

Network Working Group
Internet-Draft
Intended status: Informational
Expires: January 5, 2010

S. Sharikov
Regtime Ltd
D. Miloshevic
Afilias
J. Klensin
July 4, 2009

**Internationalized Domain Names Registration and Administration
Guideline for European languages using Cyrillic
draft-sharikov-idn-reg-00.txt**

Status of this Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted to IETF in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#). This document may contain material from IETF Documents or IETF Contributions published or made publicly available before November 10, 2008. The person(s) controlling the copyright in some of this material may not have granted the IETF Trust the right to allow modifications of such material outside the IETF Standards Process. Without obtaining an adequate license from the person(s) controlling the copyright in such materials, this document may not be modified outside the IETF Standards Process, and derivative works of it may not be created outside the IETF Standards Process, except to format it for publication as an RFC or to translate it into languages other than English.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/ietf/1id-abstracts.txt>.

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at <http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html>.

This Internet-Draft will expire on January 5, 2010.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2009 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the

document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents in effect on the date of publication of this document (<http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>). Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document.

Abstract

This document is a guideline for Registries and Registrars on registering internationalized domain names (IDNs) based on (in alphabetical order) Bosnian, Bulgarian, Byelorussian, Macedonian, Montenegrin, Russian, Serbian, and Ukrainian languages in a DNS zone. For completeness of the "European" languages, it also discusses the additional characters needed for Moldovan and Kildin Sami. It describes appropriate characters for registration and variant considerations for characters from Greek and Latin scripts with similar appearances and/or derivations.

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	4
1.1.	Similar Characters and Variants	5
1.2.	Terminology	5
2.	Languages and Characters	6
2.1.	Bosnian, Serbian, Montenegrin	6
2.2.	Bulgarian	6
2.3.	Byelorussian	6
2.4.	Macedonian	6
2.6.	Russian	7
2.8.	Ukrainian	7
3.	Language-based Tables	7
4.	Table processing rules	7
5.	Table Format	7
6.	Steps after registering an input label	8
7.	Acknowledgments	8
Appendix A.	European Cyrillic Character Tables	8
8.	References	13
8.1.	Normative References	13
8.2.	Informative References	13
	Authors' Addresses	14

1. Introduction

Cyrillic is one of a fairly small number of scripts that are used, with different subsets of characters, to write a large number of languages, some of which are not closely related to the others. When those languages might be used together in a zone (typical of generic TLDs (gTLDs) but likely in other zones both at and below the root, special considerations for intermixing characters may apply. Cyrillic also has the property that, while it is usually considered a separate script from the Latin (Roman) and Greek ones, it shares many characters with them, creating opportunities for visual confusion.

This specification provides guidelines for the use of Cyrillic, as encoded in Unicode [[Unicode51](#)] with internationalized domain name (IDN) labels derived from most "European" languages that use the script (use of the term "European" is a convenience, since there is disagreement about the relevant boundaries for different purposes and, of course, much of Russia lies within geological Asia). Specifically it covers (in alphabetic order) Bosnian, Bulgarian, Byelorussian, Macedonian, Montenegrin, Russian, Serbian, and Ukrainian. Supplemental tables, based on information in the Unicode Standard and the Omniglot discussion of Moldovan [[OmniglotMoldovan](#)] and Sami languages [[OmniglotSami](#)] are provided for use with Moldovan and Kildin Sami. The former is no longer in official use with Cyrillic script and no registrations are considered likely for the latter, at least within the relevant ccTLD. Languages of Asia that use Cyrillic are not considered here and should be the subject of separate specifications.

While Cyrillic script is the primary one used for many of the relevant languages and countries, Latin script is often used instead of, or in combination with, it. Standard keyboards used in most of the countries have both Cyrillic and Latin characters. Therefore some registries could use Latin scripts for domain names registration in their zones. In some cases, there would even be a requirement for mixing Cyrillic and Latin characters in the same label although this is not generally considered desirable. In addition, registries that support many scripts will probably encounter the need to support labels in Greek or Latin scripts as well as Cyrillic and a large number of character forms are shared among those three scripts.

Because the DNS has no way for the end-user to distinguish among the languages that might have been used to inspire a particular label, it seems useful to treat the characters of a large number of languages that use Cyrillic in their writing systems together, rather than trying to differentiate them. The discussion and tables in this specification should provide a foundation for developing more restrictive rules for zones in which only a single language is likely

to be used, but it does not specify those language-specific rules.

1.1. Similar Characters and Variants

For some human languages, there are characters and/or strings that have equivalent or near-equivalent meanings. If someone is allowed to register a name with such a character or string, the registry might want to automatically register all the names that have the same meaning in that language. Further, some registries might want to restrict the set of characters to be registered for language-based reasons. In addition, IDNA [[RFC3490](#)] allows the use of thousands of non-alphanumeric characters, and some zone administrators will want to prohibit some or all of these characters.

