

NETCONF Working Group
Internet-Draft
Intended status: Standards Track
Expires: 28 April 2022

K. Watsen
Watsen Networks
Q. Wu
Huawei Technologies
O. Hagsand
Netgate
H. Li
Hewlett Packard Enterprise
P. Andersson
Cisco Systems
25 October 2021

List Pagination for YANG-driven Protocols
draft-wwlh-netconf-list-pagination-00

Abstract

In some circumstances, instances of YANG modeled "list" and "leaf-list" nodes may contain numerous entries. Retrieval of all the entries can lead to inefficiencies in the server, the client, and the network in between.

This document defines a model for list pagination that can be implemented by YANG-driven management protocols such as NETCONF and RESTCONF. The model supports paging over optionally filtered and/or sorted entries. The solution additionally enables servers to constrain query expressions on some "config false" lists or leaf-lists.

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of [BCP 78](#) and [BCP 79](#).

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on 28 April 2022.

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2021 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the [Trust Legal Provisions](#) and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	3
1.1.	Terminology	4
1.2.	Conventions	4
1.3.	Adherence to the NMDA	4
2.	Solution Overview	4
3.	Solution Details	5
3.1.	Query Parameters for a Targeted List or Leaf-List	5
3.2.	Query Parameter for Descendant Lists and Leaf-Lists . . .	8
3.3.	Constraints on "where" and "sort-by" for "config false" Lists	9
3.3.1.	Identifying Constrained "config false" Lists and Leaf-Lists	10
3.3.2.	Indicating the Constraints for "where" Filters and "sort-by" Expressions	10
4.	The "ietf-list-pagination" Module	11
4.1.	Data Model Overview	11
4.2.	Example Usage	12
4.2.1.	Constraining a "config false" list	12
4.2.2.	Indicating number remaining in a limited list	12
4.3.	YANG Module	12
5.	IANA Considerations	19
5.1.	The "IETF XML" Registry	19
5.2.	The "YANG Module Names" Registry	19
6.	Security Considerations	19
6.1.	Regarding the "ietf-list-pagination" YANG Module	19
7.	References	19
7.1.	Normative References	20

7.2.	Informative References	20
Appendix A.	Vector Tests	21
A.1.	Example YANG Module	21
A.2.	Example Data Set	28
A.3.	Example Queries	32

A.3.1.	The "limit" Parameter	33
A.3.2.	The "offset" Parameter	35
A.3.3.	The "direction" Parameter	38
A.3.4.	The "sort-by" Parameter	39
A.3.5.	The "where" Parameter	42
A.3.6.	The "sublist-limit" Parameter	44
A.3.7.	Combinations of Parameters	48
	Acknowledgements	50
	Authors' Addresses	50

[1.](#) Introduction

YANG modeled "list" and "leaf-list" nodes may contain a large number of entries. For instance, there may be thousands of entries in the configuration for network interfaces or access control lists. And time-driven logging mechanisms, such as an audit log or a traffic log, can contain millions of entries.

Retrieval of all the entries can lead to inefficiencies in the server, the client, and the network in between. For instance, consider the following:

- * A client may need to filter and/or sort list entries in order to, e.g., present the view requested by a user.
- * A server may need to iterate over many more list entries than needed by a client.
- * A network may need to convey more data than needed by a client.

Optimal global resource utilization is obtained when clients are able to cherry-pick just that which is needed to support the application-level business logic.

This document defines a generic model for list pagination that can be implemented by YANG-driven management protocols such as NETCONF

[[RFC6241](#)] and RESTCONF [[RFC8040](#)]. Details for how such protocols are updated are outside the scope of this document.

The model presented in this document supports paging over optionally filtered and/or sorted entries. Server-side filtering and sorting is ideal as servers can leverage indexes maintained by a backend storage layer to accelerate queries.

[1.1.](#) Terminology

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "NOT RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [BCP 14](#) [[RFC2119](#)] [[RFC8174](#)] when, and only when, they appear in all capitals, as shown here.

The following terms are defined in [[RFC7950](#)] and are not redefined here: client, data model, data tree, feature, extension, module, leaf, leaf-list, and server.

[1.2.](#) Conventions

Various examples used in this document use a placeholder value for binary data that has been base64 encoded (e.g., "BASE64VALUE="). This placeholder value is used as real base64 encoded structures are often many lines long and hence distracting to the example being presented.

[1.3.](#) Adherence to the NMDA

This document is compliant with the Network Management Datastore Architecture (NMDA) [[RFC8342](#)]. The "ietf-list-pagination" module only defines a YANG extension and augments a couple leafs into a "config false" node defined by the "ietf-system-capabilities" module.

[2.](#) Solution Overview

The solution presented in this document broadly entails a client sending a query to a server targeting a specific list or leaf-list including optional parameters guiding which entries should be returned.

A secondary aspect of this solution entails a client sending a query parameter to a server guiding how descendent lists and leaf-lists should be returned. This parameter may be used on any target node, not just "list" and "leaf-list" nodes.

Clients detect a server's support for list pagination via an entry for the "ietf-list-pagination" module (defined in [Section 4](#)) in the server's YANG Library [[RFC8525](#)] response.

Relying on client-provided query parameters ensures servers remain backward compatible with legacy clients.

[3.](#) Solution Details

This section is composed of the following subsections:

- * [Section 3.1](#) defines five query parameters clients may use to page through the entries of a single list or leaf-list in a data tree.
- * [Section 3.2](#) defines one query parameter that clients may use to affect the content returned for descendant lists and leaf-lists.
- * [Section 3.3](#) defines per schema-node tags enabling servers to indicate which "config false" lists are constrained and how they may be interacted with.

[3.1.](#) Query Parameters for a Targeted List or Leaf-List

The five query parameters presented this section are listed in processing order. This processing order is logical, efficient, and matches the processing order implemented by database systems, such as SQL.

The order is as follows: a server first processes the "where"

parameter (see [Section 3.1.1](#)), then the "sort-by" parameter (see [Section 3.1.2](#)), then the "direction" parameter (see [Section 3.1.3](#)), then the "offset" parameter (see [Section 3.1.4](#)), and lastly the "limit" parameter (see [Section 3.1.5](#)).

[3.1.1](#). The "where" Query Parameter

Description

The "where" query parameter specifies a filter expression that result-set entries must match.

Default Value

If this query parameter is unspecified, then no entries are filtered from the working result-set.

Allowed Values

The allowed values are XPath 1.0 expressions. It is an error if the XPath expression references a node identifier that does not exist in the schema, is optional or conditional in the schema or, for constrained "config false" lists and leaf-lists (see [Section 3.3](#)), if the node identifier does not point to a node having the "indexed" extension statement applied to it (see [Section 3.3.2](#)).

Conformance

The "where" query parameter MUST be supported for all "config true" lists and leaf-lists and SHOULD be supported for "config false" lists and leaf-lists. Servers MAY disable the support for some or all "config false" lists and leaf-lists as described in [Section 3.3.2](#).

