Network Working Group	J. Falk
Internet-Draft	Return Path
Intended status: Informational	July 4, 2010
Expires: January 5, 2011	

A Review of Published Criteria for Acceptance Into a Complaint Feedback Loop Program
draft-jdfalk-marf-acceptance-criteria-00

Abstract

All known Feedback Generators (the operators of complaint feedback loops) have some criteria for acceptance of requests to receive feedback. This document is a review of such criteria, where publicly available. It is intended to inform design decisions within the Mail Abuse Reporting Format (MARF) Working Group (IETF, "Messaging Abuse Reporting Format (Active WG)," .) [MARF-WG], and likely will never advance beyond internet-draft status.
The information included herein was gathered from public web sites.

Status of this Memo

Copyright Notice

Table of Contents

1.   Summary   TOC

Mailbox Provider	Confirmation Email Step	Reputation Score Check	Other Requirements
AOL	yes	unknown	unknown
BlueTie	yes	unknown	unknown
Comcast	yes	yes	unknown
Cox	yes	yes	unknown
Earthlink	unknown	unknown	unknown
Microsoft	unknown	unknown	presumably
Outblaze	unknown	unknown	yes
OpenSRS	yes	unknown	unknown
Rackspace	yes	unknown	unknown
Road Runner	yes	unknown	unknown

| USA.net | yes | unknown | unknown |
| Yahoo! | yes | unknown | yes |

Table 1

2. AOL

http://postmaster.info.aol.com/Postmaster.FeedbackLoop.html
First, AOL offers subscribers a drop-down list consisting of abuse@,
postmaster@, and "any other email address listed in the FBL email's
domain WHOIS record." A prospective subscriber may choose one of these
addresses to receive a confirmation message. The message includes a
unique URI which, when opened, confirms that the subscriber has
permission to receive feedback related to that domain.
Next, AOL attempts to prove ownership of the IP addresses (AOL's
feedback loop is based on last-hop IP address, not domain.) For this,
they require that one of five criteria is met:

   1. reverse DNS (PTR record) for each IP shares the domain name
      selected in the first step

   2. at least one authoritative nameserver for each IP shares the
      domain name

   3. IP WHOIS information for each IP contains the domain

   4. ASN WHOIS information contains the domain

3. BlueTie

BlueTie is perhaps best known as the mailbox provider behind Excite.
http://feedback.bluetie.com/
Like all feedback loops hosted by Return Path, the subscriber must
first select either postmaster@ or abuse@ their domain to receive a
confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when
opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback
related to that domain.
BlueTie has not published additional criteria.

4. Comcast

http://postmaster.comcast.net/feedback-loop.aspx
Like all feedback loops hosted by Return Path, the subscriber must
first select either postmaster@ or abuse@ their domain to receive a
confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when
opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback
related to that domain.
Comcast also publishes the following criteria:

   *IPs with a Sender Score (Return Path, "About Sender Score," .)
    [SS] of 60 or above will be accepted.

   *IPs with a Sender Score of 30 to 60 cannot appear on any DNSBLs.

   *IP with a Sender Score below 30 will not be approved.

---

5. Cox

http://postmaster.cox.net/confluence/display/postmaster/Feedback+Loop
Like all feedback loops hosted by Return Path, the subscriber must
first select either postmaster@ or abuse@ their domain to receive a
confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when
opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback
related to that domain.
Cox also publishes the following criteria:

   *An IP or range with a Sender Score (Return Path, "About Sender
    Score," .) [SS] of 60 or higher will be approved.

   *An IP or range with a Sender Score between 30 and 60 may be
    approved if not listed on any RBLs.

   *A score of less than 30, or no score due to not enough traffic
    from the IP, will be denied.

---

6. Earthlink

Multiple sources, including [WTTW] (Atkins, L., "ISP Information - Word
to the Wise," .), report that Earthlink provides feedback only to
fellow ISPs. Their specific criteria do not appear to be public.

