Y. Cui Softwire Internet-Draft J. Dona

Intended status: Standards Track P. Wu Expires: September 6, 2015 M. Xu

> Tsinghua University A. Yla-Jaaski Aalto University March 5, 2015

Softwire Mesh Management Information Base (MIB) draft-ietf-softwire-mesh-mib-08

Abstract

This memo defines a portion of the Management Information Base (MIB) for use with network management protocols in the Internet community. In particular it defines objects for managing softwire mesh.

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of \underline{BCP} 78 and \underline{BCP} 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at http://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on September 6, 2015.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2015 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of

the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Table of Contents

<u>1</u> .	Introduction	2
<u>2</u> .	The Internet-Standard Management Framework	2
<u>3</u> .	Terminology	3
<u>4</u> .	Conventions	3
<u>5</u> .	Structure of the MIB Module	3
<u>5</u> .	<u>.1</u> . The swmSupportedTunnelTable Subtree	<u>3</u>
<u>5</u> .	<u>.2</u> . The swmEncapsTable Subtree	3
<u>5</u> .	.3. The swmBGPNeighborTable Subtree	3
<u>5</u> .	<u>.4</u> . The swmConformance Subtree	4
<u>6</u> .	Relationship to Other MIB Modules	4
<u>6</u> .	<u>.1</u> . Relationship to the IF-MIB	4
<u>6</u> .	<u>.2</u> . Relationship to the IP Tunnel MIB	4
6	.3. MIB modules required for IMPORTS	<u>5</u>
<u>7</u> .	Definitions	<u>5</u>
<u>8</u> .	Security Considerations	<u>12</u>
<u>9</u> .	IANA Considerations	<u>13</u>
<u> 10</u> .	Acknowledgements	14
<u>11</u> .	References	14
11	<u>1.1</u> . Normative References	14
<u>11</u>	<u>1.2</u> . Informative References	<u> 15</u>
Auth	nors' Addresses	15

1. Introduction

The Softwire mesh framework <u>RFC 5565</u> [<u>RFC5565</u>] is a tunneling mechanism that enables the connectivity between islands of IPv4 networks across a single IPv6 backbone and vice versa. In softwire mesh, extended multiprotocol-BGP (MP-BGP)is used to set up tunnels and advertise prefixes among address family border routers (AFBRs).

This memo defines a portion of the Management Information Base (MIB) for use with network management protocols in the Internet community. In particular it defines objects for managing softwire mesh [RFC5565].

2. The Internet-Standard Management Framework

For a detailed overview of the documents that describe the current Internet-Standard Management Framework, please refer to section 7 of RFC 3410 [RFC3410].

Managed objects are accessed via a virtual information store, termed the Management Information Base or MIB. MIB objects are generally

accessed through the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP). They are defined using the mechanisms stated in the Structure of Management Information (SMI). This memo specifies a MIB module that is compliant to the SMIv2, which is described in STD 58, RFC 2578 [RFC2578], STD 58, RFC 2579 [RFC2579] and STD 58, RFC 2580 [RFC2580].

3. Terminology

This document uses terminology from the softwire problem statement $\frac{RFC \ 4925}{RFC5565}$ and the softwire mesh framework $\frac{RFC \ 5565}{RFC5565}$.

4. Conventions

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in RFC 2119 [RFC2119].

5. Structure of the MIB Module

The softwire mesh MIB provides a method to configure and manage the softwire mesh objects through SNMP.

5.1. The swmSupportedTunnelTable Subtree

Since the AFBR needs to negotiate with a BGP peer what kind of tunnel they will use, it announces the types of tunnels it supports. The swmSupportedTunnelTable subtree provides the information. According to section 4 of RFC 5512 [RFC5512], current softwire mesh tunnel types include IP-IP, GRE and L2TPv3.

5.2. The swmEncapsTable Subtree

The swmEncapsTable subtree provides softwire mesh NLRI-NH information about the AFBR. It keeps the mapping between the External-IP (E-IP) prefix and the Internal-IP (I-IP) address of the next hop. The mappings determine which I-IP destination address will be used to encapsulate the received packet according to its E-IP destination address. The definitions of E-IP and I-IP are explained in section 4.1 of RFC 5565[RFC5565].

