

Workgroup: IDR  
Internet-Draft:  
draft-spaghetti-idr-deprecate-8-9-10-01  
Published: 30 June 2022  
Intended Status: Standards Track  
Expires: 1 January 2023  
Authors: J. Snijders  
Fastly

## **Deprecation of BGP OPEN Message Error subcodes 8, 9, and 10.**

### **Abstract**

This document requests IANA to mark BGP OPEN Message Error subcodes 8, 9, and 10 as "deprecated".

### **Status of This Memo**

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on 1 January 2023.

### **Copyright Notice**

Copyright (c) 2022 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Revised BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Revised BSD License.

## Table of Contents

- [1. Introduction](#)
- [2. IANA Considerations](#)
- [3. Security Considerations](#)
- [4. Informative References](#)
- [Author's Address](#)

### 1. Introduction

It has been discovered that certain BGP OPEN Message Error subcodes have been used in BGP implementations which have been deployed in the wild while not being assigned by the IANA for such usage. Unregistered usage of BGP OPEN Message Error subcodes can lead to increased difficulty when troubleshooting why BGP sessions are torn down.

The use of these unregistered values was noticed when the concept of Route Leak Prevention and Detection using Roles in UPDATE and OPEN Messages [[I-D.ietf-idr-bgp-open-policy](#)] was initially assigned value 8 by IANA. It was subsequently discovered that a widely-deployed [BGP-4](#) [[RFC4271](#)] implementation had released code which used BGP OPEN Message Error Subcode 8. As a workaround, a new Early IANA Allocation is to be requested.

The squatting of values 8, 9, and 10 has been confirmed by the involved vendors or through source code review.

### 2. IANA Considerations

Per this document, IANA is requested to mark values 8, 9, and 10 as "deprecated" in the "OPEN Message Error subcodes" registry under the "Border Gateway Protocol (BGP) Parameters" group. The marking "deprecated" meaning "use is not recommended" ([RFC8126](#)).

### 3. Security Considerations

There are no meaningful security consequences arising from this registry update.

### 4. Informative References

[[I-D.ietf-idr-bgp-open-policy](#)] Azimov, A., Bogomazov, E., Bush, R., Patel, K., and K. Sriram, "Route Leak Prevention and Detection using Roles in UPDATE and OPEN Messages", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-ietf-idr-bgp-open-

policy-18, 4 December 2021, <<https://www.ietf.org/archive/id/draft-ietf-idr-bgp-open-policy-18.txt>>.

[RFC4271] Rekhter, Y., Ed., Li, T., Ed., and S. Hares, Ed., "A Border Gateway Protocol 4 (BGP-4)", RFC 4271, DOI 10.17487/RFC4271, January 2006, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4271>>.

[RFC8126] Cotton, M., Leiba, B., and T. Narten, "Guidelines for Writing an IANA Considerations Section in RFCs", BCP 26, RFC 8126, DOI 10.17487/RFC8126, June 2017, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8126>>.

#### **Author's Address**

Job Snijders  
Fastly  
Amsterdam  
Netherlands

Email: [job@fastly.com](mailto:job@fastly.com)