```
Workgroup: Network Working Group
Internet-Draft:
draft-ietf-netmod-yang-semver-15
Updates: <u>8407</u>, <u>8525</u>, <u>7950</u> (if approved)
Published: 18 March 2024
Intended Status: Standards Track
Expires: 19 September 2024
Authors: J. Clarke, Ed.
                              R. Wilton, Ed.
         Cisco Systems, Inc. Cisco Systems, Inc.
                     B. Lengyel
         R. Rahman
                                  J. Sterne
                                               B. Claise
         Equinix
                     Ericsson
                                  Nokia
                                               Huawei
                        YANG Semantic Versioning
```

Abstract

This document specifies a YANG extension along with guidelines for applying an extended set of semantic versioning rules to revisions of YANG artifacts (e.g., modules and packages). Additionally, this document defines a YANG extension for controlling module imports based on these modified semantic versioning rules. This document updates RFCs 7950, 8407, and 8525.

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <u>https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/</u>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on 19 September 2024.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2024 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<u>https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info</u>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Revised BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Revised BSD License.

Table of Contents

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Examples of How Versioning Is Applied To YANG Module Revisions
- 3. <u>Terminology and Conventions</u>
- 4. YANG Semantic Versioning
 - 4.1. Relationship Between SemVer and YANG Semver
 - 4.2. YANG Semantic Version Extension
 - 4.3. YANG Semver Pattern
 - <u>4.4</u>. <u>Semantic Versioning Scheme for YANG Artifacts</u>
 - 4.4.1. Branching Limitations with YANG Semver
 - 4.4.2. YANG Semver with submodules
 - 4.4.3. Examples for YANG semantic versions
 - 4.5. YANG Semantic Version Update Rules
 - 4.6. Examples of the YANG Semver Label
 - 4.6.1. Example Module Using YANG Semver
 - 4.6.2. Example of Package Using YANG Semver
- 5. Import Module by YANG Semantic Version
 - 5.1. The recommended-min-version Extension
 - 5.2. Import by YANG Semantic Version Rules
- <u>6</u>. <u>Guidelines for Using Semver During Module Development</u>
 - 6.1. Pre-release Version Precedence
 - 6.2. YANG Semver in IETF Modules
 - 6.2.1. Guidelines for IETF Module Development
 - 6.2.2. Guidelines for Published IETF Modules
- <u>7</u>. <u>Updates to ietf-yang-library</u>
- 7.1. YANG library versioning augmentations
 - <u>7.1.1</u>. <u>Advertising version</u>
- <u>8</u>. <u>YANG Modules</u>
- 9. <u>Contributors</u>
- <u>10</u>. <u>Acknowledgments</u>
- <u>11</u>. <u>Security Considerations</u>
- <u>12</u>. <u>IANA Considerations</u>
 - <u>12.1</u>. <u>YANG Module Registrations</u>
 - <u>12.2.</u> <u>Guidance for YANG Semver in IANA maintained YANG modules</u> <u>and submodules</u>
- <u>13</u>. <u>References</u>
 - <u>13.1</u>. <u>Normative References</u>
 - <u>13.2</u>. <u>Informative References</u>
- Appendix A. Example IETF Module Development

<u>Authors' Addresses</u>

1. Introduction

[I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning] puts forth a number of concepts relating to modified rules for updating YANG modules and submodules, a means to signal when a new revision of a module or submodule has non-backwards-compatible (NBC) changes compared to its previous revision, and a scheme that uses the revision history as a lineage for determining from where a specific revision of a YANG module or submodule is derived.

This document defines a YANG extension that tags a YANG artifact (i.e., YANG modules, YANG submodules, and YANG packages [I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-packages]) with a version identifier that adheres to extended semantic versioning rules [SemVer]. The goal being to add a human readable version identifier that provides compatibility information for the YANG artifact without needing to compare or parse its body. The version identifier and rules defined herein represent the RECOMMENDED approach to apply versioning to IETF YANG artifacts. This document defines augmentations to ietfyang-library to reflect the version of YANG modules within the module-set data.

Note that a specific revision of the SemVer 2.0.0 specification is referenced here (from June 19, 2020) to provide an immutable version. This is because the 2.0.0 version of the specification has changed over time without any change to the semantic version itself. In some cases the text has changed in non-backwards-compatible ways.

2. Examples of How Versioning Is Applied To YANG Module Revisions

The following diagram illustrates how the branched revision history and the YANG Semver version extension statement could be used:

Example YANG module with branched revision history.

Module revision date	Example version identifier
2019-01-01	<- 1.0.0
2019-02-01	<- 2.0.0
2019-03-01 \	<- 3.0.0
2019-04-01	<- 2.1.0
2019-05-01	<- 3.1.0
2019-06-01	<- 2.2.0

The tree diagram above illustrates how an example module's revision history might evolve, over time.

3. Terminology and Conventions

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "NOT RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in BCP 14 [RFC2119] [RFC8174] when, and only when, they appear in all capitals, as shown here.

Additionally, this document uses the following terminology:

- *YANG artifact: YANG modules, YANG submodules, and YANG packages [<u>I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-packages</u>] are examples of YANG artifacts for the purposes of this document.
- *SemVer: A version string that corresponds to the rules defined in [<u>SemVer</u>]. This specific camel-case notation is the one used by the SemVer 2.0.0 website and used within this document to distinguish between YANG Semver.

*YANG Semver: A version identifier that is consistent with the extended set of semantic versioning rules, based on [<u>SemVer</u>], defined within this document.

4. YANG Semantic Versioning

This section defines YANG Semantic Versioning, explains how it is used with YANG artifacts, and describes the rules associated with changing an artifact's semantic version when its contents are updated.

4.1. Relationship Between SemVer and YANG Semver

[SemVer] is completely compatible with YANG Semver in that a SemVer semantic version number is legal according to the YANG Semver rules (though the inverse is not necessarily true). YANG Semver is a superset of the SemVer rules, and allows for limited branching within YANG artifacts. If no branching occurs within a YANG artifact (i.e., you do not use the compatibility modifiers described below), the YANG Semver version label will appear as a SemVer version number.

4.2. YANG Semantic Version Extension

The ietf-yang-semver module defines a "version" extension -- a substatement to a module or submodule's "revision" statement -- that takes a YANG semantic version as its argument and specified the version for the given module or submodule. The syntax for the YANG

semantic version is defined in a typedef in the same module and described below.

