

Megaco Errata

Status of this Memo

This document is an Internet-Draft and is in full conformance with all provisions of [Section 10 of RFC2026](#) [1].

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at

<http://www.ietf.org/ietf/lid-abstracts.txt>

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at

<http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html>.

1. Abstract

This document records the errors found in the draft Megaco/H.248 protocol document [2], along with the changes proposed in the text of that document to resolve them. After joint IETF/ITU-T Study Group 16 approval of these corrections, they will be incorporated into the final decided version of H.248 and the corresponding Megaco protocol RFC. The current status of approval is as follows:

- . IETF process is complete, and the IESG has granted its approval;
- . ITU-T process is complete except that the Members' comment period does not expire until June 8, 2000 and the final act of Decision is scheduled for June 15, 2000.

This draft has been modified from the previous issue by strengthening the sentence in section D.1.3 which requires exponential backoff in the face of congestion. The detailed list of changes from [draft-ietf-megaco-errata-01.txt](#) has been left intact for the user's convenience.

2. Conventions used in this document

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [RFC-2119](#) [1].

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

1
May 2000

[3. Errata](#)

All section numbers are those of the relevant text of [2].

[3.1 Changes From \[draft-ietf-megaco-errata-01.txt\]\(#\)](#)

[Section 7.1](#): proposed change in the comment preceding production `auditReturnItem` in Annex B.2 (ABNF) has been deleted, because a later section actually proposes deletion of the comment.

[Section 7.2.5](#): issue has been expanded to note that the text of [section 7.2.5](#) anticipates the possibility of return of multiple instances of the same descriptor. Proposed remedy is to delete the restrictive comment in front of production `auditReturnItem` in Annex B.2 (ABNF), rather than just modify it to add exceptions.

[Section 7.2.5](#): to get the current dial string of an active digit map, the `ObservedEvents` descriptor must be audited rather than the `Events` descriptor.

Section A.2: along with the addition of the protocol identifier field in the message header, the now-redundant version field is removed. The need to add extensibility to more productions through use of ellipses is noted.

Section A.2, B.2: the ASN.1 uses three values from `contextId` numbering space to denote NULL, CHOOSE, and ALL. A comment is added to the ABNF to reserve the values concerned.

Section A.2: format of `H221NonStandard` field does not properly reflect structure of T.35 country code.

Annex C: changes to ATM-related sections are noted. Alignment of sub-octet fields is stated to be at the low-order end of the octet.

Section D.1.3: exponential backoff in the face of congestion made mandatory by replacing SHOULD with SHALL.

Annex E: package serial numbers are revised to make them consecutive.

[Appendix A](#) step 3: revised to use echo control as defined in the TDM package.

[3.2](#) Complete List Of Corrections

Taylor	Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000	2
	Megaco Errata	May 2000

Section: 2 "References"

Editorial: Add missing references to I.363.5 (AAL5) and [RFC 1661](#) (PPP).

Editorial: delete unused reference to Q.724.

Editorial: Leave Recommendations referred to in Annex C undated, implying latest issue.

Editorial: add reference to [RFC 2805](#), the Megaco requirements document.

Section: 4 "Abbreviations"

Editorial: delete unused abbreviation BRI.

Editorial: add explanations for GSM and IVR.

Section: 6.2.2 "TerminationIDs"

Issue: Not clear what wildcard union responses look like.

Resolution: Add the following text:

"ie. Given termination Ta with properties p1=a, p2=b, and termination Tb with properties p2=c, p3=d a UNION response would be T* p1=a, p2=b,c, p3=d."

Section: 6.2.4 "Termination Properties and descriptors"

Issue: Says that property values set in Null context are remembered and reinstated when termination returns to Null. Contradicts latest text in 7.2.3.

Resolution: Rewrite the first paragraph from the third sentence onward, to read:

"Most properties have default values, which are explicitly defined in this standard or in a package (see [Section 12](#)) or set by provisioning. If not provisioned otherwise, all descriptors except for TerminationState and LocalControl default to empty/"no value" when a termination is first created or is returned to the null context. The default contents of the two exceptions are described in sections [7.1.5](#) and [7.1.7](#)."