5.3. The swmBGPNeighborTable Subtree

The subtree provides the softwire mesh BGP neighbor information of an AFBR. It includes the address of the softwire mesh BGP peer, and the kind of tunnel that the AFBR would use to communicate with this BGP peer.

5.4. The swmConformance Subtree

The subtree provides the conformance information of MIB objects.

6. Relationship to Other MIB Modules

6.1. Relationship to the IF-MIB

The Interfaces MIB [RFC2863] defines generic managed objects for managing interfaces. Each logical interface (physical or virtual) has an ifEntry. Tunnels are handled by creating logical interfaces (ifEntry). Being a tunnel, softwire mesh has an entry in the Interface MIB, as well as an entry in IP Tunnel MIB. Those corresponding entries are indexed by ifIndex.

The ifOperStatus in the ifTable represents whether the mesh function of the AFBR has been triggered. If the software mesh capability is negotiated during the BGP OPEN phase, the mesh function is considered to be started, and the ifOperStatus is "up". Otherwise the ifOperStatus is "down".

In the case of an IPv4-over-IPv6 softwire mesh tunnel, ifInUcastPkts counts the number of IPv6 packets which are sent to the virtual interface for decapsulation into IPv4. The ifOutUcastPkts counts the number of IPv6 packets which are generated by encapsulating IPv4 packets sent to the virtual interface. Particularly, if these IPv4 packets need fragmentation, ifOutUcastPkts counts the number of packets after fragmentation.

In the case of an IPv6-over-IPv4 softwire mesh tunnel, ifInUcastPkts counts the number of IPv4 packets, which are sent to the virtual interface for decapsulation into IPv6. The ifOutUcastPkts counts the number of IPv4 packets, which are generated by encapsulating IPv6 packets sent to the virtual interface. Particularly, if these IPv6 packets need to be fragmented, tifOutUcastPkts counts the number of packets after fragmentation. Similar definitions apply to other counter objects in the ifTable.

<u>6.2</u>. Relationship to the IP Tunnel MIB

The IP Tunnel MIB [RFC4087] contains objects applicable to all IP tunnels, including softwire mesh. Meanwhile, the Softwire Mesh MIB extends the IP Tunnel MIB to further describe encapsulation-specific information.

Running a point to multi-point tunnel, it is necessary for a softwire mesh AFBR to maintain an encapsulation table, used to perform correct "forwarding" among AFBRs. This forwarding function on an AFBR is

performed by using the E-IP destination address to look up in the encapsulation table for the I-IP encapsulation destination address. An AFBR also needs to know the BGP peer information of the other AFBRs, so that it can negotiate the NLRI-NH information and the tunnel parameters with them.

The Softwire mesh MIB requires the implementation of the IP Tunnel MIB. The tunnelIfEncapsMethod in the tunnelIfEntry MUST be set to softwireMesh("xx"), and a corresponding entry in the softwire mesh MIB module will be presented for the tunnelIfEntry. The tunnelIfRemoteInetAddress MUST be set to 0.0.0.0 for IPv4 or :: for IPv6 because it is a point to multi-point tunnel.

-- RFC Ed.: Please replace "xx" with IANA assigned number here.

The tunnelIfAddressType in the tunnelIfTable represents the type of address in the corresponding tunnelIfLocalInetAddress and tunnelIfRemoteInetAddress objects. The tunnelIfAddressType is identical to swmEncapsIIPDstType in softwire mesh, which can support either IPv4-over-IPv6 or IPv6-over-IPv4. When the swmEncapsEIPDstType is IPv6 and the swmEncapsIIPDstType is IPv4, the tunnel type is IPv6-over-IPv4; When the swmEncapsEIPDstType is IPv4 and the swmEncapsIIPDstType is IPv6, the encapsulation mode would be IPv4-over-IPv6.