4.3. YANG Semver Pattern

YANG artifacts that employ semantic versioning as defined in this document MUST use a version identifier that corresponds to the following pattern: 'X.Y.Z_COMPAT'. Where:

- *X, Y and Z are mandatory non-negative integers that are each less than or equal to 2147483647 (i.e., the maximum signed 32-bit integer value) and MUST NOT contain leading zeroes,
- *The '.' is a literal period (ASCII character 0x2e),
- *The '_' is an optional single literal underscore (ASCII character 0x5f) and MUST only be present if the following COMPAT element is included,
- *COMPAT, if specified, MUST be either the literal string "compatible" or the literal string "non_compatible".

Additionally, [SemVer] defines two specific types of metadata that may be appended to a semantic version string. Pre-release metadata MAY be appended to a YANG Semver string after a trailing '-' character. Build metadata MAY be appended after a trailing '+' character. If both pre-release and build metadata are present, then build metadata MUST follow pre-release metadata. While build metadata MUST be ignored when comparing YANG semantic versions, prerelease metadata MUST be used during module and submodule development as specified in <u>Section 6</u>. Both pre-release and build metadata are allowed in order to support all the [<u>SemVer</u>] rules. Thus, a version lineage that follows strict [<u>SemVer</u>] rules is allowed for a YANG artifact.

The ietf-yang-semver module included in this document defines an extension to apply a YANG Semver identifier to a YANG artifact as well as a typedef that formally specifies the syntax of the YANG Semver.

4.4. Semantic Versioning Scheme for YANG Artifacts

This document defines the YANG semantic versioning scheme that is used for YANG artifacts. The versioning identifier has the following properties:

*The YANG semantic versioning scheme is extended from version 2.0.0 of the semantic versioning scheme defined at semver.org [SemVer] to cover the additional requirements for the management of YANG artifact lifecycles that cannot be addressed using the semver.org 2.0.0 versioning scheme alone.

*Unlike the [SemVer] versioning scheme, the YANG semantic versioning scheme supports updates to older versions of YANG artifacts, to allow for bug fixes and enhancements to artifact versions that are not the latest. However, it does not provide for the unlimited branching and updating of older revisions which are documented by the general rules in [I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning].

*YANG artifacts that use the [<u>SemVer</u>] versioning scheme are fully compatible with implementations that understand the YANG semantic versioning scheme defined in this document.

*If updates are always restricted to the latest revision of the artifact only, then the version identifiers used by the YANG semantic versioning scheme are exactly the same as those defined by the [SemVer] versioning scheme.

Every YANG module and submodule versioned using the YANG semantic versioning scheme specifies the module's or submodule's semantic version as the argument to the 'ys:version' statement.

Because the rules put forth in

[I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning] are designed to work well with existing versions of YANG and allow for artifact authors to migrate to this scheme, it is not expected that all revisions of a given YANG artifact will have a semantic version identifier. For example, the first revision of a module or submodule may have been produced before this scheme was available.

YANG packages that make use of this YANG Semver will reflect that in the package metadata.

As stated above, the YANG semantic version is expressed as a string of the form: 'X.Y.Z_COMPAT'.

*'X' is the MAJOR version. Changes in the MAJOR version number indicate changes that are non-backwards-compatible to versions with a lower MAJOR version number.

*'Y' is the MINOR version. Changes in the MINOR version number indicate changes that are backwards-compatible to versions with the same MAJOR version number, but a lower MINOR version number and no "_compatible" or "_non_compatible" modifier.

*'Z' is the PATCH version. Changes in the PATCH version number can indicate an editorial change to the YANG artifact. In conjunction with the '_COMPAT' modifier (see below) changes to 'Z' may indicate a more substantive module change. An editorial change is defined to be a change in the YANG artifact's content that does not affect the semantic meaning or functionality provided by the artifact in any way. Some examples include correcting a spelling mistake in the description of a leaf within a YANG module or submodule, non-significant whitespace changes (e.g., realigning description statements or changing indentation), or changes to YANG comments. Note: restructuring how a module uses, or does not use, submodules is treated as an editorial level change on the condition that there is no change in the module's semantic behavior due to the restructuring.

*'_COMPAT' is an additional modifier, unique to YANG Semver (i.e., not valid in [SemVer]), that indicates backwards-compatible, or non-backwards-compatible changes relative to versions with the same MAJOR and MINOR version numbers, but lower PATCH version number, depending on what form modifier '_COMPAT' takes:

-If the modifier string is absent, the change represents an editorial change.

-If, however, the modifier string is present, the meaning is described below:

-"_compatible" - the change represents a backwards-compatible change

-"_non_compatible" - the change represents a non-backwardscompatible change

The '_COMPAT' modifier string is "sticky". Once a revision of a module has a modifier in the version identifier, then all subsequent modules in that branch (i.e., those with the same X.Y version digits) will also have a modifier. The modifier can change from "_compatible" to "_non_compatible" in a subsequent version, but the modifier MUST NOT change from "_non_compatible" to "_compatible" and MUST NOT be removed. The persistence of the "_non_compatible" modifier ensures that comparisons of versions do not give the false impression of compatible" was removed, for example between versions "3.3.2_non_compatible" and "3.3.3" (where "3.3.3" was simply an editorial change), then comparing versions "3.3.3" to "3.0.0" would look like they are backwards compatible when they are not (since "3.3.2_non_compatible" was on the same MAJOR.MINOR branch and introduced a non-backwards-compatible change).

The YANG artifact name and YANG semantic version uniquely identify a revision of said artifact. There MUST NOT be multiple instances of a YANG artifact definition with the same name and YANG semantic

version but different content (and in the case of modules and submodules, different revision dates).

There MUST NOT be multiple versions of a YANG artifact that have the same MAJOR, MINOR and PATCH version numbers, but different patch modifier strings. E.g., artifact version "1.2.3_non_compatible" MUST NOT be defined if artifact version "1.2.3" has already been defined.

4.4.1. Branching Limitations with YANG Semver

YANG artifacts that use the YANG Semver version scheme MUST ensure that two artifacts with the same MAJOR version number and no _compatible or _non_compatible modifiers are backwards compatible. Therefore, certain branching schemes cannot be used with YANG Semver. For example, the following branching approach using the following YANG Semver identifiers is not supported:

```
3.5.0 -- 3.6.0 (add leaf foo)
|
|
3.20.0 (added leaf bar)
```

In this case, given only the YANG Semver identifiers 3.6.0 and 3.20.0, one would assume that 3.20.0 is backwards compatible with 3.6.0. But in the illegal example above, 3.20.0 is not backwards compatible with 3.6.0 since 3.20.0 does not contain the leaf foo.

