

MSID - the Finish

Harald Alvestrand

Document Status

- No technical change proposed for a long time
- WMS mechanism is stable, and well explained
- Series of reviews that critique formulations
- In particular, the split into “generic” and “method-specific” is hard to get right
- We need to take action.

The WMS mechanism (recap)

- MediaStreamTracks are unidirectional, and have ID values.
- MediaStreams are unidirectional groups of MediaStreamTracks.
- MediaStreamTracks map to media sections.
- MSID: Identify which MediaStreamTracks belong to the same MediaStream (by id)
- MSID: Carry the Javascript “id” property of a MediaStreamTrack

The Generic Mechanism

- WG decision in Paris, March 2012: “we are the WG that designs generic mechanisms, so make it a generic mechanism”
- msid-semantic: “string” “id”*
- Only defined value: WMS
- No second user since then.
- Which part of the mechanism is generic?
- How can we tell?

Proposal 1: Fix the Split

- Address Fleming's comments
- Invent some completely vacuous guidance for the expert reviewer
- Hope that we'll get it right in case a second user shows up.

Proposal 2: Admit One

- Keep msid-semantic:WMS * - it is sometimes useful, and future-proofs the spec
- Add words to say how to check that nobody changed the rules on MSID on you
- Integrate MSID and “generic” sections
- Say “more mechanisms can only be added by updating this standard”

Summary

- MSID used for WMS is well understood and documented
- We're completely in the dark about what's appropriate to make "generic" and what's WMS specific
- My proposal: Let's close the box and move on - there is Only One
- I do NOT wish to be back here in 3 years' time arguing about this.