Issue: DigitMap entry in table makes explicit reference to DTMF tones, but is also intended to apply to other in-band signalling systems.

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

3
May 2000

Resolution: Change existing text to new one as follows: "Defines patterns against which sequences of a specified set of events are to be matched so they can be reported as a group rather than singly."

Section: 6.2.5 "Root Termination"

Issue: Root can have statistics as well as properties and events.

Resolution: add "statistics" to the fourth sentence of the first paragraph, listing what is valid for Root. Add "statistics" to what AuditValue can return for Root.

Section: 7.1 "Descriptors"

Issue: it is unclear how to express empty descriptors in responses to the MGC.

Proposed resolution: In [section 7.1](#), add the following text after the sentence: "Descriptors may be returned as output from a command.":

"In any such return of descriptor contents, an empty descriptor is represented by its name unaccompanied by any list."

In the ASN.1, add the following choice to the AuditReturnParameter production:

"emptyDescriptors AuditDescriptor,"

In the ABNF, add the choice auditItem to the production auditReturnParameter.

Section: 7.1.1 "Specifying Parameters"

Issue: Third paragraph (discussing unspecified parameters): not clear which parameters are mandatory.

Resolution: Replace the first two sentences (each beginning with the word "unspecified") with the following text:

"If a required descriptor other than the Audit descriptor is unspecified (i.e. entirely absent) from a command, the previous values set in that descriptor for that termination, if any, are retained. A missing Audit descriptor is equivalent to an empty Audit descriptor. The behaviour of the MG with respect to unspecified parameters within a descriptor varies with the descriptor concerned, as indicated in succeeding sections."

Section: 7.1.6 "Stream Descriptor", ABNF (Annex B.2)

Issue: Text indicates use of "true" and "false" values while ABNF uses "on" and "off"

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000

Megaco Errata

4

May 2000

Resolution: Add comment in B.2 that "true" in text corresponds to "on" in ABNF, and "false" corresponds to "off".

Section: 7.1.8 "Local and Remote Descriptors"

Issue: case where reserveGroup or reserveValue is true, last bulleted item beginning: "If the Mode property of the LocalControl descriptor is RecvOnly or SendRecv,...", could also have DSP involvement in the case of loopback mode.

Resolution: Add "loopback".

Section: 7.1.9 "Events Descriptor"

Issue: EventDM is part of syntax but not mentioned in section.

Resolution: Add text: "If a digit map completion event is present or implied in the EventsDescriptor, EventDM is used to carry either the name or the value of the associated digit map. See [section 7.1.14](#)."

Issue: Not clear whether events trigger side effects (e.g. signal termination) at time of detection, at time of processing (whether or not in active Events Descriptor) or at time of notification. Also, the third paragraph of the section fails to mention these side

effects and limits MG action to notification.

Resolution: Modify the third paragraph of the section, so that it reads:

"When an event (either newly detected or buffered) is processed against the contents of an active Events descriptor and found to be present in that descriptor ("recognized"), the default action of the MG is to send a Notify command to the MG. Notification may be deferred if the event is absorbed into the current dial string of an active digit map (see [section 7.1.14](#)). Any other action is for further study. Moreover, event recognition may cause currently active signals to stop, or may cause the current Events and/or Signals descriptor to be replaced, as described at the end of this section."

Replace "detection" with "recognition" in the fourth paragraph from the end, so that it reads:

"Normally, recognition of an event shall cause any active signals to stop. When KeepActive is specified in the event, the MG shall not interrupt any signals active on the Termination on which the event is detected."

In the third-last paragraph, replace all three instances of "detected" with "recognized".

Leave the word "detected" as is in the final paragraph.

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

5
May 2000

Issue: Case 1, step 2(a) is incorrectly formulated. Existing logic may result in an infinite loop. Also, the step excludes side effect actions such as signal termination.

Resolution: Modify step 2(a) to read:

"If the event in the queue is in the events listed in the new EventsDescriptor, the MG acts on the event and removes it from the EventBuffer. The time stamp of the Notify shall be the time the event was actually detected. The MG then waits for a new EventsDescriptor. While waiting for a new EventsDescriptor, any events detected which appear in the current EventsBufferDescriptor will be placed in the EventBuffer. When a new EventDescriptor is received, event processing repeats from step 1."

