificate by the same AlgorithmIdentifier as for the PKCS #1 v1.5 algorithm, that is, using the rsaEncryption object identifier [RFC8017]. The fact that the recipient will accept RSA-KEM with this public key is not indicated by the use of this object identifier. The willingness to accept the RSA-KEM Algorithm **MAY** be signaled by the use of the appropriate SMIME Capabilities either in a message or in the certificate.

If the recipient wishes only to employ the RSA-KEM Algorithm with a given public key, the recipient **MUST** identify the public key in the

certificate using the id-rsa-kem object identifier; see Appendix B. When the id-rsa-kem object identifier appears in the SubjectPublicKeyInfo algorithm field of the certificate, the parameters field from AlgorithmIdentifier **SHOULD** be absent. That is, the AlgorithmIdentifier **SHOULD** be a SEQUENCE of one component, the id-rsa-kem object identifier.

When the AlgorithmIdentifier parameters are present, the GenericHybridParameters **MUST** be used. As described in the next section, the GenericHybridParameters constrain the values that can be used with the RSA public key for the kdf, kekLength, and wrap fields of the KEMRecipientInfo structure.

Regardless of the AlgorithmIdentifier used, the RSA public key **MUST** be carried in the subjectPublicKey BIT STRING within the SubjectPublicKeyInfo filed of the certificate using the RSAPublicKey type defined in [RFC8017].

The intended application for the public key **MAY** be indicated in the key usage certificate extension as specified in Section 4.2.1.3 of [RFC5280]. If the keyUsage extension is present in a certificate that conveys an RSA public key with the id-rsa-kem object identifier as discussed above, then the key usage extension **MUST** contain the following value:

   keyEncipherment

The digitalSignatrure and dataEncipherment values **SHOULD NOT** be present. That is, a public key intended to be employed only with the RSA-KEM Algorithm **SHOULD NOT** also be employed for data encryption or for digital signatures. Good cryptographic practice employs a given RSA key pair in only one scheme. This practice avoids the risk that vulnerability in one scheme may compromise the security of the other, and may be essential to maintain provable security.

2.4. SMIMECapabilities Attribute Conventions

Section 2.5.2 of [RFC8551] defines the SMIMECapabilities signed attribute (defined as a SEQUENCE of SMIMECapability SEQUENCEs) to announce a partial list of algorithms that an S/MIME implementation can support. When constructing a CMS signed-data content type [RFC5652], a compliant implementation **MAY** include the SMIMECapabilities signed attribute announcing that it supports the RSA-KEM Algorithm.

The SMIMECapability SEQUENCE representing the RSA-KEM Algorithm **MUST** include the id-rsa-kem object identifier in the capabilityID field; see Appendix B for the object identifier value, and see Appendix C for examples. When the id-rsa-kem object identifier appears in the

capabilityID field and the parameters are present, then the parameters field **MUST** use the GenericHybridParameters type.

```
GenericHybridParameters ::= SEQUENCE {
  kem  KeyEncapsulationMechanism,
  dem  DataEncapsulationMechanism }
```

The fields of the GenericHybridParameters type have the following meanings:

kem is an AlgorithmIdentifer; the algorithm field **MUST** be set to id-kem-rsa; the parameters field **MUST** be RsaKemParameters, which is a SEQUENCE of an AlgorithmIdentifier that identifies the supported key-derivation function and a positive INTEGER that identifies the length of the key-encryption key in octets. If the GenericHybridParameters are present, then the provided kem value **MUST** be used as the key-derivation function in the kdf field of KEMRecipientInfo, and the provided key length **MUST** be used in the kekLength of KEMRecipientInfo.

dem is an AlgorithmIdentifier; the algorithm field **MUST** be present, and it identifies the key-encryption algorithm; parameters are optional. If the GenericHybridParameters are present, then the provided dem value **MUST** be used in the wrap field of KEMRecipientInfo.

3. Security Considerations

The RSA-KEM Algorithm should be considered as a replacement for the widely implemented PKCS #1 v1.5 [RFC8017] for new applications that use CMS to avoid potential vulnerabilities to chosen-ciphertext attacks and gain a tighter security proof; however, the RSA-KEM Algorithm has the disadvantage of slightly longer encrypted keying material.

The security of the RSA-KEM Algorithm can be shown to be tightly related to the difficulty of either solving the RSA problem or breaking the underlying symmetric key-encryption algorithm, if the underlying key-derivation function is modeled as a random oracle, and assuming that the symmetric key-encryption algorithm satisfies the properties of a data encapsulation mechanism [SHOUP]. While in practice a random-oracle result does not provide an actual security proof for any particular key-derivation function, the result does provide assurance that the general construction is reasonable; a key-derivation function would need to be particularly weak to lead to an attack that is not possible in the random-oracle model.

The RSA key size and the underlying components need to be selected consistent with the desired security level. Several security levels have been identified in the NIST SP 800-57 Part 1

[NISTSP800-57pt1r5]. To achieve 128-bit security, the RSA key size **SHOULD** be at least 3072 bits, the key-derivation function **SHOULD** make use of SHA-256, and the symmetric key-encryption algorithm **SHOULD** be AES Key Wrap with a 128-bit key.

