Comparing

draft-ietf-mpls-sfc
and
draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation

IETF 102 Montreal
Stewart.Bryant@gmail.com (Huawei)
draft-ietf-mpls-sfc

• Emulates NSH operation in an MPLS environment that does not support native NSH operations.
• Uses the existing MPLS forwarding plane to send packets to and between service functions.
• SFFs are built from existing MPLS routers
• Designed to provide migration assistance to an NSH environment, making it easy to introduce SF chaining in today’s networks.
• MPLS layer has to understand the whole of the service chain.
draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation

• Designed to carry NSH packets over an MPLS network between SFFs that understand the NSH.
• MPLS is simply a transport between SFFs and does not understand the service chain.
• Operates like a type of MPLS VPN.
Comparison

• Chalk and Cheese
• draft-ietf-mpls-sfc understands and knows the service chain.
• draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation understands how to deliver a packet to an SFF, but not what to do next.
• Neither can do the job of the other.
Recommendation

• Each draft serves a different purpose and is applicable to a different network scenario.
• There is no conflict between the drafts.
• Each draft should be considered independently on its own merits for its own purpose.
• draft-ietf-mpls-sfc is an MPLS WG draft.
• The MPLS WG should consider draft-malis-mpls-sfc-encapsulation for WG adoption when it is ready.
• Both drafts should follow their natural path along the publications process independent of each other.