

DNSOP Extended Errors

Wes Hardaker <hardaker@isi.edu>
Warren Kumari <warren@kumari.net>
Evan Hunt <each@isc.org>
Roy Arends <roy.arends@icann.org>
David Lawrence <tale@akamai.com>

Call-for-adoption Feedback #1: Use HTTP like code ranges

1. Individual codes per existing draft (i.e. sequentially assigned)
 - EG: 0x0002 = DNSSEC Bogus
2. 32-bit code field with integer ranges
 - NNY, where NN is the RCODE and Y is a sub-code
 - EG 0201 = 0x00C9 - ServFail/DNSSEC Bogus
3. 32-bit code field: 16-bit RCODE copy and 16-bit sub-code
 - EG: 0x00020001 - ServFail/DNSSEC Bogus
4. 16-bit code field: Same as #3, but don't copy RRCODE
 - EG: 0x0001 - ServFail/DNSSEC Bogus **iff [sic] RCODE == 0x0002**

Opinions Please!

Other Questions

1. Can we include more than one error code?
 - a. Any reason to prevent this?
2. What should a forwarding server do?
 - a. **Always send back edns0?**
 - b. Never send back edns0?
 - c. Send if it believes client can handle it?
3. Security -- Errors are unauthenticated
 - a. Anything we can do?
 - b. They're just "informational" anyway?