

Network Working Group
Internet-Draft
Expires: December 27, 2006

C. Jennings
Cisco Systems
K. Ono
NTT Corporation
R. Sparks, Ed.
Estacado Systems
June 25, 2006

**Example call flows using Session Initiation Protocol (SIP) security
mechanisms
draft-ietf-sip-sec-flows-01**

Status of this Memo

By submitting this Internet-Draft, each author represents that any applicable patent or other IPR claims of which he or she is aware have been or will be disclosed, and any of which he or she becomes aware will be disclosed, in accordance with [Section 6 of BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/ietf/1id-abstracts.txt>.

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html>.

This Internet-Draft will expire on December 27, 2006.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2006).

Abstract

This document shows example call flows demonstrating the use of Transport Layer Security (TLS), and Secure/Multipurpose Internet Mail Extensions (S/MIME) in Session Initiation Protocol (SIP). It also provides information that helps implementers build interoperable SIP

software. To help facilitate interoperability testing, it includes certificates used in the example call flows and processes to create certificates for testing.

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	3
2.	Conventions	3
3.	Security Considerations	4
4.	Certificates	4
4.1.	CA Certificates	4
4.2.	Host Certificates	8
4.3.	User Certificates	9
5.	Callflow with Message Over TLS	12
5.1.	TLS with Server Authentication	12
5.2.	MESSAGE Message Over TLS	13
6.	Callflow with S/MIME-secured Message	14
6.1.	MESSAGE Message with Signed Body	14
6.2.	MESSAGE Message with Encrypted Body	17
6.3.	MESSAGE Message with Encrypted and Signed Body	20
7.	Observed Interoperability Issues	25
8.	Additional test scenarios	26
9.	IANA Considerations	27
10.	Acknowledgments	27
11.	Changelog	27
12.	Known Problems with this version	28
13.	References	28
13.1.	Normative References	28
13.2.	Informative References	29
Appendix A.	Making Test Certificates	29
A.1.	makeCA script	31
A.2.	makeCert script	33
Appendix B.	Certificates for Testing	35
Appendix C.	Message Dumps	39
	Authors' Addresses	40
	Intellectual Property and Copyright Statements	41

1. Introduction

This document is informational and is not normative on any aspect of SIP.

SIP with TLS[4] implementations are becoming very common. Several implementations of the S/MIME[7] portion of SIP[2] are also becoming available. After several interoperability events, it is clear that it is difficult to write these systems without any test vectors or examples of "known good" messages to test against. Furthermore, testing at the events is often hampered by trying to get certificates signed by some common test root into the appropriate format for various clients. This document addresses both of these issues by providing messages that give detailed examples that implementers can use for comparison and that can also be used for testing. In addition, this document provides a common certificate that can be used for a Certificate Authority (CA) to reduce the time it takes to set up a test at an interoperability event. The document also provides some hints and clarifications for implementers.

A simple SIP call flow using SIPS URIs and TLS is shown in [Section 5](#). The certificates for the hosts used are shown in [Section 4.2](#), and the CA certificates used to sign these are shown in [Section 4.1](#).

The text from [Section 6.1](#) through [Section 6.3](#) shows some simple SIP call flows using S/MIME to sign and encrypt the body of the message. The user certificates used in these examples are shown in [Section 4.3](#). These host certificates are signed with the same CA certificate.

[Section 7](#) presents a partial list of things implementers should consider in order to implement systems that will interoperate.

A way to make certificates that can be used for interoperability testing is presented in [Appendix A](#), along with methods for converting these to various formats. The certificates used while creating the examples and test messages in this document are made available in [Appendix B](#).

Binary copies of various messages in this draft that can be used for testing appear in [Appendix C](#).

2. Conventions

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [RFC-2119](#) [1].

3. Security Considerations

Implementers must never use any of the certificates provided in this document in anything but a test environment. Installing the CA root certificates used in this document as a trusted root in operational software would completely destroy the security of the system while giving the user the impression that the system was operating securely.

This document recommends some things that implementers might test or verify to improve the security of their implementations. It is impossible to make a comprehensive list of these, and this document only suggests some of the most common mistakes that have been seen at the SIPit interoperability events. Just because an implementation does everything this document recommends does not make it secure.

This document does not show the messages needed to check Certificate Revocation Lists (see [\[3\]](#)) as that is not part of the SIP call flow.

4. Certificates

4.1. CA Certificates

The certificate used by the CA to sign the other certificates is shown below. This is a X509v3 certificate. Note that the basic constraints allow it to be used as a CA.


```
Version: 3 (0x2)
Serial Number: 0 (0x0)
Signature Algorithm: sha1WithRSAEncryption
Issuer: C=US, ST=California, L=San Jose, O=sipit,
        OU=Sipit Test Certificate Authority
Validity
    Not Before: Jul 18 12:21:52 2003 GMT
    Not After : Jul 15 12:21:52 2013 GMT
Subject: C=US, ST=California, L=San Jose, O=sipit,
        OU=Sipit Test Certificate Authority
Subject Public Key Info:
    Public Key Algorithm: rsaEncryption
    RSA Public Key: (1024 bit)
        Modulus (1024 bit):
            00:c3:22:1e:83:91:c5:03:2c:3c:8a:f4:11:14:c6:
            4b:9d:fa:72:78:c6:b0:95:18:a7:e0:8c:79:ba:5d:
            a4:ae:1e:21:2d:9d:f1:0b:1c:cf:bd:5b:29:b3:90:
            13:73:66:92:6e:df:4c:b3:b3:1c:1f:2a:82:0a:ba:
            07:4d:52:b0:f8:37:7b:e2:0a:27:30:70:dd:f9:2e:
            03:ff:2a:76:cd:df:87:1a:bd:71:eb:e1:99:6a:c4:
            7f:8e:74:a0:77:85:04:e9:41:ad:fc:03:b6:17:75:
            aa:33:ea:0a:16:d9:fb:79:32:2e:f8:cf:4d:c6:34:
            a3:ff:1b:d0:68:28:e1:9d:e5
        Exponent: 65537 (0x10001)
X509v3 extensions:
    X509v3 Subject Key Identifier:
        6B:46:17:14:EA:94:76:25:80:54:6E:13:54:DA:A1:E3:54:14:A1:B6
    X509v3 Authority Key Identifier:
        6B:46:17:14:EA:94:76:25:80:54:6E:13:54:DA:A1:E3:54:14:A1:B6
        DirName:/C=US/ST=California/L=San Jose/O=sipit/
            OU=Sipit Test Certificate Authority
        serial:00
    X509v3 Basic Constraints:
        CA:TRUE
Signature Algorithm: sha1WithRSAEncryption
96:6d:1b:ef:d5:91:93:45:7c:5b:1f:cf:c4:aa:47:52:0b:34:
a8:50:fa:ec:fa:b4:2a:47:4c:5d:41:a7:3d:c0:d6:3f:9e:56:
5b:91:1d:ce:a8:07:b3:1b:a4:9f:9a:49:6f:7f:e0:ce:83:94:
71:42:af:fe:63:a2:34:dc:b4:5e:a5:ce:ca:79:50:e9:6a:99:
4c:14:69:e9:7c:ab:22:6c:44:cc:8a:9c:33:6b:23:50:42:05:
1f:e1:c2:81:88:5f:ba:e5:47:bb:85:9b:83:25:ad:84:32:ff:
2a:5b:8b:70:12:11:83:61:c9:69:15:4f:58:a3:3c:92:d4:e8:
6f:52
```