6.3. MIB modules required for IMPORTS

The following MIB module IMPORTS objects from SNMPv2-SMI [RFC2578], SNMPv2-CONF [RFC2580], IF-MIB [RFC2863] and INET-ADDRESS-MIB [RFC4001].

7. Definitions

SOFTWIRE-MESH-MIB DEFINITIONS ::= BEGIN

IMPORTS

MODULE-IDENTITY, OBJECT-TYPE, transmission FROM SNMPv2-SMI

OBJECT-GROUP, MODULE-COMPLIANCE FROM SNMPv2-CONF

InetAddress, InetAddressType, InetAddressPrefixLength FROM INETADDRESS-MIB

ifIndex FROM IF-MIB

IANAtunnelType FROM IANAifType-MIB;

SWMMIB MODULE-IDENTITY

LAST-UPDATED "201503060000Z" -- March 6, 2015

```
ORGANIZATION "Softwire Working Group"
    CONTACT-INFO "
                Yong Cui
                 Email: yong@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn
                 Jiang Dong
                 Email: dongjiang@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn
                 Peng Wu
                 Email: weapon@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn
                 Mingwei Xu
                 Email: xmw@cernet.edu.cn
                Antti Yla-Jaaski
                 Email: antti.yla-jaaski@aalto.fi
                 Email comments directly to the softwire WG Mailing
                 List at softwires@ietf.org
    DESCRIPTION
               "This MIB module contains managed object definitions for
                the softwire mesh framework.
                Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2015). This version
          of this MIB module is part of RFC yyyy; see the RFC
          itself for full legal notices."
    -- RFC Ed.: please replace yyyy with actual RFC number & remove this note.
    REVISION
                "201503060000Z"
   DESCRIPTION
               "The MIB module is defined for management of object in
               the Softwire mesh framework."
    ::= { transmission XXX }
    --RFC Ed.: Please replace "XXX" with IANA assigned number here.
swmObjects OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmMIB 1 }
-- swmSupportedTunnelTable
swmSupportedTunnelTable OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF SwmSupportedTunnelEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
               current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
        "A table of objects that shows what kind of tunnels
       can be supported by the AFBR."
    ::= { swmObjects 1 }
swmSupportedTunnelEntry OBJECT-TYPE
                SwmSupportedTunnelEntry
    SYNTAX
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
                current
    DESCRIPTION
        "A set of objects that show what kind of tunnels
        can be supported in the AFBR. If the AFBR supports
        multiple tunnel types, the swmSupportedTunnelTable
        would have several entries."
    INDEX { swmSupportedTunnelType }
    ::= { swmSupportedTunnelTable 1 }
SwmSupportedTunnelEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
    swmSupportedTunnelType
                                        IANAtunnelType
}
swmSupportedTunnelType OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                IANAtunnelType
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
                current
    DESCRIPTION
        "Represents the tunnel type that the AFBR supports,
        such as MPLS, L2TPv3, GRE, and IP-in-IP. There is
        no restriction of tunnel type the Softwire mesh can use."
    ::= { swmSupportedTunnelEntry 1 }
-- end of swmSupportedTunnelTable
--swmEncapsTable
swmEncapsTable OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                SEQUENCE OF SwmEncapsEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
             current
    DESCRIPTION
        "A table of objects that display and control the
        softwire mesh encapsulation information."
    ::= { swmObjects 2 }
swmEncapsEntry OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                SwmEncapsEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
               current
    DESCRIPTION
        "A table of objects that manage the softwire mesh I-IP
```

```
encapsulation destination based on the E-IP destination prefix."
    INDEX { ifIndex,
            swmEncapsEIPDstType,
            swmEncapsEIPDst,
            swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength
          }
    ::= { swmEncapsTable 1 }
SwmEncapsEntry ::=
                        SEQUENCE {
   swmEncapsEIPDstType
                             InetAddressType,
    swmEncapsEIPDst
                             InetAddress,
    swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength InetAddressPrefixLength,
   swmEncapsIIPDstType
                             InetAddressType,
                             InetAddress
    swmEncapsIIPDst
}
swmEncapsEIPDstType OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX
               InetAddressType
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS
               current
    DESCRIPTION
       "This object specifies the address type used for
        swmEncapsEIPDst. It is different from the tunnelIfAddressType
        in the tunnelIfTable."
    ::= { swmEncapsEntry 1 }
swmEncapsEIPDst OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX
              InetAddress
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
           current
   STATUS
    DESCRIPTION
       "The E-IP destination prefix, which is
       used for I-IP encapsulation destination looking up."
    ::= { swmEncapsEntry 2 }
swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
               InetAddressPrefixLength
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
               current
   DESCRIPTION
        "The prefix length of the E-IP destination prefix."
    ::= { swmEncapsEntry 3 }
swmEncapsIIPDstType OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                InetAddressType
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
               current
    DESCRIPTION
```

```
"This object specifies the address type used for
         swmEncapsIIPDst. It is the same as the tunnelIfAddressType
         in the tunnelIfTable."
    ::= { swmEncapsEntry 4 }
swmEncapsIIPDst OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                InetAddress
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
                current
    DESCRIPTION
        "The I-IP destination address, which is used as the encapsulation
         destination for the corresponding E-IP prefix. Since the
         tunnelIfRemoteInetAddress in the tunnelIfTable should be 0.0.0.0
or ::,
         swmEncapIIPDst should be the destination address used in the outer
         IP header."
    ::= { swmEncapsEntry 5 }
-- End of swmEncapsTable
-- swmBGPNeighborTable
swmBGPNeighborTable OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                SEQUENCE OF SwmBGPNeighborEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
                current
    DESCRIPTION
        "A table of objects that display the softwire mesh
        BGP neighbor information."
    ::= { swmObjects 3 }
swmBGPNeighborEntry OBJECT-TYPE
                SwmBGPNeighborEntry
    SYNTAX
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
                current
    DESCRIPTION
        "A set of objects that display the softwire mesh
        BGP neighbor information."
    INDEX {
            ifIndex,
            swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType,
            swmBGPNeighborInetAddress
    ::= { swmBGPNeighborTable 1 }
SwmBGPNeighborEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
        swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType
                                         InetAddressType,
        swmBGPNeighborInetAddress
                                         InetAddress,
        swmBGPNeighborTunnelType
                                         IANAtunnelType
}
```

