

Human Rights Protocol Considerations Research Group  
INTERNET-DRAFT  
Intended status: Informational  
Expires: January 19, 2019

A-M. Rutkowski  
Netmagic Associates LLC  
July 18, 2018

**Human Rights as a Service (HRaaS)  
draft-rutkowski-hrpc-hraas-00**

Abstract

The establishment of Human Rights as a Service (HRaaS) has significant potential benefits. Although the generic expressions of human rights in legal instruments largely precludes definitive HRaaS specification, the establishment of a measurable objective is compelling in the global marketplace for internet capabilities made available to the public, including new virtualised NFV-SDN based implementations and protocols. This HRaaS draft provides a structured enumeration of human rights found in the principal global legal instruments against which standards bodies can evaluate their specifications, vendors can differentiate their offerings, and users can compare those offerings and make informed decisions.

Status of this Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on January 19, 2019.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2018 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

## Table of Contents

<a href="#">1. Introduction.....</a>	<a href="#">2</a>
<a href="#">2. Human Rights as a Service in existing and evolving internets...</a>	<a href="#">4</a>
<a href="#">3. Structured enumerations of human rights.....</a>	<a href="#">4</a>
3.1. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights - Enumeration <a href="#">[UDHR]</a> .....	<a href="#">4</a>
3.2. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights Enumeration <a href="#">[ICCPR]</a> .....	<a href="#">8</a>
3.3. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights - Enumeration <a href="#">[CESCR]</a> .....	<a href="#">10</a>
<a href="#">3.4. Additional human rights instrument - enumerations... ..</a>	<a href="#">11</a>
<a href="#">4. Security Considerations.....</a>	<a href="#">11</a>
<a href="#">5. IANA Considerations.....</a>	<a href="#">11</a>
<a href="#">6. Research Group Information.....</a>	<a href="#">11</a>
<a href="#">7. References.....</a>	<a href="#">12</a>
<a href="#">7.1. Informative References.....</a>	<a href="#">12</a>
<a href="#">Appendix A. Additional Human Rights Instruments.....</a>	<a href="#">15</a>
A.1. Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems - enumeration <a href="#">[COEETS189]</a> .....	<a href="#">15</a>
Acknowledgments.....	<a href="#">16</a>
Authors' Addresses.....	<a href="#">16</a>

## [1. Introduction](#)

Seventy years ago, the first of multiple legal instruments -The Universal Declaration of Human Rights -was adopted setting forth global human rights. [\[UDHR\]](#)[\[HRI-DOCS\]](#) It contained 30 different rights and freedoms. Forty years ago, the author of some of those rights headed the first major international commission created to consider how new communication technologies were advancing or impeding those rights. [\[MACBRIDE\]](#) At the time, multiple data networking technologies were proliferating, Louis Pouzin had developed the internet concept seven years earlier and being

Rutkowski

Expires January 19, 2019

[Page 2]

implemented in multiple initiatives. [[POUZIN](#)] Senior technical representatives to the Commission were projecting the developments of internets over the next decade with a view to furthering human rights. [[MACBRIDE81](#)]

Thirty years ago in 1988, the world's Nation=State representatives convened at Melbourne to sign a treaty enabling the implementation of internet public access capabilities globally subject to certain constraints following the first major internet cyberattack a few weeks before. [[WATTC88](#)] Twenty years ago in 1998, the U.S. government initiated - CRISP - the first significant work on adverse internet security and human rights challenges. [[CRISP](#)] At about the same time, a trio of international actions occurred at the U.N. Geneva Office of the High Commission on Human Rights which convened series of conferences on emerging adverse internet human rights problems, the EU Council of Ministers established the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia, and the Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe at their Second Summit met to seek common responses to the developments of new information technologies. [[OHCHR](#)]

About fifteen years ago in 2003, thirty nations adopted "The Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems" through the Council of Europe. [[T-CY-AP](#)]

In past several years, as internet human rights abuses have scaled dramatically, a number of additional aggregate human rights have evolved to deal with continuing, large-scale human rights abuses such as cyberviolence, internet hate crime, and exploitation of children. [[WISENTHAL](#)] [[COE-CYBERVIOLENCE](#)]

