

Network Working Group
Internet-Draft
Intended status: Informational
Expires: September 6, 2018

N. Sullivan
Cloudflare
C. Wood
Apple Inc.
March 05, 2018

Hashing to Elliptic Curves
draft-sullivan-cfrg-hash-to-curve-00

Abstract

This document specifies a number of algorithms that may be used to hash arbitrary strings to Elliptic Curves.

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on September 6, 2018.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2018 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Internet-Draft

hash-to-curve

March 2018

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	2
1.1.	Requirements	3
2.	Algorithm Recommendations	3
3.	Generic Interface	4
3.1.	Utility Functions	4
4.	Hashing Variants	5
4.1.	Icart Method	5
4.2.	Shallue-Woestijne-Ulas Method	6
4.3.	Simplified SWU Method	6
4.4.	Elligator2 Method	8
5.	Curve Transformations	10
6.	Cost Comparison	10
7.	IANA Considerations	11
8.	Security Considerations	11
9.	Acknowledgements	11
10.	Contributors	11
11.	Normative References	11
Appendix A.	Try-and-Increment Method	13
Appendix B.	Sample Code	13
B.1.	Icart Method	13
B.2.	Shallue-Woestijne-Ulas Method	14
B.3.	Simplified SWU Method	15
B.4.	Elligator2 Method	16
	Authors' Addresses	17

[1.](#) Introduction

Many cryptographic protocols require a procedure which maps arbitrary input, e.g., passwords, to points on an elliptic curve (EC). Prominent examples include Simple Password Exponential Key Exchange [[Jablon96](#)], Password Authenticated Key Exchange [[BMP00](#)], and Boneh-Lynn-Shacham signatures [[BLS01](#)].

Let E be an elliptic curve over base field $GF(p)$. In practice, efficient (polynomial-time) functions that hash arbitrary input to E can be constructed by composing a cryptographically secure hash function $F1 : \{0,1\}^* \rightarrow GF(p)$ and an injection $F2 : GF(p) \rightarrow E$, i.e., $Hash(m) = F2(F1(m))$. Probabilistic constructions of Hash, e.g., the MapToGroup function described by Boneh et al. [[BLS01](#)]. Their algorithm fails with probability 2^{-I} , where I is a tunable parameter that one can control. Another variant, dubbed the "Try and

Increment" approach, was described by Boneh et al. [[BLS01](#)]. This function works by hashing input m using a standard hash function, e.g., SHA256, and then checking to see if the resulting point $E(m, f(m))$, for curve function f , belongs on E . This algorithm is expected to find a valid curve point after approximately two

attempts, i.e., when $ctr=1$, on average. (See [Appendix A](#) for a more detailed description of this algorithm.) Since the running time of the algorithm depends on m , this algorithm is NOT safe for cases sensitive to timing side channel attacks. Deterministic algorithms are needed in such cases where failures are undesirable. Shallue and Woestijne [[SWU](#)] first introduced a deterministic algorithm that maps elements in $F_{\{q\}}$ to an EC in time $O(\log^4 q)$, where $q = p^n$ for some prime p , and time $O(\log^3 q)$ when $q = 3 \pmod 4$. Icart introduced yet another deterministic algorithm which maps $F_{\{q\}}$ to any EC where $q = 2 \pmod 3$ in time $O(\log^3 q)$ [[Icart09](#)]. Elligator (2) [[Elligator2](#)] is yet another deterministic algorithm for any odd-characteristic EC that has a point of order 2. Elligator2 can be applied to Curve25519 and Curve448, which are both CFRG-recommended curves [[RFC7748](#)].

This document specifies several algorithms for deterministically hashing onto a curve with varying properties: Icart, SWU, Simplified SWU, and Elligator2. Each algorithm conforms to a common interface, i.e., it maps an element from a base field F to a curve E . For each variant, we describe the requirements for F and E to make it work. Sample code for each variant is presented in the appendix. Unless otherwise stated, all elliptic curve points are assumed to be represented as affine coordinates, i.e., (x, y) points on a curve.

