Describing O/A Procedures for SDP Attributes

IETF#102
Montreal, Canada
No draft (yet…)

christer.Holmberg@ericsson.com
When a new SDP attribute is defined, the SDP offer/answer procedures associated with that attribute needs to be defined.

Currently, the structure of RFC 3264 is to be used:
- Generating the Initial SDP Offer
- Generating the SDP Answer
- Offerer Processing of the SDP Answer
- Modifying the Session
(3) THE PROBLEM

— Unclear what “Initial offer” means
  — Alt 1: First offer within a session
  — Alt 2: Offer within a session when an SDP attribute is introduced
     — Could be first offer within a session
        — If the attribute has a default value, it will always be implicitly included in the first offer within a session
        — Could be a subsequent offer within a session
— Media-level SDP attributes can be added to specific m- sections in different offers
(4) THE BOTTOMLINE

— Within the procedures, we need to separate between the following two cases:
  — Offer where SDP attribute is first added to an m-section (implicitly or explicitly)
  — Offer where an SDP attribute has previously been added to an m-section, and:
    — Attribute value unchanged
    — Attribute value modified
    — Attribute removed
Alt 1: Clarify what Initial offer means

— Keep existing structure and wording
— For each attribute, describe what “Initial offer” means
  — Example from BUNDLE:

“The procedures in this section apply to the first offer, within an SDP session (e.g. a SIP dialog when the Session Initiation Protocol (SIP) [RFC3261] is used to carry SDP), in which the offerer indicates that it wants to negotiate a given BUNDLE group. This could occur in the initial offer, or in a subsequent offer, of the SDP session.”
(6) THE SOLUTION
Alt 2: Change the structure

— Modify existing structure and wording
— Do not talk about sending initial offer
— Talk about adding/introducing an attribute to a media description (or session), and the offers and answers associated with that:
  — **Add attribute to media description (or session)**
    — Send offer
    — Send answer
  — **Modify attribute in media description (or session)**
    — Send offer
    — Keep attribute unchanged
    — Update attribute
    — Remove
    — Send answer
(7) THE SUGGESTION

ALTERNATIVE 2
— How do we document the new structure/guidelines?
   — Separate RFC
     — Standards track, Informational, BCP,…
   — RFC 3264bis
     — Motivation and cycles?
   — We don’t, and have this same discussion again in a not-so-distant future…
(9) THE END