So-called "variant techniques", introduced in [[RFC3743](#)] and generalized beyond East Asian language in [[RFC4290](#)], describe ways of registering IDN domain names to decrease the risk of misunderstandings, cybersquatting, and other forms of confusion.

The tables below (Appendix A) identify confusable characters in Latin and Greek scripts that might be easily confused with Cyrillic ones.

1.2. Terminology

The terminology that follows is derived from [[RFC3743](#)] and [[RFC4290](#)], but this specification does not depend on them.

A "string" is an ordered set of one or more characters.

This document discusses characters that have equivalent or near-equivalent characters or strings. The "base character" is the character that has one or more equivalents; the "variant(s)" are the character(s) and/or string(s) that are equivalent to the base character.

A "registration bundle" is the set of all labels that comes from expanding all base characters for a single name into their variants.

A registry is the administrative authority for a DNS zone. That is, the registry is the body that makes and enforces policies that are used in a particular zone in the DNS. The term "registry" applies to all zones in the DNS, not only those that exist at the top level.

[[anchor4: Note in Draft: This specification is based on the original version of IDNA. Updates to any revision should be obvious, but the terminology should be adjusted in needed and special attention should be paid to the mapping-only variants listed in the Appendix. (RFC Editor, if the I-D reaches you with this note in place, please just

drop it.)]]

[2.](#) Languages and Characters

In the interest of clarity and balance, this document describes a "Base Cyrillic" set of twenty-three characters for use in comparing the character usage for Russian and Central European languages that use Cyrillic. The balance of this section compares the character usage of the individual languages in that group.

"Base Cyrillic" consists of the following Unicode code points (names associated with these code points and those below appear in [Appendix A](#)): U+0430, U+0431, U+0432, U+0433, U+0434, U+0435, U+0436, U+0437, U+043A, U+043B, U+043C, U+043D, U+043E, U+043F, U+0440, U+0441, U+0442, U+0443, U+0444, U+0445, U+0446, U+0447, U+0448.

The individual languages that are the focus of this specification are discussed below (in English alphabetical order):

[2.1.](#) Bosnian, Serbian, Montenegrin

Bosnian, Serbian, and Montenegrin have 30 letters in the alphabet and the additional seven characters to the base of 23 shared Cyrillic characters: U+0438, U+0458, U+0452, U+0459, U+045A, U+045B, U+045F.

[2.2.](#) Bulgarian

The Bulgarian alphabet has thirty characters, seven in addition to the basic twenty-three: U+0456, U+0439, U+0449, U+044A, U+044C, U+044E, U+044F.

[2.3.](#) Byelorussian

Byelorussian alphabet has 32 characters, i.e., additional nine characters to the base of 23 characters: U+0451, U+0456, U+0439, U+044B, U+044C, U+045E, U+044D, U+044E, U+044F.

[2.4.](#) Macedonian

Macedonian has 31 characters in the alphabet. This is eight in addition to the basic set: U+0438, U+0458, U+0452, U+0459, U+045A, U+045C, U+045F, U+0491, U+0455.

[2.5.](#) Montenegrin

See Bosnian, [Section 2.1](#), above.

[2.6.](#) Russian

The current Russian alphabet has 33 characters, consisting of the Base Cyrillic set plus an additional ten characters: U+0451 U+0438, U+0439, U+0449, U+044A, U+044B, U+044C, U+044D, U+044E, U+044F.

[2.7.](#) Serbian

See Bosnian, [Section 2.1](#), above.

[2.8.](#) Ukrainian

Ukrainian has 31 characters and therefore an additional 8 characters to the base of 23: U+0454, U+0456, U+0457, U+0491, U+0449, U+044A, U+044E, U+044F.

[3.](#) Language-based Tables

The registration strategy described in this document uses a table that lists all characters allowed for input and any variants of those characters. Note that the table lists all characters allowed, not only the ones that have variants.

[4.](#) Table processing rules

The input to the process is called the "input label". The output of the process is either failure (the input label cannot be registered at all), or a registration bundle that contains one or more labels that have been processed with ToASCII.

[5.](#) Table Format

The table in [Appendix A](#) consists of four columns. The first and second identify the Cyrillic character and the third and fourth identify Latin or Greek characters that might be easily confused with them visually. If both a Latin and Greek character are present, the Greek one appears in the third and fourth columns on the subsequent line (with "..." in the first column to indicate more information about the character specified on the previous line). Variants needed only because of case folding are shown with "++" in the first column, as noted in the table.

Each character in the table is given in the "U+" notation for Unicode characters followed, in the next column, by its name as shown in the Unicode Standard. For easy reference, the characters are listed in

the order in which they appear in the Unicode Standard.

