Update to RFC 3777 to Clarify Nominating Committee Eligibility of IETF Leadership
draft-leiba-3777upd-eligibility-01

Abstract

   RFC 3777 specifies that "sitting members" of the IAB and IESG "may
   not volunteer to serve on the nominating commitee". Since that
   document was written the IAOC was formed, and that body is not
   covered by RFC 3777. There is also uncertainty about whether ex-
   officio members and liaisons are included as "sitting members". This
   document clarifies those situations.

Status of this Memo

   This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the
   provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

   Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering
   Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute
   working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-
   Drafts is at http://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/.

   Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months
   and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any
   time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference
   material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

   This Internet-Draft will expire on February 17, 2013.

Copyright Notice

   include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of
   the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as
   described in the Simplified BSD License.

Table of Contents

[1](#). Introduction

The "Operation of the Nominating and Recall Committees" document
[RFC3777] defines the nominating committee (NomCom) process. One of
the key points in the process and in the selection of the NomCom is
that the IETF wants to avoid having its top leadership be self-
selecting: the leaders should not be the ones who choose the leaders.
The selection of the NomCom, therefore, excludes those individuals
who are in top leadership positions currently.

That said, it would be bad to eliminate people who have the
experience necessary to understand of the IETF process: those
individuals can bring a broader perspective to the NomCom and will
help ensure that the people it selects for the leadership positions
are better prepared to fulfill the roles.

RFC 3777 specifies that "sitting members" of the IAB and IESG "may
not volunteer to serve on the nominating committee". Since that
document was written the IETF Administrative Oversight Committee
(IAOC) was formed, and that body is not covered by RFC 3777. There
is also uncertainty about whether ex-officio members liaisons, and
such are included as "sitting members". This document clarifies
those situations, with the understanding that the intent of RFC 3777
was to exclude those currently in IETF leadership positions, or who
would otherwise have a conflict of interest, from voting on the
selection of the new leadership.

This document also excludes certain individuals who are directly paid
for their work with the IETF, and who, therefore, have a direct
personal financial incentive in the selection of the leadership
boards. We limit this exclusion to a few people who are paid for
long-term full-time work. In practice, they are unlikely to
volunteer for the NomCom anyway, so this addition makes little
practical change.

In order to allow the largest reasonable list of potential NomCom
members, we do not want to exclude those at lower levels of IETF
leadership. In particular, this document does *not* exclude
participation from working group chairs, IRTF research group chairs,
members of directorates and special review teams, and members of
other advisory bodies.
[[anchor1: Some had suggested eliminating the RFC Series Oversight
Committee (RSOC) members, for example; we do not think that is a good
idea.]]

2. Addition of the IAOC to the Text of RFC 3777

   RFC 3777 specifies processes involving the IAB and the IESG in a
   number of places. For some of those situations, the "IAOC Member
   Selection Guidelines and Process" document [RFC4333] covers what's
   needed for the IAOC. This document makes the following updates to
   add the IAOC to certain of the processes that are not covered there.

   Note that the change below to Section 4, bullet 15 also puts
   additional restrictions on who may volunteer as a voting member of
   the NomCom.

   Section 2 ("Definitions") is updated as follows:

   o Paragraphs 5 and 6 are replaced by this:

      nominee: A person who is being or has been considered for one or
         more open positions of the IESG, the IAB, or the IAOC.

      sitting member: A person who is currently serving a term of
         membership in the IESG, the IAB, the IAOC, or the ISOC Board of
         Trustees.

   Section 3 ("General") is updated as follows:

   o Bullet 7, sub-bullet 1 is replaced by this:

         The IETF Executive Director informs the nominating committee of
         the IESG, IAB, and IAOC positions to be reviewed.

         The IESG, the IAB, and the IAOC are responsible for providing
         summary of the expertise desired of the candidates selected for
         their respective open positions to the Executive Director. The
         summaries are provided to the nominating committee for its
         consideration.

   o In bullet 7, sub-bullet 3, the following is inserted between
      paragraphs 3 and 4:

         The sitting IESG members review the IAOC candidate.

   Section 4 ("Nominating Committee Selection") is updated as follows:

   o Bullet 3, paragraph 1 is replaced by this:

         The nominating committee comprises at least a Chair, 10 voting
         volunteers, 4 liaisons, and an advisor.

o Bullet 3, paragraph 6 is replaced by this:

      The IESG, IAB, and IAOC liaisons are selected according to
      rules stated elsewhere in this document.

o Bullet 7, paragraph 3 is replaced by this:

      Liaisons from the IESG, the IAB, and the IAOC are expected to
      provide information to the nominating committee regarding the
      operation, responsibility, and composition of their respective
      bodies.

o Bullet 7, paragraph 5 is replaced by this:

      Liaisons from the IESG, the IAB, the IAOC, and the Internet
      Society Board of Trustees (if one was appointed) are expected
      to review the operation and executing process of the nominating
      committee and to report any concerns or issues to the Chair of
      the nominating committee immediately. If they can not resolve
      the issue between themselves, liaisons must report it according
      to the dispute resolution process stated elsewhere in this
      document.

o Bullet 8, only paragraph is replaced by this:

      For each of the IAB, the IESG, and the IAOC, the sitting
      members appoint a liaison from their current membership,
      someone who is not sitting in an open position, to serve on the
      nominating committee.

o Bullet 13, paragraph 1 is replaced by this:

      The Chair obtains the list of IESG, IAB, and IAOC positions to
      be reviewed and announces it along with a solicitation for
      names of volunteers from the IETF community willing to serve on
      the nominating committee.

o Bullet 15 is replaced by these two bullets:

   15.1. Members of the Internet Society Board of Trustees and
      sitting members of the IAB, the IESG, and the IAOC, including
      members in ex-officio positions, and not including liaisons,
      may not volunteer to serve as voting members of the
      nominating committee.

15.2. People serving in the IETF Secretariat and the RFC Editor
       may not volunteer to serve as voting members of the
       nominating committee.

o In bullet 16, to correct an erratum, the last paragraph is
   replaced by this:

      One possible selection method is described in RFC 3797 [1].

Section 5 ("Nominating Committee Operation") is updated as follows:

o In bullet 11, the last paragraph is replaced by this:

      Members of the IETF community who were recalled from any
      nominating-committee-appointed leadership position during the
      previous two years are not eligible to be considered for
      filling any open position.

3. Security Considerations

   This is a procedural document, and is entirely unrelated to security.

4. IANA Considerations

   No IANA actions are requested by this document, and the RFC Editor is
   asked to remove this section before publication.

5. References

5.1. Normative References

   [RFC3777] Galvin, J., "IAB and IESG Selection, Confirmation, and
              Recall Process: Operation of the Nominating and Recall
              Committees", BCP 10, RFC 3777, June 2004.

5.2. Informative References

   [RFC4333] Huston, G. and B. Wijnen, "The IETF Administrative
              Oversight Committee (IAOC) Member Selection Guidelines and
              Process", BCP 113, RFC 4333, December 2005.

Authors' Addresses

    Barry Leiba
    Huawei Technologies

    Phone: +1 646 827 0648
    Email: barryleiba@computer.org
    URI: http://internetmessagingtechnology.org/

    S. Moonesamy
    76, Ylang Ylang Avenue
    Quatres Bornes
    Mauritius

    Email: sm+ietf@elandsys.com