Section: 7.1.11 "Signals Descriptor"

Issue: There is a need for the MGC to be aware of signalling failures. It is not possible to use the signal completion event to monitor for signalling failures only, without also having to process

successes.

Proposed Resolution: In [section 7.1.11](#), replace the current text on completion notification, beginning: "Finally, the optional parameter "notifyCompletion" ..." and continuing to the end of the paragraph with the following text:

"Finally, the optional parameter "notifyCompletion" allows a MGC to indicate the circumstances under which it wishes to be notified when the signal finishes playout. The possible cases are that the signal timed out, that it was interrupted by an event, that it was halted when a Signals descriptor was replaced, or that it stopped or never started for other reasons. If "notifyCompletion" is absent, notification is generated in the "other reasons" case only. For reporting to occur the signal completion event (see section E.1.2) must be enabled in the currently active Events descriptor."

In Annex A.2, make notifyCompletion a BIT STRING with the four cases. In B.2, make it a parameter consisting of a name and a list of values representing the possible completion methods.

Section: 7.1.13 "ServiceChange Descriptor"

Issue: Missing "extension" component in the API.

Resolution: Add missing component.

Section: 7.1.14 "DigitMap Descriptor"

Editorial: add the following subsections.

7.1.14.1 DigitMap definition, creation, modification and termination

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

6
May 2000

(before first paragraph)

7.1.14.2 DigitMap Timers

(after the first bullet list)

7.1.14.3 DigitMap syntax

(before the long paragraph starting "The formal syntax of the digit map [...]")

7.1.14.4 DigitMap completion event

(before the paragraph starting "A digit map is active while the events descriptor [...]")

7.1.14.5 DigitMap procedures

(before the sentence "Pending completion, successive events shall be processed [...]", preceding the numbered list)

7.1.14.6 DigitMap activation

(after the numbered list)

7.1.14.7 Interaction of DigitMap and event processing

(before the next paragraph, starting "While the digit map is activated, [...]")

7.1.14.8 Wildcards

(before the the next paragraph, starting "Note that if a package contains [...]")

7.1.14.9 Example

(before the example)

Issue: incorrect statements regarding the interaction of the dot symbol with default timing rules.

Resolution: last sentence of the paragraph beginning "The letter "x" is used as a wildcard, ..." should be modified to read:

"As a consequence of the third timing rule above, inter-event timing while matching a terminal dot symbol uses the short timer by default." In the next paragraph, the third sentence, which begins: " A timer specifier following a dot ...", should be deleted.

Issue: Step 5 in second numbered list understates conditions for digit map completion when single candidate remains.

Resolution: Add the words "and it has been fully matched" to the existing sentence. Also remove the parenthetical remark:

"... (because the candidate set still contains more than one alternative event sequence)"
from step 6.

Issue: Not clear when unmatched events are recognized and trigger side effects (e.g. signal termination).

Resolution: Modify the final sentence of the paragraph following procedural step 6 to read as follows:

"Normal event behaviour (e.g. stopping of signals unless the digit completion event has the KeepActive flag enabled) continues to apply for each such event detected, except that

- . the events in the package containing the specified digit map completion event other than the completion event itself are not individually notified, and
- . an event which triggers a "partial match" completion is not recognized and therefore has no side effects until reprocessed following the recognition of the digit map completion event."

Issue: the last paragraph before the example is misleading if the package containing the digit map completion event is different from the package containing the actual digits.

Resolution: qualify the second sentence of the paragraph as follows: "Regardless of whether a digit map is activated, if the package also contains the digit events themselves, this form of event specification ...".

Section: 7.1.18 "Topology Descriptor"

Issue: Third bullet attached to third para: says loopback achieved by manipulating TerminationMode, which no longer has that name.

Resolution: Delete the clause "; loopbacks are created by setting the TerminationMode"

Section: 7.2

Issue: The order in which descriptors are processed within a command matters, but is not clear. Moreover, it is fixed in the ASN.1 but variable in the ABNF.