[3.1.2](#). The "sort-by" Query Parameter

Description

The "sort-by" query parameter indicates the node in the working result-set (i.e., after the "where" parameter has been applied) that entries should be sorted by. Sorts are in ascending order (e.g., '1' before '9', 'a' before 'z', etc.). Missing values are sorted to the end (e.g., after all nodes having values). Sub-

sorts are not supported.

Default Value

If this query parameter is unspecified, then the list or leaf-list's default order is used, per the YANG "ordered-by" statement (see [Section 7.7.7 of \[RFC7950\]](#)).

Allowed Values

The allowed values are node identifiers. It is an error if the specified node identifier does not exist in the schema, is optional or conditional in the schema or, for constrained "config false" lists and leaf-lists (see [Section 3.3](#)), if the node identifier does not point to a node having the "indexed" extension statement applied to it (see [Section 3.3.2](#)).

Conformance

The "sort-by" query parameter MUST be supported for all "config true" lists and leaf-lists and SHOULD be supported for "config false" lists and leaf-lists. Servers MAY disable the support for some or all "config false" lists and leaf-lists as described in [Section 3.3.2](#).

[3.1.3](#). The "direction" Query Parameter

Description

The "direction" query parameter indicates how the entries in the working result-set (i.e., after the "sort-by" parameter has been applied) should be traversed.

Default Value

If this query parameter is unspecified, the default value is "forwards".

Allowed Values

The allowed values are:

forwards

Return entries in the forwards direction. Also known as the "default" or "ascending" direction.

backwards

Return entries in the backwards direction. Also known as the "reverse" or "descending" direction

Conformance

The "direction" query parameter MUST be supported for all lists and leaf-lists.

[3.1.4.](#) The "offset" Query Parameter

Description

The "offset" query parameter indicates the number of entries in the working result-set (i.e., after the "direction" parameter has been applied) that should be skipped over when preparing the response.

Default Value

If this query parameter is unspecified, then no entries in the result-set are skipped, same as when the offset value '0' is specified.

Allowed Values

The allowed values are unsigned integers. It is an error for the offset value to exceed the number of entries in the working result-set, and the "offset-out-of-range" identity SHOULD be produced in the error output when this occurs.

Conformance

The "offset" query parameter MUST be supported for all lists and leaf-lists.

[3.1.5.](#) The "limit" Query Parameter

Description

The "limit" query parameter limits the number of entries returned from the working result-set (i.e., after the "offset" parameter has been applied). Any list or leaf-list that is limited includes, somewhere in its encoding, a metadata value [[RFC7952](#)] called "remaining", a positive integer indicating the number of elements that were not included in the result-set by the "limit" operation, or the value "unknown" in case, e.g., the server determines that counting would be prohibitively expensive.

Default Value

If this query parameter is unspecified, the number of entries that may be returned is unbounded.

Allowed Values

The allowed values are positive integers.

Conformance

The "limit" query parameter MUST be supported for all lists and leaf-lists.

[3.2.](#) Query Parameter for Descendant Lists and Leaf-Lists

Whilst this document primarily regards pagination for a list or leaf-list, it begs the question for how descendant lists and leaf-lists should be handled, which is addressed by the "sublist-limit" query parameter described in this section.

[3.2.1.](#) The "sublist-limit" Query Parameter

Description

The "sublist-limit" parameter limits the number of entries returned for descendent lists and leaf-lists.

Any descendent list or leaf-list limited by the "sublist-limit" parameter includes, somewhere in its encoding, a metadata value [[RFC7952](#)] called "remaining", a positive integer indicating the number of elements that were not included by the "sublist-limit" parameter, or the value "unknown" in case, e.g., the server determines that counting would be prohibitively expensive.

When used on a list node, it only affects the list's descendant nodes, not the list itself, which is only affected by the parameters presented in [Section 3.1](#).

Default Value

If this query parameter is unspecified, the number of entries that may be returned for descendent lists and leaf-lists is unbounded.

Allowed Values

The allowed values are positive integers.

Conformance

The "sublist-limit" query parameter MUST be supported for all conventional nodes, including a datastore's top-level node (i.e., '/').

[3.3.](#) Constraints on "where" and "sort-by" for "config false" Lists

Some "config false" lists and leaf-lists may contain an enormous number of entries. For instance, a time-driven logging mechanism, such as an audit log or a traffic log, can contain millions of entries.

In such cases, "where" and "sort-by" expressions will not perform well if the server must bring each entry into memory in order to process it.

The server's best option is to leverage query-optimizing features (e.g., indexes) built into the backend database holding the dataset.

However, arbitrary "where" expressions and "sort-by" node identifiers into syntax supported by the backend database and/or query-optimizers may prove challenging, if not impossible, to implement.

Thusly this section introduces mechanisms whereby a server can:

1. Identify which "config false" lists and leaf-lists are constrained.
2. Identify what node-identifiers and expressions are allowed for the constrained lists and leaf-lists.

| Note: The pagination performance for "config true" lists and
| leaf-lists is not considered as already servers must be able to
| process them as configuration. Whilst some "config true" lists
| and leaf-lists may contain thousands of entries, they are well
| within the capability of server-side processing.

[3.3.1.](#) Identifying Constrained "config false" Lists and Leaf-Lists

Identification of which lists and leaf-lists are constrained occurs in the schema tree, not the data tree. However, as server abilities vary, it is not possible to define constraints in YANG modules defining generic data models.

In order to enable servers to identify which lists and leaf-lists are constrained, the solution presented in this document augments the data model defined by the "ietf-system-capabilities" module presented in [[I-D.ietf-netconf-notification-capabilities](#)].

Specifically, the "ietf-list-pagination" module (see [Section 4](#)) augments an empty leaf node called "constrained" into the "per-node-capabilities" node defined in the "ietf-system-capabilities" module.

The "constrained" leaf MAY be specified for any "config false" list or leaf-list.

When a list or leaf-list is constrained:

- * All parts of XPath 1.0 expressions are disabled unless explicitly enabled by [Section 3.3.2](#).
- * Node-identifiers used in "where" expressions and "sort-by" filters MUST have the "indexed" leaf applied to it (see [Section 3.3.2](#)).
- * For lists only, node-identifiers used in "where" expressions and "sort-by" filters MUST NOT descend past any descendent lists. This ensures that only indexes relative to the targeted list are used. Further constraints on node identifiers MAY be applied in [Section 3.3.2](#).

[3.3.2.](#) Indicating the Constraints for "where" Filters and "sort-by" Expressions

This section identifies how constraints for "where" filters and "sort-by" expressions are specified. These constraints are valid only if the "constrained" leaf described in the previous section

[Section 3.3.1](#) has been set on the immediate ancestor "list" node or, for "leaf-list" nodes, on itself.

