L4S Dual Queue Coupled AQMs

Summary of IPR Discussion
TSVWG Chairs
IETF-105, Montreal, 2019

Alcatel-Lucent's updated IPR declarations*

- 3 IPR declarations against aqm-dualq-coupled
- Originally FRAND license terms
- Updated to non-assert with defensive suspension
  - Subsequently clarified on list that original FRAND terms still apply if preferred

https://datatracker.ietf.org/ipr/search/?submit=draft&id=draft-ietf-tsvwg-aqm-dualq-coupled

* See IPR declarations (3561 & 3562) and Koen De Schepper's subsequent clarification on the list for full wording

IPR discussion on the List

- Toke Høiland-Jørgensen raised concerns over defensive suspension clause (in which Alcatel-Lucent reserves right to suspend non-assert offer to defend against other assertions)
    - broad conditions
    - unclear whether FRAND still available – resolved by Alcatel-Lucent clarification
- Chairs summarized off-list discussion on the list*

- Survey of other IETF IPR declarations:
    - Uses terms with a common licensing formulation

* See posting for full text and disclaimers https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/tsvwg/PoFrFpjJDi007FqqPw4PJz_IGNk

Relationship of IPR to the draft

- aqm-coupled-dualq (B) is a framework for coupling AQMs
  - non-normative implementation appendices
- Bob Briscoe posted his analysis of relevance to the list*
  - **"The claims all cover non-essential or non-preferred aspects of aqm-dualq-coupled"**
- Alternative implementations
  - PI2 (Appendix A – "more responsive and stable")
  - Curvy RED (Appendix B)
  - FQ for L4S (not discussed in draft)
  - There may be others

* Each WG participant will need to make up their own mind
https://mailarchive.ietf.org/arch/msg/tsvwg/o35Lx-ftlhqUqP4RvBZH0eUaaJQ