Implementations **MUST** protect the RSA private key, the key-encryption key, the content-encryption key, the content-authenticated-encryption key. Compromise of the RSA private key could result in the disclosure of all messages protected with that key. Compromise of the key-encryption key, the content-encryption key, or content-authenticated-encryption key could result in disclosure of the associated encrypted content.

Additional considerations related to key management may be found in [NISTSP800-57pt1r5].

The security of the RSA-KEM Algorithm also depends on the strength of the random number generator, which **SHOULD** have a comparable security level. For further discussion on random number generation, see [RFC4086].

Implementations **SHOULD NOT** reveal information about intermediate values or calculations, whether by timing or other "side channels", otherwise an opponent may be able to determine information about the keying data and/or the recipient's private key. Although not all intermediate information may be useful to an opponent, it is preferable to conceal as much information as is practical, unless analysis specifically indicates that the information would not be useful to an opponent.

Generally, good cryptographic practice employs a given RSA key pair in only one scheme. This practice avoids the risk that vulnerability in one scheme may compromise the security of the other, and may be essential to maintain provable security. While RSA public keys have often been employed for multiple purposes such as key transport and digital signature without any known bad interactions, for increased security assurance, such combined use of an RSA key pair is **NOT RECOMMENDED** in the future (unless the different schemes are specifically designed to be used together).

Accordingly, an RSA key pair used for the RSA-KEM Algorithm **SHOULD NOT** also be used for digital signatures. Indeed, the Accredited Standards Committee X9 (ASC X9) requires such a separation between key pairs used for key establishment and key pairs used for digital signature [ANS-X9.44]. Continuing this principle of key separation, a key pair used for the RSA-KEM Algorithm **SHOULD NOT** be used with other key establishment schemes, or for data encryption, or with more than one set of underlying algorithm components.

Parties **MAY** gain assurance that implementations are correct through formal implementation validation, such as the NIST Cryptographic Module Validation Program (CMVP) [CMVP].

4. IANA Considerations

For the ASN.1 Module in Appendix B.2, IANA is requested to assign an object identifier (OID) for the module identifier. The OID for the module should be allocated in the "SMI Security for S/MIME Module Identifier" registry (1.2.840.113549.1.9.16.0), and the Description for the new OID should be set to "id-mod-cms-rsa-kem-2023".

5. References

5.1. Normative References

[I-D.ietf-lamps-cms-kemri] Housley, R., Gray, J., and T. Okubo, "Using Key Encapsulation Mechanism (KEM) Algorithms in the Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS)", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-ietf-lamps-cms-kemri-00, 24 February 2023, <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/html/draft-ietf-lamps-cms-kemri-00>.

[ISO18033-2] ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 27, "Information technology -- Security techniques -- Encryption algorithms -- Part 2: Asymmetric ciphers", ISO/IEC 18033-2:2006, 2006, <https://www.iso.org/standard/37971.html>.

[RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119, DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119>.

[RFC5083] Housley, R., "Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS) Authenticated-Enveloped-Data Content Type", RFC 5083, DOI 10.17487/RFC5083, November 2007, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5083>.

[RFC5280] Cooper, D., Santesson, S., Farrell, S., Boeyen, S., Housley, R., and W. Polk, "Internet X.509 Public Key Infrastructure Certificate and Certificate Revocation List (CRL) Profile", RFC 5280, DOI 10.17487/RFC5280, May 2008, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5280>.

[RFC5652] Housley, R., "Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS)", STD 70, RFC 5652, DOI 10.17487/RFC5652, September 2009, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5652>.

[RFC5911] Hoffman, P. and J. Schaad, "New ASN.1 Modules for Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS) and S/MIME", RFC 5911,

DOI 10.17487/RFC5911, June 2010, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5911>.

[RFC5912] Hoffman, P. and J. Schaad, "New ASN.1 Modules for the Public Key Infrastructure Using X.509 (PKIX)", RFC 5912, DOI 10.17487/RFC5912, June 2010, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5912>.

[RFC6268] Schaad, J. and S. Turner, "Additional New ASN.1 Modules for the Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS) and the Public Key Infrastructure Using X.509 (PKIX)", RFC 6268, DOI 10.17487/RFC6268, July 2011, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6268>.

[RFC8174] Leiba, B., "Ambiguity of Uppercase vs Lowercase in RFC 2119 Key Words", BCP 14, RFC 8174, DOI 10.17487/RFC8174, May 2017, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8174>.

[RFC8551] Schaad, J., Ramsdell, B., and S. Turner, "Secure/Multipurpose Internet Mail Extensions (S/MIME) Version 4.0 Message Specification", RFC 8551, DOI 10.17487/RFC8551, April 2019, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8551>.

[SHS] National Institute of Standards and Technology, "Secure Hash Standard", DOI 10.6028/nist.fips.180-4, July 2015, <https://doi.org/10.6028/nist.fips.180-4>.