[3.3.2.1](#). Indicating Filterable/Sortable Nodes

For "where" filters, an unconstrained XPath expressions may use any node in comparisons. However, efficient mappings to backend databases may support only a subset of the nodes.

Similarly, for "sort-by" expressions, efficient sorts may only support a subset of the nodes.

In order to enable servers to identify which nodes may be used in comparisons (for both "where" and "sort-by" expressions), the "ietf-list-pagination" module (see [Section 4](#)) augments an empty leaf node called "indexed" into the "per-node-capabilities" node defined in the "ietf-system-capabilities" module (see [\[I-D.ietf-netconf-notification-capabilities\]](#)).

When a "list" or "leaf-list" node has the "constrained" leaf, only nodes having the "indexed" node may be used in "where" and/or "sort-by" expressions. If no nodes have the "indexed" leaf, when the "constrained" leaf is present, then "where" and "sort-by" expressions are disabled for that list or leaf-list.

[4](#). The "ietf-list-pagination" Module

The "ietf-list-pagination" module is used by servers to indicate that they support pagination on YANG "list" and "leaf-list" nodes, and to provide an ability to indicate which "config false" list and/or "leaf-list" nodes are constrained and, if so, which nodes may be used in "where" and "sort-by" expressions.

[4.1](#). Data Model Overview

The following tree diagram [\[RFC8340\]](#) illustrates the "ietf-list-pagination" module:

```
module: ietf-list-pagination
```

```
    augment /sysc:system-capabilities/sysc:datastore-capabilities
```

```
        /sysc:per-node-capabilities:
+--ro constrained?    empty
+--ro indexed?       empty
```

Comments:

- * As shown, this module augments two optional leaves into the "node-selector" node of the "ietf-system-capabilities" module.
- * Not shown is that the module also defines an "md:annotation" statement named "remaining". This annotation may be present in a server's response to a client request containing either the "limit" ([Section 3.1.5](#)) or "sublist-limit" parameters (Appendix A.3.6).

[4.2.](#) Example Usage

[4.2.1.](#) Constraining a "config false" list

The following example illustrates the "ietf-list-pagination" module's augmentations of the "system-capabilities" data tree. This example assumes the "example-social" module defined in the [Appendix A.1](#) is implemented.

===== NOTE: '\' line wrapping per [RFC 8792](#) =====

```
<system-capabilities
  xmlns="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-system-capabilities"
  xmlns:ds="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-datastores"
  xmlns:es="http://example.com/ns/example-social"
  xmlns:lpg="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-list-pagination">
  <datastore-capabilities>
    <datastore>ds:operational</datastore>
    <per-node-capabilities>
      <node-selector>/es:audit-logs/es:audit-log</node-selector>
      <lpg:constrained/>
    </per-node-capabilities>
    <per-node-capabilities>
      <node-selector>/es:audit-logs/es:audit-log/es:timestamp</node-\
selector>
```

```

        <lpg:indexed/>
    </per-node-capabilities>
    <per-node-capabilities>
        <node-selector>/es:audit-logs/es:audit-log/es:member-id</node-selector>
        <lpg:indexed/>
    </per-node-capabilities>
    <per-node-capabilities>
        <node-selector>/es:audit-logs/es:audit-log/es:outcome</node-selector>
        <lpg:indexed/>
    </per-node-capabilities>
</datastore-capabilities>
</system-capabilities>

```

[4.2.2.](#) Indicating number remaining in a limited list

FIXME: valid syntax for 'where'?

[4.3.](#) YANG Module

This YANG module has normative references to [[RFC7952](#)] and [[I-D.ietf-netconf-notification-capabilities](#)].

```
<CODE BEGINS> file "ietf-list-pagination@2021-10-25.yang"
```

```

module ietf-list-pagination {
  yang-version 1.1;
  namespace
    "urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-list-pagination";
  prefix lpg;

  import ietf-yang-types {
    prefix yang;
    reference
      "RFC 6991: Common YANG Data Types";
  }

  import ietf-yang-metadata {
    prefix md;
    reference
      "RFC 7952: Defining and Using Metadata with YANG";
  }

```

```

}

import ietf-system-capabilities {
    prefix sysc;
    reference
        "draft-ietf-netconf-notification-capabilities:
        YANG Modules describing Capabilities for
        Systems and Datastore Update Notifications";
}

organization
    "IETF NETCONF (Network Configuration) Working Group";

contact
    "WG Web:    <http://tools.ietf.org/wg/netconf/>
    WG List:    <mailto:netconf@ietf.org>";

description
    "This module is used by servers to 1) indicate they support
    pagination on 'list' and 'leaf-list' resources, 2) define a
    grouping for each list-pagination parameter, and 3) indicate
    which 'config false' lists have constrained 'where' and
    'sort-by' parameters and how they may be used, if at all.

    Copyright (c) 2021 IETF Trust and the persons identified
    as authors of the code. All rights reserved.

    Redistribution and use in source and binary forms, with
    or without modification, is permitted pursuant to, and
    subject to the license terms contained in, the Simplified

```

BSD License set forth in [Section 4.c](#) of the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>).

This version of this YANG module is part of RFC XXXX (<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfcXXXX>); see the RFC itself for full legal notices.

The key words 'MUST', 'MUST NOT', 'REQUIRED', 'SHALL', 'SHALL NOT', 'SHOULD', 'SHOULD NOT', 'RECOMMENDED', 'NOT RECOMMENDED', 'MAY', and 'OPTIONAL' in this document

are to be interpreted as described in [BCP 14](#) ([RFC 2119](#)) ([RFC 8174](#)) when, and only when, they appear in all capitals, as shown here.";

```
revision 2021-10-25 {
  description
    "Initial revision.";
  reference
    "RFC XXXX: List Pagination for YANG-driven Protocols";
}
```

// Annotations

```
md:annotation remaining {
  type union {
    type uint32;
    type enumeration {
      enum "unknown" {
        description
          "Indicates that number of remaining entries is unknown
          to the server in case, e.g., the server has determined
          that counting would be prohibitively expensive.";
      }
    }
  }
  description
    "This annotation contains the number of elements not included
    in the result set (a positive value) due to a 'limit' or
    'sublist-limit' operation. If no elements were removed,
    this annotation MUST NOT appear. The minimum value (0),
    which never occurs in normal operation, is reserved to
    represent 'unknown'. The maximum value (2^32-1) is
    reserved to represent any value greater than or equal
    to 2^32-1 elements.";
}
```