The ASN.1 parse of the CA certificate is shown below.


```
0:l= 804 cons: SEQUENCE
4:l= 653 cons: SEQUENCE
8:l= 3 cons: cont [ 0 ]
10:l= 1 prim: INTEGER :02
13:l= 1 prim: INTEGER :00
16:l= 13 cons: SEQUENCE
18:l= 9 prim: OBJECT :sha1WithRSAEncryption
29:l= 0 prim: NULL
31:l= 112 cons: SEQUENCE
33:l= 11 cons: SET
35:l= 9 cons: SEQUENCE
37:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :countryName
42:l= 2 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :US
46:l= 19 cons: SET
48:l= 17 cons: SEQUENCE
50:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :stateOrProvinceName
55:l= 10 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :California
67:l= 17 cons: SET
69:l= 15 cons: SEQUENCE
71:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :localityName
76:l= 8 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :San Jose
86:l= 14 cons: SET
88:l= 12 cons: SEQUENCE
90:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :organizationName
95:l= 5 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :sipit
102:l= 41 cons: SET
104:l= 39 cons: SEQUENCE
106:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :organizationalUnitName
111:l= 32 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :
        Sipit Test Certificate Authority
145:l= 30 cons: SEQUENCE
147:l= 13 prim: UTCTIME :030718122152Z
162:l= 13 prim: UTCTIME :130715122152Z
177:l= 112 cons: SEQUENCE
179:l= 11 cons: SET
181:l= 9 cons: SEQUENCE
183:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :countryName
188:l= 2 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :US
192:l= 19 cons: SET
194:l= 17 cons: SEQUENCE
196:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :stateOrProvinceName
201:l= 10 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :California
213:l= 17 cons: SET
215:l= 15 cons: SEQUENCE
217:l= 3 prim: OBJECT :localityName
222:l= 8 prim: PRINTABLESTRING :San Jose
232:l= 14 cons: SET
234:l= 12 cons: SEQUENCE
```



```

236:l= 3 prim:    OBJECT          :organizationName
241:l= 5 prim:    PRINTABLESTRING :sipit
248:l= 41 cons:   SET
250:l= 39 cons:   SEQUENCE
252:l= 3 prim:    OBJECT          :organizationalUnitName
257:l= 32 prim:    PRINTABLESTRING :
                Sipit Test Certificate Authority
291:l= 159 cons:  SEQUENCE
294:l= 13 cons:  SEQUENCE
296:l= 9 prim:   OBJECT          :rsaEncryption
307:l= 0 prim:   NULL
309:l= 141 prim:  BIT STRING
00 30 81 89 02 81 81 00-c3 22 1e 83 91 c5 03 2c .0.....".....,
3c 8a f4 11 14 c6 4b 9d-fa 72 78 c6 b0 95 18 a7 <.....K..rx.....
e0 8c 79 ba 5d a4 ae 1e-21 2d 9d f1 0b 1c cf bd ..y.]...!-.....
5b 29 b3 90 13 73 66 92-6e df 4c b3 b3 1c 1f 2a [)....sf.n.L....*
82 0a ba 07 4d 52 b0 f8-37 7b e2 0a 27 30 70 dd ....MR..7{..'0p.
f9 2e 03 ff 2a 76 cd df-87 1a bd 71 eb e1 99 6a ....*v.....q...j
c4 7f 8e 74 a0 77 85 04-e9 41 ad fc 03 b6 17 75 ...t.w...A.....u
aa 33 ea 0a 16 d9 fb 79-32 2e f8 cf 4d c6 34 a3 .3.....y2...M.4.
ff 1b d0 68 28 e1 9d e5-02 03 01 00 01      ...h(.....
453:l= 205 cons:  cont [ 3 ]
456:l= 202 cons:  SEQUENCE
459:l= 29 cons:   SEQUENCE
461:l= 3 prim:    OBJECT          :X509v3 Subject Key Identifier
466:l= 22 prim:    OCTET STRING
04 14 6b 46 17 14 ea 94-76 25 80 54 6e 13 54 da ..kF....v%.Tn.T.
a1 e3 54 14 a1 b6      ..T...
490:l= 154 cons:  SEQUENCE
493:l= 3 prim:    OBJECT          :X509v3 Authority Key Identifier
498:l= 146 prim:   OCTET STRING
30 81 8f 80 14 6b 46 17-14 ea 94 76 25 80 54 6e 0....kF....v%.Tn
13 54 da a1 e3 54 14 a1-b6 a1 74 a4 72 30 70 31 .T...T....t.r0p1
0b 30 09 06 03 55 04 06-13 02 55 53 31 13 30 11 .0...U....US1.0.
06 03 55 04 08 13 0a 43-61 6c 69 66 6f 72 6e 69 ..U....Californi
61 31 11 30 0f 06 03 55-04 07 13 08 53 61 6e 20 a1.0...U....San
4a 6f 73 65 31 0e 30 0c-06 03 55 04 0a 13 05 73 Jose1.0...U....s
69 70 69 74 31 29 30 27-06 03 55 04 0b 13 20 53 ipit1)0'..U... S
69 70 69 74 20 54 65 73-74 20 43 65 72 74 69 66 ipit Test Certif
69 63 61 74 65 20 41 75-74 68 6f 72 69 74 79 82 icate Authority.
01      .
0092 - <SPACES/NULS>
647:l= 12 cons:   SEQUENCE
649:l= 3 prim:    OBJECT          :X509v3 Basic Constraints
654:l= 5 prim:    OCTET STRING
30 03 01 01 ff      0....
661:l= 13 cons:   SEQUENCE
663:l= 9 prim:    OBJECT          :sha1WithRSAEncryption

```



```

674:l= 0 prim: NULL
676:l= 129 prim: BIT STRING
00 96 6d 1b ef d5 91 93-45 7c 5b 1f cf c4 aa 47 ..m.....E| [....G
52 0b 34 a8 50 fa ec fa-b4 2a 47 4c 5d 41 a7 3d R.4.P....*GL]A.=
c0 d6 3f 9e 56 5b 91 1d-ce a8 07 b3 1b a4 9f 9a ..?.V[.....
49 6f 7f e0 ce 83 94 71-42 af fe 63 a2 34 dc b4 Io.....qB..c.4..
5e a5 ce ca 79 50 e9 6a-99 4c 14 69 e9 7c ab 22 ^...yP.j.L.i.|."
6c 44 cc 8a 9c 33 6b 23-50 42 05 1f e1 c2 81 88 lD...3k#PB.....
5f ba e5 47 bb 85 9b 83-25 ad 84 32 ff 2a 5b 8b _..G....%..2.*[.
70 12 11 83 61 c9 69 15-4f 58 a3 3c 92 d4 e8 6f p...a.i.OX.<...o
52                                     R

```

[4.2.](#) Host Certificates

The certificate for the host `example.com` is shown below. Note that the Subject Alternative Name is set to `example.com` and is a DNS type. The certificates for the other hosts are shown in [Appendix B](#).

Data:

```
Version: 3 (0x2)
Serial Number:
    01:95:00:71:02:33:00:55
Signature Algorithm: sha1WithRSAEncryption
Issuer: C=US, ST=California, L=San Jose, O=sipit,
        OU=Sipit Test Certificate Authority
Validity
    Not Before: Feb  3 18:49:08 2005 GMT
    Not After : Feb  3 18:49:08 2008 GMT
Subject: C=US, ST=California, L=San Jose, O=sipit,
        CN=example.com
Subject Public Key Info:
    Public Key Algorithm: rsaEncryption
    RSA Public Key: (1024 bit)
        Modulus (1024 bit):
            00:e6:31:76:b5:27:cc:8d:32:85:56:70:f7:c2:33:
            33:32:26:42:5e:3c:68:71:7b:1f:79:50:d0:72:27:
            3b:4a:af:f2:ce:d1:0c:bc:c0:5f:31:6a:43:e7:7c:
            ad:64:bd:c7:e6:25:9f:aa:cd:2d:90:aa:68:84:62:
            7b:05:be:43:a5:af:bb:ea:9d:a9:5b:a4:53:9d:22:
            8b:da:96:2e:1f:3f:92:46:b8:cc:c8:24:3c:46:cd:
            5d:2d:64:85:b1:a4:ca:01:f1:8e:c5:7e:0f:ff:00:
            91:a3:ea:cb:3e:12:02:75:a4:bb:08:c8:d0:2a:ef:
            b3:bb:72:7a:98:e5:ff:9f:81
        Exponent: 65537 (0x10001)
X509v3 extensions:
    X509v3 Subject Alternative Name:
        DNS:example.com
    X509v3 Basic Constraints:
        CA:FALSE
    X509v3 Subject Key Identifier:
        22:EA:CB:38:66:1D:F1:96:0C:9A:47:B6:BB:1C:52:
        44:B0:77:65:8D
Signature Algorithm: sha1WithRSAEncryption
ae:eb:49:ed:1e:f1:8d:26:a9:6d:03:82:92:d5:df:44:c4:1e:
1f:07:75:88:37:e4:76:97:35:12:59:98:79:78:16:6e:3b:b1:
c0:2b:db:85:02:6b:74:c9:5b:19:92:da:7e:f5:41:0b:bc:d2:
dd:45:aa:6f:be:24:dc:48:57:66:d9:2e:82:df:9e:8d:70:03:
73:75:ef:8f:7a:56:4c:cc:42:bd:31:45:b0:5e:ff:d1:3b:c4:
82:ee:fd:a7:c1:10:34:eb:81:49:1a:6b:86:7e:c7:61:1d:b3:
b9:0a:02:bd:84:f8:47:af:cf:f1:a8:73:a8:31:1d:20:7a:06:
7f:ac
```