The table does not, and any future revision **MUST NOT**, have more than one entry for a particular base character.

6. Steps after registering an input label

A registry has at least three policy options for handling the cases where the registration bundle has more than one label. These options, and their key implications, are:

- o Allocate all labels to the same registrant, making the zone information identical to that of the input label.

This option will cause end users to be able to find names with variants more easily, but will result in larger zone files. In principle, the zone file could become so large that it could negatively affect the ability of the registry to perform name resolution.

- o Block all labels so they cannot be registered in the future.

This option does not increase the size of the zone file, but it may cause end users to not be able to find names with variants that they would expect.

- o Allocate some labels and block some other labels.

This option is likely to cause the most confusion with users because including some variants will cause a name to be found, but using other variants will cause the name to be not found.

With any of these three options, the registry **MUST** keep a database that links each label in the registration bundle to the input label. This link needs to be maintained so that changes in the non-DNS registration information (such as the label's owner name and address) is reflected in every member of the registration bundle as well.

7. Acknowledgments

Support from Afilias for a major portion of this work is appreciated.

[Appendix A](#). European Cyrillic Character Tables

These tables are constructed on the basis of the characters that can

actually occur in the DNS, i.e., those that can be obtained by applying the ToUnicode operation of [RFC 3490](#) to an ACE-encoded label as defined there. If the characters that can be mapped into those characters are to be considered instead, then the number of variants would increase considerably. For example, while Cyrillic Small Letter A and Greek Small Letter Alpha are readily distinguished visually, their capital letter equivalents are not, so, if the extended set of Nameprep [[RFC3491](#)] mappings are considered, the two small letters must be considered variants of each other.

These additional, possibly-required, variants are shown below with "+++" in the first column of the table.

Characters needed for European languages, other than Moldovan and Sami, written in Cyrillic.

Cyrillic Char	Unicode Name	Variant	Unicode Name
U+0430	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER A	U+0061	LATIN SMALL LETTER A
+++		U+03B0	GREEK SMALL LETTER ALPHA
U+0431	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER BE		
U+0432	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER VE	U+0062	LATIN SMALL LETTER B
+++		U+03B2	GREEK SMALL LETTER BETA
U+0433	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER GHE	U+0072	LATIN SMALL LETTER R
+++		U+03B3	GREEK SMALL LETTER GAMMA
U+0434	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER DE		
+++		U+03B4	GREEK SMALL LETTER DELTA
U+0435	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER IE	U+0065	LATIN SMALL LETTER E
+++		U+03B5	GREEK SMALL LETTER EPSILON
U+0436	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER ZHE		
U+0437	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER ZE		
U+0438	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER I	U+0075	LATIN SMALL LETTER U
U+0439	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER SHORT I		

U+043A	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER KA	U+006B	LATIN SMALL LETTER K
...		U+03BA	GREEK SMALL LETTER KAPPA
U+043B	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER EL		
+++		U+039B	GREEK SMALL LETTER LAMBDA
U+043C	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER EM	U+006D	LATIN SMALL LETTER M
+++		U+03BC	GREEK SMALL LETTER MU
U+043D	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER EN	U+0068	LATIN SMALL LETTER H
+++		U+03B7	GREEK SMALL LETTER ETA
U+043E	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER O	U+006F	LATIN SMALL LETTER O
...		U+03BF	GREEK SMALL LETTER OMICRON
U+043F	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER PE	U+006E	LATIN SMALL LETTER N
...		U+03C0	GREEK SMALL LETTER PI
U+0440	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER ER	U+0070	LATIN SMALL LETTER P
...		U+03C1	GREEK SMALL LETTER RHO
U+0441	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER ES	U+0063	LATIN SMALL LETTER C
U+0442	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER TE	U+0074	LATIN SMALL LETTER T
+++		U+03C4	GREEK SMALL LETTER TAU
U+0443	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER U	U+0079	LATIN SMALL LETTER Y
+++		U+03C5	GREEK SMALL LETTER UPSILON
U+0444	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER EF	U+03D5	GREEK PHI SYMBOL
+++		U+03C6	GREEK SMALL LETTER PHI
U+0445	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER HA	U+0078	LATIN SMALL LETTER X
...		U+03C7	GREEK SMALL LETTER CHI
U+0446	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER TSE		
U+0447	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER CHE		