// Identities

```
identity list-pagination-error {
  description
```



```

    "Base identity for list-pagination errors.";
}

identity offset-out-of-range {
    base list-pagination-error;
    description
        "The 'offset' query parameter value is greater than the number
        of instances in the target list or leaf-list resource.";
}

// Groupings

grouping where-param-grouping {
    description
        "This grouping may be used by protocol-specific YANG modules
        to define a protocol-specific query parameter.";
    leaf where {
        type union {
            type yang:xpath1.0;
            type enumeration {
                enum "unfiltered" {
                    description
                        "Indicates that no entries are to be filtered
                        from the working result-set.";
                }
            }
        }
        default "unfiltered";
        description
            "The 'where' parameter specifies a boolean expression
            that result-set entries must match.

            It is an error if the XPath expression references a node
            identifier that does not exist in the schema, is optional
            or conditional in the schema or, for constrained 'config
            false' lists and leaf-lists, if the node identifier does
            not point to a node having the 'indexed' extension
            statement applied to it (see RFC XXXX).";
    }
}

grouping sort-by-param-grouping {
    description
        "This grouping may be used by protocol-specific YANG modules

```

```
    to define a protocol-specific query parameter.";
  leaf sort-by {
    type union {
      type string {
        // An RFC 7950 'descendant-schema-nodeid'.
        pattern '([0-9a-fA-F]*:)?[0-9a-fA-F]*'
          + '(/([0-9a-fA-F]*:)?[0-9a-fA-F]*)*';
      }
      type enumeration {
        enum "none" {
          description
            "Indicates that the list or leaf-list's default
             order is to be used, per the YANG 'ordered-by'
             statement.";
        }
      }
    }
    default "none";
    description
      "The 'sort-by' parameter indicates the node in the
       working result-set (i.e., after the 'where' parameter
       has been applied) that entries should be sorted by.

       Sorts are in ascending order (e.g., '1' before '9',
       'a' before 'z', etc.). Missing values are sorted to
       the end (e.g., after all nodes having values).";
  }
}

grouping direction-param-grouping {
  description
    "This grouping may be used by protocol-specific YANG modules
     to define a protocol-specific query parameter.";
  leaf direction {
    type enumeration {
      enum forwards {
        description
          "Indicates that entries should be traversed from
           the first to last item in the working result set.";
      }
      enum backwards {
        description
          "Indicates that entries should be traversed from
           the last to first item in the working result set.";
      }
    }
    default "forwards";
  }
}
```

description

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

```
    "The 'direction' parameter indicates how the entries in the
      working result-set (i.e., after the 'sort-by' parameter
      has been applied) should be traversed.";
  }
}

grouping offset-param-grouping {
  description
    "This grouping may be used by protocol-specific YANG modules
    to define a protocol-specific query parameter.";
  leaf offset {
    type uint32;
    default 0;
    description
      "The 'offset' parameter indicates the number of entries
      in the working result-set (i.e., after the 'direction'
      parameter has been applied) that should be skipped over
      when preparing the response.";
  }
}

grouping limit-param-grouping {
  description
    "This grouping may be used by protocol-specific YANG modules
    to define a protocol-specific query parameter.";
  leaf limit {
    type union {
      type uint32 {
        range "1..max";
      }
      type enumeration {
        enum "unbounded" {
          description
            "Indicates that the number of entries that may be
            returned is unbounded.";
        }
      }
    }
  }
  default "unbounded";
  description
```

"The 'limit' parameter limits the number of entries returned from the working result-set (i.e., after the 'offset' parameter has been applied).

Any result-set that is limited includes, somewhere in its encoding, the metadata value 'remaining' to indicate the number entries not included in the result set.";

}

}

```
grouping sublist-limit-param-grouping {
  description
    "This grouping may be used by protocol-specific YANG modules
    to define a protocol-specific query parameter.";
  leaf sublist-limit {
    type union {
      type uint32 {
        range "1..max";
      }
      type enumeration {
        enum "unbounded" {
          description
            "Indicates that the number of entries that may be
            returned is unbounded.";
        }
      }
    }
  }
  default "unbounded";
  description
    "The 'sublist-limit' parameter limits the number of entries
    for descendent lists and leaf-lists.

    Any result-set that is limited includes, somewhere in
    its encoding, the metadata value 'remaining' to indicate
    the number entries not included in the result set.";
}
```

// Protocol-accessible nodes

augment // FIXME: ensure datastore == <operational>

```

"/sysc:system-capabilities/sysc:datastore-capabilities"
+ "/sysc:per-node-capabilities" {
description
  "Defines some leafs that MAY be used by the server to
  describe constraints imposed of the 'where' filters and
  'sort-by' parameters used in list pagination queries.";
leaf constrained {
  type empty;
  description
    "Indicates that 'where' filters and 'sort-by' parameters
    on the targeted 'config false' list node are constrained.
    If a list is not 'constrained', then full XPath 1.0
    expressions may be used in 'where' filters and all node
    identifiers are usable by 'sort-by'.";
}
}

```

```

leaf indexed {
  type empty;
  description
    "Indicates that the targeted descendent node of a
    'constrained' list (see the 'constrained' leaf) may be
    used in 'where' filters and/or 'sort-by' parameters.
    If a descendent node of a 'constrained' list is not
    'indexed', then it MUST NOT be used in 'where' filters
    or 'sort-by' parameters.";
}
}
}

```

<CODE ENDS>

5. IANA Considerations

5.1. The "IETF XML" Registry

This document registers one URI in the "ns" subregistry of the IETF XML Registry [RFC3688] maintained at <https://www.iana.org/assignments/xml-registry/xml-registry.xhtml#ns>. Following the format in [RFC3688], the following registration is requested:

URI: urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-list-pagination

Registrant Contact: The IESG.
XML: N/A, the requested URI is an XML namespace.

[5.2.](#) The "YANG Module Names" Registry

This document registers one YANG module in the YANG Module Names registry [RFC6020] maintained at <https://www.iana.org/assignments/yang-parameters/yang-parameters.xhtml>. Following the format defined in [RFC6020], the below registration is requested:

name: ietf-list-pagination
namespace: urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-list-pagination
prefix: lpg
RFC: XXXX

[6.](#) Security Considerations

[6.1.](#) Regarding the "ietf-list-pagination" YANG Module

Pursuant the template defined in ...FIXME

[7.](#) References

Watsen, et al. Expires 28 April 2022 [Page 19]

Internet-Draft List Pagination October 2021

[7.1.](#) Normative References

- [I-D.ietf-netconf-notification-capabilities]
Lengyel, B., Clemm, A., and B. Claise, "YANG Modules describing Capabilities for Systems and Datastore Update Notifications", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, [draft-ietf-netconf-notification-capabilities-21](#), 15 October 2021, <<https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/html/draft-ietf-netconf-notification-capabilities-21>>.
- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 2119](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119>>.
- [RFC3688] Mealling, M., "The IETF XML Registry", [BCP 81](#), [RFC 3688](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC3688, January 2004, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3688>>.

