

Sunset4 WG

Internet Area

IETF 84, Vancouver, BC

Wes George Marc Blanchet
Sunset4-chairs@tools.ietf.org

Note Well

Any submission to the IETF intended by the Contributor for publication as all or part of an IETF Internet-Draft or RFC and any statement made within the context of an IETF activity is considered an "IETF Contribution". Such statements include oral statements in IETF sessions, as well as written and electronic communications made at any time or place, which are addressed to:

- The IETF plenary session
- The IESG, or any member thereof on behalf of the IESG
- Any IETF mailing list, including the IETF list itself, any working group or design team list, or any other list functioning under IETF auspices
- Any IETF working group or portion thereof
- Any Birds of a Feather (BOF) session
- The IAB or any member thereof on behalf of the IAB
- The RFC Editor or the Internet-Drafts function

All IETF Contributions are subject to the rules of [RFC 5378](#) and [RFC 3979](#) (updated by [RFC 4879](#)).

Statements made outside of an IETF session, mailing list or other function, that are clearly not intended to be input to an IETF activity, group or function, are not IETF Contributions in the context of this notice.

Please consult [RFC 5378](#) and [RFC 3979](#) for details.

A participant in any IETF activity is deemed to accept all IETF rules of process, as documented in Best Current Practices RFCs and IESG Statements.

A participant in any IETF activity acknowledges that written, audio and video records of meetings may be made and may be available to the public.

Administrivia

- Blue Sheet: please sign. This helps get us a properly-sized room and timeslot.
- Call for volunteers for scribing on the etherpad, jabber
- Meeting notes (Etherpad):
<http://tools.ietf.org/wg/sunset4/minutes>
- WG charter:
<http://datatracker.ietf.org/wg/sunset4/charter/>
- Mailing list: sunset4@ietf.org
- Jabber room: sunset4@jabber.ietf.org

Agenda 1/2

- Note well, administrivia, scribes, minutes
 - Chairs, 5 minutes
- Agenda Bashing
 - Chairs, 5 minutes
- [WG Charter](#) and Scope discussion
 - Chairs, 20 minutes

Drafts related to current charter Milestones

- IPv6 Support within IETF work
 - [draft-george-ipv6-support](#)
 - presenter Lee Howard, 10 minutes

- Gap Analysis for IPv4 Sunset
 - [draft-dionne-sunset4-v4gapanalysis](#)
 - presenter TBD, 10 minutes
- Scenarios of IPv4 Sunsetting
 - [draft-zhou-sunset4-scenarios](#)
 - presenter TBD, 10 minutes

IPv4 Sunset related drafts

- Turning off IPv4 using DHCPv6
 - [draft-perreault-sunset4-noipv4](#)
 - presenter TBD, 10 minutes
- 464XLAT: Combination of Stateful & Stateless Translation
 - [draft-ietf-v6ops-464xlat](#)
 - presenter Cameron Byrne, 10 minutes

Agenda 2/2

CGN/NAT related drafts

- Managed Objects for Carrier Grade NAT
 - [draft-perreault-sunset4-cgn-mib](#)
 - presenter TBD, 10 minutes
- Deterministic Address Mapping to Reduce Logging in CGN Deployments
 - [draft-donley-behave-deterministic-cgn](#)
 - presenter TBD, 10 minutes
- NAT Behavioral Requirements Updates
 - [draft-penno-behave-rfc4787-5382-5508-bis](#)
 - presenter TBD, 10 minutes
- Stateless IPv4 NAT
 - [draft-tsou-stateless-nat44](#)
 - presenter Will Liu, 10 minutes
- Experience from NAT44 Translation Testing
 - [draft-li-behave-n444-test](#)
 - presenter, Will Liu, 10 minutes
- Mitigating Aggregated Traffic of DHCP Discover Messages
 - draft-yang-dhc-ipv4-dis
 - Presenter Lianyuan Li, if time allows
- Summary/Wrap-up/next steps
 - Chairs, 15 minutes

Disclaimer

- The next two slides are editorial, not normative
 - Charter is normative, this is interpretation
- An attempt by your humble chairs to provide additional info gained during meetings about charter and scope, intent
- WG/IETF consensus trumps the chairs' opinions, this is merely a starting point

What is Sunset4?