[X.680] ITU-T, "Information technology -- Abstract Syntax Notation One (ASN.1): Specification of basic notation", ITU-T Recommendation X.680, ISO/IEC 8824-1:2021, February 2021, <https://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-X.680>.

[X.690] ITU-T, "Information technology -- ASN.1 encoding rules: Specification of Basic Encoding Rules (BER), Canonical Encoding Rules (CER) and Distinguished Encoding Rules (DER)", ITU-T Recommendation X.690, ISO/IEC 8825-1:2021, February 2021, <https://www.itu.int/rec/T-REC-X.680>.

5.2. Informative References

[ANS-X9.44] American National Standards Institute, "Public Key Cryptography for the Financial Services Industry -- Key Establishment Using Integer Factorization Cryptography", American National Standard X9.44, 2007.

[CMVP] National Institute of Standards and Technology, "Cryptographic Module Validation Program", 2016, <https://csrc.nist.gov/projects/cryptographic-module-validation-program>.

[NISTSP800-57pt1r5]
Barker, E. and National Institute of Standards and Technology, "Recommendation for key management:", DOI 10.6028/nist.sp.800-57pt1r5, May 2020, <http://dx.doi.org/10.6028/nist.sp.800-57pt1r5>.

[RFC3394] Schaad, J. and R. Housley, "Advanced Encryption Standard (AES) Key Wrap Algorithm", RFC 3394, DOI 10.17487/RFC3394, September 2002, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3394>.

[RFC4086] Eastlake 3rd, D., Schiller, J., and S. Crocker, "Randomness Requirements for Security", BCP 106, RFC 4086, DOI 10.17487/RFC4086, June 2005, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4086>.

[RFC5990] Randall, J., Kaliski, B., Brainard, J., and S. Turner, "Use of the RSA-KEM Key Transport Algorithm in the Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS)", RFC 5990, DOI 10.17487/RFC5990, September 2010, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5990>.

[RFC6194] Polk, T., Chen, L., Turner, S., and P. Hoffman, "Security Considerations for the SHA-0 and SHA-1 Message-Digest Algorithms", RFC 6194, DOI 10.17487/RFC6194, March 2011, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6194>.

[RFC8017] Moriarty, K., Ed., Kaliski, B., Jonsson, J., and A. Rusch, "PKCS #1: RSA Cryptography Specifications Version 2.2", RFC 8017, DOI 10.17487/RFC8017, November 2016, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8017>.

[SHOUP] Shoup, V., "A Proposal for an ISO Standard for Public Key Encryption", Cryptology ePrint Archive Paper 2001/112, 2001, <https://eprint.iacr.org/2001/112>.

Appendix A. RSA-KEM Algorithm

The RSA-KEM Algorithm is a one-pass (store-and-forward) cryptographic mechanism for an originator to securely send keying material to a recipient using the recipient's RSA public key.

With this type of algorithm, an originator encrypts the keying material using the recipient's public key, and then sends the resulting encrypted keying material to the recipient. The recipient decrypts the encrypted keying material using the recipient's private key to recover the keying material.

A.1. Underlying Components

The RSA-KEM Algorithm has the following underlying components:

- KDF, a key-derivation function, which derives key-encryption key of a specified length from a shared secret value;

- Wrap, a symmetric key-encryption algorithm, which encrypts keying material using key-encryption key that was produced by the KDF.

The kekLen value denotes the length in bytes of the key-encryption key for the underlying symmetric key-encryption algorithm.

The length of the keying material **MUST** be among the lengths supported by the underlying symmetric key-encryption algorithm. For example, the AES-Wrap key-encryption algorithm requires the kekLen to be 16, 24, or 32 octets. Usage and formatting of the keying material is outside the scope of the RSA-KEM Algorithm.

Many key-derivation functions support the inclusion of other information in addition to the shared secret value in the input to the function. Also, with some symmetric key-encryption algorithms, it is possible to associate a label with the keying material. Such uses are outside the scope of this document, as they are not directly supported by CMS.

A.2. Originator's Operations

Let (n,e) be the recipient's RSA public key; see [RFC8017] for details.

Let K be the keying material to be securely transferred from the originator to the recipient.

Let nLen denote the length in bytes of the modulus n, i.e., the least integer such that 2^(8*nLen) > n.

The originator performs the following operations:

1. Generate a random integer z between 0 and n-1 (see note), and convert z to a byte string Z of length nLen, most significant byte first:

   z = RandomInteger (0, n-1)

   Z = IntegerToString (z, nLen)

2. Encrypt the random integer z using the recipient's RSA public key (n,e), and convert the resulting integer c to a ciphertext C, a byte string of length nLen:

c = z^e mod n

C = IntegerToString (c, nLen)

3. Derive a symmetric key-encryption key KEK of length kekLen bytes from the byte string Z using the underlying key-derivation function:

   KEK = KDF (Z, kekLen)

4. Wrap the keying material K with the symmetric key-encryption key KEK using the key-encryption algorithm to obtain wrapped keying material WK:

   WK = Wrap (KEK, K)

5. Send the ciphertext C and the wrapped keying material WK to the recipient.

NOTE: The random integer z **MUST** be generated independently at random for different encryption operations, whether for the same or different recipients.