[4.3.](#) User Certificates

The user certificate for fluffy@example.com is shown below. Note that the Subject Alternative Name has a list of names with different

URL types such as a sip, im, or pres URL. This is necessary for interoperating with CPIM gateway. In this example, example.com is the domain for fluffy. The message could be coming from a host called atlanta.example.com, and the AOR in the user certificate would still be the same. The others are shown in [Appendix B](#).

Data:

Version: 3 (0x2)

Serial Number:

01:95:00:71:02:33:00:58

Signature Algorithm: sha1WithRSAEncryption

Issuer: C=US, ST=California, L=San Jose, O=sipit,
OU=Sipit Test Certificate Authority

Validity

Not Before: Feb 3 18:49:34 2005 GMT

Not After : Feb 3 18:49:34 2008 GMT

Subject: C=US, ST=California, L=San Jose, O=sipit,
CN=fluffy@example.com

Subject Public Key Info:

Public Key Algorithm: rsaEncryption

RSA Public Key: (1024 bit)

Modulus (1024 bit):

00:ca:ab:9b:9b:4e:3c:d5:45:3c:ce:00:a6:36:a8:
b9:ec:d2:76:e2:b9:9b:e8:28:aa:ba:86:22:c5:cf:
33:3e:4f:6d:56:21:ae:bd:54:84:7c:14:14:f9:7d:
99:85:00:4e:93:d6:fd:6b:d4:d1:d4:55:8e:c9:89:
b1:af:2b:5f:23:99:4a:95:e5:68:65:64:1d:12:a7:
db:d3:d5:97:18:47:35:9c:e6:88:27:9d:a8:6c:ca:
2a:84:e6:62:d8:f1:e9:a2:1a:39:7e:0e:0f:90:a5:
a6:79:21:bc:2a:67:b4:dd:69:90:82:9a:ae:1f:02:
52:8a:58:d3:f5:d0:d4:66:67

Exponent: 65537 (0x10001)

X509v3 extensions:

X509v3 Subject Alternative Name:

URI:sip:fluffy@example.com, URI:im:fluffy@example.com,

URI:pres:fluffy@example.com

X509v3 Basic Constraints:

CA:FALSE

X509v3 Subject Key Identifier:

EC:DA:98:5E:E9:F7:F7:D7:EC:2B:29:4B:DA:25:EE:C7:C7:
7E:95:70

Signature Algorithm: sha1WithRSAEncryption

4c:46:49:6e:01:48:e2:d4:6e:d7:48:a1:f3:7b:c8:a5:98:37:
a5:44:46:58:9f:4a:37:7d:90:fb:5f:ff:36:bd:67:31:f0:29:
de:0a:e2:ea:b9:f0:5c:9f:ad:a0:de:e5:4e:42:8f:11:d8:41:
ea:68:be:db:c2:1e:fa:e5:8a:2d:7f:66:13:29:e9:da:8f:fb:
80:bf:7e:5e:b6:04:ad:08:5e:58:95:b7:c5:38:85:d5:65:31:
ad:80:cb:28:a7:4c:ad:11:fd:41:3b:37:77:5a:de:85:96:3d:
66:eb:5f:9a:f8:60:5f:8e:b1:fc:4a:43:53:b6:11:4d:2e:f4:
3d:ff

5. Callflow with Message Over TLS

5.1. TLS with Server Authentication

The flow below shows the edited SSLDump output of the host example.com forming a TLS[4] connection to example.net. In this example mutual authentication is not used. Note that the client proposed three protocol suites including TLS_RSA_WITH_AES_128_CBC_SHA defined in [6]. The certificate returned by the server contains a Subject Alternative Name that is set to example.net. A detailed discussion of TLS can be found in [16].

This example does not use the Server Extended Hello[5].

New TCP connection #1: 127.0.0.1(55768) <-> 127.0.0.1(5061)

```

1 1  0.0060 (0.0060)  C>SV3.1(49)  Handshake
      ClientHello
        Version 3.1
        random[32]=
          42 16 8c c7 82 cd c5 87 42 ba f5 1c 91 04 fb 7d
          4d 6c 56 f1 db 1d ce 8a b1 25 71 5a 68 01 a2 14
        cipher suites
          TLS_RSA_WITH_AES_256_CBC_SHA
          TLS_RSA_WITH_AES_128_CBC_SHA
          TLS_RSA_WITH_3DES_EDE_CBC_SHA
        compression methods
          NULL
1 2  0.0138 (0.0077)  S>CV3.1(74)  Handshake
      ServerHello
        Version 3.1
        random[32]=
          42 16 8c c7 c9 2c 43 42 bb 69 a5 ba f1 2d 69 75
          c3 8d 3a 85 78 19 f2 e4 d9 2b 72 b4 cc dd e4 72
        session_id[32]=
          06 37 e9 22 56 29 e6 b4 3a 6e 53 fe 56 27 ed 1f
          2a 75 34 65 f0 91 fc 79 cf 90 da ac f4 6f 64 b5
        cipherSuite          TLS_RSA_WITH_AES_256_CBC_SHA
        compressionMethod    NULL
1 3  0.0138 (0.0000)  S>CV3.1(1477) Handshake
      Certificate
1 4  0.0138 (0.0000)  S>CV3.1(4)  Handshake
      ServerHelloDone
1 5  0.0183 (0.0045)  C>SV3.1(134) Handshake
      ClientKeyExchange
        EncryptedPreMasterSecret[128]=
          a6 bd d9 4b 76 4b 9d 6f 7b 12 8a e4 52 75 9d 74
          4f 06 e4 b0 bc 69 96 d7 42 ba 77 01 b6 9e 64 b0

```



```

    ea c5 aa de 59 41 e4 f3 9e 1c 1c a9 48 f5 0a 3f
    5e c3 50 23 15 d7 46 1d 69 79 76 ba 5e c8 ac 39
    23 71 d0 0c 18 a6 a9 77 0f 7d 49 61 ef 6f 8d 32
    54 f5 a4 1d 19 33 0a 64 ee 56 91 9b f4 f7 50 b1
    11 4b 81 46 4c 36 df 70 98 04 dc 5c 8a 16 a9 2e
    58 67 ae 5e 7a a9 44 2b 0b 7c 9c 2f 16 25 1a e9
1 6  0.0183 (0.0000)  C>SV3.1(1)  ChangeCipherSpec
1 7  0.0183 (0.0000)  C>SV3.1(48)  Handshake
1 8  0.0630 (0.0447)  S>CV3.1(1)  ChangeCipherSpec
1 9  0.0630 (0.0000)  S>CV3.1(48)  Handshake
1 10 0.3274 (0.2643)  C>SV3.1(32)  application_data
1 11 0.3274 (0.0000)  C>SV3.1(720) application_data
1 12 0.3324 (0.0050)  S>CV3.1(32)  application_data
1 13 0.3324 (0.0000)  S>CV3.1(384) application_data
1    9.2491 (8.9166)  C>S   TCP FIN
1    9.4023 (0.1531)  S>C   TCP FIN

```

5.2. MESSAGE Message Over TLS

Once the TLS session is set up, the following MESSAGE message (as defined in [13]) is sent from fluffy@example.com to kumiko@example.net. Note that the URI has a SIPS URL and that the VIA indicates that TLS was used. In order to format this document, the <allOneLine>convention from [11] is used to break long lines. The actual message does not contain the linebreaks contained within those tags.

```

MESSAGE sips:kumiko@example.net SIP/2.0
To: <sips:kumiko@example.net>
From: <sips:fluffy@example.com>;tag=03de46e1
Via: SIP/2.0/TLS 127.0.0.1:5071;
      branch=z9hG4bK-d87543-58c826887160f95f-1--d87543-;rport
Call-ID: 0dc68373623af98a@Y2ouY21zY28uc2lwaXQubmV0
CSeq: 1 MESSAGE
Contact: <sips:fluffy@127.0.0.1:5071>
Max-Forwards: 70
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary
Content-Type: text/plain
Date: Sat, 19 Feb 2005 00:48:07 GMT
User-Agent: SIPimp.org/0.2.5 (curses)
Content-Length: 6

```

Hello!