[1.1](#). Requirements

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [[RFC2119](#)].

[2](#). Algorithm Recommendations

The following table lists recommended algorithms to use for specific curves.

+-----+-----+-----+

Curve	Algorithm
P-256	SWU Section 4.3
P-384	Icart Section 4.1
Curve25519	Elligator2 Section 4.4
Curve448	Elligator2 Section 4.4

The SWU variant from Section [Section 4.2](#) applies to any curve. As such, this algorithm SHOULD be used if no other better alternative is known. More efficient variants and their curve requirements are shown in the table below. These MAY be used if the target curve meets the listed criteria.

Algorithm	Requirement
Icart Section 4.1	$p = 2 \pmod 3$
SWU Section 4.2	None
Simplified SWU Section 4.3	$p = 3 \pmod 4$
Elligator2 Section 4.4	p is large and there is a point of order two and j -invariant $\neq 1728$

[3.](#) Generic Interface

The generic interface for hashing to elliptic curves is as follows:

```
hash_to_curve(alpha)
```

where alpha is a message to hash onto a curve.

[3.1.](#) Utility Functions

Algorithms in this document make use of utility functions described below.

- o `HashToBase(x)`: $H(x)[0:\log_2(p) + 1]$, i.e., hash-truncate-reduce, where H is a cryptographic hash function, such as SHA256, and p is the prime order of base field F_p .
- o `CMOV(a, b, c)`: If $c = 1$, return a , else return b .

Note: We assume that `HashToBase` maps its input to the base field uniformly. In practice, there may be inherent biases in p , e.g., $p = 2^k - 1$ will have non-negligible bias in higher bits.

((TODO: expand on this problem))

[4.](#) Hashing Variants

[4.1.](#) Icart Method

The following `hash_to_curve_icart(alpha)` implements the Icart method from [[Icart09](#)]. This algorithm works for any curve over F_{p^n} , where $p^n = 2 \pmod 3$ (or $p = 2 \pmod 3$ and for odd n), including:

- o P384
- o Curve1174
- o Curve448

Unsupported curves include: P224, P256, P521, and Curve25519 since, for each, $p = 1 \pmod 3$.

Mathematically, given input α , and A and B from E , the Icart method works as follows:

$$u = \text{HashToBase}(\alpha)$$
$$x = (v^2 - b - (u^6 / 27))^{1/3} + (u^2 / 3)$$

$$y = ux + v$$

where $v = ((3A - u^4) / 6u)$.

The following procedure implements this algorithm in a straight-line fashion. It requires knowledge of A and B, the constants from the curve Weierstrass form. It outputs a point with affine coordinates.

hash_to_curve_icart(alpha)

Input:

alpha - value to be hashed, an octet string

Output:

(x, y) - a point in E

Steps:

1. $u = \text{HashToBase}(\text{alpha})$ // $\{0,1\}^* \rightarrow \mathbb{F}_p$
2. $u2 = u^2 \pmod{p}$ // u^2
3. $t2 = u2^2 \pmod{p}$ // u^4

```

4.  v1 = 3 * A (mod p)           // 3A
5.  v1 = v1 - t2 (mod p)        // 3A - u^4
6.  t1 = 6 * u (mod p)          // 6u
7.  t3 = t1 ^ (-1) (mod p)      // modular inverse
8.  v = v1 * t3 (mod p)         // (3A - u^4)/(6u)
9.  x = v^2 (mod p)             // v^2
10. x = x - B (mod p)           // v^2 - b
11. t1 = 27 ^ (-1) (mod p)      // 1/27
12. t1 = t1 * u2 (mod p)        // u^4 / 27
13. t1 = t1 * t2 (mod p)        // u^6 / 27
14. x = x - t1 (mod p)          // v^2 - b - u^6/27
15. t1 = (2 * p) - 1 (mod p)    // 2p - 1
16. t1 = t1 / 3 (mod p)         // (2p - 1)/3
17. x = x^t1 (mod p)            // (v^2 - b - u^6/27) ^ (1/3)
18. t2 = u2 / 3 (mod p)         // u^2 / 3
19. x = x + t2 (mod p)          // (v^2 - b - u^6/27) ^ (1/3) + (u^2 / 3)
20. y = u * x (mod p)           // ux
21. y = y + v (mod p)           // ux + v
22. Output (x, y)