Cui, et al. Expires September 6, 2015 [Page 9]

```
swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                InetAddressType
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
                current
    DESCRIPTION
        "This object specifies the address type used for
         swmBGPNeighborInetAddress."
    ::= { swmBGPNeighborEntry 1 }
swmBGPNeighborInetAddress OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                InetAddress
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
               current
    DESCRIPTION
        "The address of the AFBR's BGP neighbor. The
        address type is the same as the tunnelIfAddressType
        in the tunnelIfTable."
    ::= { swmBGPNeighborEntry 2 }
swmBGPNeighborTunnelType OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
                IANAtunnelType
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
                current
    DESCRIPTION
        "Represents the type of tunnel that the
       AFBR chooses to transmit traffic with another AFBR/BGP neighbor."
    ::= { swmBGPNeighborEntry 3 }
-- End of swmBGPNeighborTable
-- conformance information
swmConformance
                    OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmMIB 2 }
swmCompliances
                    OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmConformance 1 }
swmGroups
                    OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmConformance 2 }
 -- compliance statements
swmCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE
  STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
       "Describes the requirements for conformance to the softwire
       mesh MIB.
       The following index objects cannot be added as OBJECT
       clauses but nevertheless have compliance requirements:
       -- OBJECT swmEncapsEIPDstType
```