The response is sent from example.net to example.com over the same TLS connection. It is shown below.


```
SIP/2.0 200 OK
To: <sips:kumiko@example.net>;tag=4c53f1b8
From: <sips:fluffy@example.com>;tag=03de46e1
Via: SIP/2.0/TLS 127.0.0.1:5071;
      branch=z9hG4bK-d87543-58c826887160f95f-1--d87543-;
      rport=55768;received=127.0.0.1
Call-ID: 0dc68373623af98a@Y2ouY2lzY28uc2lwaXQubmV0
CSeq: 1 MESSAGE
Contact: <sips:kumiko@127.0.0.1:5061>
Content-Length: 0
```

[6.](#) Callflow with S/MIME-secured Message

[6.1.](#) MESSAGE Message with Signed Body

Example Signed Message. The value on the Content-Type line has been broken across lines to fit on the page but it should not be broken across lines in actual implementations.


```
MESSAGE sip:kumiko@example.net SIP/2.0
To: <sip:kumiko@example.net>
From: <sip:fluffy@example.com>;tag=0c523b42
Via: SIP/2.0/UDP 68.122.119.3:5060;
      branch=z9hG4bK-d87543-16a1192b7960f635-1--d87543-;rport
Call-ID: 27bb7608596d8914@Y2ouY2lzY28uc2lwaXQubmV0
CSeq: 1 MESSAGE
Contact: <sip:fluffy@68.122.119.3:5060>
Max-Forwards: 70
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary
Content-Type: multipart/signed;boundary=151aa2144df0f6bd;\
      micalg=sha1;protocol="application/pkcs7-signature"
Date: Sat, 19 Nov 2005 23:34:50 GMT
User-Agent: SIPimp.org/0.2.5 (curses)
Content-Length: 639

--151aa2144df0f6bd
Content-Type: text/plain
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary

hello
--151aa2144df0f6bd
Content-Type: application/pkcs7-mime;name=smime.p7s
Content-Disposition: attachment;handling=required;filename=smime.p7s
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary

*****
*  BINARY BLOB 1      *
*****
--151aa2144df0f6bd--
```

It is important to note that the signature includes the header and excludes the boundary. The value on the Message-body line ends with CRLF. The CRLF is included in the boundary and should not be part of the signature computation. In the example below, the signature is computed over data starting with the C in the Content-Type and ending with the o in the hello.

```
Content-Type: text/plain
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary

hello
```

ASN.1 parse of binary Blob 1. Note that at address 30, the hash for the signature is specified as SHA1. Also note that the sender's certificate is not attached as it is optional in [8].


```
0:SEQUENCE {
4:  OBJECT IDENTIFIER signedData (1 2 840 113549 1 7 2)
15: [0] {
19:   SEQUENCE {
23:     INTEGER 1
26:     SET {
28:       SEQUENCE {
30:         OBJECT IDENTIFIER sha1 (1 3 14 3 2 26)
:       }
:     }
37:   SEQUENCE {
39:     OBJECT IDENTIFIER data (1 2 840 113549 1 7 1)
:   }
50: SET {
54:   SEQUENCE {
58:     INTEGER 1
61:     SEQUENCE {
63:       SEQUENCE {
65:         SET {
67:           SEQUENCE {
69:             OBJECT IDENTIFIER countryName (2 5 4 6)
74:             PrintableString 'US'
:           }
:         }
78:       SET {
80:         SEQUENCE {
82:           OBJECT IDENTIFIER stateOrProvinceName(2 5 4 8)
87:           PrintableString 'California'
:         }
:       }
99:     SET {
101:      SEQUENCE {
103:        OBJECT IDENTIFIER localityName (2 5 4 7)
108:        PrintableString 'San Jose'
:      }
:    }
118:   SET {
120:     SEQUENCE {
122:       OBJECT IDENTIFIER organizationName (2 5 4 10)
127:       PrintableString 'sipit'
:     }
:   }
134: SET {
136:   SEQUENCE {
138:     OBJECT IDENTIFIER
:       organizationalUnitName (2 5 4 11)
143:     PrintableString
      'Sipit Test Certificate Authority'
```



```

:           }
:         }
:       }
177:         INTEGER 01 95 00 71 02 33 00 58
:       }
187:     SEQUENCE {
189:       OBJECT IDENTIFIER sha1 (1 3 14 3 2 26)
:     }
196:     SEQUENCE {
198:       OBJECT IDENTIFIER rsaEncryption
:         (1 2 840 113549 1 1 1)
209:     NULL
:   }
211:   OCTET STRING
:     C4 0E 40 A5 7F 88 5B 06 90 E7 B2 40 39 DF 33 E3
:     18 39 C2 9E EC 51 5E 06 E2 D5 DA F0 F6 87 77 1E
:     F7 F9 C1 26 04 20 F8 30 B8 C0 37 92 F6 5C 64 DD
:     87 41 43 F8 2D E5 28 20 35 7D 84 72 2B 5E 5F CF
:     2E 73 93 03 4B DB 35 4C CA 44 CD F8 91 58 A2 4C
:     65 A1 A6 EA DC E6 1B 1E DD DA BD BE 1A EA 9F 62
:     12 7A D1 1A E7 27 B5 96 88 B9 E6 EF 79 C0 E5 40
:     A0 5F 9F 93 09 4C 65 55 DA A8 FE CD 02 10 A9 67
:   }
: }
: }
: }
: }
: }

```

[6.2.](#) MESSAGE Message with Encrypted Body

Example encrypted text/plain message that says "hello":


```
MESSAGE sip:kumiko@example.net SIP/2.0
To: <sip:kumiko@example.net>
From: <sip:fluffy@example.com>;tag=6d2a39e4
Via: SIP/2.0/UDP 68.122.119.3:5060;
      branch=z9hG4bK-d87543-44ddc0a217a51788-1--d87543-;rport
Call-ID: 031be67669ea9799@Y2ouY2lzY28uc2lwaXQubmV0
CSeq: 1 MESSAGE
Contact: <sip:fluffy@68.122.119.3:5060>
Max-Forwards: 70
Content-Disposition: attachment;handling=required;filename=smime.p7
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary
Content-Type: application/pkcs7-mime;\
              smime-type=enveloped-data;name=smime.p7m
Date: Sat, 19 Nov 2005 23:33:18 GMT
User-Agent: SIPimp.org/0.2.5 (curses)
Content-Length: 435
```

```
*****
* BINARY BLOB 2 *
*****
```