U+0448	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	SHA		
U+0449	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	SHCHA		
U+044A	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	HARD SIGN		
U+044B	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	YERU		
U+044C	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	SOFT SIGN		
U+044D	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER E		
U+044E	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER YU		
U+044F	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER YA		
U+0451	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER IO		
+++		U+00EB	LATIN SMALL LETTER E WITH DIAERESIS
U+0452	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	DJE		
U+0453	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	GJE		
U+0454	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER	U+03B5	GREEK SMALL LETTER EPSILON
	UKRAINIAN IE		
U+0455	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER	U+0073	LATIN SMALL LETTER S
	DZE		
U+0456	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER	U+0069	LATIN SMALL LETTER I
	BYELORUSSIAN-UKRAINIAN I		
+++		U+03B9	GREEK SMALL LETTER IOTA
U+0457	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER	U+03CA	GREEK SMALL LETTER IOTA WITH DIALYTIKA
	UKRAINIAN YI		
+++		U+00EF	LATIN SMALL LETTER I WITH DIAERESIS
U+0458	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER JE	U+006A	LATIN SMALL LETTER J
...		U+03F3	GREEK LETTER YOT
U+0459	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	LJE		
U+045A	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	NJE		
U+045B	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	TSHE		
U+045C	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	KJE		
U+045D	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER I		
	WITH GRAVE		

U+045E	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	SHORT U		
U+045F	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	DZHE		
U+0491	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	GHE WITH UPTURN		
U+04C2	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	ZHE WITH BREVE		
+-----+-----+-----+-----+			

Additional characters needed for Moldovan written in Cyrillic.

Cyrillic	Unicode Name	Variant	Unicode
Char			Name
+-----+-----+-----+-----+			
U+04C2	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER ZHE		
	WITH BREVE		
+-----+-----+-----+-----+			

Information in this table relies completely on the additional character identified as needed for Moldovan in The Unicode Standard. Moldovan is normally written in Latin characters today, so IDN use of the characters above is not anticipated.

Additional characters needed for Sami written in Cyrillic.

Cyrillic	Unicode Name	Variant	Unicode
Char			Name
+-----+-----+-----+-----+			
U+048B	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER SHORT I		
	WITH TAIL		
U+048D	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER		
	SEMISOFT SIGN		
U+048F	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER ER WITH		
	TICK		
U+04C6	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER EL WITH		
	TAIL		
U+04CA	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER EN WITH		
	TAIL		
U+04CE	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER EM WITH		
	TAIL		
U+04ED	CYRILLIC SMALL LETTER E WITH		
	DIAERESIS		
+-----+-----+-----+-----+			

Information in this table relies completely on the characters

identified as needed for Kildin Sami in The Unicode Standard. No separate verification or consideration for IDN use has been made, nor has careful consideration been given to the question of whether the tails and tics that distinguish most of these characters from their basic Cyrillic counterparts would be noticed by a user who was not expecting them.

8. References

8.1. Normative References

- [RFC3490] Faltstrom, P., Hoffman, P., and A. Costello, "Internationalizing Domain Names in Applications (IDNA)", [RFC 3490](#), March 2003.
- [RFC3491] Hoffman, P. and M. Blanchet, "Nameprep: A Stringprep Profile for Internationalized Domain Names (IDN)", [RFC 3491](#), March 2003.
- [Unicode51]
The Unicode Consortium, "The Unicode Standard, Version 5.1.0", 2008.
- Defined by: The Unicode Standard, Version 5.0, Boston, MA, Addison-Wesley, 2007, ISBN 0-321-48091-0, as amended by Unicode 5.1.0
(<http://www.unicode.org/versions/Unicode5.1.0/>).

8.2. Informative References

- [OmniglotMoldovan]
Ager, S., "Moldovan", 2009,
<<http://www.omniglot.com/writing/moldovan.htm>>.
- [OmniglotSami]
Ager, S., "Sami (Saami)", 2009,
<<http://www.omniglot.com/writing/saami.htm>>.
- [RFC3743] Konishi, K., Huang, K., Qian, H., and Y. Ko, "Joint Engineering Team (JET) Guidelines for Internationalized Domain Names (IDN) Registration and Administration for Chinese, Japanese, and Korean", [RFC 3743](#), April 2004.
- [RFC4290] Klensin, J., "Suggested Practices for Registration of Internationalized Domain Names (IDN)", [RFC 4290](#), December 2005.

Authors' Addresses

Sergey Sharikov
Regtime Ltd
Kalinina str.,14
Samara 443008
Russia

Phone: +7(846) 979-9039
Fax: +7(846)979-9038
Email: s.shar@regtime.net

Desiree Miloshevic
Afilias
Oxford Internet Institute, 1 St. Giles
Oxford OX1 3JS
United Kingdom

Phone: +44 7973 987 147
Email: dmiloshevic@afilias.info

John C Klensin
1770 Massachusetts Ave, #322
Cambridge, MA 02140
USA

Phone: +1 617 491 5735
Email: john-ietf@jck.com