A.3. Recipient's Operations

Let (n,d) be the recipient's RSA private key; see [RFC8017] for details, but other private key formats are allowed.

Let WK be the encrypted keying material.

Let C be the ciphertext.

Let nLen denote the length in bytes of the modulus n.

The recipient performs the following operations:

1. If the length of the encrypted keying material is less than nLen bytes, output "decryption error", and stop.

2. Convert the ciphertext C to an integer c, most significant byte first. Decrypt the integer c using the recipient's private key (n,d) to recover an integer z (see NOTE below):

   c = StringToInteger (C)

   z = c^d mod n

   If the integer c is not between 0 and n-1, output "decryption error", and stop.

3. Convert the integer z to a byte string Z of length nLen, most significant byte first (see NOTE below):

        Z = IntegerToString (z, nLen)

4. Derive a symmetric key-encryption key KEK of length kekLen bytes from the byte string Z using the key-derivation function (see NOTE below):

        KEK = KDF (Z, kekLen)

5. Unwrap the wrapped keying material WK with the symmetric key-encryption key KEK using the underlying key-encryption algorithm to recover the keying material K:

        K = Unwrap (KEK, WK)

   If the unwrapping operation outputs an error, output "decryption error", and stop.

6. Output the keying material K.

NOTE: Implementations **SHOULD NOT** reveal information about the integer z, the string Z, or about the calculation of the exponentiation in Step 2, the conversion in Step 3, or the key derivation in Step 4, whether by timing or other "side channels". The observable behavior of the implementation **SHOULD** be the same at these steps for all ciphertexts C that are in range. For example, IntegerToString conversion should take the same amount of time regardless of the actual value of the integer z. The integer z, the string Z, and other intermediate results **MUST** be securely deleted when they are no longer needed.

Appendix B. ASN.1 Syntax

The ASN.1 syntax for identifying the RSA-KEM Algorithm is an extension of the syntax for the "generic hybrid cipher" in ANS X9.44 [ANS-X9.44].

The ASN.1 Module is unchanged from RFC 5990. The id-rsa-kem object identifier is used in a backward compatible manner in certificates [RFC5280] and SMIMECapabilities [RFC8551]. Of course, the use of the id-kem-rsa object identifier in the new KEMRecipientInfo structure [I-D.ietf-lamps-cms-kemri] was not yet defined at the time that RFC 5990 was written.

B.1. Underlying Components

Implementations that conform to this specification **MUST** support the KDF3 [ANS-X9.44] key-derivation function using SHA-256 [SHS].

The object identifier for KDF3 is:

```
id-kdf-kdf3 OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { x9-44-components kdf3(2) }
```

The KDF3 parameters identify the underlying hash function. For alignment with the ANS X9.44, the hash function **MUST** be an ASC X9-approved hash function. While the SHA-1 hash algorithm is included in the ASN.1 definitions, SHA-1 **MUST NOT** be used. SHA-1 is considered to be obsolete; see [RFC6194]. SHA-1 remains in the ASN.1 module for compatibility with RFC 5990. In addition, other hash functions **MAY** be used with CMS.

```
kda-kdf3 KEY-DERIVATION ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-kdf-kdf3
   PARAMS TYPE KDF3-HashFunction ARE required
   -- No S/MIME caps defined -- }

KDF3-HashFunction ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { DIGEST-ALGORITHM, {KDF3-HashFunctions} }

KDF3-HashFunctions DIGEST-ALGORITHM ::= { X9-HashFunctions, ... }

X9-HashFunctions DIGEST-ALGORITHM ::= {
   mda-sha1 | mda-sha224 | mda-sha256 | mda-sha384 |
   mda-sha512, ... }
```

Implementations that conform to this specification **MUST** support the AES Key Wrap [RFC3394] key-encryption algorithm with a 128-bit key. There are three object identifiers for the AES Key Wrap, one for each permitted size of the key-encryption key. There are three object identifiers imported from [RFC5912], and none of these algorithm identifiers have associated parameters:

```
kwa-aes128-wrap KEY-WRAP ::= {
    IDENTIFIER id-aes128-wrap
    PARAMS ARE absent
    SMIME-CAPS { IDENTIFIED BY id-aes128-wrap } }

kwa-aes192-wrap KEY-WRAP ::= {
    IDENTIFIER id-aes192-wrap
    PARAMS ARE absent
    SMIME-CAPS { IDENTIFIED BY id-aes192-wrap } }

kwa-aes256-wrap KEY-WRAP ::= {
    IDENTIFIER id-aes256-wrap
    PARAMS ARE absent
    SMIME-CAPS { IDENTIFIED BY id-aes256-wrap } }
```