Resolution: Add text stating that descriptors are processed in the order in which they are provided. Change ASN.1 in Annex A.2 to allow the MGC to specify ordering:

```
AmmRequest ::= SEQUENCE
{
    terminationID          TerminationIDList,
    descriptors             SEQUENCE OF AmmDescriptor,
    -- At most one descriptor of each type (see AmmDescriptor)
    -- allowed in the sequence
    ...
}
```

```
AmmDescriptor ::= CHOICE
{
    mediaDescriptor        MediaDescriptor,
    modemDescriptor        ModemDescriptor,
    muxDescriptor          MuxDescriptor,
    eventsDescriptor       EventsDescriptor,
    eventBufferDescriptor  EventBufferDescriptor,
    signalsDescriptor      SignalsDescriptor,
    digitMapDescriptor     DigitMapDescriptor,
```

```
auditDescriptor          AuditDescriptor,
```

...
}

Section: 7.2.3 "Subtract"

Issue: cannot use the CHOOSE wildcard for terminationId of a Subtract command.

Resolution: add this qualification to the second sentence, which indicates that terminationId may be wildcarded.

Section: 7.2.4 "Move"

Issue: cannot use the CHOOSE wildcard for terminationId of a Move command.

Resolution: add this qualification to the second sentence, which indicates that terminationId may be wildcarded.

Section: 7.2.5 "AuditValue"

Issue: Not clear whether AuditValue of ObservedEventsDescriptor reports events captured in current dial string of active digit map.

Resolution: Add text to indicate that if a digit map is active and ObservedEventsDescriptor is specified the response to an AuditValue includes a digit map completion event which shows the current dial string but does not show a termination method.

Issue: Fails to indicate what AuditValue for EventBufferDescriptor returns

Resolution: Add the following text: "EventBuffer returns the set of events and associated parameter values currently enabled in the EventBufferDescriptor."

Issue: not clear whether wildcarded context includes the null context.

Resolution: add statement that ALL as a contextID does not include the null context.

Issue: the text of 7.2.5 allows retrieval of multiple digit maps with one AuditValue command if the terminationId is ALL. Moreover, earlier text in the Annex anticipates that multiple instances of a descriptor may be returned. The comment in front of production auditReturnParameter in Annex B.2 contradicts this text. Note that Annex A has no restriction on the number of instances of any descriptor in either a command or a response.

Proposed Resolution: delete the "at-most-once" comment preceding ABNF production `auditReturnParameter`.

Issue: Does not indicate how an audit of digit maps returns unnamed digit maps.

Resolution: Change syntax of `DigitMapDescriptor` to allow return of unnamed digit maps as follows:

```
digitMapDescriptor = DigitMapToken EQUAL
                    ( (LBRKT digitMapValue RBRKT)
                      / (digitMapname [ LBRKT digitMapValue RBRKT ])
                    )
```

and

```
DigitMapDescriptor ::= SEQUENCE
{
    digitMapName      DigitMapName OPTIONAL,
    digitMapValue     DigitMapValue OPTIONAL
}
```

Issue: the text in [section 7.2.5](#) mentions that using an empty Audit descriptor with a wildcarded `terminationId` is a way to get a list of the terminations in the context. Annex A provides the possibility that the `auditReply` may be a `contextAuditResult` of type `terminationIdList`, and Annex B allows for an `auditReply` containing a `contextTerminationAudit` which in turn presents a `terminationIdList`. The connection between the text in 7.2.5 and these special forms of audit result is not clear. Moreover, a note at the beginning of Annex A section A.2 limits `terminationIdList` to one `terminationId`.

Proposed Resolution: add the following text in [section 7.2.5](#) after the sentence "This may be useful to get a list of `TerminationIDs` when used with wildcard.":

"Annexes A and B provide a special syntax for presenting such a list in condensed form, such that the `AuditValue` command tag does not have to be repeated for each `terminationId`."

Also, in the Note at the beginning of section A.2 of Annex A, provide an exception on the length of type `TerminationIdList` when used in `contextAuditResult`.

Section: 7.2.6 "AuditCapabilities"

Issue: Fails to indicate what `AuditCapabilities` for `EventBufferDescriptor` returns

Resolution: Add the following text: "EventBuffer returns the same information as Events."

