INTERNET-DRAFT
Intended Status: Informational
Updates: 4693 (if approved)
Expires: September 30, 2011

M. Yevstifeyev
March 29, 2011

Report on the Experiment with IETF Operational Notes (IONs) <draft-yevstifeyev-ion-report-02>

Abstract

This document is a report from the process experiment with IETF Operational Notes (IONs), conducted by RFC 4693 in accordance with RFC 3933. It also updates RFC 4693 and moves it to Historic status.

Status of this Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted to IETF in full conformance with the provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at http://www.ietf.org/1id-abstracts.html

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html

Copyright and License Notice

Copyright (c) 2011 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must

include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

1. Introduction

This document is a report from the experiment with IETF Operational Notes (IONs), conducted by RFC 4693 [RFC4693] in accordance with RFC 3933 [RFC3933]. It discusses the results of this experiment after first giving some background information on it in Section 2 and makes the appropriate conclusion. This document updates RFC 4693 [RFC4693] and moves it to Historic status [RFC2026].

1.1 Terminology

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in RFC 2119 [RFC2119].

2. Background

IETF Operational Notes (IONs) are a series of documents established by RFC 4693 [RFC4693] on an experimental basis [RFC3933] in 2006. This series is (in accordance with RFC 4693 [RFC4693])

> intended for use as a repository for IETF operations documents, which should be more ephemeral than RFCs, but more referenceable than Internet-Drafts, and with more clear handling procedures than a random Web page.

RFC 4693 [RFC4693] contains some regulations regarding this series, such as ION attributes, approval procedure, ION store considerations, etc. It also proposes a set off initial IONs to be published and sets the sunset period of 1 year. See RFC 4693 [RFC4693] itself for more background information on this topic.

3. Experiment Notes and Results

After establishing the IONs series per RFC 4693 [RFC4693], a number of IONs proposed by that document, as well as on some other topics, were published. Particularly, the following IONs were issued:

- ion-ad-sponsoring on "Guidance on Area Director Sponsoring of Documents" by Jari Arkko;

- ion-agenda-and-minutes on "Formatting and Content of IETF Working Group Agendas and Minutes" by David Meyer and Olaf Kolkman;

- ion-discuss-criteria on "DISCUSS Criteria in IESG Review" by the IESG members (at the date of approval);

- ion-procdocs on "The IETF Process: an Informal Guide" by Brian Carpenter;

- ion-rfc-2026-in-practice on "RFC 2026 in Practice" by Brian Carpenter;

- ion-execd-tasks on "Tasks previously assigned to the IETF Executive Director" by Lucy Lynch and Brian Carpenter;

- ion-meeting-network-requirements on "IETF Meeting Network Requirements" by Karen O'Donoghue, Jim Martin, Chris Elliott and Joel Jaeggli;

- ion-subpoena on "Subpoenas in the IETF: Procedures" by Brian Carpenter;

- ion-tsv-alt-cc on "Experimental Specification of New Congestion Control Algorithms" by Lars Eggert;

- ion-ion-formats on "ION Format specification" by Brian Carpenter and Cullen Jennings;

- ion-ion-store on "The ION Store" by Cullen Jennings and Brian Carpenter.

However in 2008 it was identified that IONs experiment was closed.

> The IESG has determined that IONs will not be used in the future. It is clear that the IESG, IAB, and IAOC need the ability to publish documents that do not expire and are easily updated. Information published as web pages, including IESG Statements, are sufficient for this purpose.

was mentioned in IESG note on this topic [IESG-IONS] by Russ Housley.

All IONs were republished whether as IESG statements, Web Pages, or were discarded. The full list is as follows:

- ion-ad-sponsoring was republished as IESG statement "Guidance on Area Director Sponsoring of Documents" [SPONSOR];

- ion-agenda-and-minutes was republished as Web Page "Formatting and

Content of IETF Working Group Agendas and Minutes" [AGENDA];

- ion-discuss criteria was republished as IESG Statement "DISCUSS Criteria in IESG Review" [DISCUSS];

- ion-procdocs was republished as Web Page "The IETF Process: an Informal Guide" [PROCDOCS];

- ion-rfc2026-in-practice was republished as the Internet-Draft "RFC 2026 in Practice" [2026PRACTICE] (that, however, at the time of publication of this document, has not resulted in RFC and is expired);

- ion-execd-tasks was republished as Web Page "Tasks previously assigned to the IETF Executive Director" [EXECD];

- ion-meeting-network-requirements was republished as Web Page "IETF Meeting Network Requirements" [MEETING];

- ion-subpoena was republished as Web Page "Subpoenas in the IETF: Procedures" [SUBPOENAS];

- ion-tsv-alt-cc was republished as IESG Statement "Experimental Specification of New Congestion Control Algorithms" [ALT-CC];

- ion-ion-formats was discarded;

- ion-ion-store was discarded.

