Tunnel Foo over UDP discussion what recommendations does TSV make (and why)

TSVAREA meeting @ IETF-89

Where to start from

- A number of tunneling foo-over-UDP proposals
 - (incomplete list for sure!)
 - Generic UDP Encapsulation for IP Tunneling
 - draft-ietf-tsvwg-gre-in-udp-encap
 - Encapsulating MPLS in UDP
 - draft-ietf-mpls-in-udp
 - Generic UDP Encapsulation
 - draft-herbert-gue
 - Automatic Multicast Tunneling
 - draft-ietf-mboned-auto-multicast

WHAT'S THE ISSUE?

Taking any protocol to run over UDP

See prior talk about BCP 145

Below transport layer protocols tunneled over UDP

Lower-layer protocols 'escape' from their environment and run over the public Internet

Usually no feedback loop and no reaction to feedback

RECOMMENDATIONS

What to do, if?!

- Feedback loop is required
- Reaction to feedback loop is required
- Reaction can be
 - Reduction in sending rate
 - Stop service fire circuit breaker
- Depends on your "application"
 - How long is you "application" working in a useful operating point if there is congestion?

Circuit Breakers!



TDM Pseudowires: "Circuit Breaker" Ideas

David Black, EMC

TDM Pseudowires (PWs)

- Emulate fixed-bandwidth TDM (e.g., T1, E3)
- Transmission: ON or OFF (cannot adjust rate)
- TDM PWs known to run over IP
 - What happens when they compete with TCP?
 - Or other congestion-responsive traffic?
- Author team working (slowly) on a draft
 - draft-ietf-pwe3-congcons (expired, sorry)
 - Initial results apply to "circuit breakers"

Pseudowire (PW) Background

- Pseudowire (PW) emulates a "wire"
 - Ethernet, Frame Relay, TDM telephone, FC, etc.
 - Mostly over MPLS, some over IP
- Significant congestion concerns arose
 - E.g., see RFC 3985 (Sec. 6.5), RFC 4553 (Sec. 8)
- Congestion usually not a problem in practice
 - Most PWs run over traffic-engineered MPLS
 - But some PWs run over IP, e.g., TDM PWs
 - Time Division Multiplex voice and/or data

Generalizing

- 1. Independent service level spec for traffic
 - Crucial input, independent of TCP for TDM PWs.
- 2. Apply TCP throughput equation
 - Depends on RTT (2-way latency) and loss rate
- 3. Monitor error rate and define threshold
 - Threshold could be generous (multiple of TCP)
- 4. Figure out what to do when threshold exceeded
- 5. More importantly, *how/where* to do it:
 - Hypothetical TDM PW "delayed trip circuit breaker":
 - Management plane, human network operator
 - Response delays ok: This is about recovery when prevention fails.
 - Approaches to other technologies will vary.