IETF LC comments on draft-ietf-pim-sm-bsr-10

PIM WG meeting, IETF 68, Prague
March 20 2007
Alexander Gall gall@switch.ch
LC comments

• Gen-ART review by Eric Gray

• secdir review by Sandy Murphy. Not yet discussed among authors, will take it to the list soon.

• Lars Eggert: is “updates RFC2362” correct? 2362 has been obsoleted by 4601, but old BSR spec is only in 2362.
Non-candidate-BSR state machine

Issues

- NoInfo state missing from overview in section 2
- Distinct FSMs for dynamically learned scope zones and configured scope zones merged into one

Proposed changes to section 3.1.2

- Explain there are two different FSMs up front, the one displayed is for dynamically learned scopes
- Clarify why NoInfo state is omitted from section 2
- Explain how the FSM for configured scope zones differs (no NoInfo state, no Timer)
Non-candidate-BSR state machine (cont.)

Zone expiry timer is primed in various transitions, when it is only really needed in the transition from AP to AA.
Non-candidate-BSR state machine (cont.)

The FSM can be simplified without changing its behavior (almost):

- Remove action Set SZT to SZ_Timeout from transitions NoInfo → AP, AP → AP, AA → AP
- Add action Set SZT to SZ_Timeout to transition AP → AA

Only difference: a scope zone will expire one BS_Timeout period later than with current spec.
Group-to-RP-mapping timer (GET) expiration

What happens when this timer expires is not explicitly described anywhere. We propose to add some text in section 3.6.
Actions Remove BSR state/Clear State

- It appears to be unclear which state is removed in the action Remove BSR state. Clarify this by listing the items explicitly (BSR address, priority, bootstrap timer, saved BSM).

- Action Clear State in transition AA → NoInfo is not described anywhere. Rename action to Remove scope zone state, add description

Remove scope zone state
When the Scope-Zone Expiry Timer expires, all state associated with the scope zone is removed (see section 2).

- Remove action Cancel Timers in transition AA → NoInfo (timer is removed with Remove scope zone state)
Draft status: IESG Evaluation/Revised ID Needed

- Address issues from secdir review on the list
- Publish revision 11
- Start new LC (?)