- [RFC7950] Bjorklund, M., Ed., "The YANG 1.1 Data Modeling Language", [RFC 7950](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7950, August 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7950>>.
- [RFC7952] Lhotka, L., "Defining and Using Metadata with YANG", [RFC 7952](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC7952, August 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7952>>.
- [RFC8174] Leiba, B., "Ambiguity of Uppercase vs Lowercase in [RFC 2119](#) Key Words", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 8174](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8174, May 2017, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8174>>.

7.2. Informative References

- [RFC6020] Bjorklund, M., Ed., "YANG – A Data Modeling Language for the Network Configuration Protocol (NETCONF)", [RFC 6020](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6020, October 2010, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6020>>.
- [RFC6241] Enns, R., Ed., Bjorklund, M., Ed., Schoenwaelder, J., Ed., and A. Bierman, Ed., "Network Configuration Protocol (NETCONF)", [RFC 6241](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC6241, June 2011, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6241>>.
- [RFC8040] Bierman, A., Bjorklund, M., and K. Watsen, "RESTCONF Protocol", [RFC 8040](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8040, January 2017, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8040>>.

- [RFC8340] Bjorklund, M. and L. Berger, Ed., "YANG Tree Diagrams", [BCP 215](#), [RFC 8340](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8340, March 2018, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8340>>.
- [RFC8342] Bjorklund, M., Schoenwaelder, J., Shafer, P., Watsen, K., and R. Wilton, "Network Management Datastore Architecture (NMDA)", [RFC 8342](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8342, March 2018, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8342>>.
- [RFC8525] Bierman, A., Bjorklund, M., Schoenwaelder, J., Watsen, K., and R. Wilton, "YANG Library", [RFC 8525](#), DOI 10.17487/RFC8525, March 2019,

<<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8525>>.

[Appendix A](#). Vector Tests

This normative appendix section illustrates every notable edge condition conceived during this document's production.

Test inputs and outputs are provided in a manner that is both generic and concise.

Management protocol specific documents need only reproduce as many of these tests as necessary to convey peculiarities presented by the protocol.

Implementations are RECOMMENDED to implement the tests presented in this document, in addition to any tests that may be presented in protocol specific documents.

[A.1](#). Example YANG Module

The vector tests assume the "example-social" YANG module defined in this section.

This module has been specially crafted to cover every notable edge condition, especially with regards to the types of the data nodes.

Following is the tree diagram [[RFC8340](#)] for the "example-social" module:

```
module: example-social
  +--rw members
  |   +--rw member* [member-id]
  |       +--rw member-id          string
  |       +--rw email-address      inet:email-address
```



```

|      +--rw password          ianach:crypt-hash
|      +--rw avatar?           binary
|      +--rw tagline?          string
|      +--rw privacy-settings
|      |      +--rw hide-network?    boolean
|      |      +--rw post-visibility? enumeration
|      +--rw following*        -> /members/member/member-id
|      +--rw posts
|      |      +--rw post* [timestamp]
|      |      |      +--rw timestamp    yang:date-and-time
|      |      |      +--rw title?      string
|      |      |      +--rw body        string
|      +--rw favorites
|      |      +--rw uint8-numbers*    uint8
|      |      +--rw uint64-numbers*   uint64
|      |      +--rw int8-numbers*     int8
|      |      +--rw int64-numbers*    int64
|      |      +--rw decimal64-numbers* decimal64
|      |      +--rw bits*             bits
|      +--ro stats
|      |      +--ro joined            yang:date-and-time
|      |      +--ro membership-level  enumeration
|      |      +--ro last-activity?    yang:date-and-time
+--ro audit-logs
  +--ro audit-log* []
    +--ro timestamp    yang:date-and-time
    +--ro member-id    string
    +--ro source-ip     inet:ip-address
    +--ro request       string
    +--ro outcome       boolean

```

Following is the YANG [[RFC7950](#)] for the "example-social" module:

```

module example-social {
  yang-version 1.1;
  namespace "http://example.com/ns/example-social";
  prefix es;

  import ietf-yang-types {
    prefix yang;
    reference
      "RFC 6991: Common YANG Data Types";
  }
}

```

```

import ietf-inet-types {
    prefix inet;
    reference
        "RFC 6991: Common YANG Data Types";
}

import iana-crypt-hash {
    prefix ianach;
    reference
        "RFC 7317: A YANG Data Model for System Management";
}

organization "Example, Inc.";
contact      "support@example.com";
description  "Example Social Data Model.";

revision YYYY-MM-DD {
    description
        "Initial version.";
    reference
        "RFC XXXX: Example social module.";
}

container members {
    description
        "Container for list of members.";
    list member {
        key "member-id";
        description
            "List of members.";

        leaf member-id {
            type string {
                length "1..80";
                pattern '.*[\n].*' {
                    modifier invert-match;
                }
            }
            description
                "The member's identifier.";
        }

        leaf email-address {
            type inet:email-address;
            mandatory true;
            description
                "The member's email address.";
        }
    }
}

```

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

```
leaf password {
  type ianach:crypt-hash;
  mandatory true;
  description
    "The member's hashed-password.";
}

leaf avatar {
  type binary;
  description
    "An binary image file.";
}

leaf tagline {
  type string {
    length "1..80";
    pattern '.*[\n].*' {
      modifier invert-match;
    }
  }
  description
    "The member's tagline.";
}

container privacy-settings {
  leaf hide-network {
    type boolean;
    description
      "Hide who you follow and who follows you.";
  }
  leaf post-visibility {
    type enumeration {
      enum public {
        description
          "Posts are public.";
      }
      enum unlisted {
        description
          "Posts are unlisted, though visable to all.";
      }
      enum followers-only {
        description
```

```

        "Posts only visible to followers.";
    }
}
default public;
description
    "The post privacy setting.";

```

```

    }
    description
        "Preferences for the member.";
}

leaf-list following {
    type leafref {
        path "/members/member/member-id";
    }
    description
        "Other members this members is following.";
}

container posts {
    description
        "The member's posts.";
    list post {
        key timestamp;
        leaf timestamp {
            type yang:date-and-time;
            description
                "The timestamp for the member's post.";
        }
        leaf title {
            type string {
                length "1..80";
                pattern '.*[\n].*' {
                    modifier invert-match;
                }
            }
            description
                "A one-line title.";
        }
        leaf body {
            type string;

```

```

        mandatory true;
        description
            "The body of the post.";
    }
    description
        "A list of posts.";
}
}

```

```

container favorites {
    description
        "The member's favorites.";
    leaf-list uint8-numbers {

```

```

        type uint8;
        ordered-by user;
        description
            "The member's favorite uint8 numbers.";
    }
    leaf-list uint64-numbers {
        type uint64;
        ordered-by user;
        description
            "The member's favorite uint64 numbers.";
    }
    leaf-list int8-numbers {
        type int8;
        ordered-by user;
        description
            "The member's favorite int8 numbers.";
    }
    leaf-list int64-numbers {
        type int64;
        ordered-by user;
        description
            "The member's favorite uint64 numbers.";
    }
    leaf-list decimal64-numbers {
        type decimal64 {
            fraction-digits 5;
        }
        ordered-by user;