Note that this type of branching, where two versions on the same branch have different backwards compatible changes is allowed in [<u>I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning</u>].

4.4.2. YANG Semver with submodules

YANG Semver MAY be used to version submodules. Submodule version are separate of any version on the including module, but if a submodule has changed, then the version of the including module MUST also be updated.

The rules for determining the version change of a submodule are the same as those defined in <u>Section 4.3</u> and <u>Section 4.4</u> as applied to YANG modules, except they only apply to the part of the module schema defined within the submodule's file.

One interesting case is moving definitions from one submodule to another in a way that does not change the resulting schema of the including module. In this case:

1. The including module has editorial changes

- 2. The submodule with the schema definition removed has nonbackwards-compatible changes
- 3. The submodule with the schema definitions added has backwardscompatible changes

Note that the meaning of a submodule may change drastically despite having no changes in content or revision due to changes in other submodules belonging to the same module (e.g. groupings and typedefs declared in one submodule and used in another).

4.4.3. Examples for YANG semantic versions

The following diagram and explanation illustrate how YANG semantic versions work.

YANG Semantic versions for an example module:

```
0.1.0
 0.2.0
 1.0.0
 1.1.0 -> 1.1.1_compatible -> 1.1.2_non_compatible
 1.2.0 -> 1.2.1 non compatible -> 1.2.2 non compatible
 | \rangle
2.0.0 \
 \--> 1.3.0 -> 1.3.1_non_compatible
3.0.0
 1.4.0
3.1.0
```

The tree diagram above illustrates how the version history might evolve for an example module. The tree diagram only shows the branching relationships between the versions. It does not describe the chronology of the versions (i.e. when in time each version was published relative to the other versions).

The following description lists an example of what the chronological order of the versions could look like, from oldest version to newest:

0.1.0 - first pre-release module version0.2.0 - second pre-release module version (with NBC changes)1.0.0 - first release (may have NBC changes from 0.2.0)

1.1.0 - added new functionality, leaf "foo" (BC)

1.2.0 - added new functionality, leaf "baz" (BC)

2.0.0 - change existing model for performance reasons, e.g. rekey list (NBC)

1.3.0 - improve existing functionality, added leaf "foo-64" (BC)

1.1.1_compatible - backport "foo-64" leaf to 1.1.x to avoid implementing "baz" from 1.2.0. This revision was created after 1.2.0 otherwise it may have been released as 1.2.0. (BC)

3.0.0 - NBC bugfix, rename "baz" to "bar"; also add new BC leaf "wibble"; (NBC)

1.3.1_non_compatible - backport NBC fix, rename "baz" to "bar"
(NBC)

1.2.1_non_compatible - backport NBC fix, rename "baz" to "bar"
(NBC)

1.1.2_non_compatible - NBC point bug fix, not required in 2.0.0
due to model changes (NBC)

1.4.0 - introduce new leaf "ghoti" (BC)

3.1.0 - introduce new leaf "wobble" (BC)

1.2.2_non_compatible - backport "wibble". This is a BC change but "non_compatible" modifier is sticky. (BC)

4.5. YANG Semantic Version Update Rules

When a new version of an artifact is produced, then the following rules define how the YANG semantic version for the new artifact is calculated, based on the changes between the two artifact versions, and the YANG semantic version of the original artifact from which the changes are derived.

The following four rules specify the RECOMMENDED, and REQUIRED minimum, update to a YANG semantic version:

1. If an artifact is being updated in a non-backwards-compatible way, then the artifact version "X.Y.Z[_compatible] __non_compatible]" SHOULD be updated to "X+1.0.0" unless that version has already been used for this artifact but with different content, in which case the artifact version "X.Y.Z+1_non_compatible" SHOULD be used instead.

- 2. If an artifact is being updated in a backwards-compatible way, then the next version number depends on the format of the current version number:
 - i "X.Y.Z" the artifact version SHOULD be updated to "X.Y+1.0", unless that version has already been used for this artifact but with different content, when the artifact version SHOULD be updated to "X.Y.Z+1_compatible" instead.
 - ii "X.Y.Z_compatible" the artifact version SHOULD be updated to "X.Y.Z+1_compatible".
 - iii "X.Y.Z_non_compatible" the artifact version SHOULD be updated to "X.Y.Z+1_non_compatible".
- 3. If an artifact is being updated in an editorial way, then the next version identifier depends on the format of the current version identifier:
 - i "X.Y.Z" the artifact version SHOULD be updated to "X.Y.Z+1"
 - ii "X.Y.Z_compatible" the artifact version SHOULD be updated to "X.Y.Z+1_compatible".
 - iii "X.Y.Z_non_compatible" the artifact version SHOULD be updated to "X.Y.Z+1_non_compatible".
- 4. YANG artifact semantic version identifiers beginning with 0, i.e., "0.X.Y", are regarded as pre-release definitions and need not follow the rules above. Either the MINOR or PATCH version numbers may be updated, regardless of whether the changes are non-backwards-compatible, backwards-compatible, or editorial. See <u>Section 6</u> for more details on using this notation during module and submodule development.
- 5. Additional pre-release rules for modules that have had at least one release are specified in <u>Section 6</u>.

Although artifacts SHOULD be updated according to the rules above, which specify the recommended (and minimum required) update to the version identifier, the following rules MAY be applied when choosing a new version identifier:

 An artifact author MAY update the version identifier with a more significant update than described by the rules above. For example, an artifact could be given a new MAJOR version number (i.e., X+1.0.0), even though no non-backwards-compatible changes have occurred, or an artifact could be given a new MINOR version number (i.e., X.Y+1.0) even if the changes were only editorial.

2. An artifact author MAY skip versions. That is, an artifact's version history could be 1.0.0, 1.1.0, and 1.3.0 where 1.2.0 is skipped.

Although YANG Semver always indicates when a non-backwardscompatible, or backwards-compatible change may have occurred to a YANG artifact, it does not guarantee that such a change has occurred, or that consumers of that YANG artifact will be impacted by the change. Hence, tooling, e.g., [<u>I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-schema-comparison</u>], also plays an important role for comparing YANG artifacts and calculating the likely impact from changes.

[I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning] defines the "rev:nonbackwards-compatible" extension statement to indicate where nonbackwards-compatible changes have occurred in the module revision history. If a revision entry in a module's revision history includes the "rev:non-backwards-compatible" statement then that MUST be reflected in any YANG semantic version associated with that revision. However, the reverse does not necessarily hold, i.e., if the MAJOR version has been incremented it does not necessarily mean that a "rev:non-backwards-compatible" statement would be present.