There is also an increasing recognition that while large enterprises and knowledgeable may possess the resources to prevent or mitigate most human rights abuses, large classes of people subject to those abuses at the network edges do not possess those resources - especially when manifested by nation-state actors. [[DTRA-MASS](#)] Exacerbating the challenges is the use of the internet to pursue pursuit of racism, xenophobia, and election manipulation agendas today by national leaders as part of their political agendas. [[TTWEETS](#)]

Notwithstanding the somewhat dire contemporary developments, evolving new virtualised internets are emerging that could lead to human rights improvements in the protocols, architectures, and offerings to the public. NFV-SDN based virtualised internets are rapidly emerging = especially for 5G environments. They make use of

Rutkowski

Expires January 19, 2019

[Page 3]

a broad array of protocols instantiated as service functions on demand. [NFVRG] In conjunction with this virtualisation, internets are witnessing a major paradigm shift of intelligence from the network edges to network cores and gateways. [MBOX-INNOVATE] A concept of Human Rights as a Service that provides structured enumerations of human rights in global legal instruments can enable standards bodies evaluating their specifications, vendors differentiating their offerings, and users can compare those offerings and making informed decisions.

## **2. Human Rights as a Service in existing and evolving internets**

Although the generic expressions of human rights in legal instruments largely precludes definitive HRaaS specification. In addition to the typically unstructured language and often vague terminology found in these instruments, they fall into the conundrum of "the fog of more." There are dozens of intergovernmental bodies involved, and even more in individual countries at varying governmental levels. All of these bodies have promulgated human rights. It has resulted in a significant body of human right law that is manifested in legal systems, law schools, and institutes distributed worldwide.

Notwithstanding these challenges, the creation of structured enumerations for human rights found in the principal legal instruments, has potential value under the aegis of "Human Rights as a Service." Such enumerations would further the objective of furthering cognizance, respect, implementation, and statistical monitoring of those rights in the global marketplace of internet protocols, virtual functions, applications, management, practices, and services offered to the public.

## **3. Structured enumerations of human rights**

The following subclauses provide an initial set of enumerations which can be extended via a registry to encompass any legal instrument of human rights.

### **3.1. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights - Enumeration [UDHR]**

UDHR01 All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights



UDHR02 Everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration, without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status; no distinction shall be made on the basis of the political, jurisdictional or international status of the country or territory to which a person belongs

UDHR03 Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person

UDHR04 No one shall be held in slavery or servitude

UDHR05 No one shall be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment

UDHR06 Everyone has the right to recognition everywhere as a person before the law.

UDHR07 All are equal before the law and are entitled without any discrimination to equal protection of the law

UDHR08 Everyone has the right to an effective remedy by the competent national tribunals for acts violating...fundamental rights

UDHR09 No one shall be subjected to arbitrary arrest, detention or exile

UDHR10 Everyone is entitled in full equality to a fair and public hearing by an independent and impartial tribunal, in the determination of his rights and obligations and of any criminal charge against him

UDHR11 Everyone charged with a penal offence has the right to be presumed innocent until proved guilty according to law in a public trial at which he has had all the guarantees necessary for his defence

UDHR12 No one shall be subjected to arbitrary interference with his privacy, family, home or correspondence, nor to attacks upon his honour and reputation

UDHR13 Everyone has the right to freedom of movement and residence within the borders of each State...to leave any country, including his own, and to return to his country





UDHR14 Everyone has the right to seek and to enjoy in other countries asylum from persecution.

UDHR15 Everyone has the right to a nationality...[nor] arbitrarily deprived of his nationality nor denied the right to change his nationality.

UDHR16 Men and women of full age, without any limitation due to race, nationality or religion, have the right to marry and to found a family...are entitled to equal rights as to marriage, during marriage and at its dissolution

UDHR17 Everyone has the right to own property alone as well as in association with others...no one shall be arbitrarily deprived of his property.

