Analysis of BFD Security According to KARP Design Guide

draft-bhatia-zhang-karp-bfd-analysis-03

Manav Bhatia
Dacheng Zhang
Mahesh Jethanandani
Why?

- BFD used for liveliness check by
  - Routing Protocols
    - IS-IS
    - OSPFv2
    - RIPv2
  - Data path
    - MPLS(-TP)
What are the threats?

- [I-D.ietf-karp-threats-reqs](#) outlines 22 threats that all protocols should consider.

- BFD is vulnerable to
  - Replay Protection:
  - Lack of Strong Algorithms: SHA-2 is not supported
  - DoS Attacks: When malicious packets are sent at a millisecond interval, with the authentication bit set, it can cause a DoS attack.
### Existing Authentication Mechanisms

- [RFC5880] describes five authentication mechanisms for securing BFD control packets:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authentication Mechanisms</th>
<th>Features</th>
<th>Security Strength</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Simple Password</td>
<td>Password transported in plain text</td>
<td>weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keyed MD5</td>
<td>sequence member required to increase occasionally</td>
<td>Subject to both intra and inter-session replay attacks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keyed SHA-1</td>
<td>Same with Keyed MD5</td>
<td>Same with Keyed MD5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meticulous Keyed MD5</td>
<td>sequence member required to increase monotonically</td>
<td>Subject to inter-session replay attacks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meticulous Keyed SHA-1</td>
<td>Same with Meticulous Keyed MD5</td>
<td>Same with Meticulous Keyed MD5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Issues with Inter-Session

- Sequence number are re-initialized
  - Cold Reboot: after each reboot, the sequence number will be re-initialized
  - 32-bit sequence number: If sequence number is increased every 3.3 ms, it will roll over in 24 weeks

- Discriminators are not random
  - Routers pick the same discriminator after reboot
Additionally

- Limited key updating functionality
  - No smooth key rollover

- No protection of echo mode
Impacts of BFD Replays

- Force victims to change state
  - Replayed packet with the AdminDown state will force the victim set its state to Down

```
If received state is AdminDown
If bfd.SessionState is not Down
    Set bfd.LocalDiag to 3 (Neighbor signaled session down)
    Set bfd.SessionState to Down
```

- Security issues in the BFD echo mode directly affect the BFD protocol and session states, and hence the network stability.
Impact of New Authentication Requirements

- Time interval between BFD tx/rx in milliseconds
- Hardware support for authentication is not common
- Performing authentication in software impacts number of sessions that can be supported
- This is specially true for Meticulous algorithms
Recommendations

- At the re-initialization of the sequence number, a router can:
  - Change key: A Key ID is provided to the key used to hash the packet.
  - Change discriminator
- Increase the sequence number space to 64 bits
  - Wrap around in 2 million years
- Only accept sequence number in the 3 * timeout period
- Use random numbers in echo mode
- Use hardware assist in authentication
Next Step

- WG item?
Questions?