4.6. Examples of the YANG Semver Label

4.6.1. Example Module Using YANG Semver

Below is a sample YANG module that uses YANG Semver based on the rules defined in this document.

```
module example-versioned-module {
  yang-version 1.1;
  namespace "urn:example:versioned:module";
  prefix "exvermod";
  import ietf-yang-revisions { prefix "rev"; }
  import ietf-yang-semver { prefix "ys"; }
  description
    "to be completed";
  revision 2017-08-30 {
    description "Backport 'wibble' leaf";
   ys:version 1.2.2_non_compatible;
  }
  revision 2017-07-30 {
    description "Rename 'baz' to 'bar'";
    ys:version 1.2.1_non_compatible;
    rev:non-backwards-compatible;
  }
  revision 2017-04-20 {
    description "Add new functionality, leaf 'baz'";
   ys:version 1.2.0;
  }
  revision 2017-04-03 {
    description "Add new functionality, leaf 'foo'";
    ys:version 1.1.0;
  }
  revision 2017-02-07 {
    description "First release version.";
    ys:version 1.0.0;
  }
  // Note: YANG Semver rules do not apply to 0.X.Y labels.
  // The following pre-release revision statements would not
  // appear in any final published version of a module. They
  // are removed when the final version is published.
  // During the pre-release phase of development, only a
  // single one of these revision statements would appear
  // revision 2017-01-30 {
  11
     description "NBC changes to initial revision";
  11
      ys:version 0.2.0;
  11
      rev:non-backwards-compatible; // optional
  11
                             // (theoretically no
  11
                             // 'previous released version')
```

```
// }
// revision 2017-01-26 {
// description "Initial module version";
// ys:version 0.1.0;
// }
//YANG module definition starts here
```

```
}
```

```
Below is an example YANG package that uses the YANG Semver version
   identifier based on the rules defined in this document. Note: '\'
  line wrapping per [RFC8792].
{
  "ietf-yang-instance-data:instance-data-set": {
    "name": "example-yang-pkg",
    "content-schema": {
      "module": "ietf-yang-packages@2022-03-04"
   },
    "timestamp": "2022-12-06T17:00:38Z",
    "description": ["Example of a Package \
       using YANG Semver"],
    "content-data": {
      "ietf-yang-packages:packages": {
        "package": [
          {
            "name": "example-yang-pkg",
            "version": "1.3.1",
            . . .
          }
        1
     }
   }
 }
}
```

Figure 2

5. Import Module by YANG Semantic Version

[I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning] allows for imports to be done based on the earliest supported date and later using the rev:recommended-min-date extension. This section defines a similar extension for controlling import by YANG semantic version, as well as the rules for how imports are resolved.

5.1. The recommended-min-version Extension

The ietf-yang-semver module defines a "recommended-min-version" extension -- a substatement to the "import" statement -- that takes a YANG semantic version as its argument and specifies that the minimum version of the associated module being imported SHOULD be greater than or equal to the specified value. The specific conditions for determining if a module's version is greater than or equal is defined in <u>Section 5.2</u> below. Multiple recommended-minversion statements MAY be specified. If there are multiple recommended-min-version statements, they are treated as a logical OR. Removing recommended-min-version statements is considered a backwards compatible change. An example use is:

```
import example-module {
    ys:recommended-min-version 3.0.0;
}
```

5.2. Import by YANG Semantic Version Rules

A module to be imported is considered as meeting the recommended minimum version criteria if it meets one of the following conditions::

- Has the exact MAJOR, MINOR, PATCH and "_compatible" or "_non_compatible" modifiers as in the recommend-min-version value.
- Has the same MAJOR and MINOR version numbers and a greater PATCH number. In this case, "_compatible" and "_non_compatible modifiers" are ignored.
- 3. Has the same MAJOR version number and greater MINOR number. In this case the PATCH number and the "_compatible" and "_non_compatible" modifiers are ignored.
- 4. Has a greater MAJOR version number. In this case MINOR and PATCH numbers and "_compatible" and "_non_compatible" modifiers are ignored.

If the recommended-min-version is specified as 3.1.0, the following examples would be satisfy that recommend-min-version:

3.1.0 (by condition 1 above)

3.1.1 (by condition 2 above)

3.2.0 (by condition 3 above)

4.1.2 (by condition 4 above)

3.1.1_compatible (by condition 2 above, noting that modifiers are ignored)

3.1.2_non_compatible (by condition 2 above, noting that modifiers are ignored)

If an import by recommended-min-version cannot locate a module with a version that is viable according to the conditions above, the YANG compiler SHOULD emit a warning, and then continue to resolve the import based on established [<u>RFC7950</u>] rules.

6. Guidelines for Using Semver During Module Development

This section and the IETF-specific sub-section below provides YANG Semver-specific guidelines to consider when developing new YANG modules. As such this section updates [RFC8407].

Development of a brand new YANG module or submodule outside of the IETF that uses the YANG Semver versioning scheme SHOULD begin with a 0 for the MAJOR version component. This allows the module or submodule to disregard strict SemVer rules with respect to nonbackwards-compatible changes during its initial development. However, module or submodule developers MAY choose to use the SemVer pre-release syntax instead with a 1 for the MAJOR version number. For example, an initial module or submodule version might be either 0.0.1 or 1.0.0-alpha.1. If the authors choose to use the 0 MAJOR version number scheme, they MAY switch to the pre-release scheme with a MAJOR version number of 1 when the module or submodule is nearing initial release (e.g., a module's or submodule's version may transition from 0.3.0 to 1.0.0-beta.1 to indicate it is more mature and ready for testing).