UDHR18 Everyone has the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion; this right includes freedom to change his religion or belief, and freedom, either alone or in community with others and in public or private, to manifest his religion or belief in teaching, practice, worship and observance

UDHR19 Everyone has the right to freedom of opinion and expression;...includes freedom to hold opinions without interference and to seek, receive and impart information and ideas through any media and regardless of frontiers

UDHR20 Everyone has the right to freedom of peaceful assembly and association...[nor] compelled to belong to an association

UDHR21 Everyone has the right to take part in the government of his country, directly or through freely chosen representatives;...to equal access to public service in his country;...[and] the will of the people shall be the basis of the authority of government...expressed in periodic and genuine elections which shall be by universal and equal suffrage and shall be held by secret vote or by equivalent free voting procedures

UDHR22 Everyone, as a member of society, has the right to social security and is entitled to realization, through national effort and international co-operation and in accordance with the organization and resources of each State, of the economic, social and cultural rights indispensable for his dignity and the free development of his personality

Rutkowski

Expires January 19, 2019

[Page 6]

UDHR23 Everyone has the right to work, to free choice of employment, to just and favourable conditions of work and to protection against unemployment [and] without any discrimination, has the right to equal pay for equal work...to just and favourable remuneration ensuring for himself and his family an existence worthy of human dignity, and supplemented, if necessary, by other means of social protection...[and] to join trade unions for the protection of his interests

UDHR24 Everyone has the right to rest and leisure, including reasonable limitation of working hours and periodic holidays with pay

UDHR25 Everyone has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and of his family, including food, clothing, housing and medical care and necessary social services, and the right to security in the event of unemployment, sickness, disability, widowhood, old age or other lack of livelihood in circumstances beyond his control...[and] motherhood and childhood are entitled to special care and assistance [where] all children, whether born in or out of wedlock, shall enjoy the same social protection

UDHR26 Everyone has the right to education [and] education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages [and] elementary education shall be compulsory [and] technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit...[where] education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms [and] promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace [and] parents have a prior right to choose the kind of education that shall be given to their children

UDHR27 Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits, [and] to the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from any scientific, literary or artistic production of which he is the author

UDHR28 Everyone is entitled to a social and international order in which the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration can be fully realized



UDHR29 Everyone has duties to the community in which alone the free and full development of his personality is possible [and] in the exercise of his rights and freedoms, everyone shall be subject only to such limitations as are determined by law solely for the purpose of securing due recognition and respect for the rights and freedoms of others and of meeting the just requirements of morality, public order and the general welfare in a democratic society

UDHR30 Nothing in this Declaration may be interpreted as implying for any State, group or person any right to engage in any activity or to perform any act aimed at the destruction of any of the rights and freedoms set forth herein

### **3.2. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights Enumeration [[ICCPR](#)]**

ICCPR01 All peoples have the right of self-determination [including]...political status and freely pursue their economic, social and cultural development

ICCPR06 Every human being has the inherent right to life [nor] arbitrarily deprived of his life

ICCPR07 No one shall be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment...[or] subjected without his free consent to medical or scientific experimentation.

ICCPR08 No one shall be held in slavery [and]...no one shall be held in servitude

ICCPR09 Everyone has the right to liberty and security of person [or] subjected to arbitrary arrest or detention

ICCPR10 All persons deprived of their liberty shall be treated with humanity and with respect for the inherent dignity of the human person

ICCPR11 No one shall be imprisoned merely on the ground of inability to fulfil a contractual obligation

ICCPR12 Everyone lawfully within the territory of a State shall, within that territory, have the right to liberty of movement and freedom to choose his residence [and] free to leave any country, including his own [or] arbitrarily deprived of the right to enter his own country



ICCPR13 An alien lawfully in the territory of a State Party to the present Covenant may be expelled therefrom only in pursuance of a decision reached in accordance with law

ICCPR17 No one shall be subjected to arbitrary or unlawful interference with his privacy, family, home or correspondence, nor to unlawful attacks on his honour and reputation

ICCPR18 Everyone shall have the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion [and] include freedom to have or to adopt a religion or belief of his choice, and freedom, either individually or in community with others and in public or private, to manifest his religion or belief in worship, observance, practice and teaching

ICCPR19 Everyone shall have the right to hold opinions without interference [and] to freedom of expression

ICCPR20 Any propaganda for war shall be prohibited by law [and] any advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence shall be prohibited

ICCPR21 The right of peaceful assembly shall be recognized

ICCPR22 Everyone shall have the right to freedom of association with others, including the right to form and join trade unions for the protection of his interests

ICCPR23 The right of men and women of marriageable age to marry and to found a family shall be recognized

ICCPR24 Every child shall have, without any discrimination as to race, colour, sex, language, religion, national or social origin, property or birth, the right to such measures of protection as are required by his status as a minor, on the part of his family, society and the State.

