DNS Zone Transfer Protocol (AXFR)
draft-ietf-dnsext-axfr-clarify-09.txt

Ed Lewis (editor)
DNSEXT WG
Report at IETF 72
Draft Tracker Detail

• Draft Name: draft-ietf-dnsext-axfr-clarify-09.txt
• IESG Discussion: No IESG evaluation record (*next slides)
• Version: 09
• Intended Status: Proposed Standard
• On Next Agenda? No
• Current State: AD is watching
• Responsible AD: Mark Townsley
• Status Date: 2008-06-06
• Note: 2008-6-6 New editor is Edward Lewis. Issues should have been addressed, working through the editing. Olafur recused, Andrew handling WG for this draft.
Reviseion History

- 00: March 2000
- 01: November 2000
- 02: June 2001
- 03: July 2001
- 04: March 2002
- 05: November 2002
- 06: January 2008
- 07: February 2008
- 08: June 2008
- 09: July 2008

What happened between November 2002 and January 2008?
IESG Log

• 2002-12-18  AD Evaluation from Publication Requested
• 2003-02-06  Last Call Requested
• 2003-02-10  In Last Call
• 2003-02-27  Waiting for Writeup
• 2003-05-15  AD to express result of IETF last call
• 2004-04-23  djb raised issues. AD review found issues
• 2004-04-23  AD is watching
• 2005-05-26  Dead
• 2008-01-23  AD is watching
"AD review found issues"

• I just became aware of this (Wednesday as I prepared slides)
• Found out there was an email exchange on this in 2004 that I still need to "consume"
Recent editing work

• Targeted a number of people for comments
  – Got a few responses, but not as many as hoped
  – Representing 4 separate implementation teams
  – Energetic review from Alfred H too

• My purpose in stating this, ensure that this is the will of the Working Group
Current editing issues

• Two section 1.4's
  – Assume latter is the one that will stay

• Section 3.2
  – Submitted text hasn't made sense to me

• Comment: "The defaults on whether to allow a transfer or not are problematic. They sound nice but are impractical."
  – Such a comment is hard to respond to
Upon starting on AD comments

• The central question "what is in a zone?"
• RFC 1034, 4.2.1:
  – Authoritative data for all nodes within the zone.
  – Data that defines the top node of the zone...
  – Data that describes delegated subzones, ...
  – Data ... called "glue" ...
• Added to this
  – Occluded data from dynamic update and DNAME
What is in a zone?

• My interpretation
  – Even incorrect glue is part of a zone

• What about typo's?
  – What if there's an out of zone (besides occluded) name accidently inserted into the zone?
  – Should the zone be available for AXFR? Even if it isn't available for queries?
Next steps

• Look to see if we have answered the AD and DJB comments
• "Wait" for more implementer input?
• Soon have a version ready for WGLC
  — That means "with pagination"