ASN.1 parse of binary Blob 2. Note that at address 324, the encryption is set to aes128-CBC.

```
0:SEQUENCE {
  4: OBJECT IDENTIFIER envelopedData (1 2 840 113549 1 7 3)
  15: [0] {
    19: SEQUENCE {
      23: INTEGER 0
      26: SET {
        30: SEQUENCE {
          34: INTEGER 0
          37: SEQUENCE {
            39: SEQUENCE {
              41: SET {
                43: SEQUENCE {
                  45: OBJECT IDENTIFIER countryName (2 5 4 6)
                  50: PrintableString 'US'
                  :
                  :
                }
              54: SET {
                56: SEQUENCE {
                  58: OBJECT IDENTIFIER stateOrProvinceName(2 5 4 8)
                  63: PrintableString 'California'
                  :
                  :
                }
              75: SET {
```



```
77:         SEQUENCE {
79:             OBJECT IDENTIFIER localityName (2 5 4 7)
84:             PrintableString 'San Jose'
      :         }
      :     }
94:     SET {
96:         SEQUENCE {
98:             OBJECT IDENTIFIER organizationName (2 5 4 10)
103:            PrintableString 'sipit'
      :         }
      :     }
110:    SET {
112:        SEQUENCE {
114:            OBJECT IDENTIFIER
      :            organizationalUnitName (2 5 4 11)
119:            PrintableString
      :            'Sipit Test Certificate Authority'
      :        }
      :    }
      : }
153:    INTEGER 01 95 00 71 02 33 00 57
      : }
163:    SEQUENCE {
165:        OBJECT IDENTIFIER rsaEncryption(1 2 840 113549 1 1 1)
176:        NULL
      :    }
178:    OCTET STRING
      :        7C F3 8A 02 E8 44 2C A6 9B 3E 64 46 06 D3 95 2D
      :        DF 19 8F 5D 0C 24 6B F7 93 03 E7 3C 98 F1 57 74
      :        67 70 0E 40 F8 05 96 34 06 36 97 61 5C 0B 2D 61
      :        AD CB F0 82 56 23 E5 09 C0 C7 BC A5 F4 A3 B7 59
      :        5D 8B 44 6E 3F 7C DE 50 54 2C 95 73 CC 9A 74 8B
      :        A9 26 68 FD F8 82 01 43 1D 30 3C 0C 40 B2 19 A2
      :        5A 90 06 0F AC 95 CB DF 21 13 F2 26 C8 10 45 A3
      :        F4 AB 54 74 72 FD 91 6C 73 27 BF 62 47 7B EC 58
      :    }
      : }
309:    SEQUENCE {
311:        OBJECT IDENTIFIER data (1 2 840 113549 1 7 1)
322:        SEQUENCE {
324:            OBJECT IDENTIFIER aes128-CBC (2 16 840 1 101 3 4 1 2)
335:            OCTET STRING
      :                50 9E 44 AA A5 54 C3 5C 0D 9A DF 65 F7 47 36 99
      :            }
353:    [0]
      :        55 C5 C7 EA 5D 5A 7C 06 95 3C 24 25 D5 53 08 BB
      :        04 19 B4 BF 84 15 F5 6C 4C 80 05 14 06 3E F3 D1
      :        B7 04 A1 46 4E E3 1E FF 16 35 79 2A 06 DD A8 83
```



```
:      61 24 E1 62 B0 DA 03 53 78 F8 B7 CD B2 11 68 57
:      BE 5F 13 49 B9 5E AB 6F 6E 26 2D 8A A5 9E E5 10
:      }
:      }
:      }
:      }
```

[6.3.](#) MESSAGE Message with Encrypted and Signed Body

In the example below, one of the headers is contained in a box and is split across two lines. This was only done to make it fit in the RFC format. This header should not have the box around it and should be on one line with no whitespace between the "mime;" and the "smime-type". Note that Content-Type is split across lines for formatting but is not split in the real message.


```

MESSAGE sip:kumiko@example.net SIP/2.0
To: <sip:kumiko@example.net>
From: <sip:fluffy@example.com>;tag=361300da
Via: SIP/2.0/UDP 68.122.119.3:5060;
      branch=z9hG4bK-d87543-0710dbfb18ebb8e6-1--d87543-;rport
Call-ID: 5eda27a67de6283d@Y2ouY2lzY28uc2lwaXQubmV0
CSeq: 1 MESSAGE
Contact: <sip:fluffy@68.122.119.3:5060>
Max-Forwards: 70
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary
Content-Type: multipart/signed;boundary=1af019eb7754ddf7;\
              micalg=sha1;protocol="application/pkcs7-signature"
Date: Sat, 19 Nov 2005 23:35:40 GMT
User-Agent: SIPimp.org/0.2.5 (curses)
Content-Length: 1191

--1af019eb7754ddf7
|--See note about stuff in this box -----|
|Content-Type: application/pkcs7-mime;      |
|      smime-type=enveloped-data;name=smime.p7m |
|-----|
Content-Disposition: attachment;handling=required;filename=smime.p7
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary

*****
* BINARY BLOB 3 *
*****

--1af019eb7754ddf7
Content-Type: application/pkcs7-mime;name=smime.p7s
Content-Disposition: attachment;handling=required;filename=smime.p7s
Content-Transfer-Encoding: binary

*****
* BINARY BLOB 4 *
*****

--1af019eb7754ddf7--

```

Binary blob 3

```

0:SEQUENCE {
  4: OBJECT IDENTIFIER envelopedData (1 2 840 113549 1 7 3)
  15: [0] {
    19: SEQUENCE {
      23: INTEGER 0
      26: SET {
        30: SEQUENCE {
          34: INTEGER 0

```



```
37:      SEQUENCE {
39:          SEQUENCE {
41:              SET {
43:                  SEQUENCE {
45:                      OBJECT IDENTIFIER countryName (2 5 4 6)
50:                      PrintableString 'US'
      :                  }
      :              }
54:          SET {
56:              SEQUENCE {
58:                  OBJECT IDENTIFIER stateOrProvinceName(2 5 4 8)
63:                  PrintableString 'California'
      :                  }
      :              }
75:          SET {
77:              SEQUENCE {
79:                  OBJECT IDENTIFIER localityName (2 5 4 7)
84:                  PrintableString 'San Jose'
      :                  }
      :              }
94:          SET {
96:              SEQUENCE {
98:                  OBJECT IDENTIFIER organizationName (2 5 4 10)
103:                 PrintableString 'sipit'
      :                 }
      :             }
110:         SET {
112:             SEQUENCE {
114:                 OBJECT IDENTIFIER
      :                 organizationalUnitName (2 5 4 11)
119:                 PrintableString
      :                 'Sipit Test Certificate Authority'
      :                 }
      :             }
      :         }
153:         INTEGER 01 95 00 71 02 33 00 57
      :     }
163:     SEQUENCE {
165:         OBJECT IDENTIFIER rsaEncryption(1 2 840 113549 1 1 1)
176:         NULL
      :     }
178:     OCTET STRING
      :         69 B3 A3 61 F4 F8 63 4F 46 0A 1A AB 0F 1B 16 09
      :         DB 3A A9 12 3B 23 F0 C9 4E 68 04 15 AB 42 4F 66
      :         FA EF 8D C4 86 88 41 BA 53 A3 88 49 54 E3 0E EB
      :         E3 69 63 5A DF 77 2A 8A 1E 42 7E E4 A7 DB CF 90
      :         7E 90 47 FD 20 C9 B2 3B 2F A5 42 2A 68 66 9A 25
      :         53 D8 FC D9 70 9F 02 0F F2 D2 CB F7 15 7F 6F 4F
```



```

:          AB 19 0F 55 51 A2 76 24 DA A3 78 F4 1E 31 AA 6A
:          DF 7C E2 42 3B C5 33 11 E0 EE EE 2E 02 9D 8C 1A
:      }
:  }
309:  SEQUENCE {
311:      OBJECT IDENTIFIER data (1 2 840 113549 1 7 1)
322:      SEQUENCE {
324:          OBJECT IDENTIFIER aes128-CBC (2 16 840 1 101 3 4 1 2)
335:          OCTET STRING
:              72 71 AE FE 55 12 BA 99 92 EA D3 C5 9C B6 60 69
:          }
353:  [0]
:      9A 9F DD 9E 58 B6 BE 59 BC CA 6C 3E 3E F5 81 A3
:      30 A0 38 A3 1C 25 92 E3 AA 07 7A 85 7C 36 F0 12
:      9F 80 DF 98 BD 1E 22 EC BF 8B 03 EB 33 AE 81 75
:      D3 91 0A 82 1E 13 8C 60 F0 2B 55 DD 03 52 84 52
:      B1 51 5F E2 F0 CE 8A 94 4B F5 46 CE BF 77 80 8F
:  }
:  }
:  }
:  }