-- SYNTAX InetAddressType { ipv4(1), ipv6(2) }

```
-- DESCRIPTION
      -- "An implementation is required to support
      -- global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
      -- on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."
      -- OBJECT swmEncapsEIPDst
      -- SYNTAX InetAddress (SIZE(4|16))
      -- DESCRIPTION
      -- "An implementation is required to support
      -- global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
      -- on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."
      -- OBJECT swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength
      -- SYNTAX InetAddressPrefixLength (Unsigned32 (0..128))
      -- DESCRIPTION
      -- "An implementation is required to support
      -- global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
      -- on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."
      -- OBJECT swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType
      -- SYNTAX InetAddressType { ipv4(1), ipv6(2) }
      -- DESCRIPTION
      -- "An implementation is required to support
      -- global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
      -- on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."
      -- OBJECT swmBGPNeighborInetAddress
      -- SYNTAX InetAddress (SIZE(4|16))
      -- DESCRIPTION
      -- "An implementation is required to support
      -- global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
      -- on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."
  MODULE -- this module
  MANDATORY-GROUPS
                        swmSupportedTunnelGroup,
                        swmEncapsGroup,
                        swmBGPNeighborGroup
                      }
   ::= { swmCompliances 1 }
swmSupportedTunnelGroup OBJECT-GROUP
  OBJECTS {
      swmSupportedTunnelType
  STATUS current
  DESCRIPTION
```

```
"The collection of objects which are used to show
      what kind of tunnel the AFBR supports."
   ::= { swmGroups 1 }
swmEncapsGroup
                  OBJECT-GROUP
   OBJECTS {
        swmEncapsIIPDst,
        swmEncapsIIPDstType
   }
  STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
       "The collection of objects which are used to display
       softwire mesh encapsulation information."
   ::= { swmGroups 2 }
swmBGPNeighborGroup
                       OBJECT-GROUP
  OBJECTS {
        swmBGPNeighborTunnelType
   }
  STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
       "The collection of objects which are used to display
       softwire mesh BGP neighbor information."
   ::= { swmGroups 3 }
```

 ${\sf END}$

Security Considerations

The swmMIB module can be used for configuration of certain objects, and anything that can be configured can be incorrectly configured, with potentially disastrous results. Because this MIB module reuses the IP tunnel MIB, the security considerations of the IP tunnel MIB is also applicable to the Softwire mesh MIB.

There are no management objects defined in this MIB module that have a MAX-ACCESS clause of read-write and/or read-create. So, if this MIB module is implemented correctly, then there is no risk that an intruder can alter or create any management objects of this MIB module via direct SNMP SET operations.

Some of the readable objects in this MIB module (i.e., objects with a MAX-ACCESS other than not-accessible) may be considered sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments. It is thus important to control even GET and/or NOTIFY access to these objects and possibly to even encrypt the values of these objects when sending them over

the network via SNMP. These are objects and their sensitivity/vulnerability:

Particularly, swmSupportedTunnelType, swmEncapsIIPDstType, swmEncapsIIPDst and swmBGPNeighborTunnelType can expose the types of tunnel used within the internal network, and potentially reveal the topology of the internal network.

SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 did not include adequate security. Even if the network itself is secure (for example by using IPsec), there is no control as to who on the secure network is allowed to access and GET/SET (read/change/create/delete) the objects in this MIB module.

Implementations SHOULD provide the security features described by the SNMPv3 framework (see [RFC3410]), and implementations claiming compliance to the SNMPv3 standard MUST include full support for authentication and privacy via the User-based Security Model (USM) [RFC3414] with the AES cipher algorithm [RFC3826]. Implementations MAY also provide support for the Transport Security Model (TSM)[RFC5591] in combination with a secure transport such as SSH [RFC5592] or TLS/DTLS [RFC6353].

Further, deployment of SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 is NOT RECOMMENDED. Instead, it is RECOMMENDED to deploy SNMPv3 and to enable cryptographic security. It is then a customer/operator responsibility to ensure that the SNMP entity giving access to an instance of this MIB module is properly configured to give access to the objects only to those principals (users) that have legitimate rights to indeed GET or SET (change/create/delete) them.