```

[4.2.](#) Shallue-Woestijne-Ulas Method

((TODO: write this section))

[4.3.](#) Simplified SWU Method

The following `hash_to_curve_simple_swu(alpha)` implements the simplified Shallue-Woestijne-Ulas algorithm from [[SimpleSWU](#)]. This algorithm works for any curve over $F_{\{p^n\}}$, where $p = 3 \bmod 4$, including:

- o P256

- o ...

Given curve equation $g(x) = x^3 + Ax + B$, this algorithm works as follows:

1. $t = \text{HashToBase}(\alpha)$
2. $\alpha = (-b / a) * (1 + (1 / (t^4 + t^2)))$
3. $\beta = -t^2 * \alpha$

4. $z = t^3 * g(\alpha)$
5. Output $(-g * \alpha) * (g * \beta)$

The following procedure implements this algorithm. It outputs a point with affine coordinates.

Input:

alpha - value to be hashed, an octet string

Output:

(x, y) - a point in E

Steps:

1. $t = \text{HashToBase}(\text{alpha})$
2. $\text{alpha} = t^2 \pmod{p}$
3. $\text{alpha} = \text{alpha} * -1 \pmod{p}$
4. $\text{right} = \text{alpha}^2 + \text{alpha} \pmod{p}$
5. $\text{right} = \text{right}^{-1} \pmod{p}$
6. $\text{right} = \text{right} + 1 \pmod{p}$
7. $\text{left} = B * -1 \pmod{p}$
8. $\text{left} = \text{left} / A \pmod{p}$
9. $x_2 = \text{left} * \text{right} \pmod{p}$
10. $x_3 = \text{alpha} * x_2 \pmod{p}$
11. $h_2 = x_2^3 \pmod{p}$
12. $i_2 = x_2 * A \pmod{p}$
13. $i_2 = i_2 + B \pmod{p}$
14. $h_2 = h_2 + i_2 \pmod{p}$
15. $h_3 = x_3^3 \pmod{p}$
16. $i_3 = x_3 * A \pmod{p}$
17. $i_3 = i_3 + B \pmod{p}$
18. $h_3 = h_3 + i_3 \pmod{p}$
19. $y_1 = h_2^{((p+1)//4)} \pmod{p}$
20. $y_2 = h_3^{((p+1)//4)} \pmod{p}$
21. $e = (y_1^2 == h_2)$
22. $x = \text{CMOV}(x_2, x_3, e)$ // If $e = 1$, choose x_2 , else choose x_3
23. $y = \text{CMOV}(y_1, y_2, e)$ // If $e = 1$, choose y_1 , else choose y_2
24. Output (x, y)

[4.4.](#) Elligator2 Method

The following `hash_to_curve_elligator2(alpha)` implements the Elligator2 method from [\[Elligator2\]](#). This algorithm works for any curve with a point of order 2 and j -invariant $\neq 1728$. Given curve equation $f(x) = y^2 = x(x^2 + Ax + B)$, i.e., a Montgomery form with the point of order 2 at $(0,0)$, this algorithm works as shown below. (Note that any curve with a point of order 2 is isomorphic to this representation.)

-
1. $r = \text{HashToBase}(\alpha)$
 2. If $f(-A/(1+ur^2))$ is square, then output $f(-A/(1+ur^2))^{(1/2)}$
 3. Else, output $f(-Aur^2/(1+ur^2))^{(1/2)}$

Another way to express this algorithm is as follows:

1. $r = \text{HashToBase}(\alpha)$
2. $d = -A / (1 + ur^2)$
3. $e = f(d)^{((p-1)/2)}$
4. $u = ed - (1 - e)A/u$

Here, e is the Legendre symbol of $y = (d^3 + Ad^2 + d)$, which will be 1 if y is a quadratic residue (square) mod p , and -1 otherwise. (Note that raising y to $((p-1)/2)$ is a common way to compute the Legendre symbol.)