ICCPR25 Every citizen shall have the right and the opportunity... without unreasonable restrictions...to take part in the conduct of public affairs, directly or through freely chosen representatives... [and] vote and to be elected at genuine periodic elections which shall be by universal and equal suffrage and shall be held by secret ballot, guaranteeing the free expression of the will of the electors [and]...have access, on general terms of equality, to public service in his country.





ICCPR26 All persons are equal before the law and are entitled without any discrimination to the equal protection of the law...and effective protection against discrimination on any ground such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status.

ICCPR27 In those States in which ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities exist, persons belonging to such minorities shall not be denied the right, in community with the other members of their group, to enjoy their own culture, to profess and practise their own religion, or to use their own language

### **3.3. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights**

- Enumeration [[CESCR](#)]

CESCR01 All peoples have the right of self-determination [including] ...political status and freely pursue their economic, social and cultural development

CESCR06 the right to work, which includes the right of everyone to the opportunity to gain his living by work which he freely chooses or accepts

CESCR07 the right of everyone to the enjoyment of just and favourable conditions of work

CESCR08 The right of everyone to form trade unions and join the trade union of his choice

CESCR09 the right of everyone to social security

CESCR10 The widest possible protection and assistance should be accorded to the family [including]...special measures of protection and assistance...on behalf of all children and young persons without any discrimination for reasons of parentage or other conditions... [and] protected from economic and social exploitation

CESCR11 the right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living conditions



CESCR12 right of everyone to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health [including] environmental and industrial hygiene...prevention, treatment and control of epidemic, endemic, occupational and other diseases...the creation of conditions which would assure to all medical service and medical attention in the event of sickness.

CESCR13 the right of everyone to education

CESCR15 the right of everyone...to take part in cultural life...to enjoy the benefits of scientific progress and its applications...the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from any scientific, literary or artistic production of which he is the author...the development and the diffusion of science and culture

CESCR25 the inherent right of all peoples to enjoy and utilize fully and freely their natural wealth and resources

### **3.4. Additional human rights instrument - enumerations**

See [Appendix A](#).

## **4. Security Considerations**

As this draft concerns a research document, there are no security considerations.

## **5. IANA Considerations**

This document has no actions for IANA.

## **6. Research Group Information**

The discussion list for the IRTF Human Rights Protocol Considerations proposed working group is located at the e-mail address [hrpc@ietf.org](mailto:hrpc@ietf.org). Information on the group and information on how to subscribe to the list is at <https://www.irtf.org/mailman/listinfo/hrpc>

Archives of the list can be found at:  
<https://www.irtf.org/mailarchive/web/hrpc/current/index.html>.



## 7. References

### 7.1. Informative References

- [UDHR] U.N., "The Universal Declaration of Human Rights," 1948.  
<[https://www.ohchr.org/EN/UDHR/Documents/UDHR\\_Translations/eng.pdf](https://www.ohchr.org/EN/UDHR/Documents/UDHR_Translations/eng.pdf)>
- [HRI-DOCS]  
UConn, Human Rights Institute, Human Rights Documents,  
<<https://humanrights.uconn.edu/human-rights-documents/>>.  
See also, Human Rights Organizations,  
<<https://humanrights.uconn.edu/human-rightsorganizations/>>.
- [MACBRIDE]  
UNESCO, International Commission for the Study of  
Communication Problems, <<http://www.undocuments.net/macbride-report.pdf>>
- [POUZIN] L. Pouzin, "Presentation and major design aspects of the  
CYCLADES computer network," in Proc. 3rd Data  
Communications Symp., 1973.  
<<https://dl.acm.org/citation.cfm?id=811034>>. See also,  
<<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/CYCLADES>>
- [MACBRIDE81]  
A. Rutkowski, et al, Communication technologies of the  
1980s, UNESCO, International commission for the study of  
communication problems, Doc. 81.  
<<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0004/000491/049100eb.pdf>>
- [WATTC88] World Administrative Telegraph and Telephone Conference  
(Melbourne, 1988).  
<<https://www.itu.int/en/history/Pages/TelegraphAndTelephoneConferences.aspx?conf=4.33>>. See also, A. Rutkowski, The  
ITU treaty provisions for infrastructure protection, June  
2005,  
<[https://www.itu.int/osg/spu/cybersecurity/contributions/Rutkowski\\_contribution.pdf](https://www.itu.int/osg/spu/cybersecurity/contributions/Rutkowski_contribution.pdf)>
- [CRISP] Stanford University, Consortium for Research on  
Information Security and Policy,  
<[https://cisac.fsi.stanford.edu/research/consortium\\_for\\_research\\_on\\_information\\_security\\_and\\_policy](https://cisac.fsi.stanford.edu/research/consortium_for_research_on_information_security_and_policy)>