All IONs were located at <http://www.ietf.org/iesg/content/ions.html>, that is currently removed from IETF site. However the Internet Wayback Machine project <http://www.archive.org/web/web.php> currently has some snapshots of this page, as well as all IONs, the most current before the experiment closure dated 16 April 2008. You may freely access these snapshots at [IONS-SNAP].

4. Conclusion

Taking everything into account, it is now considered that IONs were an excessive facility, that does not give a great benefit to the IETF. This document formally concludes the IONs experiment [RFC4693]. The IONs series SHALL now be terminated; no new IONs MUST be either approved or published.

5. Security Considerations

IONs did not include protocol specifications and therefore terminating this series is not believed to have any impact on the Internet security.

6. IANA Considerations

None. RFC Editor SHALL delete this section upon publication.

7. Acknowledgments

Many thanks to Harald Alvestrand for his work on RFC 4693.

I would also like to thank all the authors and editors of IONs for their input to the experiment, particularly Jari Arkko, Brian Carpenter, Karen O'Donoghue, Lars Eggert, Chris Elliott, Joel Jaeggli, Cullen Jennings, Olaf Kolkman, Lucy Lynch, Jim Martin, David Meyer (in alphabetical order).

8. References

8.1. Normative References

[RFC2119] S. Bradner, "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119, March 1997.

[RFC4693] Alvestrand, H., "IETF Operational Notes", RFC 4693, October 2006.

8.2. Informative References

[2026PRACTICE] Carpenter, B., "RFC 2026 in Practice", draft-carpenter-rfc2026-practice-00, Expired Internet-Draft, July 2008.

[AGENDA] D. Meyer and Kolkman, O., "Formatting and Content of IETF Working Group Agendas and Minutes", Web Page, January 2007. <http://www.ietf.org/wg/agenda-minutes-procedures.html>

[ALT-CC] L. Eggert, "Experimental Specification of New Congestion Control Algorithms", IESG Statement, July 2007. <http://www.ietf.org/iesg/statement/congestion-control.html>

[DISCUSS] Peterson, J., "DISCUSS Criteria in IESG Review", IESG Statement, July 2007. <http://www.ietf.org/iesg/statement/discuss-criteria.html>

[EXECD] IETF Administrative Oversight Committee, "Tasks previously assigned to the IETF Executive Director", Web Page, March 2007. <http://iaoc.ietf.org/execd-tasks.html>

[IESG-IONS] Housley, R., "IETF Operational Notes", Web Page, April 2008. <http://www.ietf.org/old/2009/u/iesgcontent/ions.html>

[IONS-SNAP] Internet Wayback Machine project, "IETF Operational Notes", Web Page archived snapshot, April 2008. <http://replay.waybackmachine.org/20080416153527/http://www.ietf.org/IESG/content/ions.html>

[MEETING] O'Donoghue, K., Martin, J., Elliott, C., and J. Jaeggli, "IETF Meeting Network Requirements", Web Page, June 2009. <http://iaoc.ietf.org/network_requirements.html>

[PROCDOCS] Carpenter, B., Ed., "The IETF Process: an Informal Guide", Web Page, February 2011. <http://www.ietf.org/about/process-docs.html>

[RFC2026] Bradner, S., "The Internet Standards Process -- Revision 3", BCP 9, RFC 2026, October 1996.

[RFC3933] Klensin, J. and S. Dawkins, "A Model for IETF Process Experiments", BCP 93, RFC 3933, November 2004.

[SPONSOR] The IESG, "Guidance on Area Director Sponsoring of Documents", IESG Statement, March 2007. <http://www.ietf.org/iesg/statement/ad-sponsoring-docs.html>

[SUBPOENAS] Alvestrand, H., Carpenter, B. and R. Pelletier, "Subpoenas in the IETF: Procedures", Web Page, January 2007. <http://iaoc.ietf.org/subpoena.html>

Author's Addresses

Mykyta Yevstifeyev
8 Kuzovkov St., flat 25,
Kotovsk

Ukraine

EMail: evnikita2@gmail.com