Issue: Inconsistency regarding permissibility of DigitMap or Packages as capability audit items.

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

10
May 2000

Resolution: Add comment to B.2 "auditItem" production indicating that DigitMap and Packages are not allowed in the AuditCapabilities command.

Section: 7.2.8 "ServiceChange"

Issue: In point 1) describing the Graceful ServiceChange method, the scope of the recommendation against new connections is unclear.

Resolution: at the end of the first sentence, add the phrase "on the termination(s) affected by the ServiceChange command".

Issue: the explanatory string associated with ServiceChangeReason is optional in the syntax, but not in the text.

Resolution: add "optional" before "explanatory string" in the explanation of the ServiceChangeReason" parameter.

Issue: Paragraph beginning "A ServiceChange Command specifying the Root..." immediately following the description of ServiceChange Descriptor parameters erroneously states that the response to the ServiceChange command terminates the registration process. This is so only if the response does not specify an alternate MGC.

Resolution: Add text to the offending sentence, so that it reads: "Acknowledgement of the ServiceChange Command completes the registration process, except when the MGC has returned an alternative ServiceChangeMgcId as described in the next paragraph."

Section: 7.3 "Command Error Codes"

Issue: Text for error code 403 should be consistent with that for 404 and 405.

Resolution: Change text to "Syntax error in TransactionRequest"

Issue: There should be no error responses to TransactionReply or TransactionPending, lest they create response loops.

Resolution: Delete codes 404, 405, 461-467

Section: 8 "Transactions", A.2

Issue: state is unclear if a command fails.

Resolution: add the following text:

"If a command fails, the MG shall as far as possible restore the state which prevailed prior to the attempted execution of the command before continuing with transaction processing."

Section: 8.1.1 "Transaction Identifiers"

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

11
May 2000

Issue: need a transaction identifier to use when reporting a syntax error such that the identifier is unavailable.

Resolution: add text reserving transionId = 0 for this purpose.

Section: 8.1.2 "Context Identifiers"

Issue: ALL as a context identifier does not include the null context.

Resolution: add text to indicate that exclusion in the final sentence of the section.

Section: 8.2.2 "TransactionReply"

Issue: Final para has wrong text for error code 442.

Resolution: Change to "Syntax Error in Command"

Section: 10.2 "Interim AH Scheme", B.2

Issue: The interim AH header can actually be as short as 24 hex digits (per RFCs 2403, 2404 which are indirectly referenced). It is also unclear whether it is the source or destination UDP port which is prepended in the calculation.

Resolution: Change 10.2 second para, second-last sentence to specify the destination port, in consistency with IPSEC. In Annex B.2, change lower count for production AuthData to 24 from 32.

Section: 11.2 "Cold Start"

Issue: First paragraph last sentence inadvertently modified --

duplicates material in 11.3.

Resolution: Restore original sentence: "If the MG is unable to establish a control relationship with any MGC, it shall wait a random amount of time as described in [Section 9.2](#) and then start contacting its primary, and if necessary, its secondary MGCs again."

Section: 11.4 "Failure Of an MG"

Issue: Second para: wrong MG is specified as the one to be used after failover.

Resolution: Change fourth sentence to refer to "secondary MG" rather than "primary MG".

Section: 12.1.2 "Properties"

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

12
May 2000

Issue: As indicated in 6.2.4, Properties occur in other descriptors besides LocalControl and TerminationState.

Resolution: after the sentence mentioning TerminationState, add another sentence:

"Although these are the most common cases, it is also possible for a property to be defined for other descriptors."

Section: 12.1.4 "Signals"

Issue: Note says that default duration should be specified for BR signals. This also applies to T0 signals.

Resolution: Add T0 signals to note.

Section: 12.2 "Guidelines to defining Properties, Statistics and Parameters to Events and Signals", B.2

Issue: Text indicates that statistics can have the sub-list data type, but ABNF does not support that.

Resolution: qualify the sublist type by adding the note:
"(not supported for statistics)".

