

... **with Expert Review**

draft-bormann-gendispatch-[with-expert-review](#)-00

Draft by two CoRE WG chairs:

- Carsten Bormann
- Marco Tiloca (stuck at SCHC at the moment)

ALLDISPATCH 2024-07-22

BCP26 (RFC 8126)

IANA registries have Policies

Section 4 of RFC 8126 provides canned Policies

- Well-known names, easy to reference
- Details are fleshed out, based on experience
- Interactions are well-defined, e.g.:
 - BCP100 (RFC 7120): Early allocation

~~Canned~~ Well-Known Policies

Designated Expert
approves registration:

- 4.5. Expert Review
- 4.6. Specification Required

(Decision is made by
Expert only)

Review Body approves
registration:

- 4.7. RFC Required
- 4.8. IETF Review
- 4.9. Standards Action
- 4.10. IESG Approval

(Decision is made by
Review Body only,
doesn't talk to Expert)

Combined Policies

4.12:

Similarly, it will often be useful to specify multiple policies in parallel, with each policy being used under different circumstances. [...] see Section 4.12.

Combining policies via conditions:

```
if other SDO wants this
  then 4.6. Specification Required
  else 4.8. IETF Review
fi
```

Where the firewall fails

- (1) Some registries are complicated.
 - Designated expert needed to ensure consistent/permissible/valid registration

 - (2) Some registries are meant to be used by other efforts/WGs/...
 - Review body approval may never touch designated expert
- Need logical AND of 4.5 Expert Review and one of 4.7..4.10

You can write it up in your RFC

Of course. (There actually is no need for RFC 8126 either.)

And we do (imperfectly).

- Complexity of multi-body review and approval process
 - Interaction with processes such as Early Allocation (BCP100 == RFC 7120)
- Do the work once, not in every WG that needs this

Oh great, I wanted a 8126bis anyway

Nothing is wrong with starting an 8126bis process.
(If there is energy.)

This effort is for the five years until that is done.

(8126bis will then swallow this effort.)

What should be the result

- Short document (3-page body)
Gets a few eyes beyond the WGs that need it
- Covers cross-product 4.5 ✖ 4.7..4.10:
 - 2.1. RFC Required With Expert Review
 - 2.2. IETF Review With Expert Review
 - 2.3. Standards Action With Expert Review
 - 2.4. IESG Approval With Expert Review
- Explains responsibilities and BCP100 procedure

DISPATCH?