7. Microsoft

Microsoft's "Junk Mail Reporting" program covers Hotmail, MSN, and
Windows Live Mail.
https://support.msn.com/eform.aspx?
productKey=edfsjmrpp&page=support_home_options_form_byemail&ct=eformts&scrx=1
While Microsoft does not publicize the precise criteria used, some of
the questions asked by their sign-up form provide some clues:

> *How would you describe your company or yourself? (multiple
> choice)

> *The home page where people sign up for your service

> *The opt-out link for each list or a link to your organization's
> Privacy Policy

> *Sender IPs for verification

> *Are the IP addresses registered under your company's name or
> domain name?

> *If no, do you have exclusive sending rights from the IP via your
> hosting company (not shared with any other senders)?

> *Can you remove customers who complain from your lists, or take
> action against spam accounts?

8. Outblaze

http://spamblock.outblaze.com/
Word to the Wise (Atkins, L., "ISP Information - Word to the Wise," .)
[WTTW] reports that Outblaze's complaint feedback loop is only
available to senders who confirm all subscription (opt-in) requests to
their lists. Other sources have reported that Outblaze's complaint
feedback loop is tied to their whitelisting program. The specifics do
not appear to have been publicized.

9. OpenSRS

OpenSRS is a mail hosting service operated by Tucows.
http://fbl.hostedemail.com/

Like all feedback loops hosted by Return Path, the subscriber must
first select either postmaster@ or abuse@ their domain to receive a
confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when
opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback
related to that domain.
Tucows has not published additional criteria.

---

10. Rackspace

http://fbl.apps.rackspace.com/
Like all feedback loops hosted by Return Path, the subscriber must
first select either postmaster@ or abuse@ their domain to receive a
confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when
opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback
related to that domain.
Rackspace has not published additional criteria.

---

11. Road Runner

http://feedback.postmaster.rr.com/
Like all feedback loops hosted by Return Path, the subscriber must
first select either postmaster@ or abuse@ their domain to receive a
confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when
opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback
related to that domain.
Road Runner has not published additional criteria.

---

12. USA.net

http://fbl.usa.net/
Like all feedback loops hosted by Return Path, the subscriber must
first select either postmaster@ or abuse@ their domain to receive a
confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when
opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback
related to that domain.
USA.net has not published additional criteria.

---

13. Yahoo!

http://help.yahoo.com/l/us/yahoo/mail/postmaster/feedback/
Yahoo!'s is currently the only known complaint feedback loop where complaints are routed based on the [DKIM] (Allman, E., Callas, J., Delany, M., Libbey, M., Fenton, J., and M. Thomas, "DomainKeys Identified Mail (DKIM) Signatures," May 2007.) d= domain of the offending message, rather than last-hop IP address. Thus, the primary initial criteria is that the prospective subscriber sign all their outbound mail with DKIM.
(They do route by IP for ISPs, using unpublished criteria to determine whether an ISP qualifies.)
The signup process requires a free Yahoo! user ID, after which (like all feedback loop signup pages hosted by Return Path) the subscriber must select either postmaster@ or abues@ their domain to receive a confirmation message. The message includes a unique URI which, when opened, confirms that the subscriber has permission to receive feedback related to that domain.
Yahoo! has not published additional criteria.

---

14. References

[DKIM]	Allman, E., Callas, J., Delany, M., Libbey, M., Fenton, J., and M. Thomas, "DomainKeys Identified Mail (DKIM) Signatures," RFC 4871, May 2007.
[MARF-WG]	IETF, "Messaging Abuse Reporting Format (Active WG)."
[SS]	Return Path, "About Sender Score."
[WTTW]	Atkins, L., "ISP Information - Word to the Wise."

Author's Address

	J.D. Falk
	Return Path
	8001 Arista Place, Suite 300
	Broomfield, CO 80021
	US
Email:	ietf@cybernothing.org
URI:	http://www.returnpath.net/