Section: Annex A.1, ASN.1 Syntax

Issue: the ASN.1 uses the values 0x0, 0xFFFFFFFFE, and 0xFFFFFFFF for

the NULL context, a wildcard CHOOSE of context, and a wildcard ALL of context respectively. Because of the possibility of a switch between binary and text encoding for messages relating to the same context, these values should be reserved in the text encoded syntax.

Resolution: Add a comment preceding the ContextID production in Annex B.2 indicating that these values are reserved.

Section: Annex A.2, ASN.1 Syntax

Issue: sloppy ASN.1 -- in production EventBufferControl the values "off" and "lockstep" should not be capitalized, and IA5STRING in production NonStandardIdentifier should be IA5String. Both TransactionID and TransactionId are used. A number of productions need ellipses to express extensibility.

Resolution: fix them.

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

13
May 2000

Issue: syntax for PropertyParm does not support sub-lists (i.e. parameters supporting multiple values simultaneously)

Resolution: add a third choice to extraInfo in PropertyParm as follows:

```
extraInfo    CHOICE
{
    relation      Relation,
    range         BOOLEAN,
    sublist       BOOLEAN
} OPTIONAL
```

and add an appropriate note to the preceding comments.

Issue: LocalControlDescriptor still contains reserve rather than reserveValue and reserveGroup.

Resolution: Replace reserve with separate reserveValue and reserveGroup Booleans.

Issue: EventBufferDescriptor is incorrectly portrayed as a SEQUENCE OF ObservedEvent.

Resolution: replace with the following productions:

EventBufferDescriptor ::= SEQUENCE OF EventSpec

EventSpec ::= SEQUENCE

```
{
    pkgdName          PkgdName,
    streamID          StreamID OPTIONAL,
    evParList         SEQUENCE OF EventParameter
}
```

Issue: Assigned object identifier missing. It is usually present as a matter of convention.

Resolution: Add object identifier line in the message header with content:

"itu-t recommendation h 248 media-gateway-control(0)"

Delete the version field, which this makes redundant.

Issue: the T.35 country code in the H221NonStandard production does not have the right structure.

Resolution: fix it.

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

14
May 2000

Section: Annex B.2, ABNF Syntax

Issue: Syntax for parmValue and VALUE together make parsing of range ambiguous. Furthermore, sub-lists and sets of alternative values have the same syntax, introducing possible ambiguity

Resolution: Replace production alternativeValue by the following:

```
"alternativeValue = ( VALUE
    / LSBRKT VALUE *(COMMA VALUE) RSBRKT      ; sub-list
    / LBRKT VALUE *(COMMA VALUE) RBRKT        ; alternatives
    / LSBRKT VALUE COLON VALUE RSBRKT )       ; range"
```

Issue: EventBufferDescriptor content mistakenly shown as a sequence of observedEvent.

Resolution: replace the production for eventBufferDescriptor with

the following productions:

```
eventBufferDescriptor = EventBufferToken LBRKT [ eventSpec
    *( COMMA eventSpec ) ] RBRKT
```

```
eventSpec = pkgdName [ LBRKT eventSpecParameter
    *( COMMA eventSpecParameter ) RBRKT ]
```

```
eventSpecParameter = ( eventStream / eventOther )
```

Issue: Error in syntax for digitMapDescriptor: value meant to be optional.

Resolution: Change production:

```
digitMapDescriptor = DigitMapToken EQUAL digitMapName
    [ LBRKT digitMapValue RBRKT ]
```

Issue: VersionToken not defined.

Resolution: Add ABNF: VersionToken = ("Version" / "V")

Issue: DiscardToken not used.

Resolution: Delete production.

Section: Annex C

Issue: alignment of sub-octet fields within the octet is not indicated.

Resolution: add note that fields of sub-octet length are placed in the low-order bits of the octet.

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

15
May 2000

Section: Annex C, ATM-related sections C.4, C.7, C.8, C.10

Issue: direction of flow is segregated by outgoing (Remote descriptor) and incoming (Local descriptor). Since forward and backward properties will not both reside in the same descriptor, need only the one set of properties applicable to both directions.

Resolution: replace with a single set of properties.

Issue: miscellaneous problems of parameter specifications

inconsistent with the relevant standards, unused parameters, distinction between ATM Forum and ITU-T usages, missing references.