B.2. ASN.1 Module

RFC EDITOR: Please replace TBD2 with the value assigned by IANA during the publication of [I-D.ietf-lamps-cms-kemri].

```
<CODE BEGINS>
CMS-RSA-KEM-2023
   { iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) rsadsi(113549) pkcs(1)
     pkcs-9(9) smime(16) modules(0) id-mod-cms-rsa-kem-2023(TBD1) }

DEFINITIONS ::= BEGIN

-- EXPORTS ALL

IMPORTS

  KEM-ALGORITHM
    FROM KEMAlgorithmInformation-2023  -- [I-D.ietf-lamps-cms-kemri]
       { iso(1) identified-organization(3) dod(6) internet(1)
         security(5) mechanisms(5) pkix(7) id-mod(0)
         id-mod-kemAlgorithmInformation-2023(TBD3) }

  AlgorithmIdentifier{}, PUBLIC-KEY, DIGEST-ALGORITHM,
  KEY-DERIVATION, KEY-WRAP
    FROM AlgorithmInformation-2009  -- [RFC5912]
      { iso(1) identified-organization(3) dod(6) internet(1)
        security(5) mechanisms(5) pkix(7) id-mod(0)
        id-mod-algorithmInformation-02(58) }

  kwa-aes128-wrap, kwa-aes192-wrap, kwa-aes256-wrap
    FROM CMSAesRsaesOaep-2009  -- [RFC5911]
      { iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) rsadsi(113549)
        pkcs(1) pkcs-9(9) smime(16) modules(0)
        id-mod-cms-aes-02(38) }

  kwa-3DESWrap
    FROM CryptographicMessageSyntaxAlgorithms-2009  -- [RFC5911]
      { iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) rsadsi(113549)
        pkcs(1) pkcs-9(9) smime(16) modules(0)
        id-mod-cmsalg-2001-02(37) }

  id-camellia128-wrap, id-camellia192-wrap, id-camellia256-wrap
    FROM CamelliaEncryptionAlgorithmInCMS  -- [RFC3657]
      { iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) rsadsi(113549)
        pkcs(1) pkcs9(9) smime(16) modules(0)
        id-mod-cms-camellia(23) }

  mda-sha1, pk-rsa, RSAPublicKey
    FROM PKIXAlgs-2009  -- [RFC5912]
      { iso(1) identified-organization(3) dod(6) internet(1)
        security(5) mechanisms(5) pkix(7) id-mod(0)
        id-mod-pkix1-algorithms2008-02(56) }

  mda-sha224, mda-sha256, mda-sha384, mda-sha512
    FROM PKIX1-PSS-OAEP-Algorithms-2009  -- [RFC5912]
```

```
      { iso(1) identified-organization(3) dod(6) internet(1)
        security(5) mechanisms(5) pkix(7) id-mod(0)
        id-mod-pkix1-rsa-pkalgs-02(54) } ;


-- Useful types and definitions

OID ::= OBJECT IDENTIFIER  -- alias

NullParms ::= NULL

-- ISO/IEC 18033-2 arc

is18033-2 OID ::= { iso(1) standard(0) is18033(18033) part2(2) }

-- NIST algorithm arc

nistAlgorithm OID ::= { joint-iso-itu-t(2) country(16) us(840)
   organization(1) gov(101) csor(3) nistAlgorithm(4) }

-- PKCS #1 arc

pkcs-1 OID ::= { iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) rsadsi(113549)
   pkcs(1) pkcs-1(1) }

-- X9.44 arc

x9-44 OID ::= { iso(1) identified-organization(3) tc68(133)
   country(16) x9(840) x9Standards(9) x9-44(44) }

x9-44-components OID ::= { x9-44 components(1) }

-- RSA-KEM Algorithm

id-rsa-kem OID ::= { iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) rsadsi(113549)
   pkcs(1) pkcs-9(9) smime(16) alg(3) 14 }

GenericHybridParameters ::= SEQUENCE {
   kem  KeyEncapsulationMechanism,
   dem  DataEncapsulationMechanism }

KeyEncapsulationMechanism ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { KEM-ALGORITHM, {KEMAlgorithms} }

KEMAlgorithms KEM-ALGORITHM ::= { kema-kem-rsa | kema-rsa-kem, ... }

kema-rsa-kem KEM-ALGORITHM ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-rsa-kem
   PARAMS TYPE GenericHybridParameters ARE optional
   PUBLIC-KEYS { pk-rsa | pk-rsa-kem }
```

```
   UKM ARE optional
   SMIME-CAPS { TYPE GenericHybridParameters
      IDENTIFIED BY id-rsa-kem } }

kema-kem-rsa KEM-ALGORITHM ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-kem-rsa
   PARAMS TYPE RsaKemParameters ARE optional
   PUBLIC-KEYS { pk-rsa | pk-rsa-kem }
   UKM ARE optional
   SMIME-CAPS { TYPE GenericHybridParameters
      IDENTIFIED BY id-rsa-kem } }

id-kem-rsa OID ::= { is18033-2 key-encapsulation-mechanism(2)
   rsa(4) }

RsaKemParameters ::= SEQUENCE {
   keyDerivationFunction  KeyDerivationFunction,
   keyLength              KeyLength }

pk-rsa-kem PUBLIC-KEY ::= {
  IDENTIFIER id-rsa-kem
  KEY RSAPublicKey
  PARAMS TYPE GenericHybridParameters ARE preferredAbsent
  -- Private key format is not specified here --
  CERT-KEY-USAGE {keyEncipherment} }

KeyDerivationFunction ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { KEY-DERIVATION, {KDFAlgorithms} }

KDFAlgorithms KEY-DERIVATION ::= { kda-kdf2 | kda-kdf3, ... }

KeyLength ::= INTEGER (1..MAX)

DataEncapsulationMechanism ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { KEY-WRAP, {DEMAlgorithms} }

DEMAlgorithms KEY-WRAP ::= {
   X9-SymmetricKeyWrappingSchemes |
   Camellia-KeyWrappingSchemes, ... }

X9-SymmetricKeyWrappingSchemes KEY-WRAP ::= {
   kwa-aes128-wrap | kwa-aes192-wrap | kwa-aes256-wrap |
   kwa-3DESWrap, ... }

X9-SymmetricKeyWrappingScheme ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { KEY-WRAP, {X9-SymmetricKeyWrappingSchemes} }

Camellia-KeyWrappingSchemes KEY-WRAP ::= {
   kwa-camellia128-wrap | kwa-camellia192-wrap |
   kwa-camellia256-wrap, ... }
```

```
Camellia-KeyWrappingScheme ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { KEY-WRAP, {Camellia-KeyWrappingSchemes} }

kwa-camellia128-wrap KEY-WRAP ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-camellia128-wrap
   PARAMS ARE absent
   SMIME-CAPS { IDENTIFIED BY id-camellia128-wrap } }

kwa-camellia192-wrap KEY-WRAP ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-camellia192-wrap
   PARAMS ARE absent
   SMIME-CAPS { IDENTIFIED BY id-camellia192-wrap } }

kwa-camellia256-wrap KEY-WRAP ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-camellia256-wrap
   PARAMS ARE absent
   SMIME-CAPS { IDENTIFIED BY id-camellia256-wrap } }

-- Key Derivation Functions

id-kdf-kdf2 OID ::= { x9-44-components kdf2(1) }

kda-kdf2 KEY-DERIVATION ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-kdf-kdf2
   PARAMS TYPE KDF2-HashFunction ARE required
   -- No S/MIME caps defined -- }

KDF2-HashFunction ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { DIGEST-ALGORITHM, {KDF2-HashFunctions} }

KDF2-HashFunctions DIGEST-ALGORITHM ::= { X9-HashFunctions, ... }

id-kdf-kdf3 OID ::= { x9-44-components kdf3(2) }

kda-kdf3 KEY-DERIVATION ::= {
   IDENTIFIER id-kdf-kdf3
   PARAMS TYPE KDF3-HashFunction ARE required
   -- No S/MIME caps defined -- }

KDF3-HashFunction ::=
   AlgorithmIdentifier { DIGEST-ALGORITHM, {KDF3-HashFunctions} }

KDF3-HashFunctions DIGEST-ALGORITHM ::= { X9-HashFunctions, ... }

-- Hash Functions

X9-HashFunctions DIGEST-ALGORITHM ::= {
   mda-sha1 | mda-sha224 | mda-sha256 | mda-sha384 |
   mda-sha512, ... }
```

```
END
```