When using pre-release notation, the format MUST include at least one alphabetic component and MUST end with a '.' or '-' and then one or more digits. These alphanumeric components will be used when deciding pre-release precedence. The following are examples of valid pre-release versions:

1.0.0-alpha.1

1.0.0-alpha.3

2.1.0-beta.42

3.0.0-202007.rc.1

When developing a new revision of an existing module or submodule using the YANG Semver versioning scheme, the intended target semantic version MUST be used along with pre-release notation. For example, if a released module or submodule which has a current version of 1.0.0 is being modified with the intent to make nonbackwards-compatible changes, the first development MAJOR version component must be 2 with some pre-release notation such as -alpha.1, making the version 2.0.0-alpha.1. That said, every publicly available release of a module or submodule MUST have a unique YANG Semver identifier (where a publicly available release is one that could be implemented by a vendor or consumed by an end user). Therefore, it may be prudent to include the year or year and month development began (e.g., 2.0.0-201907-alpha.1). As a module or submodule undergoes development, it is possible that the original intent changes. For example, a 1.0.0 version of a module or submodule that was destined to become 2.0.0 after a development cycle may have had a scope change such that the final version has no non-backwards-compatible changes and becomes 1.1.0 instead. This change is acceptable to make during the development phase so long as pre-release notation is present in both versions (e.g., 2.0.0-alpha. 3 becomes 1.1.0-alpha.4). However, on the next development cycle (after 1.1.0 is released), if again the new target release is 2.0.0, new pre-release components must be used such that every version for a given module or submodule MUST be unique throughout its entire lifecycle (e.g., the first pre-release version might be 2.0.0-202005-alpha.1 if keeping the same year and month notation mentioned above).

6.1. Pre-release Version Precedence

As a module or submodule is developed, the scope of the work may change. That is, while a released module or submodule with version 1.0.0 is initially intended to become 2.0.0 in its next released version, the scope of work may change such that the final version is 1.1.0. During the development cycle, the pre-release versions could move from 2.0.0-some-pre-release-tag to 1.1.0-some-pre-release-tag. This downwards changing of version identifiers makes it difficult to evaluate semantic version rules between pre-release versions. However, taken independently, each pre-release version can be compared to the previously ratified version (e.g., 1.1.0-some-prerelease-tag and 2.0.0-some-pre-release-tag can each be compared to 1.0.0). Module and submodule developers SHOULD maintain only one revision statement in a pre-released module or submodule that reflects the latest revision. IETF authors MAY choose to include an appendix in the associated draft to track overall changes to the module or submodule.

6.2. YANG Semver in IETF Modules

All published IETF modules and submodules MUST use YANG semantic versions in their revisions.

Development of a new module or submodule within the IETF SHOULD begin with the 0 MAJOR number scheme as described above. When revising an existing IETF module or submodule, the version MUST use the target (i.e., intended) MAJOR and MINOR version components with a 0 PATCH version number. If the intended RFC release will be nonbackwards-compatible with the current RFC release, the MINOR version number MUST be 0.

6.2.1. Guidelines for IETF Module Development

All IETF modules and submodules in development MUST use the whole document name as a pre-release version identifier, including the current document revision. For example, if a module or submodule which is currently released at version 1.0.0 is being revised to include non-backwards-compatible changes in draft-user-netmod-foo, its development versions MUST include 2.0.0-draft-user-netmod-foo followed by the document's revision (e.g., 2.0.0-draft-user-netmodfoo-02). This will ensure each pre-release version is unique across the lifecycle of the module or submodule. Even when using the 0 MAJOR version for initial module or submodule development (where MINOR and PATCH can change), appending the draft name as a prerelease component helps to ensure uniqueness when there are perhaps multiple, parallel efforts creating the same module or submodule.

Some draft revisions may not include an update to the YANG modules or submodules contained in the draft. In that case, those modules or submodules that are not updated do not not require a change to their versions. Updates to the YANG Semver version MUST only be done when the revision of the module changes.

See <u>Appendix A</u> for a detailed example of IETF pre-release versions.

6.2.2. Guidelines for Published IETF Modules

For IETF YANG modules and submodules that have already been published, versions MUST be retroactively applied to all existing revisions when the next new revision is created, starting at version "1.0.0" for the initial published revision, and then incrementing according to the YANG Semver version rules specified in <u>Section 4.5</u>. For example, if a module or submodule started out in the pre-NMDA ([<u>RFC8342</u>]) world, and then had NMDA support added without removing any legacy "state" branches -- and you are looking to add additional new features -- a sensible choice for the target YANG Semver would be 1.2.0 (since 1.0.0 would have been the initial, pre-NMDA release, and 1.1.0 would have been the NMDA revision).

7. Updates to ietf-yang-library

This document updates YANG 1.1 [<u>RFC7950</u>] and YANG library [<u>RFC8525</u>] to clarify how ambiguous module imports are resolved. It also defines the YANG module, ietf-yang-library-semver, that augments YANG library [<u>RFC8525</u>] with a version leaf for modules and submodules.

7.1. YANG library versioning augmentations

The "ietf-yang-library-semver" YANG module has the following structure (using the notation defined in [<u>RFC8340</u>]):

```
module: ietf-yang-library-semver
augment /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set/yanglib:module:
+--ro version? ys:version
augment /yanglib:submodule:
+--ro version? ys:version
augment /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:import-only-module:
+--ro version? ys:version
augment /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:import-only-module:
+--ro version? ys:version
augment /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set
            /yanglib:import-only-module/yanglib:submodule:
+--ro version? ys:version
```

Figure 3

7.1.1. Advertising version

The ietf-yang-library-semver YANG module augments the "module" and "submodule" lists in ietf-yang-library with "version" leafs to optionally declare the version identifier associated with each module and submodule.

8. YANG Modules

This YANG module contains the typedef for the YANG semantic version and the identity to signal its use.

```
<CODE BEGINS> file "ietf-yang-semver@2024-03-01.yang"
module ietf-yang-semver {
  yang-version 1.1;
  namespace "urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-yang-semver";
 prefix vs;
  organization
    "IETF NETMOD (Network Modeling) Working Group";
  contact
    "WG Web: <http://tools.ietf.org/wg/netmod/>
    WG List: <mailto:netmod@ietf.org>
    Author:
              Joe Clarke
              <mailto:jclarke@cisco.com>
    Author: Robert Wilton
              <mailto:rwilton@cisco.com>
    Author: Reshad Rahman
              <mailto:reshad@yahoo.com>
    Author: Balazs Lengyel
              <mailto:balazs.lengyel@ericsson.com>
    Author:
              Jason Sterne
              <mailto:jason.sterne@nokia.com>
    Author:
              Benoit Claise
               <mailto:benoit.claise@huawei.com>";
  description
    "This module provides type and grouping definitions for YANG
    packages.
    Copyright (c) 2024 IETF Trust and the persons identified as
     authors of the code. All rights reserved.
    Redistribution and use in source and binary forms, with or
    without modification, is permitted pursuant to, and subject
    to the license terms contained in, the Revised BSD License
    set forth in Section 4.c of the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions
    Relating to IETF Documents
     (http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info).
    The key words 'MUST', 'MUST NOT', 'REQUIRED', 'SHALL', 'SHALL
    NOT', 'SHOULD', 'SHOULD NOT', 'RECOMMENDED', 'NOT RECOMMENDED',
     'MAY', and 'OPTIONAL' in this document are to be interpreted as
    described in BCP 14 (RFC 2119) (RFC 8174) when, and only when,
    they appear in all capitals, as shown here.
```