The following procedure implements this algorithm.

Internet-Draft

hash-to-curve

March 2018

hash_to_curve_elligator2(alpha)

Input:

alpha - value to be hashed, an octet string

u - fixed non-square value in F_p .

f() - Curve function

Output:

(x, y) - a point in E

Steps:

1. $r = \text{HashToBase}(\text{alpha})$
2. $r = r^2 \pmod{p}$
3. $nu = r * u \pmod{p}$
4. $r = nu$
5. $r = r + 1 \pmod{p}$
6. $r = r^{-1} \pmod{p}$
7. $v = A * r \pmod{p}$
8. $v = v * -1 \pmod{p}$ // $-A / (1 + ur^2)$
9. $v2 = v^2 \pmod{p}$
10. $v3 = v * v2 \pmod{p}$
11. $e = v3 * v \pmod{p}$
12. $v2 = v2 * A \pmod{p}$
13. $e = v2 * e \pmod{p}$
14. $e = e^{((p - 1) / 2)}$ // Legendre symbol
15. $nv = v * -1 \pmod{p}$
16. $v = \text{CMOV}(v, nv, e)$ // If $e = 1$, choose v , else choose nv
17. $v2 = \text{CMOV}(0, A, e)$ // If $e = 1$, choose 0 , else choose A
18. $u = v - v2 \pmod{p}$
19. Output (u, f(u))

Elligator2 can be simplified with projective coordinates.

((TODO: write this variant))

5. Curve Transformations

((TODO: write this section))

6. Cost Comparison

The following table summarizes the cost of each hash_to_curve variant. We express this cost in terms of additions (A), multiplications (M), squares (SQ), and square roots (SR).

((TODO: finish this section))

Algorithm	Cost (Operations)
hash_to_curve_icart	TODO
hash_to_curve_swu	TODO
hash_to_curve_simple_swu	TODO
hash_to_curve_elligator2	TODO

7. IANA Considerations

This document has no IANA actions.

8. Security Considerations

Each hash function variant accepts arbitrary input and maps it to a pseudorandom point on the curve. Points are close to indistinguishable from randomly chosen elements on the curve. Some variants are not full-domain hashes. Elligator2, for example, only maps strings to "about half of all curve points," whereas Icart's method only covers about 5/8 of the points.

9. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Adam Langley for this detailed writeup up Elligator2 with Curve25519 [[ElligatorAGL](#)]. We also thank Sean Devlin and Thomas Icart for feedback on earlier versions of this

document.

10. Contributors

- o Sharon Goldberg
Boston University
goldbe@cs.bu.edu

11. Normative References

- [BLS01] "Short signatures from the Weil pairing", n.d.,
<<https://iacr.org/archive/asiacrypt2001/22480516.pdf>>.
- [BMP00] "Provably secure password-authenticated key exchange using
diffie-hellman", n.d..

Sullivan & Wood

Expires September 6, 2018

[Page 11]

Internet-Draft

hash-to-curve

March 2018

- [ECOPRF] "EC-OPRF - Oblivious Pseudorandom Functions using Elliptic
Curves", n.d..
- [Elligator2]
"Elligator -- Elliptic-curve points indistinguishable from
uniform random strings", n.d., <[https://dl.acm.org/
ft_gateway.cfm?id=2516734&type=pdf](https://dl.acm.org/ft_gateway.cfm?id=2516734&type=pdf)>.
- [ElligatorAGL]
"Implementing Elligator for Curve25519", n.d.,
<[https://www.imperialviolet.org/2013/12/25/
elligator.html](https://www.imperialviolet.org/2013/12/25/elligator.html)>.
- [Icart09] "How to Hash into Elliptic Curves", n.d.,
<<https://eprint.iacr.org/2009/226.pdf>>.
- [Jablon96]
"Strong password-only authenticated key exchange", n.d..
- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate
Requirement Levels", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 2119](#),
DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997, <[https://www.rfc-
editor.org/info/rfc2119](https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119)>.
- [RFC7748] Langley, A., Hamburg, M., and S. Turner, "Elliptic Curves

for Security", [RFC 7748](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7748, January 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7748>>.

