

Network WG  
Internet-Draft  
Expires: January 4, 2015  
Intended Status: Standards Track  
Updates: RFC 2872 (if accepted)

James Polk  
Subha Dhesikan  
Cisco Systems  
July 4, 2014

Resource Reservation Protocol (RSVP) Application-ID  
Profiles for Voice and Video Streams  
draft-ietf-tsvwg-rsvp-app-id-vv-profiles-02

Abstract

RFC 2872 defines an Resource Reservation Protocol (RSVP) object for application identifiers. This document uses that App-ID and gives implementers specific guidelines for differing voice and video stream identifications to nodes along a reservation path, creating specific profiles for voice and video session identification.

Status of this Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at <http://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/>.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on July 4, 2014.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2014 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

## Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	2
2.	RSVP Application-ID Template	3
3.	The Voice and Video Application-ID Profiles	4
3.1	The Broadcast video Profile	4
3.2	The Real-time Interactive Profile	5
3.3	The Multimedia Conferencing Profile	5
3.4	The Multimedia Streaming Profile	6
3.5	The Conversational Profile	6
4.	Security considerations	7
5.	IANA considerations	7
5.1	Application Profiles	7
5.1.1	Broadcast Profiles IANA Registry	8
5.1.2	Realtime-Interactive Profiles IANA Registry	8
5.1.3	Multimedia-Conferencing Profiles IANA Registry	9
5.1.4	Multimedia-Streaming Profiles IANA Registry	10
5.1.5	Conversational Profiles IANA Registry	10
6.	Acknowledgments	12
7.	References	12
7.1.	Normative References	12
7.2.	Informative References	13
	Authors' Addresses	13
	Appendix	14

## 1. Introduction

RFC 2872 [RFC2872] describes the usage of policy elements for providing application information in Resource Reservation Protocol (RSVP) signaling [RFC2205]. The intention of providing this information is to enable application-based policy control. However, RFC 2872 does not enumerate any application profiles. The absence of explicit, uniform profiles leads to incompatible handling of these values and misapplied policies. An application profile used by a sender might not be understood by the intermediaries or receiver in a different domain. Therefore, there is a need to enumerate application profiles that are universally understood and applied for correct policy control.

Call control between endpoints has the ability to bind or associate many attributes to a reservation. One new attribute is currently being defined so as to establish the type of traffic contained in that reservation. This is accomplished via assigning a traffic label to the call (or session or flow) [ID-TRAF-CLASS].

This document takes the application traffic classes from [ID-TRAF-CLASS] and places those strings in the APP-ID object defined in RFC 2872. Thus, the intermediary devices (e.g., routers) processing the RSVP message can learn the identified profile within the Application-ID policy element for a particular reservation, and possibly be configured with the profile(s) to understand them



RFC 2872 states the #1 sub-element from RFC 2872 as the "identifier that uniquely identifies the application vendor", which is optional to include. This document modifies this vendor limitation so that the identifier need only be unique - and not limited to an application vendor (identifier). For example, this specification now allows an RFC that defines an industry recognizable term or string to be a valid identifier. For example, a term or string taken from another IETF document, such as "conversational" or "avconf" from [ID-TRAF-CLASS]. This sub-element is still optional to include.

The following subsections will define the values within the above template into specific profiles for voice and video identification.

### 3. The Voice and Video Application-ID Profiles

This section contains the elements of the Application ID policy object which is used to signal the application classes defined in [ID-TRAF-CLASS].

#### 3.1 The Broadcast Profiles

Broadcast profiles are for minimally buffered one-way streaming flows, such as video surveillance, or Internet based concerts or non-VOD TV broadcasts such as live sporting events.

This document creates Broadcast profiles for

- Broadcast IPTV for audio and video
- Broadcast Live-events for audio and video
- Broadcast Surveillance for audio and video

Here is an example profile for identifying Broadcast Video-Surveillance

```
AUTH_APP, POLICY_LOCATOR, ASCII_DN,  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=broadcast.video.surveillance, VER="
```

[Editor's Note: "rfcXXXX" will be replaced with the RFC number assigned to the [ID-TRAF-CLASS] reference. This 'note' should be removed during the RFC-Editor review process.]