```

Binary Blob 4

```

0:SEQUENCE {
4:  OBJECT IDENTIFIER signedData (1 2 840 113549 1 7 2)
15:  [0] {
19:      SEQUENCE {
23:          INTEGER 1
26:          SET {
28:              SEQUENCE {
30:                  OBJECT IDENTIFIER sha1 (1 3 14 3 2 26)
:              }
:          }
37:      SEQUENCE {
39:          OBJECT IDENTIFIER data (1 2 840 113549 1 7 1)
:      }
50:      SET {
54:          SEQUENCE {
58:              INTEGER 1
61:              SEQUENCE {
63:                  SEQUENCE {
65:                      SET {
67:                          SEQUENCE {
69:                              OBJECT IDENTIFIER countryName (2 5 4 6)
74:                              PrintableString 'US'
:                          }
:                      }
:                  }
:              }
:          }
:      }
:  }

```



```

:      }
78:      SET {
80:          SEQUENCE {
82:              OBJECT IDENTIFIER stateOrProvinceName(2 5 4 8)
87:              PrintableString 'California'
:          }
:      }
99:      SET {
101:          SEQUENCE {
103:              OBJECT IDENTIFIER localityName (2 5 4 7)
108:              PrintableString 'San Jose'
:          }
:      }
118:      SET {
120:          SEQUENCE {
122:              OBJECT IDENTIFIER organizationName (2 5 4 10)
127:              PrintableString 'sipit'
:          }
:      }
134:      SET {
136:          SEQUENCE {
138:              OBJECT IDENTIFIER
:              organizationalUnitName (2 5 4 11)
143:              PrintableString
:              'Sipit Test Certificate Authority'
:          }
:      }
:
177:      INTEGER 01 95 00 71 02 33 00 58
:      }
187:      SEQUENCE {
189:          OBJECT IDENTIFIER sha1 (1 3 14 3 2 26)
:      }
196:      SEQUENCE {
198:          OBJECT IDENTIFIER rsaEncryption(1 2 840 113549 1 1 1)
209:          NULL
:      }
211:      OCTET STRING
:      16 85 D7 B8 08 C6 32 D5 85 7D 26 0F F8 89 DA D0
:      B8 FE 96 FB 40 C9 0E 52 C7 FE A5 87 55 F7 1A 86
:      29 80 CC B0 75 A3 72 DD 76 80 6B 2C 8B C0 14 EA
:      49 FE 18 8F A6 27 BC 5B 60 C1 FE 15 4D 2A 42 DD
:      33 F8 0D D0 77 11 73 82 31 4D 31 66 B1 CF 95 F0
:      9D EE DF 81 E3 54 DF 8C 7B 63 70 D4 93 B5 AE E0
:      D4 90 DB BE D8 0B 3B C2 99 6A FE 5A F0 E9 F0 DF
:      85 F2 A6 8C 28 33 0D 77 04 59 78 06 E5 0E 48 78
:      }
:  }
```



```
:    }  
:    }  
: }
```

7. Observed Interoperability Issues

This section describes some common interoperability problems. Implementers should verify that their clients do the correct things and when possible make their clients forgiving in what they receive. Implementations should take extra care to produce reasonable error messages when interacting with software that has these problems.

Some SIP clients incorrectly only do SSLv3 and do not support TLS.

Many SIP clients were found to accept expired certificates with no warning or error.

When used with SIP, TLS and S/MIME provide the identity of the peer that a client is communicating with in the Subject Alternative Name in the certificate. The software must check that this name corresponds to the identity the server is trying to contact. If a client is trying to set up a TLS connection to good.example.com and it gets a TLS connection set up with a server that presents a valid certificate but with the name evil.example.com, it must generate an error or warning of some type. Similarly with S/MIME, if a user is trying to communicate with sip:fluffy@example.com, one of the items in the Subject Alternate Name set in the certificate must match.

Some implementations used binary MIME encodings while others used base64. Implementations should send only binary but must be prepared to receive either.

In several places in this draft, the messages contain the encoding for the SHA-1 digest algorithm identifier. The preferred form for encoding as set out in [Section 2 of RFC 3370](#) [10] is the form in which the optional AlgorithmIdentifier parameter field is omitted. However, [RFC 3370](#) also says the recipients need to be able to receive the form in which the AlgorithmIdentifier parameter field is present and set to NULL. Examples of the form using NULL can be found in [Section 4.2 of RFC 4134](#) [12]. Receivers really do need to be able to receive the form that includes the NULL because the NULL form, while not preferred, is what was observed as being generated by most implementations. Implementers should also note that if the algorithm is MD5 instead of SHA1, then the form that omits the AlgorithmIdentifier parameters field is not allowed and the sender has to use the form where the NULL is included.

The preferred encryption algorithm for S/MIME in SIP is AES as defined in [RFC 3853](#) [9].

Observed interoperability has been better when UAs did not attach the senders' certificates. Attaching the certificates significantly increases the size of the messages, and since it can not be relied on, it does not turn out to be useful in most situations.

8. Additional test scenarios

This section provides the beginning of a list of tests that implementations should perform while developing systems that use S/MIME and TLS for SIP.

Much of the required behavior for inspecting certificates when using S/MIME and TLS with SIP is currently underspecified. The non-normative recommendations in this document capture the current folklore around that required behavior, guided by related normative works such as [14] (particularly the section on Domain Names and Subordination) and [15] [section 3.1](#). To summarize that non-normative lore:

- o For S/MIME the peer's URI must appear in the subjectAltName of the peer's certificate as a uniformResourceIdentifier field.
- o For TLS the peer's hostname (as fed into 3263 for resolution for locating the peer) must appear as
 - * an exact match in a dNSName entry in the subjectAltName if there are any dNSNames in the subjectAltName. (Wildcard matching is not allowed against these dNSName entries)
 - * the most specific CommonName in the Subject field if there are no dNSName entries in the subjectAltName at all (which is not the same as there being no matching dNSName entries). This match can be either exact, or against an entry that uses the wildcard matching character '*'

For each of these tests, an implementation will proceed past the verification point only if the certificate is "good". S/MIME protected requests presenting bad certificate data will be rejected. S/MIME protected responses presenting bad certificate information will be ignored. TLS connections involving bad certificate data will not be completed.

1. S/MIME : Good peer certificate
2. S/MIME : Bad peer certificate (peer URI does not appear in subjAltName)
3. S/MIME : Bad peer certificate (valid authority chain does not end at a trusted CA)

4. S/MIME : Bad peer certificate (the current time does not fall within the period of validity)
5. S/MIME : Bad peer certificate (certificate or cert in authority chain has been revoked)
6. TLS : Good peer certificate (hostname appears in dNSName in subjAltName)
7. TLS : Good peer certificate (no dNSNames in subjAltName, hostname appears in CN of Subject)
8. TLS : Bad peer certificate (no match in dNSNames or in the Subject CN)
9. TLS : Bad peer certificate (valid authority chain does not end at a trusted CA)
10. TLS : Bad peer certificate (the current time does not fall within the period of validity)
11. TLS : Bad peer certificate (certificate or cert in authority chain has been revoked)

9. IANA Considerations

No IANA actions are required.

10. Acknowledgments

Many thanks to the developers of all the open source software used to create these call flows. This includes the underlying crypto and TLS software used from openssl.org, the SIP stack from www.resiprocate.org, and the SIMPLE IMPP agent from www.sipimp.org. The TLS flow dumps were done with SSLDump from <http://www.rtfm.com/ssldump>. The book "SSL and TLS" [16] was a huge help in developing the code for these flows. It's sad there is no second edition.

Thanks to Jim Schaad, Russ Housley, Eric Rescorla, Dan Wing, Tat Chan, and Lyndsay Campbell who all helped find and correct mistakes in this document.

Vijay Gurbani and Alan Jeffrey contributed much of the additional test scenario content.