This version of this YANG module is part of RFC XXXX; see the RFC itself for full legal notices.";

// RFC Ed.: update the date below with the date of RFC publication $\ensuremath{\prime\prime}$ and remove this note.

```
// RFC Ed.: replace XXXX with actual RFC number and remove this
// note.
// RFC Ed. update the ys:version to "1.0.0".
revision 2024-03-01 {
 ys:version "1.0.0-draft-ietf-netmod-yang-semver-13";
 description
    "Initial revision";
  reference
    "RFC XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning.";
}
/*
 * Extensions
*/
extension version {
  argument yang-semantic-version;
 description
    "The version extension can be used to provide an additional
     identifier associated with a module or submodule
     revision.
     The format of the version extension argument MUST conform
     to the 'version' typedef defined in this module.
     The statement MUST only be a substatement of the revision
     statement. Zero or one version statements per parent
     statement are allowed. No substatements for this extension
     have been standardized.
     Versions MUST be unique amongst all revisions of a
     module or submodule.
     Adding a version is a backwards-compatible
     change. Changing or removing an existing version in
     the revision history is a non-backwards-compatible
     change, because it could impact any references to that
     version.";
  reference
    "XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning;
     Section 3.2, YANG Semantic Version Extension";
}
extension recommended-min-version {
  argument yang-semantic-version;
  description
    "Recommends the versions of the module that may be imported to
     one that is greater than or equal to the specified version.
```

```
The format of the recommended-min-version extension argument
MUST conform to the 'version' typedef defined in this module.
```

```
The statement MUST only be a substatement of the import
statement. Zero, one or more 'recommended-min-version'
statements per parent statement are allowed. No
substatements for this extension have been
standardized.
```

```
If specified multiple times, then any module revision that
satisfies at least one of the 'recommended-min-version'
statements is an acceptable recommended version for
import.
```

```
A particular version of an imported module adheres to an
import's 'recommended-min-version' extension statement if one
of the following conditions are met:
```

- * Has the same MAJOR and MINOR version numbers and same or greater PATCH number.
- * Has the same MAJOR version number and greater MINOR number. In this case the PATCH number is ignored.
- * Has a greater MAJOR version number. In this case MINOR and PATCH numbers are ignored.

```
Adding, removing or updating a 'recommended-min-version'
     statement to an import is a backwards-compatible change.";
  reference
    "XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning; Section 4,
     Import Module by Semantic Version";
}
/*
 * Typedefs
 */
typedef version {
  type string {
    pattern '[0-9]+[.][0-9]+[.][0-9]+(_(non_)?compatible)?'
          + '(-[A-Za-z0-9.-]+[.-][0-9]+)?([+][A-Za-z0-9.-]+)?';
  }
  description
    "Represents a YANG semantic version. The rules governing the
     use of this version identifier are defined in the
     reference for this typedef.";
  reference
    "RFC XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning.";
}
```

}

<CODE ENDS>

This YANG module contains the augmentations to the ietf-yang-library.

```
<CODE BEGINS> file "ietf-yang-library-semver@2024-03-02.yang"
module ietf-yang-library-semver {
  yang-version 1.1;
 namespace
    "urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-yang-library-semver";
  prefix yl-semver;
  import ietf-yang-semver {
   prefix ys;
   reference
     "XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning";
  }
  import ietf-yang-library {
   prefix yanglib;
    reference
      "RFC 8525: YANG Library";
 }
  organization
    "IETF NETMOD (Network Modeling) Working Group";
  contact
    "WG Web: <https://datatracker.ietf.org/wg/netmod/>
    WG List: <mailto:netmod@ietf.org>
    Author:
               Joe Clarke
               <mailto:jclarke@cisco.com>
    Author:
               Reshad Rahman
               <mailto:reshad@yahoo.com>
    Author:
               Robert Wilton
               <mailto:rwilton@cisco.com>
    Author: Balazs Lengyel
               <mailto:balazs.lengyel@ericsson.com>
    Author:
               Jason Sterne
               <mailto:jason.sterne@nokia.com>";
  description
    "This module contains augmentations to YANG Library to add module
    and submodule level version identifiers.
    Copyright (c) 2024 IETF Trust and the persons identified as
    authors of the code. All rights reserved.
    Redistribution and use in source and binary forms, with or
    without modification, is permitted pursuant to, and subject
```

to the license terms contained in, the Revised BSD License set forth in Section 4.c of the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions

```
Relating to IETF Documents
   (http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info).
   This version of this YANG module is part of RFC XXXX; see
   the RFC itself for full legal notices.
   The key words 'MUST', 'MUST NOT', 'REQUIRED', 'SHALL', 'SHALL
   NOT', 'SHOULD', 'SHOULD NOT', 'RECOMMENDED', 'NOT RECOMMENDED',
   'MAY', and 'OPTIONAL' in this document are to be interpreted as
   described in BCP 14 (RFC 2119) (RFC 8174) when, and only when,
   they appear in all capitals, as shown here.";
// RFC Ed.: update the date below with the date of RFC publication
// and remove this note.
// RFC Ed.: replace XXXX (including in the imports above) with
// actual RFC number and remove this note.
// RFC Ed.: please replace ys:version with 1.0.0 and
// remove this note.
revision 2024-03-02 {
  ys:version "1.0.0-draft-ietf-netmod-yang-semver-14";
  description
    "Initial revision";
  reference
    "XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning";
}
// library 1.0 modules-state is not augmented with version
augment "/yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set/yanglib:module" {
  description
    "Add a version to module information";
  leaf version {
    type ys:version;
    description
      "The version associated with this module revision.
       The value MUST match the version value in the
       specific revision of the module loaded in this module-set.";
    reference
      "XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning;
       Section 7.1.1, Advertising version";
 }
}
augment
  "/yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set/yanglib:module/"
+ "yanglib:submodule" {
  description
    "Add a version to submodule information";
```

```
leaf version {
      type ys:version;
      description
        "The version associated with this submodule revision.
         The value MUST match the version value in the
         specific revision of the submodule included by the module
         loaded in this module-set.";
      reference
        "XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning;
         Section 7.1.1, Advertising version";
   }
  }
  augment "/yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set/"
        + "yanglib:import-only-module" {
   description
      "Add a version to module information";
    leaf version {
      type ys:version;
      description
        "The version associated with this module revision.
         The value MUST match the version value in the
         specific revision of the module included in this
         module-set.";
      reference
        "XXXX: YANG Semantic Versioning;
         Section 7.1.1, Advertising version";
   }
  }
  augment "/yanglib:yang-library/yanglib:module-set/"
        + "yanglib:import-only-module/yanglib:submodule" {
   description
      "Add a version to submodule information";
    leaf version {
      type ys:version;
      description
        "The version associated with this submodule revision.
         The value MUST match the version value in the specific
         revision of the submodule included by the import-only-module
         loaded in this module-set.";
      reference
        "XXXX: Updated YANG Module Revision Handling;
         Section 7.1.1, Advertising version";
   }
 }
}
<CODE ENDS>
```

