



Report from NomCom 2006
IETF 68 - Prague

Andrew Lange

Comments on NomCom

- Voting members and liaison members all worked **very** hard. Material review, teleconference and email discussion and debate and preparation all consumed a lot of time. All members kept the best interests of the IETF as a whole as their guiding principle. And expressed independent and well-reasoned positions.

- Cengiz Alaettinoglu
- Dan Li
- Brian Haberman
- John Drake
- Stephen Kent
- Vidya Narayanan
- Hao Zhou
- Kurt Zeilenga

- Martin Stiernerling
- Juergen Quittek
- Andrew Lange (Chair)
- Olaf Kolkman (IAB Liaison)
- Cullen Jennings (IESG Liaison)
- Fred Baker (ISOC Liaison)
- Ralph Droms (Previous Chair)

- Honorary Mention and Tool Wizard: Henrik Levkowetz

Nominees - IESG

- Russ Housley ** ▶ IETF Chair/General Area
- Mark Townsley * ▶ Internet Area
- Ron Bonica ▶ OAM Area
- Jon Peterson * ▶ RAI Area
- Dave Ward ▶ Routing Area
- Tim Polk ▶ Security Area
- Lars Eggert * ▶ Transport Area

* Returning incumbent

** Moved from Security Area

Nominees - IAB & IAOC

IAB

- Barry Lieba
- Loa Andersson *
- Kurtis Lindqvist *
- Danny McPherson
- Dave Thaler *
- Lixia Zhang *

IAOC

- Jonne Soininen *

* Returning incumbent

Some Numbers

- 7.3% (69/949) eligible IETF participants volunteered for NomCom. Trends:
 - 2006/07: 7.3% (69/949)
 - 2005/06: 7.3% (69/950)
 - 2004/05: 12.9% (123/assumed 950)
 - 2003/04: 12% (min 114/assumed 950)
 - 2002/03: 14.7% (min 140/assumed 950)
- 114 IESG nominations (74 declined) 35% vs 45% for 05/06
- 44 IAB nominations (20 declined) 55% vs. 39% for 05/06
- 4 IAOC nominations (1 declined) 75% vs. 83% for 05/06

Second Call for Nominations in SEC

- Selection of Russ Housley for the Chair position exacerbated the already short list of candidates for the SEC AD position. This necessitated an additional call for nominations for the SEC AD position.
- One-week call for candidates held. Large number of additional candidates was generated from this call (+8 willing to serve).

Announcements

- IESG and IAOC announced Feb 27th.
- IAB announced March 2nd.
- Later than the target of: Feb 18th (1 month prior to Spring IETF)
- For timeline improvement suggestions, please see NomCom 05/06 report to the community
- Also, 3777 does not take into account the 1/2 to 1 week required to confirm with selectees post-confirmation, and notify non-selectees including some time for non-selectees to read their mail.

Key Issues

- Not enough willing volunteers for NomCom. Significant decline in recent years.
- Strong Incumbent Syndrome: Where there is a strong, well respected incumbent few other people are willing to come forward and stand. This causes an issue when a NomCom wants to move the strong incumbent to a different position.
- Confirming body <> NomCom interaction is not clear, possible need for revisions to the 3777 guidelines.
- Tension between openness and confidentiality.
- Radical Suggestion: Amend 3777 to make lists of willing candidates, or, perhaps, all nominated candidates, public.

Backup

Process Summary

- Added a significant new tool set for this year's NomCom. This will have a positive impact on all future NomComs.
- Collected nominations through web-tool, and email.
- Asked each nominee to agree to be considered, and if they are willing, fill out the questionnaire. Shortened the questionnaire for this year. Questionnaire could probably improve with some more shortening.
- Collected nominations and conducted in-person interviews at the third IETF (San Diego).
- Sent requests for feedback on a subset of the candidates for each position. These lists were targeted to include:
 - Sitting IESG and IAB
 - Working Group Chairs for the area in question
 - Members of the Directorates (if any) for the area in question
 - Authors of active working group drafts in the area in question
- For IAB, IAOC and Chair, input from all areas was the scope, since these positions affect all areas.

Process Summary Continued

- Collated and presented the material and read all comments from the community members. Used the internal NomCom tracker (Thanks Henrik!!) for information gathering.
- 2 hours weekly, or bi-weekly teleconferences to discuss area needs, community feedback and candidates.
- Constant discussions on email list.
- Official voting carried out on email. Teleconference votes confirmed on email.

Confirming Body Interaction

- Rules are unclear in the interaction between NomCom and the confirming bodies.
- Specifically: Can the confirming body demand the entire slate of candidates before they will confirm any individual member.
 - On one hand: This is reasonable since the confirming body wants to see what the interaction is between candidates,
 - On the other, dogmatic application of this rule can cause a violation of the confidentiality rules, by forcing NomCom's hand in issuing another call for candidates. This also limits the flexibility and adaptability of the nominations and selection system.

Serving on NomCom

- The workload, although present, is fairly tightly bounded to the 5-6 months between committee selection and the announcement of the candidate lists. Also, the bulk of the workload occurs only in the 2-3 months between close of nominations and the announcement of candidates.
- NomCom is an excellent way for people to participate in the leadership of the IETF. You meet people outside your area, and through NomCom get a much better understanding of the issues across the IETF as a whole. Members also get an exposure to perhaps better ways of doing things in different areas. Cross-interaction such as this allows ex-members to go back to their own work with more tools and experiences.

Web Tools

- Radically enhanced toolset.
- Toolset now includes:
 - Web-based nomination with automated questionnaire sending
 - NomCom tracker by candidate and area
 - Encrypted comments storage
 - Mark comments as nomination acceptance or questionnaire to ease compiling lists of accepted nominees and those who have submitted the questionnaire.
 - NomCom Wiki
 - Web-based request for comments on nominees tool
- “Off Season” to do:
 - Add comments not tied to a specific candidate (area comments)
 - Add tools to handle the NomCom volunteering and selection process