11. Changelog

(RFC Editor: remove this section)

-00 to -01

- * Incorporated the Test cases from Vijay Gurbani's and Alan Jeffrey's Use of TLS in SIP draft
- * Began to capture the folklore around where identities are carried in certificates for use with SIP
- * Removed the message dump archive pending verification (will return in -02)

12. Known Problems with this version

The flows, encryption and signatures captured in this document were manually collected from actual test runs. Those runs need to be reproduced so the source messages can be modified (as below for instance). This reproduction is being automated, but is not yet complete.

The messages are missing the accept header fields. They should have the following values:

Accept: multipart/signed
Accept: text/plain
Accept: application/pkcs7-mime
Accept: application/sdp
Accept: multipart/alternative

13. References

13.1. Normative References

- [1] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 2119](#), March 1997.
- [2] Rosenberg, J., Schulzrinne, H., Camarillo, G., Johnston, A., Peterson, J., Sparks, R., Handley, M., and E. Schooler, "SIP: Session Initiation Protocol", [RFC 3261](#), June 2002.
- [3] Housley, R., Polk, W., Ford, W., and D. Solo, "Internet X.509 Public Key Infrastructure Certificate and Certificate Revocation List (CRL) Profile", [RFC 3280](#), April 2002.
- [4] Dierks, T., Allen, C., Treese, W., Karlton, P., Freier, A., and P. Kocher, "The TLS Protocol Version 1.0", [RFC 2246](#), January 1999.
- [5] Blake-Wilson, S., Nystrom, M., Hopwood, D., Mikkelsen, J., and T. Wright, "Transport Layer Security (TLS) Extensions",

[RFC 3546](#), June 2003.

- [6] Chown, P., "Advanced Encryption Standard (AES) Ciphersuites for Transport Layer Security (TLS)", [RFC 3268](#), June 2002.
- [7] Ramsdell, B., "Secure/Multipurpose Internet Mail Extensions (S/MIME) Version 3.1 Message Specification", [RFC 3851](#), July 2004.
- [8] Housley, R., "Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS)", [RFC 3369](#), August 2002.
- [9] Peterson, J., "S/MIME Advanced Encryption Standard (AES) Requirement for the Session Initiation Protocol (SIP)", [RFC 3853](#), July 2004.
- [10] Housley, R., "Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS) Algorithms", [RFC 3370](#), August 2002.
- [11] Sparks, R., Hawrylyshen, A., Johnston, A., Rosenberg, J., and H. Schulzrinne, "Session Initiation Protocol (SIP) Torture Test Messages", [RFC 4475](#), May 2006.

[13.2.](#) Informative References

- [12] Hoffman, P., "Examples of S/MIME Messages", [RFC 4134](#), July 2005.
- [13] Campbell, B., Rosenberg, J., Schulzrinne, H., Huitema, C., and D. Gurle, "Session Initiation Protocol (SIP) Extension for Instant Messaging", [RFC 3428](#), December 2002.
- [14] Peterson, J. and C. Jennings, "Enhancements for Authenticated Identity Management in the Session Initiation Protocol (SIP)", [draft-ietf-sip-identity-06](#) (work in progress), October 2005.
- [15] Rescorla, E., "HTTP Over TLS", [RFC 2818](#), May 2000.
- [16] Rescorla, E., "SSL and TLS - Designing and Building Secure Systems", 2001.

[Appendix A.](#) Making Test Certificates

These scripts allow you to make certificates for test purposes. The certificates will all share a common CA root so that everyone running these scripts can have interoperable certificates. WARNING - these certificates are totally insecure and are for test purposes only.

All the CA created by this script share the same private key to facilitate interoperability testing, but this totally breaks the security since the private key of the CA is well known.

The instructions assume a Unix-like environment with openssl installed, but openssl does work in Windows too. Make sure you have openssl installed by trying to run "openssl". Run the makeCA script found in [Appendix A.1](#); this creates a subdirectory called demoCA. If the makeCA script cannot find where your openssl is installed you will have to set an environment variable called OPENSSLDIR to whatever directory contains the file openssl.cnf. You can find this with a "locate openssl.cnf". You are now ready to make certificates.

To create certs for use with TLS, run the makeCert script found in [Appendix A.2](#) with the fully qualified domain name of the proxy you are making the certificate for. For example, "makeCert host.example.net". This will generate a private key and a certificate. The private key will be left in a file named domain_key_example.net.pem in pem format. The certificate will be in domain_cert_example.net.pem. Some programs expect both the certificate and private key combined together in a PKCS12 format file. This is created by the script and left in a file named example.net.p12. Some programs expect this file to have a .pfx extension instead of .p12 - just rename the file if needed. A file with a certificate signing request, called example.net.csr, is also created and can be used to get the certificate signed by another CA.

A second argument indicating the number of days for which the certificate should be valid can be passed to the makeCert script. It is possible to make an expired certificate using the command "makeCert host.example.net 0".

Anywhere that a password is used to protect a certificate, the password is set to the string "password".

The root certificate for the CA is in the file root_cert_fluffyCA.pem.

For things that need DER format certificates, a certificate can be converted from PEM to DER with "openssl x509 -in cert.pem -inform PEM -out cert.der -outform DER".

Some programs expect certificates in PKCS#7 format (with a file extension of .p7c). You can convert these from PEM format to PKCS#7 with "openssl crl2pkcs7 -nocrl -certfile cert.pem -certfile demoCA/cacert.pem -outform DER -out cert.p7c"

IE, Outlook, and Netscape can import and export .p12 files and .p7c

files. You can convert a pkcs7 certificate to PEM format with
"openssl pkcs7 -in cert.p7c -inform DER -outform PEM -out cert.pem".

The private key can be converted to pkcs8 format with "openssl pkcs8
-in a_key.pem -topk8 -outform DER -out a_key.p8c"

In general, a TLS client will just need the root certificate of the CA. A TLS server will need its private key and its certificate. These could be in two PEM files or one .p12 file. An S/MIME program will need its private key and certificate, the root certificate of the CA, and the certificate for every other user it communicates with.

[A.1.](#) makeCA script

```
#!/bin/sh
#set -x

rm -rf demoCA

mkdir demoCA
mkdir demoCA/certs
mkdir demoCA/crl
mkdir demoCA/newcerts
mkdir demoCA/private
echo "01" > demoCA/serial
hexdump -n 4 -e '4/1 "%04u"' /dev/random > demoCA/serial
touch demoCA/index.txt

# You may need to modify this for where your default file is
# you can find where yours in by typing "openssl ca"
for D in /etc/ssl /usr/local/ssl /sw/etc/ssl /sw/share/ssl; do
    CONF=${OPENSSLDIR:=${D}}/openssl.cnf
    [ -f ${CONF} ] && break
done

if [ ! -f $CONF ]; then
    echo "Can not find file $CONF - set your OPENSSLDIR variable"
    exit
fi
cp $CONF openssl.cnf

cat >> openssl.cnf <<EOF
[ cj_cert ]
subjectAltName=\${ENV::ALTNAME}
basicConstraints=CA:FALSE
subjectKeyIdentifier=hash
```



```
#authorityKeyIdentifier=keyid,issuer:always
```

```
[ cj_req ]
```

```
basicConstraints = CA:FALSE
```

```
subjectAltName=\${ENV:ALTNAME}
```

```
subjectKeyIdentifier=hash
```

```
#authorityKeyIdentifier=keyid,issuer:always
```

```
#keyUsage = nonRepudiation, digitalSignature, keyEncipherment
```

```
EOF
```

```
cat > demoCA/private/cakey.pem <<EOF
```

```
-----BEGIN RSA PRIVATE KEY-----
```

```
Proc-Type: 4, ENCRYPTED
```

```
DEK-Info: DES-EDE3-CBC, 4B47A0A73ADE342E
```

```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```

```
-----END RSA PRIVATE KEY-----
```

```
EOF
```

```
cat > demoCA/cacert.pem <<EOF
```

```
-----BEGIN CERTIFICATE-----
```

```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```



```

AQUFAA0BgQCWbRvv1ZGTRXxbH8/EqkdSCzSoUPrs+rQqR0xdQac9wNY/nlZbkR30
qAezG6Sfmlkvf+D0g5RxQq/+Y6I03LRepc7KeVDpaplMFGnpfKsibETMipwzayNQ
QgUf4cKBiF+65Ue7hZuDJa2EMv8qW4twEhGDYclpFU9YozyS10hvUg==
-----END CERTIFICATE-----
EOF

