

This chart is a comparison between NTPv4 and IEEE1588v2 capabilities, and a summary of the applications requirements. It is an output of the TICTOC Paris Interim June 2008.

|                                 | 1588 wide-area   | 1588 constrained network  | NTPv4 Internet   | NTPv4 constrained   | NTP NG (based on lab data)                                     | GSM/WCDMA over packet Frequency/FDD   |
|---------------------------------|--|---|--|---|--|---|
| <b>time type</b>                | TAI or arbitrary   | TAI or arbitrary  | UTC  | UTC   | UTC, monotonic (GPS)   | frequency only  |
| <b>time resolution</b>          | 250 femtosec   | 250 femtosec  | 232 picosec (NTP timestamp)  | 232 picosec (NTP timestamp)                                 | 232 picosec (NTP timestamp)                                    | NA  |
| <b>client's time resolution</b> |  |   | microseconds   | microseconds  | nanoseconds  |   |
| <b>freq stability</b>           | Local osc dependent  | Local osc dependent   | not defined by protocol  | not defined by protocol                                     | not defined by protocol  | 50-250 ppb (1)  |
| <b>freq accuracy</b>            | short term: dependent on local oscillator, update rate, and algorithm (1)                                | short term: dependent on local oscillator, update rate, and algorithm (1)             | $1 \times 10^{-7}$ (100 ppm) (2)   | $1 \times 10^{-8}$ (100 ppm) (2)                            | $1 \times 10^{-11}$ (w/ Rb or OCXO) with current polling rates | 50-250 ppb (1)  |
| <b>time/phase stability</b>     | HW dependent (mainly oscillator dependent)   | h/w dependent (mainly osc)  | 10 microseconds (6)  | 10 microseconds (6)   | 8 nanoseconds with hardware support at egress (6)              | NA  |
| <b>time/phase accuracy</b>      | limited by asymmetry   | higher with on-path support   | 10 ms (7)  | 10 - 100 microseconds (small scale - few hops switched) (7) | sub microsecond has been demonstrated in lab                   | NA  |
| <b>acquisition time</b>         | good   | very good   | 24 hours   | 8 minutes   | 10-20 seconds  | as soon as possible, x minutes  |
| <b>service jitter</b>           |  |   | NA   | NA  | NA   | Depends on oscillator stability   |
| <b>service wander</b>           |  | Protocol can not guarantee PRC mask but has been experimentally achieved (cf. note 5) | NA   | NA  | NA   | Depends on oscillator stability   |
| <b>asymmetry</b>                | Not an issue for frequency<br>Can correct asymmetry if asymmetry is known                                | Not an issue for frequency<br>Can correct asymmetry if asymmetry is known             | YES  | yes - asymmetry may possibly be constrained                 | must be less than 2 microseconds for this performance          | NA  |
| <b>constrained network</b>      |  |   | no   | yes   | yes  | Yes   |
| <b>on-path support</b>          | none   | may be used   | none   | none  | hardware timestamping (8)                                      | No  |
| <b>clients/server</b>           | Not limited by protocol  | Limited by states stored in on-path support device (unicast) (4)                      | millions (9)   | 100s - 1000s (9)  | 100s (9)   | Under study, 100 to 1000's  |
| <b>update rate</b>              | Not practically limited by protocol  | Not practically limited by protocol   | 16 seconds - 17 minutes (10)   | 16 seconds - 17 minutes (10)                                | more than 1 pps (10)   | Depends on oscillator stability and network   |
| <b>server auth</b>              | Needs development  | Needs development   | yes  | yes   | no   | No (3)  |
| <b>client auth</b>              | Needs specification  | Needs specification (3)   | no   | no  | no   | No (3)  |
| <b>transaction auth</b>         | Needs specification (cf. note 3)   | Needs specification (3)   | no   | no  | no   | No (3)  |
| <b>backwards compat</b>         | NA   | N/A except industrial (backward compatibility with 1588-2002)                         | NTPv3  | NTPv3   | NTPv4  | Yes   |
| <b>time alignment</b>           |  |   |  |   |  |   |
|                                 | Note (1): long term frequency accuracy should always converge to that of source clock                    | Note (3): IEEE1588 authentication and on-path support still needs clarification       | Note (5): this applies to NTP; implementation and network specific         | Note (7): limited by layering and asymmetry                 | (9) for NTP total clients in network                           | Note (1) This is requirement in the air interface. In practice more accurate frequency is required at the input. For example OBSAI RP1 defines 16 ppb |
|                                 | Note (2): NTP supports oscillators as bad as 500 ppm; could be better simply by increasing polling rates | Note (4): in multicast P2P mode, can scale to 1000's slaves                           | Note (6): rms jitter on timestamp from server (phase noise on ntp packets) | Note (8): follow up packets have also been proposed         | Note (10): polling interval                                    | Note (2). In input  |