Resolution: fix them.

Section: Annex C.8 "ATM AAL1"

Issue: Length of GIT is wrong.

Resolution: ITU-T procedural problem, to be resolved by SG 16.
Probable solution is to allow 29 octets, event though the relevant form requires only four octets.

Section: Annex C.9 "Bearer Capabilities"

Issue: ITC has reference to missing note 2

Resolution: Delete reference.

Issue: Not clear that Q.931 Bearer Capability IE rather than Low Layer Compatibility IE is being used.

Resolution: Specify that values are those valid for Bearer Capability IE

Section: Annex D.1 "Transport over IP/UDP using Application Level Framing"

Issue: Even in the case of handoff or failover, the originating MGC needs confirmation that its command was received.

Resolution: In the last sentence of the first paragraph, delete the excepting clause, so that the sentence reads: "Responses must be sent to the address and port from which the corresponding commands were sent."

Section: Annex D.1.1 "Providing At-Most-Once Functionality"

Issue: Second para last sentence provides a procedural reference to 8.2.3. Should refer to UDP-specific procedures.

Resolution: Add reference to D.1.4.

Section: Annex D.1.3 "Repeating Requests, Responses and Acknowledgements"

Issue: Make exponential backoff in the face of congestion mandatory.

Resolution: To the paragraph just before the note, which begins "The specification purposely avoids specifying any value for the retransmission timers...", add the following sentence:

"Implementations SHALL ensure that the algorithm used to calculate retransmission timing performs an exponentially increasing backoff of the retransmission timeout for each retransmission or repetition after the first one."

In the paragraph in the middle of the note beginning "After any retransmission ...", capitalize the word SHOULD to emphasize the importance of the steps which follow.

Issue: Last paragraph is equivocal about what ServiceChangeReason to use when recovering from loss of contact; it must always be "Disconnected".

Resolution: Change the two sentences following the phrase "_ and it begins its recovery process" to read as follows: "The MG shall use a ServiceChange with ServiceChangeMethod set to disconnected so that the new MGC will be aware that the MG lost one or more transactions."

Section: Annex D.1.4 "Provisional responses"

Issue: First paragraph, last sentence talks about when to send the Transaction Pending response. When UDP/ALF is in use, the originator of a transaction may repeat it because it has not received an acknowledgement that the transaction was received. An appropriate response to a duplicate transaction which is still being processed is to return Transaction Pending.

Resolution: Add the sentence: "They SHOULD send this response if they receive a repetition of a transaction that is still being executed."

Issue: Second para: transaction originator may not have received TransactionPending response(s) because they were lost, and may therefore not know that responder is expecting immediate acknowledgement of the TransactionReply.

Resolution: add an optional field to TransactionReply allowing the responder to indicate if an immediate ACK is required. Add text in the section indicating that when the responder has sent a provisional response, it shall also set the indicator in the final

transaction reply to indicate that an immediate acknowledgement is required.

Section: Annex E "Basic Packages"

Issue: package numbering does not follow order of presentation.

Resolution: renumber packages to follow order of numbering.

Section: Annex E.2.1 "Base Root Package -- Properties"

Issue: the descriptor in which these properties occur is not specified.

Resolution: in each case, indicate that the property is defined in the TerminationState descriptor.

Section: Annex E.6.2 "DTMF detection Package -- Events"

Issue: "Long duration event modifier" is shown as "L" in parameter DigitString -- should be "Z".

Resolution: Replace with "Z".

Section: Annex E.9.2 "Analog Line Supervision Package -- Events"

Issue: Stated hook state reporting behaviour has race condition where same transition could be reported twice.

Resolution: add an optional EventsDescriptor parameter and an optional ObservedEvents parameter to each of the on-hook and off-hook events. Delete the second sentence of the existing event description (which indicates that the event is always reported if the hook state has already been achieved).

The EventsDescriptor parameter is described as follows:

Strict Transition

ParameterID: strict (0x0001)

Type: enumeration

Possible values:

"exact" means that only an actual hook state transition to on-hook (off-hook) is to be recognized

"state" means that the event is to be recognized either if the hook state transition is detected or if the hook state is already on-hook (off-hook). This is the default value if "strict" is unspecified.