```

```

# uncomment the following lines to generate your own key pair

```

```

#openssl req -newkey rsa:1024 -passin pass:password \
# -passout pass:password \
# -sha1 -x509 -keyout demoCA/private/akey.pem \
# -out demoCA/cacert.pem -days 3650 <<EOF
#US
#California
#San Jose
#sipit
#Sipit Test Certificate Authority
#
#
#EOF

```

```

openssl crl2pkcs7 -nocrl -certfile demoCA/cacert.pem \
    -outform DER -out demoCA/cacert.p7c

```

```

cp demoCA/cacert.pem root_cert_fluffyCA.pem

```

[A.2.](#) makeCert script

```

#!/bin/sh
#set -x

if [ $# == 1 ]; then
    DAYS=1095
elif [ $# == 2 ]; then
    DAYS=$2
else
    echo "Usage: makeCert test.example.org [days]"
    echo "      makeCert alice@example.org [days]"
    echo "days is how long the certificate is valid"
    echo "days set to 0 generates an invalid certificate"
    exit 0
fi

ADDR=$1

echo "making cert for ${ADDR}"

```



```
rm -f ${ADDR}_*.pem
rm -f ${ADDR}.p12

case ${ADDR} in
*:*) ALTNAME="URI:${ADDR}" ;;
*@*) ALTNAME="URI:sip:${ADDR},URI:im:${ADDR},URI:pres:${ADDR}" ;;
*) ALTNAME="DNS:${ADDR}" ;;
esac

rm -f demoCA/index.txt
touch demoCA/index.txt
rm -f demoCA/newcerts/*

export ALTNAME

openssl genrsa -out ${ADDR}_key.pem 1024
openssl req -new -config openssl.cnf -reqexts cj_req \
    -sha1 -key ${ADDR}_key.pem \
    -out ${ADDR}.csr -days ${DAYS} <<EOF
US
California
San Jose
sipit

${ADDR}

EOF

if [ $DAYS == 0 ]; then
openssl ca -extensions cj_cert -config openssl.cnf \
    -passin pass:password -policy policy_anything \
    -md sha1 -batch -notext -out ${ADDR}_cert.pem \
    -startdate 990101000000Z \
    -enddate 000101000000Z \
    -infiles ${ADDR}.csr
else
openssl ca -extensions cj_cert -config openssl.cnf \
    -passin pass:password -policy policy_anything \
    -md sha1 -days ${DAYS} -batch -notext -out ${ADDR}_cert.pem \
    -infiles ${ADDR}.csr
fi

openssl pkcs12 -passin pass:password \
    -passout pass:password -export \
    -out ${ADDR}.p12 -in ${ADDR}_cert.pem \
    -inkey ${ADDR}_key.pem -name ${ADDR} -certfile demoCA/cacert.pem
```



```

openssl x509 -in ${ADDR}_cert.pem -noout -text

case ${ADDR} in
  *@*) mv ${ADDR}_key.pem user_key_${ADDR}.pem; \
        mv ${ADDR}_cert.pem user_cert_${ADDR}.pem ;;
  *)   mv ${ADDR}_key.pem domain_key_${ADDR}.pem; \
        mv ${ADDR}_cert.pem domain_cert_${ADDR}.pem ;;
esac

```

Appendix B. Certificates for Testing

This section contains various certificates used for testing in PEM format.

Fluffy's certificate.

```

-----BEGIN CERTIFICATE-----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-----END CERTIFICATE-----

```

Fluffy's private key

-----BEGIN RSA PRIVATE KEY-----
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-----END RSA PRIVATE KEY-----

Kumiko's certificate

-----BEGIN CERTIFICATE-----
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-----END CERTIFICATE-----

Kumiko's private key

-----BEGIN RSA PRIVATE KEY-----
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-----END RSA PRIVATE KEY-----

Certificate for example.com

-----BEGIN CERTIFICATE-----
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-----END CERTIFICATE-----

Private key for example.com

-----BEGIN RSA PRIVATE KEY-----
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-----END RSA PRIVATE KEY-----

Certificate for example.net

-----BEGIN CERTIFICATE-----
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�xg=

-----END CERTIFICATE-----<

Private key for example.net


```
-----BEGIN RSA PRIVATE KEY-----
MIICXgIBAAKBgQDbDgj9vP+/HNWYRQQXnoRiN/jJR+2kby0GYiLCwDwAovBzsJ0d
x5b60uZ0N9RAtbD4c/iTlS2BBADqma+I85FQ205KP3V0TsQmTdkp48TcxnYzkkvo
IQWfccQWcc5Aq/dMwogZKlRkmMeabXnJE+ICXHRDa8nb2HhbnZfUM8zrYwIDAQAB
AoGBAIRUP1CIutEldi3wXaKwFTI+ZPc0FeFz6mDdy0gAS0bf/WJk03lYqFA434Ni
aqvEOu+LmEu2gzNUFTyZwE0ciMg3NQ0H57z70vbnHa0LajiJR0o7zkR0rmE5GTIV
v2WstOKJYSmdcTVa4VZd9cHH6zWXHtWDT+Y2MxrIerFn0YxBAKEA72cBQSE4SStZ
KvodDuMjFXG97Z1F927Xe/47iWnYRKhVB/jwN9uYpJog2cQFgsIsRMltozi3huTP
L8IKkI5N4QJBA0o95ShiRPcbXIXY1IcUGx1RuIr+paIAJwjuutwrtCA1CbIKB0j
vfGvR3mKBGV2XLmz15nNV+5WFiLRBiUgucMCQQCxf+63KnLADurS6ZTH5/KoQKfw
WE568WzFwy8raBXyefJpsdHxqFiZmk1HDIaFd5A5BBvNDA1077EKGNWablghAkeA
zbvpPqv4+LRuchy8pZtyKTE0JWHNZ1kN79mGE04ajITqUNmx6c4PsVUQFwayz87C
qFQdxDdHyMyRiqjd5dQ1cwJAfJsXNGc0hilkv3xBy95tb3IsVP6G5DqwtID4hrYa
Onf9xrVzh9M29Xp+AHcwS4Y0+UgiNrd5BlbZs+ALZPD/jw==
-----END RSA PRIVATE KEY-----
```

[Appendix C](#). Message Dumps

This section contains a base64 encoded gzipped, compressed tar file of various CMS messages used in this document. Saving the data in a file foo.tgz.b64 then running a command like "openssl base64 -d -in foo.tgz.b64 | tar txzf -" would recover the CMS messages and allow them to be used as test vectors.

(dump removed pending verification)

Authors' Addresses

Cullen Jennings
Cisco Systems
170 West Tasman Drive
Mailstop SJC-21/2
San Jose, CA 95134
USA

Phone: +1 408 421 9990
Email: fluffy@cisco.com

Kumiko Ono
NTT Corporation
Musashino-shi, Tokyo 180-8585
Japan

Phone: +81 422 59 4508
Email: ono.kumiko@lab.ntt.co.jp

Robert Sparks (editor)
Estacado Systems

Email: RjS@estacado.net

Intellectual Property Statement

The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any Intellectual Property Rights or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; nor does it represent that it has made any independent effort to identify any such rights. Information on the procedures with respect to rights in RFC documents can be found in [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Copies of IPR disclosures made to the IETF Secretariat and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementers or users of this specification can be obtained from the IETF on-line IPR repository at <http://www.ietf.org/ipr>.

The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights that may cover technology that may be required to implement this standard. Please address the information to the IETF at ietf-ipr@ietf.org.

Disclaimer of Validity

This document and the information contained herein are provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE CONTRIBUTOR, THE ORGANIZATION HE/SHE REPRESENTS OR IS SPONSORED BY (IF ANY), THE INTERNET SOCIETY AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIM ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

Copyright Statement

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2006). This document is subject to the rights, licenses and restrictions contained in [BCP 78](#), and except as set forth therein, the authors retain all their rights.

Acknowledgment

Funding for the RFC Editor function is currently provided by the Internet Society.

