Introductions
0. Agenda
1. WG Status
   - There are many proposals for new work
2. Charter and Milestones
   - Successful rechartering of BMWG
   - New Charter (and new milestones), see:
     https://datatracker.ietf.org/group/bmwg/about/
   - ETSI NFV Liaison on NFVI Benchmarking Normative Specification. No comments from WG by the deadline. Latest Draft available:
     https://docbox.etsi.org/ISG/NFV/Open/Drafts/TST009_NFVI_Benchmarks
   - Liaison from ITU-T SG 11: https://datatracker.ietf.org/liaison/1565/
   - **NEW!!!! Requirements Language modified by RFC 8174!!!** Please review and keep this in mind as you’re authoring or editing your drafts.

3. Benchmarking Methodology for EVPN and PBB-EVPN
   Presenter: Sudhin Jacob
   - Presentation of PPT by Sudhin
   - Request for adoption was made by Sudhin, chairs point out that the draft has been adopted into the charter.
   - Request by chairs for hands for those who’ve read the draft. 2 hands were raised in the room.
   - Chairs request that anyone in the room or on the list with specific routing expertise review the document.
   - Q from Jim, AT&T: This document encompasses a wide area of services, does it cover any of the services, like FXE?
   - A: No, the scope is limited to the definition of scope of the base RFCs.
4. Methodology for VNF Benchmarking Automation
Presenter: Raphael Vicente Rosa
- Presentation from Raphael
- Q from Sarah Banks, Chair: Target metrics should not only be left up to developers; how are you going to achieve repeatability if you don’t specify the metrics?
  - A: Going to get there, with the addition of the benchmarking descriptor
- Comment from Al Morton, Chair: Should use common terminology (tester vs. probe, for example)
  - A: Agree, will update

5. Considerations for Benchmarking Network Virtualization Platforms
Presenter: Samuel Kommu and Jacob Rapp
Presentation Slides: https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/slides-102-bmwg-considerations-for-benchmarking-network-virtualization-platforms/00/
- Presentation by Jacob (in the room)
- NEW-ish Draft with minimal exposure, lots of comments at IETF-98

6. Updates to Firewall Benchmarking for Modern Firewalls
Presenter: Tim Winters of UNH-IOL
Related Web Pages:
  - https://www.netsecopen.org/
  - https://www.netsecopen.org/about
- Presentation of PPT by Tim
- Q from Al Morton, Chair: Why was binary search removed?
  - A: We found it overly complicated and not easily automated
- Comment from Al: We’ve updated the binary search work, you might want to take another look
- Q from Jacob Rapp, VMWare: Does the scope include distributed firewalls, like agent-based or hypervisor-based?
  - A: Virtual firewalls yes, but not distributed.
7. Updates for Back-to-Back Frame Benchmark & OPNFV Plugfest/VSPERF Testing
Presenter: Al Morton
Related Slides:
  https://wiki.opnfv.org/display/vsperf/Traffic+Generator+Testing
- Presentation by Al, covering the OPNFV Plugfest for the Fraser release. Readers, you should really pull the materials from the Materials for the IETF102 meeting; notes won’t cover the fine material presented, and the recording will give you the details on the conversation held in the room. It was widely applauded, however, and we note that BMWG continues to encourage testing/test results to be brought into the WG.

8. Presentation on Reliability and Precision of Software Packet Generators
Presenter: Paul Emmerich
- See presentation slides for info; very good presentation on the subject, and the chairs noted that they hope to see a follow up presentation on the subject as the research continues.

-=-=-=-=-=-=-=-=
EOM