[RFC8017] Moriarty, K., Ed., Kaliski, B., Jonsson, J., and A. Rusch, "PKCS #1: RSA Cryptography Specifications Version 2.2", [RFC 8017](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8017, November 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8017>>.

[RFC8032] Josefsson, S. and I. Liusvaara, "Edwards-Curve Digital Signature Algorithm (EdDSA)", [RFC 8032](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8032, January 2017, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8032>>.

[SECG1] "SEC 1 -- Elliptic Curve Cryptography", n.d., <<http://www.secg.org/sec1-v2.pdf>>.

[SimpleSWU] "Efficient Indifferentiable Hashing into Ordinary Elliptic Curves", n.d..

[SWU] "Rational points on certain hyperelliptic curves over finite fields", n.d., <<https://arxiv.org/pdf/0706.1448>>.

[Appendix A](#). Try-and-Increment Method

In cases where constant time execution is not required, the so-called try-and-increment method may be appropriate. As discussed in [Section 1](#), this variant works by hashing input m using a standard hash function ("Hash"), e.g., SHA256, and then checking to see if the resulting point $E(m, f(m))$, for curve function f , belongs on E . This is detailed below.

1. $ctr = 0$
3. $h = \text{"INVALID"}$
4. While h is "INVALID" or h is EC point at infinity:
 - A. $CTR = \text{I2OSP}(ctr, 4)$
 - B. $ctr = ctr + 1$
 - C. $\text{attempted_hash} = \text{Hash}(m \parallel CTR)$
 - D. $h = \text{RS2ECP}(\text{attempted_hash})$
 - E. If h is not "INVALID" and $\text{cofactor} > 1$, set $h = h^{\text{cofactor}}$
5. Output h

I2OSP is a function that converts a nonnegative integer to octet string as defined in [Section 4.1 of \[RFC8017\]](#), and RS2ECP is a function that converts of a random 2n-octet string to an EC point as specified in [Section 5.1.3 of \[RFC8032\]](#).

[Appendix B](#). Sample Code

[B.1](#). Icart Method

The following Sage program implements `hash_to_curve_icart(alpha)` for P-384.

```
p = 394020061963944792122790401001436138050797392704654466679482934042 \
45721771496870329047266088258938001861606973112319
F = GF(p)
A = p - 3
B = 0xb3312fa7e23ee7e4988e056be3f82d19181d9c6efe8141120314088f5013875a \
c656398d8a2ed19d2a85c8edd3ec2aef
q = 394020061963944792122790401001436138050797392704654466679469052796 \
27659399113263569398956308152294913554433653942643
E = EllipticCurve([F(A), F(B)])
g = E(0xaa87ca22be8b05378eb1c71ef320ad746e1d3b628ba79b9859f741e082542a \
385502f25dbf55296c3a545e3872760ab7, \
0x3617de4a96262c6f5d9e98bf9292dc29f8f41dbd289a147ce9da3113b5f0b8c0 \
0a60b1ce1d7e819d7a431d7c90ea0e5f)
E.set_order(q)
```

```
def icart(u):
    u = F(u)
```

```
v = (3*A - u^4)/(6*u)
x = (v^2 - B - u^6/27)^((2*p-1)//3) + u^2/3
y = u*x + v
return E(x, y)
```

```
def icart_straight(u):
    u = F(u)
    u2 = u ^ 2
    t2 = u2 ^ 2
    assert t2 == u^4
```

```

v1 = 3 * A
v1 = v1 - t2
t1 = 6 * u
t3 = t1 ^ (-1)
v = v1 * t3
assert v == (3 * A - u^4) // (6 * u)

x = v ^ 2
x = x - B
assert x == (v^2 - B)

t1 = F(27) ^ (-1)
t1 = t1 * u2
t1 = t1 * t2
assert t1 == ((u^6) / 27)

x = x - t1
t1 = (2 * p) - 1
t1 = t1 / 3
assert t1 == ((2*p) - 1) / 3

x = x ^ t1

t2 = u2 / 3
x = x + t2
y = u * x
y = y + v
return E(x, y)

