Comparing
draft-ietf-mpls-sfc
and
draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation

IETF 102 Montreal

Stewart.Bryant@gmail.com (Huawei)

draft-ietf-mpls-sfc

- Emulates NSH operation in an MPLS environment that does not support native NSH operations.

- Uses the existing MPLS forwarding plane to send packets to and between service functions.

- SFFs are built from existing MPLS routers

- Designed to provide migration assistance to an NSH environment, making it easy to introduce SF chaining in today's networks.

- MPLS layer has to understand the whole of the service chain.

draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation

- Designed to carry NSH packets over an MPLS network between SFFs that understand the NSH.

- MPLS is simply a transport between SFFs and does not understand the service chain.

- Operates like a type of MPLS VPN.

Comparison

- Chalk and Cheese
- draft-ietf-mpls-sfc understands and knows the service chain.
- draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation understands how to deliver a packet to an SFF, but not what to do next.
- Neither can do the job of the other.

Recommendation

- Each draft serves a different purpose and is applicable to a different network scenario.

- There is no conflict between the drafts.

- Each draft should be considered independently on its own merits for its own purpose.

- draft-ietf-mpls-sfc is an MPLS WG draft.

- The MPLS WG should consider draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation for WG adoption when it is ready.

- Both drafts should follow their natural path along the publications process independent of each other.