Where the Globally Unique Identifier (GUID) indicates the documented reference that created this well-known string [ID-TRAF-CLASS], the APP is the profile name with no spaces, and the "VER=" is included, but has no value at this time.

### 3.2 The Realtime Interactive Profiles

Realtime Interactive profiles are for on-line gaming, and both remote and virtual avconf applications, in which the timing is particularly important towards the feedback to uses of these applications. This traffic type will generally not be UDP based, with minimal tolerance to RTT delays.

This document creates Realtime Interactive profiles for

- Realtime-Interactive Gaming
- Realtime-Interactive Remote-Desktop
- Realtime-Interactive Virtualized-Desktop

Here is the profile for identifying Realtime-Interactive Gaming

```
AUTH_APP, POLICY_LOCATOR, ASCII_DN,  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=realtime-interactive.gaming, VER="
```

Where the Globally Unique Identifier (GUID) indicates the documented reference that created this well-known string [ID-TRAF-CLASS], the APP is the profile name with no spaces, and the "VER=" is included, but has no value, but MAY if versioning becomes important.

### 3.3 The Multimedia Conferencing Profiles

There will be Multimedia Conferencing profiles for presentation data, application sharing and whiteboarding, where these applications will most often be associated with a larger Conversational (audio and/or audio/video) conference. Timing is important, but some minimal delays are acceptable, unlike the case for Realtime-Interactive traffic.

This document creates Multimedia-Conferencing profiles for

- Multimedia-Conferencing presentation-data
- Multimedia-Conferencing presentation-video
- Multimedia-Conferencing presentation-audio
- Multimedia-Conferencing application-sharing
- Multimedia-Conferencing whiteboarding

Here is the profile for identifying Multimedia-Conferencing Application-sharing

```
AUTH_APP, POLICY_LOCATOR, ASCII_DN,  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=multimedia-conferencing.application-sharing, VER="
```

Where the Globally Unique Identifier (GUID) indicates the RFC reference that created this well-known string [ID-TRAF-CLASS], the

APP is the profile name with no spaces, and the "VER=" is included, but has no value, but MAY if versioning becomes important.

### 3.4 The Multimedia Streaming Profiles

Multimedia Streaming profiles are for more significantly buffered one-way streaming flows than Broadcast profiles. These include...

This document creates Multimedia Streaming profiles for

- Multimedia-Streaming multiplex
- Multimedia-Streaming webcast

Here is the profile for identifying Multimedia Streaming webcast

```
AUTH_APP, POLICY_LOCATOR, ASCII_DN,  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=multimedia-streaming.webcast, VER="
```

Where the Globally Unique Identifier (GUID) indicates the documented reference that created this well-known string [ID-TRAF-CLASS], the APP is the profile name with no spaces, and the "VER=" is included, but has no value, but MAY if versioning becomes important.

### 3.5 The Conversational Profiles

Conversational category is for realtime bidirectional communications, such as voice or video, and is the most numerous due to the choices of application with or without adjectives. The number of profiles is then doubled because there needs to be one for unadmitted and one for admitted. The IANA section lists all that are currently proposed for registration at this time, therefore there will not be an exhaustive list provided in this section.

This document creates Conversational profiles for

- Conversational Audio
- Conversational Audio Admitted
- Conversational Video
- Conversational Video Admitted
- Conversational Audio Avconf
- Conversational Audio Avconf Admitted
- Conversational Video Avconf
- Conversational Video Avconf Admitted
- Conversational Audio Immersive
- Conversational Audio Immersive Admitted
- Conversational Video Immersive
- Conversational Video Immersive Admitted

Here is an example profile for identifying Conversational Audio:

```
AUTH_APP, POLICY_LOCATOR, ASCII_DN,  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=conversational.audio, VER="
```

Where the Globally Unique Identifier (GUID) indicates the documented reference that created this well-known string [ID-TRAF-CLASS], the APP is the profile name with no spaces, and the "VER=" is included, but has no value, but MAY if versioning becomes important.

#### 4. Security considerations

The security considerations section within RFC 2872 sufficiently covers this document, with one possible exception - someone using the wrong template values (e.g., claiming a reservation is Multimedia Streaming when it is in fact Real-time Interactive). Given that each traffic flow is within separate reservations, and RSVP does not have the ability to police the type of traffic within any reservation, solving for this appears to be administratively handled at best. This is not meant to be a 'punt', but there really is nothing this template creates that is going to make things any harder for anyone (that we know of now).