9. IANA Considerations

The MIB module in this document uses the following IANA-assigned OBJECT IDENTIFIER values recorded in the SMI Numbers registry, and the following IANA-assigned tunnelType values recorded in the IANAtunnelType-MIB registry:

```
Descriptor OBJECT IDENTIFIER value

swmMIB { transmission XXX }

IANAtunnelType ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
   SYNTAX INTEGER {

       softwireMesh ("xx") -- softwire Mesh tunnel
   }
```

Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): the IANA is requested to assign a value for "XXX" under the 'mib-2' subtree and to record the assignment in the SMI Numbers registry. When the assignment has been made, the RFC Editor is asked to replace "XXX" (here and in the MIB module) with the assigned value and to remove this note.

10. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Dave Thaler, Jean-Philippe Dionne, Qi Sun, Sheng Jiang, Yu Fu for their valuable comments.

11. References

11.1. Normative References

- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", <u>BCP 14</u>, <u>RFC 2119</u>, March 1997.
- [RFC2578] McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J.
 Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Structure of Management Information
 Version 2 (SMIv2)", STD 58, RFC 2578, April 1999.
- [RFC2579] McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Textual Conventions for SMIv2", STD 58, RFC 2579, April 1999.
- [RFC3414] Blumenthal, U. and B. Wijnen, "User-based Security Model (USM) for version 3 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv3)", STD 62, RFC 3414, December 2002.
- [RFC3826] Blumenthal, U., Maino, F., and K. McCloghrie, "The Advanced Encryption Standard (AES) Cipher Algorithm in the SNMP User-based Security Model", RFC 3826, June 2004.
- [RFC4925] Li, X., Dawkins, S., Ward, D., and A. Durand, "Softwire Problem Statement", RFC 4925, July 2007.
- [RFC5512] Mohapatra, P. and E. Rosen, "The BGP Encapsulation Subsequent Address Family Identifier (SAFI) and the BGP Tunnel Encapsulation Attribute", <u>RFC 5512</u>, April 2009.
- [RFC5565] Wu, J., Cui, Y., Metz, C., and E. Rosen, "Softwire Mesh Framework", <u>RFC 5565</u>, June 2009.

- [RFC5591] Harrington, D. and W. Hardaker, "Transport Security Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", STD 78, RFC 5591, June 2009.
- [RFC5592] Harrington, D., Salowey, J., and W. Hardaker, "Secure Shell Transport Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", RFC 5592, June 2009.
- [RFC6353] Hardaker, W., "Transport Layer Security (TLS) Transport Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", STD 78, RFC 6353, July 2011.

11.2. Informative References

- [RFC2223] Postel, J. and J. Reynolds, "Instructions to RFC Authors", RFC 2223, October 1997.
- [RFC2863] McCloghrie, K. and F. Kastenholz, "The Interfaces Group MIB", RFC 2863, June 2000.
- [RFC3410] Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D., and B. Stewart,
 "Introduction and Applicability Statements for InternetStandard Management Framework", RFC 3410, December 2002.
- [RFC2629] Rose, M., "Writing I-Ds and RFCs using XML", RFC 2629, June 1999.
- [RFC4087] Thaler, D., "IP Tunnel MIB", RFC 4087, June 2005.
- [RFC4181] Heard, C., "Guidelines for Authors and Reviewers of MIB Documents", <u>BCP 111</u>, <u>RFC 4181</u>, September 2005.

Authors' Addresses

Yong Cui Tsinghua University Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University Beijing 100084 P.R.China

Phone: +86-10-6260-3059

EMail: yong@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn

Jiang Dong Tsinghua University Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University Beijing 100084 P.R.China

Phone: +86-10-6278-5822

EMail: dongjiang@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn

Peng Wu Tsinghua University Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University Beijing 100084 P.R.China

Phone: +86-10-6278-5822

EMail: weapon@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn

Mingwei Xu Tsinghua University Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University Beijing 100084 P.R.China

Phone: +86-10-6278-5822 EMail: xmw@cernet.edu.cn

Antti Yla-Jaaski Aalto University Konemiehentie 2 Espoo 02150 Finland

Phone: +358-40-5954222

EMail: antti.yla-jaaski@aalto.fi