```

```

        description
            "The member's favorite decimal64 numbers.";
    }
    leaf-list bits {
        type bits {
            bit zero {
                position 0;
                description "zero";
            }
            bit one {
                position 1;
                description "one";
            }
            bit two {
                position 2;
                description "two";
            }
        }
    }
    ordered-by user;
    description

```

```

        "The member's favorite bits.";
    }
}

container stats {
    config false;
    description
        "Operational state members values.";
    leaf joined {
        type yang:date-and-time;
        mandatory true;
        description
            "Timestamp when member joined.";
    }
    leaf membership-level {
        type enumeration {
            enum admin {
                description
                    "Site administrator.";
            }
            enum standard {

```

```

        description
            "Standard membership level.";
    }
    enum pro {
        description
            "Professional membership level.";
    }
}
mandatory true;
description
    "The membership level for this member.";
}
leaf last-activity {
    type yang:date-and-time;
    description
        "Timestamp of member's last activity.";
}
}
}
}

```

```

container audit-logs {
    config false;
    description
        "Audit log configuration";
    list audit-log {
        description

```

```

        "List of audit logs.";
    leaf timestamp {
        type yang:date-and-time;
        mandatory true;
        description
            "The timestamp for the event.";
    }
    leaf member-id {
        type string;
        mandatory true;
        description
            "The 'member-id' of the member.";
    }
    leaf source-ip {

```

```

    type inet:ip-address;
    mandatory true;
    description
        "The apparent IP address the member used.";
}
leaf request {
    type string;
    mandatory true;
    description
        "The member's request.";
}
leaf outcome {
    type boolean;
    mandatory true;
    description
        "Indicate if request was permitted.";
}
}
}
}

```

[A.2.](#) Example Data Set

The examples assume the server's operational state as follows.

The data is provided in JSON only for convenience and, in particular, has no bearing on the "generic" nature of the tests themselves.

```

{
  "example-social:members": {
    "member": [
      {
        "member-id": "bob",
        "email-address": "bob@example.com",

```

```

    "password": "$0$1543",
    "avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
    "tagline": "Here and now, like never before.",
    "posts": {
      "post": [
        {
          "timestamp": "2020-08-14T03:32:25Z",

```



```

        "body": "Just got in."
    },
    {
        "timestamp": "2020-08-14T03:33:55Z",
        "body": "What's new?"
    },
    {
        "timestamp": "2020-08-14T03:34:30Z",
        "body": "I'm bored..."
    }
]
},
"favorites": {
    "decimal64-numbers": ["3.14159", "2.71828"]
},
"stats": {
    "joined": "2020-08-14T03:30:00Z",
    "membership-level": "standard",
    "last-activity": "2020-08-14T03:34:30Z"
}
},
{
    "member-id": "eric",
    "email-address": "eric@example.com",
    "password": "$0$1543",
    "avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
    "tagline": "Go to bed with dreams; wake up with a purpose.",
    "following": ["alice"],
    "posts": {
        "post": [
            {
                "timestamp": "2020-09-17T18:02:04Z",
                "title": "Son, brother, husband, father",
                "body": "What's your story?"
            }
        ]
    },
    "favorites": {
        "bits": ["two", "one", "zero"]
    },
    "stats": {

```

```

        "joined": "2020-09-17T19:38:32Z",
        "membership-level": "pro",
        "last-activity": "2020-09-17T18:02:04Z"
    },
    {
        "member-id": "alice",
        "email-address": "alice@example.com",
        "password": "$0$1543",
        "avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
        "tagline": "Every day is a new day",
        "privacy-settings": {
            "hide-network": "false",
            "post-visibility": "public"
        },
        "following": ["bob", "eric", "lin"],
        "posts": {
            "post": [
                {
                    "timestamp": "2020-07-08T13:12:45Z",
                    "title": "My first post",
                    "body": "Hiya all!"
                },
                {
                    "timestamp": "2020-07-09T01:32:23Z",
                    "title": "Sleepy...",
                    "body": "Catch y'all tomorrow."
                }
            ]
        },
        "favorites": {
            "uint8-numbers": [17, 13, 11, 7, 5, 3],
            "int8-numbers": [-5, -3, -1, 1, 3, 5]
        },
        "stats": {
            "joined": "2020-07-08T12:38:32Z",
            "membership-level": "admin",
            "last-activity": "2021-04-01T02:51:11Z"
        }
    },
    {
        "member-id": "lin",
        "email-address": "lin@example.com",
        "password": "$0$1543",
        "privacy-settings": {
            "hide-network": "true",
            "post-visibility": "followers-only"
        },

```

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

```
    "following": ["joe", "eric", "alice"],
    "stats": {
      "joined": "2020-07-09T12:38:32Z",
      "membership-level": "standard",
      "last-activity": "2021-04-01T02:51:11Z"
    }
  },
  {
    "member-id": "joe",
    "email-address": "joe@example.com",
    "password": "$0$1543",
    "avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
    "tagline": "Greatness is measured by courage and heart.",
    "privacy-settings": {
      "post-visibility": "unlisted"
    },
    "following": ["bob"],
    "posts": {
      "post": [
        {
          "timestamp": "2020-10-17T18:02:04Z",
          "body": "What's your status?"
        }
      ]
    },
    "stats": {
      "joined": "2020-10-08T12:38:32Z",
      "membership-level": "pro",
      "last-activity": "2021-04-01T02:51:11Z"
    }
  }
]
},
"example-social:audit-logs": {
  "audit-log": [
    {
      "timestamp": "2020-10-11T06:47:59Z",
      "member-id": "alice",
      "source-ip": "192.168.0.92",
      "request": "POST /groups/group/2043",
      "outcome": true
    },
    {
```

```
"timestamp": "2020-11-01T15:22:01Z",
"member-id": "bob",
"source-ip": "192.168.2.16",
"request": "POST /groups/group/123",
"outcome": false
```

```
},
{
  "timestamp": "2020-12-12T21:00:28Z",
  "member-id": "eric",
  "source-ip": "192.168.254.1",
  "request": "POST /groups/group/10",
  "outcome": true
},
{
  "timestamp": "2021-01-03T06:47:59Z",
  "member-id": "alice",
  "source-ip": "192.168.0.92",
  "request": "POST /groups/group/333",
  "outcome": true
},
{
  "timestamp": "2021-01-21T10:00:00Z",
  "member-id": "bob",
  "source-ip": "192.168.2.16",
  "request": "POST /groups/group/42",
  "outcome": true
},
{
  "timestamp": "2020-02-07T09:06:21Z",
  "member-id": "alice",
  "source-ip": "192.168.0.92",
  "request": "POST /groups/group/1202",
  "outcome": true
},
{
  "timestamp": "2020-02-28T02:48:11Z",
  "member-id": "bob",
  "source-ip": "192.168.2.16",
  "request": "POST /groups/group/345",
  "outcome": true
}
```

```
}
}
}
```

[A.3.](#) Example Queries

The following sections are presented in reverse query-parameters processing order. Starting with the simplest (limit) and ending with the most complex (where).

