DNSOP Extended Errors

Wes Hardaker <hardaker@isi.edu>
Warren Kumari <warren@kumari.net>
Evan Hunt <each@isc.org>
Roy Arends <roy.arends@icann.org>
David Lawrence <tale@akamai.com>
Call-for-adoptioin Feedback #1:
Use HTTP like code ranges

1. Individual codes per existing draft (i.e. sequentially assigned)
   ○ EG: 0x0002 = DNSSEC Bogus

2. 32-bit code field with integer ranges
   ○ NNYY, where NN is the RCODE and YY is a sub-code
   ○ EG 0201 = 0x00C9 - ServFail/DNSSEC Bogus

3. 32-bit code field: 16-bit RCODE copy and 16-bit sub-code
   ○ EG: 0x00020001 - ServFail/DNSSEC Bogus

4. 16-bit code field: Same as #3, but don’t copy RRCODE
   ○ EG: 0x0001 - ServFail/DNSSEC Bogus \textit{iff} [sic] RCODE == 0x0002

Opinions Please!
Other Questions

1. Can we include more than one error code?
   a. Any reason to prevent this?

2. What should a forwarding server do?
   a. *Always send back edns0*?
   b. Never send back edns0?
   c. Send if it believes client can handle it?

3. Security -- Errors are unauthenticated
   a. Anything we can do?
   b. They’re just “informational” anyway?