- [OHCHR] OHCHR, Racism and the Internet,  
<<https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Racism/IntergovWG/Pages/RefDocSession4.aspx>>; European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia,  
<<https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/observatories/eurwork/industrial-relations-dictionary/european-monitoring-centreon-racism-and-xenophobia>>; Final Declaration and Action Plan, Second Summit of Heads of State and Government, (Strasbourg, 10-11 October 1997)
- [T-CY-AP] Council of Europe, "The Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems."  
<<https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list//conventions/rms/090000168008160f>>
- [WISENTHAL]  
The Simon Wiesenthal Center,  
<<https://www.infodocket.com/2018/03/07/the-simonwiesenthal-center-releases-digital-terrorism-and-hate2018-report/>>
- [COE-CYBERVIOLENCE]  
COE, Mapping study on cyberviolence, 9 July 2018.  
<<https://rm.coe.int/t-cy-2017-10-cbg-studyprovisional/16808c4914>>. See also, Cyber hate at the International Network for Hate Studies,  
<<http://www.internationalhatestudies.com/topic/hate-crimeand-technology/>>
- [DTRA-MASS]  
S.J. Lukasik, Mass-Effect Network Attacks, Defense Threat Reduction Agency, Jan 2007. See also, See also,  
<[https://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=en&as\\_sdt=0%2C47&q=internet+%2B+xenophobia+%2B+racism&btnG=>](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=en&as_sdt=0%2C47&q=internet+%2B+xenophobia+%2B+racism&btnG=>)>
- [TTWEETS] A. Rutkowski, Trump's Tweets Flouting the Cybercrime Treaty Curbs on Racist and Xenophobic Incitement, CircleID July 2018.  
<[http://www.circleid.com/posts/20180702\\_trumps\\_tweets\\_flouting\\_the\\_cybercrime\\_treaty\\_curbs\\_on\\_racist/](http://www.circleid.com/posts/20180702_trumps_tweets_flouting_the_cybercrime_treaty_curbs_on_racist/)>. See also, USDC, Case 1:18-cr-00215-ABJ, Indictment, U.S. v. Netyksho et al, filed 07/13/18,  
<<https://www.justice.gov/file/1080281/download>>
- [NFVRG] See Network Function Virtualization Research Group (NFVRG), <<https://trac.ietf.org/trac/irtf/wiki/nfvrg>>.



Rutkowski

Expires January 19, 2019

[Page 13]

## [MBOX-INNOVATE]

See, e.g., J. Sherry, Middlebox Processing as a Cloud Service,

<<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/ecb1/3b2c3bdd5d558828cc20fccfe75a1d02873a.pdf>>; V. Sekar et al., The Middlebox Manifesto: Enabling Innovation in Middlebox Deployment, <<https://people.eecs.berkeley.edu/~sylvia/papers/hotnets19-sekar.pdf>>

## [ICCPR]

U.N., "The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights," 1966.

<<https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/ccpr.pdf>>

## [CESCR]

U.N., "The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights," 1966.

<<https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/cescr.pdf>>

## [COE-ETS189]

Council of Europe, ETS No. 189, Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, Strasbourg, 28.I.2003. <<https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list//conventions/rms/090000168008160f>>



## **Appendix A. Additional Human Rights Instruments**

### **A.1. Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems - enumeration [[COE-ETS189](#)]**

APCR03 Dissemination of racist and xenophobic material through computer systems

APCR04 Racist and xenophobic motivated threat

APCR05 Racist and xenophobic motivated insult

APCR06 Denial, gross minimisation, approval or justification of genocide or crimes against humanity

APCR07 Aiding and abetting



## Acknowledgments

Thanks to Sean MacBride who played a leading role in articulating global human rights in international legal instruments, creating implementing organizations, and leading the first major worldwide body forty years ago to consider the potential for advancing human rights in communication networks.

## Authors' Addresses

Anthony-M. Rutkowski  
Netmagic Associates LLC

Email: [trutkowski@netmagic.com](mailto:trutkowski@netmagic.com)

