

# draft-ietf-dnsop-rfc8499bis again

---

Paul Hoffman  
DNSOP interim meeting  
2021-12-14

# Two topics

---

- In-bailiwick
- Glue

# In-bailiwick

---

- These definitions were added in RFC 8499 after a lot of discussion, but then become controversial
- A few threads in November
- Summary is in the WG [archive](#) on 2021-10-18
- No definitions in source RFCs
- Weak consensus is to abandon any discussion on in-bailiwick
- But we probably want to put *something* in for bailiwick, in-bailiwick, and out-of-bailiwick

# Glue, current text part 1

---

"...[Resource records] which are not part of the authoritative data [of the zone], and are address RRs for the [name] servers [in subzones]. These RRs are only necessary if the name server's name is 'below' the cut, and are only used as part of a referral response." Without glue "we could be faced with the situation where the NS RRs tell us that in order to learn a name server's address, we should contact the server using the address we wish to learn." (Quoted from `<xref target="RFC1034"/>`, Section 4.2.1)

# Glue, current text part 2

---

A later definition is that glue "includes any record in a zone file that is not properly part of that zone, including nameserver records of delegated sub-zones (NS records), address records that accompany those NS records (A, AAAA, etc), and any other stray data that might appear." (Quoted from `<xref target="RFC2181"/>`, Section 5.4.1)

Although glue is sometimes used today with this wider definition in mind, the context surrounding the definition in `<xref target="RFC2181"/>` suggests it is intended to apply to the use of glue within the document itself and not necessarily beyond.

# Possible more succinct definition of glue

---

Section 4.2.1 of RFC 1034 says that “Data that allows access to name servers for subzones” is “sometimes called ‘glue’ data”. It later says:

To fix this problem, a zone contains "glue" RRs which are not part of the authoritative data, and are address RRs for the servers. These RRs are only necessary if the name server's name is "below" the cut, and are only used as part of a referral response.

Section 5.4.1 of RFC 2181 says “‘Glue’ above includes any record in a zone file that is not properly part of that zone, including nameserver records of delegated sub-zones (NS records), address records that accompany those NS records (A, AAAA, etc), and any other stray data that might appear.”

# Discussion

---

- What to do about in-bailiwick?
- Maybe simplify “glue”?