- Central place to discuss IPv4-specific IETF work, ensure it's justified before proceeding
 - What is the minimum work that IETF needs to finish so that standards work on IPv4 is “done”?
- A WG to consider how to turn IPv4 **OFF**
 - Focus on changes to **IPv4** protocols, processes, implementations, best practices
 - Can identify issues in IPv6 that make disabling IPv4 difficult, but not fix them
 - Missing features for parity, broken stuff gets handed to the appropriate IPv6 WG (v6ops, 6man, others)

What Sunset4 ISN'T

- The IPv4 life support group
- IPv6 Deployment Deniers Anonymous
- The IPv4-specific Internet Draft orphanage
- CGNs R US
- BEHAVE 2.0/Softwire Annex
- v4Ops
- Creating solutions to all permutations of all IPv4 transition problems
 - Define need for a solution based on *actual demand*, not the mere existence of the problem

Current Charter

- Initial charter written by IESG and to-be Sunset4 chairs, no WG-formation BoF
 - Feedback from WG formation announcement did not result in substantive changes
- Has some problems:
 - Overlaps with other WGs' charter items
 - Contradicts itself
 - Excludes almost all potential work

New Charter

- Product of several discussions between ADs, WG Chairs from all of the groups Sunset4 might work with (e.g. Behave, Softwire, v6ops, Intarea, etc)
 - Determine separation of work, fix wording
- Still not perfect, but gives the chairs and WG flexibility to adopt work we think is useful without asking IESG's approval each time
- Awaiting WG consensus before going back to IESG for final approval

Charter changes 1/3

- The Working Group ~~works only~~ **focuses primarily** on IPv4 protocols to facilitate IPv4 sunsetting.
- before the working group adopts any technology, it must:
 - 1) describe the problem to be solved and show that there is widespread demand for a solution
 - 2) demonstrate that the problem can not be solved with existing technologies
 - 3) provide a description of the proposed solution along with ~~the~~ **its** impact on current IPv4-only use and ~~its ability to promote~~ **justification that it does not harm or delay** the deployment of IPv6

Charter changes 2/3

- ~~Any work on IPv4 to IPv6 transition methods is out of scope~~**This working group focuses IPv4-specific work within the IETF into a single group in order to minimize IETF work on creating and standardizing new IPv4-specific features, IPv4 life extension technologies, and IPv4 to IPv6 transition methods mechanisms whose primary focus is on IPv4. The scope of work on these items is not limited to the minimal amount necessary to support continued operation of scope. the Internet until IPv6 is fully deployed.**

Charter changes 3/3

The initial work items are:

- ~~Review current Carrier Grade NAT (CGN) documents and related issues, including requirements for standardization, and determine if CGN is a suitable sunsetting technology to become a work item:~~
 - ~~—draft-ietf-behave-lsn-requirements draft-ietf-behave-nat-mib~~ CGN port allocation **and address sharing** methods
- Gap analysis of IPv4 features to facilitate IPv4 sunsetting
- **Provisioning methods to signal a dual-stack host to disable the use of IPv4**

Goals and Milestones:

Dec 2012 - CGN port allocation and address sharing methods

Jun 2013 - Send gap analysis on IPv4 sunsetting to IESG

Sep 2013 - Provisioning methods to signal a dual-stack host to disable the use of IPv4

Summary and Next Steps

- Call consensus on WG Charter (today)
- Verify consensus on list
- Begin discussing WG draft adoption
 - Shouldn't really adopt drafts until charter is approved
 - Solicit volunteers for substantive reviews of drafts to be adopted