<CODE ENDS>

Appendix C. SMIMECapabilities Examples

To indicate support for the RSA-KEM algorithm coupled with the KDF3 key-derivation function with SHA-256 and the AES Key Wrap symmetric key-encryption algorithm 128-bit key-encryption key, the SMIMECapabilities will include the following entry:

```
SEQUENCE {
   id-rsa-kem,                                  -- RSA-KEM Algorithm
   SEQUENCE {                             -- GenericHybridParameters
      SEQUENCE {                    -- key encapsulation mechanism
         id-kem-rsa,                                   -- RSA-KEM
         SEQUENCE {                             -- RsaKemParameters
            SEQUENCE {                  -- key derivation function
               id-kdf-kdf3,                                 -- KDF3
               SEQUENCE {                       -- KDF3-HashFunction
                  id-sha256  -- SHA-256; no parameters (preferred)
               },
            16                                -- KEK length in bytes
            },
      SEQUENCE {                    -- data encapsulation mechanism
         id-aes128-Wrap             -- AES-128 Wrap; no parameters
      }
   }
}
```

This SMIMECapability value has the following DER encoding (in hexadecimal):

```
30 47
  06 0b 2a 86 48 86 f7 0d 01 09 10 03 0e           -- id-rsa-kem
  30 38
     30 29
        06 07 28 81 8c 71 02 02 04                 -- id-kem-rsa
        30 1e
           30 19
              06 0a 2b 81 05 10 86 48 09 2c 01 02  -- id-kdf-kdf3
              30 0b
                 06 09 60 86 48 01 65 03 04 02 01  -- id-sha256
                 02 01 10                          -- 16 bytes
      30 0b
         06 09 60 86 48 01 65 03 04 01 05         -- id-aes128-Wrap
```