|                                    | LTE - TDD   | Circuit emulation              |                                     | Remote telco                                     | instrumentation / measurement - automated test system (5)  | industrial (5)                      |
|------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|-------------------------------------|
| WCDMA TDD                          |   | Traffic mask apps              | Synch mask apps                     |  |  |                                     |
| phase alignment                    | phase alignment   | frequency only                 | frequency only                      | TAI + leap second information                    | UTC  | TAI/UTC/arbitrary                   |
| e.g. 10 ns                         | e.g. 10 ns  | NA<br>NA                       | NA<br>NA                            | 10ns is fine                                     | sub nanosecond, maybe pico seconds                         | 10nS                                |
| 50-250 ppb (1)                     | 50-250 ppb (1)  |                                |                                     |  | 1.00E+12   | n/a                                 |
| 50-250 ppb (1)                     | 50-250 ppb (1)  |                                |                                     |  | 1.00E+12   | n/a                                 |
| Terminology TBD                    | Terminology TBD   |                                |                                     |  | meaning unclear  | meaning unclear                     |
| '±/ 1.25 us relative (2)           | 1 us - 50 us (4a,4b)  |                                |                                     | within 100uS of GPS                              | unknown  | 10 - 100uS                          |
| as soon as possible, x minutes     | as soon as possible, x minutes  |                                |                                     | 5 minutes start up, 30 minutes for full accuracy | 30 min   | 5 min                               |
| Depends on oscillator stability    | Depends on oscillator stability   | G.823/G824 traffic mask        | G.823/G824 synch mask               |  | meaning unclear  | meaning unclear                     |
| Depends on oscillator stability    | Depends on oscillator stability   | G.823/G.824 traffic mask       | G.823/G824 synch mask               | less than 1uS MTIE relative to GPS               | meaning unclear  | meaning unclear                     |
| Should be taken into account       | Should be taken into account  | NA                             | NA                                  | links are symmetric within 1uS                   | symmetry   | yes                                 |
| Yes                                | Yes   | Yes                            | Yes                                 | campus network, maybe 3-6 hops                   | yes  | yes                                 |
| In most cases                      | In most cases   | yes (continuous physical line) | yes (continuous physical line, SSU) | unlikely   | maybe  | yes                                 |
| Under study, 100 to 1000's         | Under study, 100 to 1000's  | 1 to 1                         | 1 to 1                              | perhaps 100                                      | <100/1000's  | 100-1000 clients                    |
| Depends on many aspects            | Depends on many aspects   | data packet rate               | typically 10s per second            | perhaps 1000/sec/client permitted                | implementation specific/1 per s                            | implementation specific             |
| No (3)                             | No (3)  | No need                        | No need                             | NA   | no   | yes                                 |
| No (3)                             | No (3)  | No                             | No                                  | NA   | no   | no                                  |
| No (3)                             | No (3)  | No meaning                     | No meaning                          | NA   | no   | no                                  |
| Yes                                | Yes   |                                | output should be 8KHz or 2M         | preferred  | maybe 1588 v1<br>100pS                                     | ntp - 1588 V1 - IRIG<br>100nS - 1mS |
| Note (3) assumes a private network | Note 4a : no precise phase accuracy requirements defined in standard. The actual requirement will depend on implementation and network scenario.<br>Note 4b : In general LTE TDD systems may be defined to operate with 10-50 microseconds phase accuracy by making some limitations on the deployment (e.g. cell range), and radio frame configuration, however further investigation are required. When no assumption possible, microsecond or sub-microsecond requirement would apply. |                                |                                     |  | Note (5) draft answers based on unfair definition of terms |                                     |

| power - sub station (5)         | Networking SLA   | Network CDR           | TOD/Internet                               | legal time               | metrology           | sensor networks   |
|---------------------------------|--|-----------------------|--|--------------------------|---------------------|---|
| 3 UTC                           | arbitrary, UTC, TAI  | UTC                   | UTC(k)+company local                       | UTC(k)                   | local clock         | arbitrary time or only ordering                                 |
| 100nS                           | to achieve 1us we should timestamp to 100ns, moving to better than 10ns to have a unique ts per pkt in the future      | 10us                  | 1us  | infinite                 | 10fs representation | short timestamp critical  |
| don't care                      | 10ns good enough   | 10us                  |  |                          |                     | NA  |
|                                 | accuracy + stability = 10-7 moving to 10-8   | 10ppm                 | 3*10-15 (6)                                |                          |                     | not critical  |
| almost don't care               | see above  | see above             | 6*10-13 (6)                                |                          |                     | not critical  |
| meaning unclear                 | don't understand   | don't understand      | 1us  | infinite                 |                     | don't understand concept  |
| 1uS                             | better than 1us  | 1ms                   | 1us  | infinite                 |                     | 1 ms  |
| 1 min                           | not critical   | not critical          | 4 min                                      | 4 min                    |                     | 1 ms  |
| dkm                             | NA   | NA                    |  |                          |                     | NA  |
| meaning unclear                 | NA   | NA                    |  |                          |                     | NA  |
| <100nS                          | must not limit one way measurement time delivery nw may be constrained, measurement n/w will not                       | must not limit        | handle yes                                 | handle yes               |                     | NA  |
| yes                             | if required  | if required           | no   | no                       |                     | completely uncontrolled (random number and position of sensors) |
| maybe                           | if required  | unlikely to be needed | no   | no                       | out-of-band         | NO  |
| 1 server (backup) - 100 clients | 100K DSLAMs, 10k PEs, 1K P routers, ~200pops don't know how many servers   | small number          | 25M  | c/s s/c                  |                     | distributed network - no servers no clients                     |
| implementation specific         | better than 1pps   | low                   | 255spp-1000pps                             | 155spp-1000pps           | down to 1pps        | variable, very low but with peaks                               |
| yes                             | depend on how controlled the environment is  | depends               | yes  | yes                      | yes                 | NA  |
| no                              | depends on how controlled the environment is   | depends               | no   | yes                      | yes                 | NA  |
| no                              | depends on how controlled the environment is   | depends               | no   | yes (server log client?) | yes                 | possibly  |
| yes if IRIG                     | would be nice if server NTP compatible for existing devices, but not a showstopper if new protocol needed to meet goal | not critical          | yes  | no                       |                     | NO  |
|                                 |  |                       |  |                          |                     | amount depends on application                                   |
|                                 |  |                       | Note (6) value is for clock feeding master |                          |                     |   |