"failWrong" means that if the hook state is already what the transition would imply, the command fails and an error is reported [error code to be defined in the package].

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

18
May 2000

The ObservedEvents parameter is described as follows:

Initial State

ParameterID: init (0x0002)

Type: Boolean

Possible values:

true/"ON" means that the event was reported because the line was already on-hook (off-hook) when the events descriptor containing this event was activated

false/"OFF" means that the event represents an actual state transition to on-hook (off-hook)

Section: Annex E.10.3 "Basic Continuity Package -- Signals"

Issue: The rsp signal should continue until the MGC tells the MG to stop applying it.

Resolution: change the type of signal from Timeout to ON/OFF.

Section: Annex E.10.5 "Basic Continuity Package -- Procedures"

Issue: Wording of condition for generating cmp event with "success" does not cover case where test also requires successful removal of tone.

Resolution: In the second paragraph of E.10.5 (dealing with test initiation), add the words "and any other required conditions are satisfied" in the second sentence, as part of the condition upon which success is reported. Replace the third paragraph (dealing with test response) with the following text:

"When a MGC wants the MG to respond to a continuity test, it sends a command to the MG containing a signals descriptor with the rsp signal. Upon reception of a command with the rsp signal, the MG either applies a loop-back or (for 2-wire circuits) awaits reception of a continuity test tone. In the loop-back case, any incoming information shall be reflected back as outgoing information. In the 2-wire case, any time the appropriate test tone is received, the appropriate response tone should be sent. The MGC will determine

when to remove the rsp signal."

Taylor

Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000
Megaco Errata

19
May 2000

Section: [Appendix A.1.2](#) "Example -- Collecting Originator Digits and Initiating Termination"

Issue: Step 3 uses a now-obsolete package DS0 for echo cancellation.

Resolution: replace with echo cancellation via package TDM.

Issue: Step 20 fails to show a returned TerminationStateDescriptor. It also contains the erroneous statement that an RTP termination does not support events and signals and fails to show a number of other descriptors.

Resolution:

Delete the sentence containing the erroneous statement.

Add the following to the Media Descriptor preceding the line "Stream = 1_":

```
"TerminationState { ServiceStates = InService, EventBufferControl = OFF },"
```

Add lines showing Events, Signals, and DigitMap descriptors following the Media descriptor.

```
"Events, Signals, DigitMap,"
```

[6.](#) Security Considerations

This draft is a supplement to [2], which contains the required security section.

[7.](#) References

[1] Scott Bradner, The Internet Standards Process -- Revision 3, IETF [RFC 2026](#), October 1996.

[2] Rosen et al, [draft-ietf-megaco-protocol-08.txt](#), Megaco Protocol, work in progress, May 2000.

[3] Scott Bradner, Key Words For Use In RFCs To Indicate Requirement Levels, IETF [RFC 2119](#), March, 1997.

[8](#). Acknowledgments

This draft records the contributions of a number of people on the Megaco list and the H.248 faithful in ITU-T Study Group 16 who took the time to read the Megaco/H.248 draft with care and attention. Thanks to all of them.

Taylor	Standards Track -- Expires Nov 2000	20
	Megaco Errata	May 2000

[9](#). Author's Addresses

Tom Taylor
Nortel Networks
P.O. Box 3511, Station C
Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1Y 4P7
Phone: +1 613 736 0961
Email: taylor@nortelnetworks.com

Full Copyright Statement

"Copyright (C) The Internet Society (date). All Rights Reserved. This document and translations of it may be copied and furnished to others, and derivative works that comment on or otherwise explain it or assist in its implementation may be prepared, copied, published and distributed, in whole or in part, without restriction of any kind, provided that the above copyright notice and this paragraph are included on all such copies and derivative works. However, this document itself may not be modified in any way, such as by removing the copyright notice or references to the Internet Society or other Internet organizations, except as needed for the purpose of developing Internet standards in which case the procedures for copyrights defined in the Internet Standards process must be followed, or as required to translate it into other languages.

- 1 Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 2119](#), March 1997