9. Contributors

The following people made substantial contributions to this document:

Bo Wu lana.wubo@huawei.com

Jan Lindblad jlindbla@cisco.com

Figure 4

10. Acknowledgments

This document grew out of the YANG module versioning design team that started after IETF 101. The team consists of the following members whom have worked on the YANG versioning project: Balazs Lengyel, Benoit Claise, Bo Wu, Ebben Aries, Jan Lindblad, Jason Sterne, Joe Clarke, Juergen Schoenwaelder, Mahesh Jethanandani, Michael (Wangzitao), Per Andersson, Qin Wu, Reshad Rahman, Tom Hill, and Rob Wilton.

The initial revision of this document was refactored and built upon [<u>I-D.clacla-netmod-yang-model-update</u>]. We would like the thank Kevin D'Souza for his initial work in this problem space.

Discussions on the use of SemVer for YANG versioning has been held with authors of the OpenConfig YANG models based on their own [openconfigsemver]. We would like thank both Anees Shaikh and Rob Shakir for their input into this problem space.

We would also like to thank Joseph Donahue from the SemVer.org project for his input on SemVer use and overall document readability.

11. Security Considerations

The YANG module specified in this document defines a schema for data that is designed to be accessed via network management protocols such as NETCONF [RFC6241] or RESTCONF [RFC8040]. The lowest NETCONF layer is the secure transport layer, and the mandatory-to-implement secure transport is Secure Shell (SSH) [RFC6242]. The lowest RESTCONF layer is HTTPS, and the mandatory-to-implement secure transport is TLS [RFC8446].

The NETCONF access control model [<u>RFC8341</u>] provides the means to restrict access for particular NETCONF or RESTCONF users to a

preconfigured subset of all available NETCONF or RESTCONF protocol operations and content.

That said, the YANG module in this document does not define any writeable nodes. The extensions defined are only used to document YANG artifacts.

12. IANA Considerations

12.1. YANG Module Registrations

This document requests IANA to register URIs in the "IETF XML Registry" [<u>RFC3688</u>]. Following the format in RFC 3688, the following registrations are requested.

URI: urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-yang-semver

Registrant Contact: The IESG.

XML: N/A, the requested URI is an XML namespace.

URI: urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-yang-library-semver

Registrant Contact: The IESG.

XML: N/A, the requested URI is an XML namespace.

The following YANG modules are requested to be registered in the "IANA Module Names" [<u>RFC6020</u>]. Following the format in RFC 6020, the following registrations are requested:

The ietf-yang-semver module:

Name: ietf-yang-semver

XML Namespace: urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-yang-semver

Prefix: ys

Reference: [RFCXXXX]

The ietf-yang-library-semver module:

Name: ietf-yang-library-semver

XML Namespace: urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-yang-librarysemver

Prefix: yl-semver

Reference: [RFCXXXX]

12.2. Guidance for YANG Semver in IANA maintained YANG modules and submodules

Note for IANA (to be removed by the RFC editor): Please check that the registries and IANA YANG modules and submodules are referenced in the appropriate way.

IANA is responsible for maintaining and versioning some YANG modules and submodules, e.g., iana-if-types.yang [IfTypeYang] and ianarouting-types.yang [RoutingTypesYang].

In addition to following the rules specified in the IANA Considerations section of [I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning], IANA maintained YANG modules and submodules MUST also include a YANG Semver version identifier for all new revisions, as defined in Section 4.

The YANG Semver version associated with the new revision MUST follow the rules defined in <u>Section 4.5</u>.

Note: For IANA maintained YANG modules and submodules that have already been published, versions MUST be retroactively applied to all existing revisions when the next new revision is created, starting at version "1.0.0" for the initial published revision, and then incrementing according to the YANG Semver rules specified in <u>Section 4.5</u>.

Most changes to IANA maintained YANG modules and submodules are expected to be backwards-compatible changes and classified as MINOR version changes. The PATCH version may be incremented instead when only editorial changes are made, and the MAJOR version would be incremented if non-backwards-compatible changes are made.

Given that IANA maintained YANG modules are versioned with a linear history, it is anticipated that it should not be necessary to use the "_compatible" or "_non_compatible" modifiers to the "Z_COMPAT" version element.

13. References

13.1. Normative References

- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119, DOI 10.17487/ RFC2119, March 1997, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/</u> rfc2119>.
- [RFC3688] Mealling, M., "The IETF XML Registry", BCP 81, RFC 3688, DOI 10.17487/RFC3688, January 2004, <<u>https://www.rfc-</u> editor.org/info/rfc3688>.

[RFC6020]

Bjorklund, M., Ed., "YANG - A Data Modeling Language for the Network Configuration Protocol (NETCONF)", RFC 6020, DOI 10.17487/RFC6020, October 2010, <<u>https://www.rfc-</u> editor.org/info/rfc6020>.

- [RFC8174] Leiba, B., "Ambiguity of Uppercase vs Lowercase in RFC 2119 Key Words", BCP 14, RFC 8174, DOI 10.17487/RFC8174, May 2017, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8174</u>>.
- [RFC8407] Bierman, A., "Guidelines for Authors and Reviewers of Documents Containing YANG Data Models", BCP 216, RFC 8407, DOI 10.17487/RFC8407, October 2018, <<u>https://</u> www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8407>.
- [RFC7950] Bjorklund, M., Ed., "The YANG 1.1 Data Modeling Language", RFC 7950, DOI 10.17487/RFC7950, August 2016, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7950</u>>.
- [RFC8525] Bierman, A., Bjorklund, M., Schoenwaelder, J., Watsen, K., and R. Wilton, "YANG Library", RFC 8525, DOI 10.17487/RFC8525, March 2019, <<u>https://www.rfc-</u> editor.org/info/rfc8525>.

