

Network Working Group  
Internet-Draft  
Updates: [2616](#) (if approved)  
Intended status: Standards Track  
Expires: July 15, 2013

T. Bray  
Google  
January 11, 2013

**A New HTTP Status Code to Report Legal Obstacles**  
**draft-tbray-http-legally-restricted-status-02**

Abstract

This document specifies an additional Hypertext Transfer Protocol (HTTP) status code for use when resource access is denied due to legal demands.

Status of this Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <http://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on July 15, 2013.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2013 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

## Table of Contents

|                             |   |                   |
|-----------------------------|---|-------------------|
| <a href="#">1.</a>          | Introduction . . . . .                      | <a href="#">3</a> |
| <a href="#">2.</a>          | Requirements . . . . .                      | <a href="#">3</a> |
| <a href="#">3.</a>          | 451 Unavailable For Legal Reasons . . . . . | <a href="#">3</a> |
| <a href="#">4.</a>          | Security Considerations . . . . .           | <a href="#">4</a> |
| <a href="#">5.</a>          | IANA Considerations . . . . .               | <a href="#">4</a> |
| <a href="#">6.</a>          | Normative References . . . . .              | <a href="#">4</a> |
| <a href="#">Appendix A.</a> | Acknowledgements . . . . .                  | <a href="#">5</a> |
|                             | Author's Address . . . . .                  | <a href="#">5</a> |

## **1. Introduction**

This document specifies an additional Hypertext Transfer Protocol (HTTP) status code for use when resource access is denied due to legal demands. This allows server operators to provide greater transparency in circumstances where issues of law or public policy affect their operation. This transparency may be beneficial both to these operators and to end users.

Feedback should occur on the [ietf-http-wg@w3.org](mailto:ietf-http-wg@w3.org) mailing list, although this draft is NOT a work item of the IETF HTTPbis Working Group.

## **2. Requirements**

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [[RFC2119](#)].

## **3. 451 Unavailable For Legal Reasons**

This status code indicates that the server is denying access to the resource in response to a legal demand.

Since such demands typically apply to all operators in a legal jurisdiction, the server in question may or may not be an origin server. The demands typically most directly affect the operations of ISPs and search engines.

Responses using this status code SHOULD include an explanation, in the response body, of the details of the legal demand: the party making it, the applicable legislation or regulation, and what classes of person and resource it applies to. For example:



HTTP/1.1 451 Unavailable For Legal Reasons

Content-Type: text/html

```
<html>
<head>
<title>Unavailable For Legal Reasons</title>
</head>
<body>
<h1>Unavailable For Legal Reasons</h1>
<p>This request may not be serviced in the Roman Province
of Judea due to the Lex Julia Majestatis, which disallows
access to resources hosted on servers deemed to be
operated by the People's Front of Judea.</p>
</body>
</html>
```

The use of the 451 status code implies neither the existence nor non-existence of the resource named in the request. That is to say, it is possible that if the legal demands were removed, a request for the resource still might not succeed.

## **4. Security Considerations**

### **4.1. 451 Unavailable for Legal Reasons**

The 451 status code is optional; clients cannot rely upon its use. It is possible that certain legal authorities may wish to avoid transparency, and not only demand the restriction of access to certain resources, but also avoid disclosing that the demand was made.

## **5. IANA Considerations**

The HTTP Status Codes Registry should be updated with the following entries:

- o Code: 451
- o Description: Unavailable for Legal Reasons
- o Specification: [ this document ]

## **6. Normative References**

[RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 2119](#), March 1997.



## **Appendix A. Acknowledgements**

Thanks to Terence Eden, who observed that the existing status code 403 was not really suitable for this situation, and suggested the creation of a new status code.

Thanks also to Ray Bradbury.

The author takes all responsibility for errors and omissions.

### Author's Address

Tim Bray  
Google

Email: [tbray@textuality.com](mailto:tbray@textuality.com)

URI: <http://www.tbray.org/ongoing/>