#### 5. IANA considerations

##### 5.1 Application Profiles

This document requests IANA create a new registry for the application identification classes similar to the following table within the Resource Reservation Protocol (RSVP) Parameters registry:

```
Registry Name: RSVP APP-ID Profiles  
Reference: [this document]  
Registration procedures: Standards Track document [RFC5226]
```

```
[Editor's Note: "rfcXXXX" will be replaced with the RFC number  
assigned to the [ID-TRAF-CLASS] reference. This  
'note' should be removed during the RFC-Editor  
review process.]
```

##### 5.1.1 Broadcast Profiles IANA Registry

###### Broadcast Audio IPTV Profile

```
P-type = AUTH_APP  
A-type = POLICY_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=broadcast.audio.iptv, VER="
```

Reference: [this document]

## Broadcast Video IPTV Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

```
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,
APP=broadcast.video.iptv, VER="
```

Reference: [this document]

## Broadcast Audio Live-events Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

```
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,
APP=broadcast.audio.live-events, VER="
```

Reference: [this document]

## Broadcast Video Live-events Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

```
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,
APP=broadcast.video.live-events, VER="
```

Reference: [this document]

## Broadcast Audio-Surveillance Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

```
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,
APP=broadcast.audio.surveillance, VER="
```

Reference: [this document]

## Broadcast Video-Surveillance Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

```
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,
APP=broadcast.video.surveillance, VER="
```

Reference: [this document]

## 5.1.2 Realtime-Interactive Profiles IANA Registry

## Realtime-Interactive Gaming Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP= realtime-interactive.gaming, VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Real-time Interactive Remote-Desktop Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=realtime-interactive.remote-desktop, VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Real-time Interactive Virtualized-Desktop Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=realtime-interactive.  
remote-desktop.virtual, VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Real-time Interactive Telemetry Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=realtime-interactive.telemetry, VER="

Reference: [this document]

### 5.1.3 Multimedia-Conferencing Profiles IANA Registry

#### Multimedia-Conferencing Presentation-Data Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP= multimedia-conferencing.presentation-data,  
VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Multimedia-Conferencing Presentation-Video Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,

APP= multimedia-conferencing.presentation-video,  
VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Multimedia-Conferencing Presentation-Audio Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP= multimedia-conferencing.presentation-audio,  
VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Multimedia-Conferencing Application-Sharing Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP= multimedia-conferencing.application-sharing,  
VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Multimedia-Conferencing Whiteboarding Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP= multimedia-conferencing.whiteboarding, VER="

Reference: [this document]

### 5.1.4 Multimedia-Streaming Profiles IANA Registry

#### Multimedia-Streaming Multiplex Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=multimedia-streaming.multiplex, VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Multimedia-Streaming Webcast Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=multimedia-streaming.webcast, VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### 5.1.5 Conversational Profiles IANA Registry

##### Conversational Audio Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=conversational.audio, VER="

Reference: [this document]

##### Conversational Audio Admitted Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=conversational.audio.aq:admitted, VER="

Reference: [this document]

##### Conversational Video Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=conversational.video, VER="

Reference: [this document]

##### Conversational Video Admitted Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=conversational.video.aq:admitted, VER="

Reference: [this document]

##### Conversational Audio Avconf Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=conversational.audio.avconf, VER="

Reference: [this document]

##### Conversational Audio Avconf Admitted Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
    "GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
      APP=conversational.audio.avconf.aq:admitted,  
      VER="

Reference: [this document]

Conversational Video Avconf Profile  
P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
    "GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
      APP=conversational.video.avconf, VER="

Reference: [this document]

Conversational Video Avconf Admitted Profile  
P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
    "GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
      APP=conversational.video.avconf.aq:admitted,  
      VER="

Reference: [this document]

Conversational Audio Immersive Profile  
P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
    "GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
      APP=conversational.audio.immersive, VER="

Reference: [this document]

Conversational Audio Immersive Admitted Profile  
P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
    "GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
      APP=conversational.audio.immersive.aq:admitted,  
      VER="

Reference: [this document]