[I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-module-versioning]

Wilton, R., Rahman, R., Lengyel, B., Clarke, J., and J. Sterne, "Updated YANG Module Revision Handling", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-ietf-netmod-yang-moduleversioning-11, 1 March 2024, <<u>https://</u> <u>datatracker.ietf.org/doc/html/draft-ietf-netmod-yang-</u> <u>module-versioning-11</u>>.

13.2. Informative References

- [I-D.clacla-netmod-yang-model-update] Claise, B., Clarke, J., Lengyel, B., and K. D'Souza, "New YANG Module Update Procedure", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draftclacla-netmod-yang-model-update-06, 2 July 2018, <<u>https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/html/draft-claclanetmod-yang-model-update-06</u>>.
- [I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-packages] Wilton, R., Rahman, R., Clarke, J., Sterne, J., and B. Wu, "YANG Packages", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-ietf-netmod-yang-packages-03, 4 March 2022, <<u>https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/html/draft-ietf-netmod-yang-packages-03</u>>.
- [I-D.ietf-netmod-yang-schema-comparison] Andersson, P. and R. Wilton, "YANG Schema Comparison", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-ietf-netmod-yang-schema-

comparison-02, 14 March 2023, <<u>https://</u> datatracker.ietf.org/doc/html/draft-ietf-netmod-yangschema-comparison-02>.

- [RFC8340] Bjorklund, M. and L. Berger, Ed., "YANG Tree Diagrams", BCP 215, RFC 8340, DOI 10.17487/RFC8340, March 2018, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8340</u>>.
- [RFC8342] Bjorklund, M., Schoenwaelder, J., Shafer, P., Watsen, K., and R. Wilton, "Network Management Datastore Architecture (NMDA)", RFC 8342, DOI 10.17487/RFC8342, March 2018, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8342>.
- [RFC6241] Enns, R., Ed., Bjorklund, M., Ed., Schoenwaelder, J., Ed., and A. Bierman, Ed., "Network Configuration Protocol (NETCONF)", RFC 6241, DOI 10.17487/RFC6241, June 2011, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6241>.
- [RFC6242] Wasserman, M., "Using the NETCONF Protocol over Secure Shell (SSH)", RFC 6242, DOI 10.17487/RFC6242, June 2011, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6242</u>>.
- [RFC8040] Bierman, A., Bjorklund, M., and K. Watsen, "RESTCONF Protocol", RFC 8040, DOI 10.17487/RFC8040, January 2017, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8040</u>>.
- [RFC8341] Bierman, A. and M. Bjorklund, "Network Configuration Access Control Model", STD 91, RFC 8341, DOI 10.17487/ RFC8341, March 2018, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/</u> rfc8341>.
- [RFC8446] Rescorla, E., "The Transport Layer Security (TLS)
 Protocol Version 1.3", RFC 8446, DOI 10.17487/RFC8446,
 August 2018, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8446</u>>.
- [RFC8792] Watsen, K., Auerswald, E., Farrel, A., and Q. Wu, "Handling Long Lines in Content of Internet-Drafts and RFCs", RFC 8792, DOI 10.17487/RFC8792, June 2020, <<u>https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8792</u>>.

[IfTypeYang] "iana-if-type YANG Module", <<u>https://www.iana.org/</u> assignments/iana-if-type/iana-if-type.xhtml>.

[RoutingTypesYang]

"iana-routing-types YANG Module", <<u>https://</u>
www.iana.org/assignments/iana-routing-types/iana-routingtypes.xhtml>.

Appendix A. Example IETF Module Development

Assume a new YANG module is being developed in the netmod working group in the IETF. Initially, this module is being developed in an individual internet draft, draft-jdoe-netmod-example-module. The following represents the initial version tree (i.e., value of ys:version) of the module as it's being initially developed.

Version lineage for initial module development:

0.0.1-draft-jdoe-netmod-example-module-00
|
0.1.0-draft-jdoe-netmod-example-module-01
|
0.2.0-draft-jdoe-netmod-example-module-02
|
0.2.1-draft-jdoe-netmod-example-module-03

At this point, development stabilizes, and the workgroup adopts the draft. Thus now the draft becomes draft-ietf-netmod-example-module. The initial pre-release lineage continues as follows.

Continued version progression after adoption:

1.0.0-draft-ietf-netmod-example-module-00
 |
1.0.0-draft-ietf-netmod-example-module-01
 |
1.0.0-draft-ietf-netmod-example-module-02

At this point, the draft is standardized and becomes RFC12345 and the YANG module version becomes 1.0.0.

A time later, the module needs to be revised to add additional capabilities. Development will be done in a backwards-compatible way. Two new individual drafts are proposed to go about adding the capabilities in different ways: draft-jdoe-netmod-exmod-enhancements and draft-asmith-netmod-exmod-changes. These are initially developed in parallel with the following versions.

Parallel development for next module revision (track 1):

1.1.0-draft-jdoe-netmod-exmod-enhancements-00
 |
1.1.0-draft-jdoe-netmod-exmod-enhancements-01

In parallel with (track 2):
 1.1.0-draft-asmith-netmod-exmod-changes-00
 |
 1.1.0-draft-asmith-netmod-exmod-changes-01

At this point, the WG decides to merge some aspects of both and adopt the work in asmith's draft as draft-ietf-netmod-exmod-changes. A single version progression continues.

```
1.1.0-draft-ietf-netmod-exmod-changes-00
|
1.1.0-draft-ietf-netmod-exmod-changes-01
|
1.1.0-draft-ietf-netmod-exmod-changes-02
|
1.1.0-draft-ietf-netmod-exmod-changes-03
```

The draft is standardized, and the new module version becomes 1.1.0.

Authors' Addresses

```
Joe Clarke (editor)
Cisco Systems, Inc.
7200-12 Kit Creek Rd
Research Triangle Park, North Carolina
United States of America
Phone: +1-919-392-2867
Email: jclarke@cisco.com
Robert Wilton (editor)
Cisco Systems, Inc.
Email: <u>rwilton@cisco.com</u>
Reshad Rahman
Equinix
Email: reshad@yahoo.com
Balazs Lengyel
Ericsson
1117 Budapest
Magyar Tudosok Korutja
Hungary
Phone: +36-70-330-7909
Email: balazs.lengyel@ericsson.com
```

Jason Sterne Nokia

Email: jason.sterne@nokia.com

Benoit Claise Huawei

Email: benoit.claise@huawei.com