All the vector tests are presented in a protocol-independent manner. JSON is used only for its conciseness.

[A.3.1.](#) The "limit" Parameter

Noting that "limit" must be a positive number, the edge condition values are '1', '2', num-elements-1, num-elements, and num-elements+1.

```
| If '0' were a valid limit value, it would always return an
| empty result set. Any value greater than or equal to num-
| elements results the entire result set, same as when "limit" is
| unspecified.
```

These vector tests assume the target "/example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers", which has six values, thus the edge condition "limit" values are: '1', '2', '5', '6', and '7'.

[A.3.1.1.](#) limit=1

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

```
Where:      -
Sort-by:    -
Direction:  -
Offset:     -
Limit:      1
```

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [17],
  "@example-social:uint8-numbers": [
    {
      "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": 5
    }
  ]
}
```

[A.3.1.2.](#) limit=2

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites:uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

```
Where:      -
Sort-by:    -
Direction:  -
Offset:     -
Limit:      2
```

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [17, 13],
  "@example-social:uint8-numbers": [
    {
      "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": 4
    }
  ]
}
```

[A.3.1.3.](#) limit=5

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: -
Limit: 5

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [17, 13, 11, 7, 5],
  "@example-social:uint8-numbers": [
    {
      "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": 1
    }
  ]
}
```

[A.3.1.4.](#) limit=6

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: -
Limit: 6

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [17, 13, 11, 7, 5, 3]
}
```

[A.3.1.5.](#) limit=7

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: -
Limit: 7

RESPONSE

```
{  
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [17, 13, 11, 7, 5, 3]  
}
```

[A.3.2.](#) The "offset" Parameter

Noting that "offset" must be an unsigned number less than or equal to the num-elements, the edge condition values are '0', '1', '2', num-elements-1, num-elements, and num-elements+1.

These vector tests again assume the target "/example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers", which has six values, thus the edge condition "limit" values are: '0', '1', '2', '5', '6', and '7'.

[A.3.2.1.](#) offset=0

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: 0
Limit: -

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [17, 13, 11, 7, 5, 3]
}
```

[A.3.2.2.](#) offset=1

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites:uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: 1
Limit: -

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [13, 11, 7, 5, 3]
}
```

[A.3.2.3.](#) offset=2

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites:uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: 2
Limit: -

RESPONSE

```
{
```

```
    "example-social:uint8-numbers": [11, 7, 5, 3]
}
```

[A.3.2.4.](#) offset=5

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites:uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: 5
Limit: -

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [3]
}
```

[A.3.2.5.](#) offset=6

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites:uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: 6
Limit: -

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": []
}
```

[A.3.2.6.](#) offset=7

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: 7
Limit: -

RESPONSE

ERROR

[A.3.3.](#) The "direction" Parameter

Noting that "direction" is an enumeration with two values, the edge condition values are each defined enumeration.

| The value "forwards" is sometimes known as the "default" value,
| as it produces the same result set as when "direction" is
| unspecified.

These vector tests again assume the target "/example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers". The number of elements is relevant to the edge condition values.

| It is notable that "uint8-numbers" is an "ordered-by" user
| leaf-list. Traversals are over the user-specified order, not
| the numerically-sorted order, which is what the "sort-by"
| parameter addresses. If this were an "ordered-by system" leaf-
| list, then the traversals would be over the system-specified
| order, again not a numerically-sorted order.

[A.3.3.1.](#) direction=forwards

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: forwards
Offset: -
Limit: -

RESPONSE

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [17, 13, 11, 7, 5, 3]
}
```

[A.3.3.2.](#) direction=backwards

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member=alice/favorites:uint8-numbers

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: -
Direction: backwards
Offset: -
Limit: -

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [3, 5, 7, 11, 13, 17]
}
```

[A.3.4.](#) The "sort-by" Parameter

Noting that the "sort-by" parameter is a node identifier, there is not so much "edge conditions" as there are "interesting conditions". This section provides examples for some interesting conditions.

[A.3.4.1.](#) the target node's type

The section provides three examples, one for a "leaf-list" and two for a "list", with one using a direct descendent and the other using an indirect descendent.

[A.3.4.1.1.](#) type is a "leaf-list"

This example illustrates when the target node's type is a "leaf-list". Note that a single period (i.e., '.') is used to represent the nodes to be sorted.

This test again uses the target `"/example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers"`, which is a leaf-list.

REQUEST

Watsen, et al.

Expires 28 April 2022

[Page 39]

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

Target: `/example-social:members/member=alice/favorites/uint8-numbers`
Pagination Parameters:
Where: -
Sort-by: .
Direction: -
Offset: -
Limit: -

RESPONSE

```
{  
  "example-social:uint8-numbers": [3, 5, 7, 11, 13, 17]  
}
```

[A.3.4.1.2.](#) type is a "list" and sort-by node is a direct descendent

This example illustrates when the target node's type is a "list" and a direct descendent is the "sort-by" node.

This vector test uses the target `"/example-social:members/member"`, which is a "list", and the sort-by descendent node `"member-id"`, which is the "key" for the list.

REQUEST

Target: `/example-social:members/member`
Pagination Parameters:
Where: -
Sort-by: `member-id`
Direction: -
Offset: -

Limit: -

RESPONSE

| To make the example more understandable, an ellipse (i.e.,
| "...") is used to represent a missing subtree of data.

Watsen, et al.

Expires 28 April 2022

[Page 40]

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

```
{
  "example-social:member": [
    {
      "member-id": "alice",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "bob",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "eric",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "joe",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "lin",
      ...
    }
  ]
}
```

[A.3.4.1.3.](#) type is a "list" and sort-by node is an indirect descendent

This example illustrates when the target node's type is a "list" and an indirect descendent is the "sort-by" node.

This vector test uses the target `/example-social:members/member`, which is a "list", and the sort-by descendent node `stats/joined`, which is a "config false" descendent leaf. Due to "joined" being a "config false" node, this request would have to target the "member" node in the <operational> datastore.

REQUEST

Target: `/example-social:members/member`

Pagination Parameters:

Where: -
Sort-by: `stats/joined`
Direction: -
Offset: -
Limit: -

RESPONSE

| To make the example more understandable, an ellipse (i.e.,
| "...") is used to represent a missing subtree of data.

```
{
  "example-social:member": [
    {
      "member-id": "alice",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "lin",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "bob",
      ...
    },
    {
```

```

        "member-id": "eric",
        ...
    },
    {
        "member-id": "joe",
        ...
    }
]
}

```

[A.3.4.2.](#) handling missing entries

The section provides one example for when the "sort-by" node is not present in the data set.