Conversational Video Immersive Profile  
P-type = AUTH\_APP  
A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR  
Sub-type = ASCII\_DN  
Conformant policy locator =  
    "GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,

APP=conversational.video.immersive, VER="

Reference: [this document]

#### Conversational Video Immersive Admitted Profile

P-type = AUTH\_APP

A-type = POLICY\_LOCATOR

Sub-type = ASCII\_DN

Conformant policy locator =

"GUID=http://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfcXXXX.txt,  
APP=conversational.video.immersive.aq:admitted,  
VER="

Reference: [this document]

## 6. Acknowledgments

To Francois Le Faucheur, Paul Jones, Ken Carlberg, Georgios Karagiannis and Glen Lavers for their helpful comments, document reviews and encouragement.

## 7. References

### 7.1. Normative References

- [RFC2119] S. Bradner, "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", RFC 2119, March 1997
- [RFC2205] R. Braden, Ed., L. Zhang, S. Berson, S. Herzog, S. Jamin, "Resource ReSerVation Protocol (RSVP) -- Version 1 Functional Specification", RFC 2205, September 1997
- [RFC2474] K. Nichols, S. Blake, F. Baker, D. Black, "Definition of the Differentiated Services Field (DS Field) in the IPv4 and IPv6 Headers ", RFC 2474, December 1998
- [RFC2750] S. Herzog, "RSVP Extensions for Policy Control", RFC 2750, January 2000
- [RFC2872] Y. Bernet, R. Pabbati, "Application and Sub Application Identity Policy Element for Use with RSVP", RFC 2872, June 2000
- [RFC2996] Y. Bernet, "Format of the RSVP DCLASS Object", RFC 2996, November 2000
- [RFC3182] S. Yadav, R. Yavatkar, R. Pabbati, P. Ford, T. Moore, S. Herzog, R. Hess, "Identity Representation for RSVP", RFC 3182, October 2001
- [RFC5226] T. Narten, H. Alvestrand, "Guidelines for Writing an IANA

Considerations Section in RFCs", RFC 5226, May 2008

[ID-TRAF-CLASS] J. Polk, S. Dhesikan, P. Jones, "The Session Description Protocol (SDP) 'trafficclass' Attribute", work in progress, Feb 2013

## 7.2. Informative References

[RFC4594] J. Babiarez, K. Chan, F Baker, "Configuration Guidelines for Diffserv Service Classes", RFC 4594, August 2006

## Authors' Addresses

James Polk  
3913 Treemont Circle  
Colleyville, Texas, USA  
+1.817.271.3552

mailto: jmpolk@cisco.com

Subha Dhesikan  
170 W Tasman St  
San Jose, CA, USA  
+1.408-902-3351

mailto: sdhesika@cisco.com

## Appendix - Changes to ID

[Editor's Note: this appendix should be removed in the RFC-Editor's process.]

### A.1 - Changes from WG version -00 to WG version -01

The following changes were made in this version:

- corrected nits
- globally replaced GUID link from the MMUSIC Trafficclass ID to the future RFC of that document.
- added profiles for presentation-video and presentation-audio

### A.2 - Changes from Individual -04 to WG version -00

The following changes were made in this version:

- changed P-Type from APP\_TC back to AUTH\_APP, which is already defined.
- fixed nits and inconsistencies

#### A.3 - Changes from Individual -03 to -04

The following changes were made in this version:

- clarified security considerations section to mean RSVP cannot police the type of traffic within a reservation to know if a traffic flow should be using a different profile, as defined in this document.
- changed existing informative language regarding "... other Sub-types ..." from 'can' to normative 'MAY'.
- editorial changes to clear up minor mistakes

#### A.4 - Changes from Individual -02 to -03

The following changes were made in this version:

- Added [ID-TRAF-CLASS] as a reference
- Changed to a new format of the profile string.
- Added many new profiles based on the new format into each parent category of Section 3.
- changed the GUID to refer to draft-ietf-mmusic-traffic-class-for-sdp-03.txt
- changed 'desktop' adjective to 'avconf' to keep in alignment with [ID-TRAF-CLASS]
- Have a complete IANA Registry proposal for each application-ID discussed in this draft.
- General text clean-up of the draft.