

Centralization and Internet Standards

draft-nottingham-avoiding-internet-centralization

Mark Nottingham, IABOPEN / IETF 113

Purpose

- Inspired by 'chokepoints' w/ Brian T (abandoned IAB proto-draft)
- Focus is on exploring how centralisation relates to the Internet standards community and our work
 - Centralisation / competition in general are MUCH larger topics
 - We lack expertise and authority in many aspects (economics, law, etc.)
 - In many cases, we do not have the ability to prevent centralization through positive or negative action
 - But there are still things we can do

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	2
2.	What is Centralization	3
3.	Why Avoid Centralization	5
4.	Kinds of Centralization	6
4.1.	Direct Centralization	6
4.2.	Necessary Centralization	7
4.3.	Indirect Centralization	8
4.4.	Inherited Centralization	8
4.5.	Platform Centralization	9
5.	The Limits of Decentralization	10
5.1.	Federation isn't Enough	10
5.2.	Multi-Stakeholder Administration is Hard	11
5.3.	Blockchains Are Not Magical	12
6.	What Should Internet Standards Do?	14
6.1.	Be Realistic	14
6.2.	Decentralize Proprietary Functions	15
6.3.	Build Well-Balanced Standards	15
6.4.	Limit Intermediary Power	16
6.5.	Avoid Over-Extensibility	18
7.	Security Considerations	18
8.	Informative References	18
	Appendix A. Acknowledgements	21
	Author's Address	21

Feedback So Far

- Seems to be strong / broad interest in the topic
- Much encouragement to publish
- Many tweaks / adjustments to text throughout
- No pushback or substantial suggestions on 'kinds of centralization'
- 'What should internet standards do?' is most tentative, needs development
- Need to update acknowledgements section

Next Steps

- Something like 75% 'there' - some open issues / things in my head / outstanding feedback
- Planning to submit to the Independent Stream
- Want to incorporate more community feedback / review
- Want to publish relatively soon

Contribute

- <https://github.com/mnot/avoiding-internet-centralization>
- architecture-discuss@ietf.org (?)