```

[B.2.](#) Shallue-Woestijne-Ulas Method

((TODO: write this section))

[B.3.](#) Simplified SWU Method

The following Sage program implements `hash_to_curve_swu(alpha)` for P-256.


```

p = 115792089210356248762697446949407573530086143415290314195533631308 \
867097853951
F = GF(p)
A = F(p - 3)
B = F(ZZ("5ac635d8aa3a93e7b3ebbd55769886bc651d06b0cc53b0f63bce3c3e27d2 \
604b", 16))
E = EllipticCurve([A, B])

def simple_swu(alpha):
    t = F(alpha)

    alpha = -(t^2)
    frac = (1 / (alpha^2 + alpha))
    x2 = (-B / A) * (1 + frac)

    x3 = alpha * x2
    h2 = x2^3 + A * x2 + B
    h3 = x3^3 + A * x3 + B

    if is_square(h2):
        return E(x2, h2^((p + 1) // 4))
    else:
        return E(x3, h3^((p + 1) // 4))

def simple_swu_straight(alpha):
    t = F(alpha)

    alpha = t^2
    alpha = alpha * -1

    right = alpha^2 + alpha
    right = right^(-1)
    right = right + 1

    left = B * -1
    left = left / A

    x2 = left * right
    x3 = alpha * x2

    h2 = x2 ^ 3
    i2 = x2 * A
    i2 = i2 + B

```

```
h2 = h2 + i2

h3 = x3 ^ 3
i3 = x3 * A
i3 = i3 + B
h3 = h3 + i3

y1 = h2^((p + 1) // 4)
y2 = h3^((p + 1) // 4)

# Is it square?
e = y1^2 == h2

x = x2
if e != 1:
    x = x3

y = y1
if e != 1:
    y = y2

return E(x, y)
```

[B.4.](#) Elligator2 Method

The following Sage program implements `hash_to_curve_elligator2(alpha)` for Curve25519.

```
p = 2**255 - 19
F = GF(p)
A = 486662
B = 1
E = EllipticCurve(F, [0, A, 0, 1, 0])

def curve25519(x):
    return x^3 + (A * x^2) + x

def elligator2(alpha):

    r = F(alpha)

    # u is a fixed nonsquare value, eg -1 if p==3 mod 4.
    u = F(2) # F(2)
    assert(not u.is_square())

    # If f(-A/(1+ur^2)) is square, return its square root.
    # Else, return the square root of f(-Aur^2/(1+ur^2)).
```

$$x = -A / (1 + (u * r^2))$$

```
y = curve25519(x)
if y.is_square(): # is this point square?
    y = y.square_root()
else:
    x = (-A * u * r^2) / (1 + (u * r^2))
    y = curve25519(x).square_root()

return (x, curve25519(x))

def elligator2_straight(alpha):
    r = F(alpha)

    r = r^2
    r = r * 2
    r = r + 1
    r = r^(-1)
    v = A * r
    v = v * -1 # d

    v2 = v^2
    v3 = v * v2
    e = v3 + v
    v2 = v2 * A
    e = v2 + e

    # Legendre symbol
    e = e^((p - 1) / 2)

    nv = v * -1
    if e != 1:
        v = nv

    v2 = 0
    if e != 1:
        v2 = A

    u = v - v2

    return (u, curve25519(u))
```

Authors' Addresses

Sullivan & Wood

Expires September 6, 2018

[Page 17]

Internet-Draft

hash-to-curve

March 2018

Nick Sullivan
Cloudflare
101 Townsend St
San Francisco
United States of America

Email: nick@cloudflare.com

Christopher A. Wood
Apple Inc.
One Apple Park Way
Cupertino, California 95014
United States of America

Email: cawood@apple.com

Sullivan & Wood

Expires September 6, 2018

[Page 18]