To indicate support for the RSA-KEM algorithm coupled with the KDF3 key-derivation function with SHA-384 and the AES Key Wrap symmetric key-encryption algorithm 192-bit key-encryption key, the SMIMECapabilities will include the following SMIMECapability value (in hexadecimal):

```
30 47 06 0b 2a 86 48 86 f7 0d 01 09 10 03 0e 30
38 30 29 06 07 28 81 8c 71 02 02 04 30 1e 30 19
06 0a 2b 81 05 10 86 48 09 2c 01 02 30 0b 06 09
60 86 48 01 65 03 04 02 02 02 01 18 30 0b 06 09
60 86 48 01 65 03 04 01 19
```

To indicate support for the RSA-KEM algorithm coupled with the KDF3 key-derivation function with SHA-512 and the AES Key Wrap symmetric key-encryption algorithm 256-bit key-encryption key, the SMIMECapabilities will include the following SMIMECapability value (in hexadecimal):

```
30 47 06 0b 2a 86 48 86 f7 0d 01 09 10 03 0e 30
38 30 29 06 07 28 81 8c 71 02 02 04 30 1e 30 19
06 0a 2b 81 05 10 86 48 09 2c 01 02 30 0b 06 09
60 86 48 01 65 03 04 02 03 02 01 20 30 0b 06 09
60 86 48 01 65 03 04 01 2d
```

Appendix D. RSA-KEM CMS Enveloped-Data Example

This example shows the establishment of an AES-128 content-encryption key using:

* RSA-KEM with a 3072-bit key;

* key derivation using KDF2 with SHA-256; and

* key wrap using AES-128-KEYWRAP.

In real-world use, the originator would encrypt the content-encryption key in a manner that would allow decryption with their own private key as well as the recipient's private key. This is omitted in an attempt to simplify the example.

D.1. Originator Processing

Alice obtains Bob's public key:

```
-----BEGIN PUBLIC KEY-----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-----END PUBLIC KEY-----
```

Bob's RSA public key has the following key identifier:

9eeb67c9b95a74d44d2f16396680e801b5cba49c

Alice randomly generates integer z between 0 and n-1:
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Alice encrypts integer z using the Bob's RSA public key, the result is called c:
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Alice encodes the CMSORIforKEMOtherInfo structure with the algorithm identifier for AES-128-KEYWRAP and a key length of 16 octets. The DER encoding of CMSORIforKEMOtherInfo produces 18 octets:

3010300b060960864801650304010502 0110

The CMSORIforKEMOtherInfo structure contains:

```
     0  16: SEQUENCE {
     2  11:   SEQUENCE {
     4   9:     OBJECT IDENTIFIER aes128-wrap (2 16 840 1 101 3 4 1 5)
         :     }
    15   1:   INTEGER 16
         :   }
```

Alice derives the key-encryption key from integer z and the CMSORIforKEMOtherInfo structure with KDF2 and SHA-256, the KEK is:

4a95fe82f8d6ba56c83b4d51ef7dc06b

Alice randomly generates a 128-bit content-encryption key:

77f2a84640304be7bd42670a84a1258b

Alice uses AES-128-KEYWRAP to encrypt the 128-bit content-encryption key with the derived key-encryption key:

904dbeb0271fc02082fe6d358c03352ae4ae6b540b782423

Alice encrypts the padded content using AES-128-CBC with the content-encryption key. The 16-octet IV used is:

480ccafebabefacedbaddecaf8887781

The padded content plaintext is:

48656c6c6f2c20776f726c6421030303

The resulting ciphertext is:

c6ca65db7bdd76b0f37e2fab6264b66d

D.2. ContentInfo and EnvelopedData

Alice encodes the EnvelopedData (using KEMRecipientInfo) and ContentInfo, and then sends the result to Bob. The Base64-encoded: result is:

```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```

This result decodes to:

```
  0 604: SEQUENCE {
  4   9:  OBJECT IDENTIFIER envelopedData (1 2 840 113549 1 7 3)
 15 589:  [0] {
 19 585:   SEQUENCE {
 23   1:    INTEGER 3
 26 516:    SET {
 30 512:     [4] {
 34  11:      OBJECT IDENTIFIER
       :       KEMRecipientInfo (1 2 840 113549 1 9 16 13 3)
 47 495:      SEQUENCE {
 51   1:       INTEGER 0
 54  20:       [0]
       :       9E EB 67 C9 B9 5A 74 D4 4D 2F 16 39 66 80 E8 01
       :       B5 CB A4 9C
 76   9:       SEQUENCE {
 78   7:        OBJECT IDENTIFIER kemRSA (1 0 18033 2 2 4)
       :        }
 87 384:       OCTET STRING
       :       C0 71 FC 27 3A F8 E7 BD B1 52 E0 6B F7 33 10 36
       :       10 74 15 4A 43 AB CF 3C 93 C1 34 99 D2 06 53 44
       :       3E ED 9E F5 D3 C0 68 5E 4A A7 6A 68 54 81 5B B9
       :       76 91 FF 9F 8D AC 15 EE A7 D7 4F 45 2B F3 50 A6
       :       46 16 3D 68 28 8E 97 8C BF 7A 73 08 9E E5 27 12
       :       F9 A4 F4 9E 06 AC E7 BB C8 5A B1 4D 4E 33 6C 97
       :       C5 72 8A 26 54 13 8C 7B 26 E8 83 5C 6B 0A 9F BE
       :       D2 64 95 C4 EA DF 74 5A 29 33 BE 28 3F 6A 88 B1
       :       66 95 FC 06 66 68 73 CF B6 D3 67 18 EF 33 76 CE
       :       FC 10 0C 39 41 F3 C4 94 94 40 78 32 58 07 A5 59
       :       18 6B 95 CC AB F3 71 4C FA F7 9F 83 BD 30 53 7F
       :       DD 9A ED 5A 4C DC BD 8B D0 48 6F AE D7 3E 9D 48
       :       6B 30 87 D6 C8 06 54 6B 6E 26 71 57 5C 98 46 1E
       :       44 1F 65 54 2B D9 5D E2 6D 0F 53 A6 4E 78 48 D7
       :       31 D9 60 8D 05 3E 8D 34 55 46 60 2D 86 23 6F FE
       :       37 04 C9 8A D5 91 44 F3 08 9E 5E 6D 52 7B 54 97
       :       BA 10 3C 79 D6 2E 80 D0 23 54 10 B0 6F 71 A7 D9
       :       BD 1C 38 00 0F 91 0D 63 12 EA 2F 20 A3 55 75 35
       :       AD 01 B3 09 3F B5 F7 EE 50 70 80 D0 F7 7D 48 C9
       :       C3 B3 79 6F 6B 7D D3 78 60 85 FB 89 51 23 F0 4C
       :       A1 F1 C1 BE 22 C7 47 A8 DF AC E3 23 70 FB 0D 57
       :       07 83 E2 7D BB 7E 74 FC A9 4E E3 96 76 FD E3 D8
       :       A9 55 3D 87 82 24 73 6E 37 E1 91 DA B9 53 C7 E2
       :       28 C0 7A D5 CA 31 22 42 1C 14 DE BD 07 2A 9A B6
475  27:       SEQUENCE {
477  10:        OBJECT IDENTIFIER
       :         kdf2 (1 3 133 16 840 9 44 1 1)
489  13:        SEQUENCE {
491   9:         OBJECT IDENTIFIER
       :          sha-256 (2 16 840 1 101 3 4 2 1)
502   0:         NULL
```

```
       :          }
       :         }
504   1:       INTEGER 16
507  11:       SEQUENCE {
509   9:        OBJECT IDENTIFIER
       :         aes128-wrap (2 16 840 1 101 3 4 1 5)
       :         }
520  24:       OCTET STRING
       :       90 4D BE B0 27 1F C0 20 82 FE 6D 35 8C 03 35 2A
       :       E4 AE 6B 54 0B 78 24 23
       :        }
       :       }
       :      }
546  60:    SEQUENCE {
548   9:     OBJECT IDENTIFIER data (1 2 840 113549 1 7 1)
559  29:     SEQUENCE {
561   9:      OBJECT IDENTIFIER
       :       aes128-CBC (2 16 840 1 101 3 4 1 2)
572  16:      OCTET STRING
       :      48 0C CA FE BA BE FA CE DB AD DE CA F8 88 77 81
       :       }
590  16:     [0] C6 CA 65 DB 7B DD 76 B0 F3 7E 2F AB 62 64 B6 6D
       :      }
       :     }
       :    }
       :   }
```

ß## Recipient Processing

Bob's private key:

```
-----BEGIN PRIVATE KEY-----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-----END PRIVATE KEY-----
```

Bob decrypts the integer z with his RSA private key:
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Bob encodes the CMSORIforKEMOtherInfo structure with the algorithm identifier for AES-128-KEYWRAP and a key length of 16 octets. The DER encoding of CMSORIforKEMOtherInfo is not repeated here.

Bob derives the key-encryption key from integer z and the CMSORIforKEMOtherInfo structure with KDF2 and SHA-256, the KEK is:

4a95fe82f8d6ba56c83b4d51ef7dc06b

Bob uses AES-KEY-WRAP to decrypt the content-encryption key with the key-encryption key; the content-encryption key is:

77f2a84640304be7bd42670a84a1258b

Bob decrypts the content using AES-128-CBC with the content-encryption key. The 16-octet IV used is:

480ccafebabefacedbaddecaf8887781

The received ciphertext content is:

c6ca65db7bdd76b0f37e2fab6264b66d

The resulting padded plaintext content is:

48656c6c6f2c20776f726c6421030303

After stripping the padding, the plaintext content is:

Hello, world!

Acknowledgements

We thank James Randall, Burt Kaliski, and John Brainard as the original authors of [RFC5990]; this document is based on their work.

We thank the members of the ASC X9F1 working group for their contributions to drafts of ANS X9.44, which led to [RFC5990].

We thank Blake Ramsdell, Jim Schaad, Magnus Nystrom, Bob Griffin, and John Linn for helping bring [RFC5990] to fruition.

Authors' Addresses

Russ Housley
Vigil Security, LLC
516 Dranesville Road
Herndon, VA, 20170
United States of America

Email: housley@vigilsec.com

Sean Turner
sn3rd

Email: sean@sn3rd.com