FIXME: need to finish this section...

[A.3.5.](#) The "where" Parameter

The "where" is an XPath 1.0 expression, there are numerous edge conditions to consider, e.g., the types of the nodes that are targeted by the expression.

[A.3.5.1.](#) match of leaf-list's values

FIXME

[A.3.5.2.](#) match on descendent string containing a substring

This example selects members that have an email address containing "@example.com".

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member

Pagination Parameters:

Where: //.[contains (@email-address,'@example.com')]

Sort-by: -

Direction: -
Offset: -
Limit: -

RESPONSE

| To make the example more understandable, an elipse (i.e.,
| "...") is used to represent a missing subtree of data.

```
{
  "example-social:member": [
    {
      "member-id": "bob",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "eric",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "alice",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "joe",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "lin",
      ...
    }
  ]
}
```

[A.3.5.3.](#) match on decendent timestamp starting with a substring

This example selects members that have a posting whose timestamp begins with the string "2020".

REQUEST

Target: /example-social:members/member

Pagination Parameters:

Where: //posts//post[starts-with(@timestamp,'2020')]
Sort-by: -
Direction: -
Offset: -
Limit: -

RESPONSE

| To make the example more understandable, an elipse (i.e.,
| "...") is used to represent a missing subtree of data.

```
{
  "example-social:member": [
    {
      "member-id": "bob",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "eric",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "alice",
      ...
    },
    {
      "member-id": "joe",
      ...
    }
  ]
}
```

[A.3.6.](#) The "sublist-limit" Parameter

The "sublist-limit" parameter may be used on any target node.

[A.3.6.1.](#) target is a list entry

This example uses the target node `/example-social:members/member=alice` in the `<intended>` datastore.

- | The target node is a specific list entry/element node, not the
- | YANG "list" node.

This example sets the `sublist-limit` value `'1'`, which returns just the first entry for all descendent lists and leaf-lists.

Note that, in the response, the `"remaining"` metadata value is set on the first element of each descendent list and leaf-list having more than one value.

REQUEST

```
Datastore: <intended>
Target: /example-social:members/member=alice
Sublist-limit: 1
Pagination Parameters:
  Where:      -
  Sort-by:    -
  Direction:  -
  Offset:     -
  Limit:      -
```

RESPONSE

Internet-Draft

List Pagination

October 2021

```
{
  "example-social:member": [
    {
      "member-id": "alice",
      "email-address": "alice@example.com",
      "password": "$0$1543",
      "avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
      "tagline": "Every day is a new day",
      "privacy-settings": {
        "hide-network": "false",
        "post-visibility": "public"
      },
      "following": ["bob"],
      "@following": [
        {
          "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "2"
        }
      ],
      "posts": {
        "post": [
          {
            "@": {
              "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "1"
            },
            "timestamp": "2020-07-08T13:12:45Z",
            "title": "My first post",
            "body": "Hiya all!"
          }
        ]
      },
      "favorites": {
        "uint8-numbers": [17],
        "int8-numbers": [-5],
        "@uint8-numbers": [
          {
            "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "5"
          }
        ],
        "@int8-numbers": [
          {
```

```
        "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "5"
      }
    ]
  }
}
]
```

[A.3.6.2.](#) target is a datastore

This example uses the target node <intended>.

This example sets the sublist-limit value '1', which returns just the first entry for all descendent lists and leaf-lists.

Note that, in the response, the "remaining" metadata value is set on the first element of each descendent list and leaf-list having more than one value.

REQUEST

```
Datastore: <intended>
Target: /
Sublist-limit: 1
Pagination Parameters:
  Where:      -
  Sort-by:    -
  Direction:  -
  Offset:     -
  Limit:      -
```

RESPONSE

```
{
  "example-social:members": {
    "member": [
      {
        "@": {
          "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "4"
        },
        "member-id": "bob",
        "email-address": "bob@example.com",
        "password": "$0$1543",
        "avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
        "tagline": "Here and now, like never before.",
        "posts": {
          "post": [
            {
              "@": {
                "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "2"
              },
              "timestamp": "2020-08-14T03:32:25Z",
              "body": "Just got in."
            }
          ]
        }
      }
    ],
    "favorites": {
      "decimal64-numbers": ["3.14159"],
      "@decimal64-numbers": [
```

```

        {
            "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "1"
        }
    ]
}
]
}
]
}
}

```

[A.3.7.](#) Combinations of Parameters

[A.3.7.1.](#) All six parameters at once

REQUEST

Datastore: <operational>

Target: /example-social:members/member

Sublist-limit: 1

Pagination Parameters:

Where: //stats//joined[starts-with(@timestamp,'2020')]

Sort-by: member-id

Direction: backwards

Offset: 2

Limit: 2

RESPONSE

```

{
  "example-social:member": [
    {
      "@": {
        "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "1"
      },
      "member-id": "eric",
    }
  ]
}

```

```

"email-address": "eric@example.com",
"password": "$0$1543",
"avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
>tagline": "Go to bed with dreams; wake up with a purpose.",
"following": ["alice"],
"posts": {
  "post": [
    {
      "timestamp": "2020-09-17T18:02:04Z",
      "title": "Son, brother, husband, father",
      "body": "What's your story?"
    }
  ]
},
"favorites": {
  "bits": ["two"],
  "@bits": [
    {
      "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "2"
    }
  ]
},
"stats": {
  "joined": "2020-09-17T19:38:32Z",
  "membership-level": "pro",
  "last-activity": "2020-09-17T18:02:04Z"
}
},
{

```

```

"member-id": "bob",
"email-address": "bob@example.com",
"password": "$0$1543",
"avatar": "BASE64VALUE=",
>tagline": "Here and now, like never before.",
"posts": {
  "post": [
    {
      "@": {
        "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "2"
      },
      "timestamp": "2020-08-14T03:32:25Z",

```



```

        "body": "Just got in."
      }
    ]
  },
  "favorites": {
    "decimal64-numbers": ["3.14159"],
    "@decimal64-numbers": [
      {
        "ietf-list-pagination:remaining": "1"
      }
    ]
  },
  "stats": {
    "joined": "2020-08-14T03:30:00Z",
    "membership-level": "standard",
    "last-activity": "2020-08-14T03:34:30Z"
  }
}
}
}

```

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank the following for lively discussions on list (ordered by first name): Andy Bierman, Martin Bjoerklund, and Robert Varga.

Authors' Addresses

Kent Watsen
Watsen Networks

Email: kent+ietf@watsen.net

Qin Wu
Huawei Technologies

Email: bill.wu@huawei.com

Olof Hagsand
Netgate

Email: olof@hagsand.se

Hongwei Li
Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Email: flycoolman@gmail.com

Per Andersson
Cisco Systems

Email: perander@cisco.com